

## 評価調査結果要約表（英文）

<b>1. Outline of the Project</b>		
<b>Country:</b> Republic of Sudan		<b>Project title:</b> Project for Strengthening Vocational Training in the Republic of Sudan
<b>Issue/Sector:</b> Human resources — Vocational Training		<b>Cooperation scheme:</b> Technical Cooperation Project
<b>Division in Charge:</b> JICA Human Development Department		<b>Total Cost:</b> 428 million Japanese Yen (at the time of the evaluation)
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): January 2011 – December 2013 (3 years)	<b>Partner Country’s Implementing Organization:</b> Supreme Council for Vocational Training and Apprenticeship
		<b>Supporting Organization in Japan:</b> O.P.C. Cooperation
		Related Cooperation:

### 1-1. Background of the Project

The Supreme Council for Vocational Training and Apprenticeship (hereinafter referred to as “SCVTA”), under Ministry of Human Resources Development and Labor (hereinafter referred to as “MoHRDL”) is mandated by the Vocational Training and Apprenticeship Act (2001) as an authority responsible for overseeing vocational training, including setting policies on vocational training and apprenticeship as well as preparing vocational training plans and programs. However, the vocational training system in Sudan faces such challenges as: a) outdated structure and curriculum; b) lack of administrative skills for vocational training centers (VTCs) ; c) lack of training skills of VTC trainers; and d) aging facilities and equipment of VTCs. Moreover, training is not meeting the labor market needs and training needs. On the other hand, there is an increasing social need for vocational training as a measure to address the issue of unemployment of youth. It is urgently needed to review the current vocational training system so that it responds to the needs of the private sector.

Against this background, the Government of Sudan requested the Government of Japan to conduct a development study on a master plan for the vocational training system in order to establish a more strategic human resource development plan that reflected the needs of the private sector. From November 2008 to March 2010, JICA conducted "Study on Vocational Training System Development". Based on the result of this study, “Project for Strengthening Vocational Training in the Republic of Sudan” was commenced in January 2011 with a purpose to strengthen SCVTA's capacity to manage vocational training based on social and labor market needs. Khartoum 2 Vocational Training Center (K2VTC) was identified as a model site for pilot activities through which SCVTA strengthen its function to support other VTCs and training providers.

### 1-2. Project Overview

The Project aims to strengthen the vocational training system of Sudan through pilot activities leading to strengthening SCVTA’s function to support VTCs as well as to support various training providers through technical guidance and training of trainers (TOT) .

### (1) Overall Goal

Overall Goal: Vocational training system is strengthened to activate the employment and income opportunities of ex-trainees.

### (2) Project Purpose

Project Purpose: SCVTA's capacity for managing vocational training based on social and labor market needs is strengthened.

### (3) Outputs

Output 1: Functions of SCVTA to support VTCs are strengthened through pilot activities with model training courses

Output 2: Functions of SCVTA to support various training providers are strengthened through technical guidance and TOT.

### (4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Experts:	11 experts (in total 77.57 M/M)
Trainees received:	63 persons (15 persons for Japan including 13 to be dispatched in October 2013, 35 persons for Egypt)
Provision of Equipment:	Equivalent to 67,271,000 Yen
Local Operational Expenses:	Equivalent to 2,6290,000 Yen
Renovation of facilities	Equivalent to 34,121,000 Yen Khartoum 2 VTC (restroom for persons with physical disabilities, restroom for women, meeting room, workshop with storage and instructors' room)

Sudanese side:

Counterpart Personnel:	Total of 10 CPs were assigned by SCVTA
Provision of Space:	Project office (1 room at SCVTA, 1 room at K2VTC, furniture)
Local Cost Sharing:	391,021 Sudanese Pound (equivalent to 8,751,049 Yen) by September 2013 SCVTA shared costs for training, furniture, survey, custom clearance fee and transportation costs for equipment, equipment maintenance and installation, electricity and water supply, telephone, and other consumable goods and travel expenses.

## 2. Evaluation Team

<b>Member of Evaluation Team</b>	Team leader	Ms. Emi Aizawa	Director, Social Security Division, Human Development Department, JICA
	Evaluation Planning	Mr. Takashi Shimizu	Program Officer, Social Security Division, Human Development Department, JICA
	Evaluation Analysis	Ms. Hiroyo Onozato	Consultant, VSOC. Co., Ltd.
<b>Schedule of survey</b>	30 <sup>th</sup> August – 18 <sup>th</sup> September 2013		Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

### **3. Result of Evaluation**

#### **3-1. Project Performance**

##### **3-1-1. Outputs**

(1) Output 1 has been achieved by the time of the terminal evaluation.

All the indicators have been achieved. More than 95% of the participants of TOT evaluated TOT higher than 3 in 5-grade evaluation (Indicator 1-1) . The curricula of 11 short-term courses have been developed and 2 long-term courses have been revised (Indicator 1-2) . Through the implementation of seminars and workshops on equipment management, SCVTA has improved its capacity to provide guidance to VTCs on this issue (Indicator 1-3) .

(2) Output 2 has been achieved by the time of the terminal evaluation.

TOT for training providers were implemented with the participation of 10 organizations in total and SCVTA visited various training providers 21 times for information sharing and needs assessment. SCVTA also organized Training Providers' Meetings (Indicator 2-1) . According to the results of the follow-up survey and interviews during the terminal evaluation, the training providers evaluate assistance provided by SCVTA highly (Indicator 2-2) .

##### **3-1-2. Project Purpose**

3 out of 5 indicators for the Project Purpose have been achieved at the time of the terminal evaluation. 92% of the ex-trainees evaluated the model courses with a score higher than 3 out of 5-grade evaluation (Indicator 1) . All the employers of ex-trainees of the model courses (8 companies) gave a score higher than 3 out of 5-grade evaluation to their performance (Indicator 3) . Training for disadvantaged groups has been implemented by various training providers with support of SCVTA (Indicator 4) .

Indicator 2 and Indicator 5 have not been achieved by the time of the terminal evaluation. Indicator 2 refers to the employment rate of the ex-trainees of the model courses. While the employment rate is one of the important indicators, it cannot measure the quality of training or SCVTA's capacity for managing vocational training by itself, because the employment rate is greatly affected by external factors such as economic conditions, labor market situation and personal relationship. It should also be pointed out that the duration of the model courses was relatively short (three months), and it is difficult to find jobs directly after short-term training.

#### **3-2. Evaluation Results**

##### **3-2-1. Relevance**

Relevance of the Project is high as evidenced by the following factors:

- The objectives and activities of the Project are in line with policies and strategy of the Government of Sudan; Twenty-Five Year National Strategy (2007-2031), Sudan Five Year Plan (2012-2016), Three Year Program for Sustainability of Economic Stabilization (2012-2014), Vocational Training and Apprenticeship Act 2001, Sudan TVET Policy (draft as of May 2013), and National Policy on Persons with Disabilities (under consideration) .
- Relevance of the Project relating to SCVTA and its target group's (VTCs, training providers) needs is high. The vocational training system has been facing various challenges; outdated curricula, lack of administrative skills in SCVTA and VTCs, lack of training skills of VTC trainers, aging facilities and

equipment and not being able to reflect the changing social needs and labor market needs in the vocational training system.

- Relevance to consistency with the Japanese aid policy/strategy is high as stated in Country Assistance Policy for Sudan and rolling plan (December, 2012), TICAD V "Yokohama Declaration 2013" and "Yokohama Action Plan 2013-2017".
- Relevance to Japanese technical expertise in Vocational Training is high as reflected to Japanese assistance in vocational training in Sudan; dispatch of Experts to the vocational training center in the 1980s, the Study on Vocational Training System Development (2008-2010) in order to design the Master Plan of the Vocational Training System, and dispatch of Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCV) to the vocational training sector since 2009.

### **3-2-2. Effectiveness**

Effectiveness of the Project is relatively high as evidenced by the following factors;

Most of the indicators for the Project Purpose have been achieved. The achievement of the two outputs has been confirmed and it has contributed to the achievement of the Project Purpose. One of the indicators for the Project Purpose, which is concerned with the employment rate of the ex-trainees, is unlikely to be achieved. It should be noted that this indicator should be considered more as reference information.

### **3-2-3. Efficiency**

Efficiency of the Project is relatively high as evidenced by the following factors;

As mentioned above, Output 1 and Output 2 have been achieved even within the relatively short Project period of 3 years.

#### **(1) Inputs of Sudanese side**

SCVTA has assigned C/Ps to cover all the expertise along with Japanese experts. Curriculum development activities as well as TOT and short-term model courses were designed and implemented with active participation of VTCs' trainers. In 2011, lack of budget disbursement for local expenses caused postponing of the implementation of the model course to 2012. Amount of disbursement from the Ministry of Finance and National Economy (MoFNE) has been increasing while some inconsistency in terms of timing and amount still remains.

#### **(2) Inputs of Japanese side**

The expertise and number of the Japanese experts have been appropriate, and they have been dispatched according to the plan. Equipment and local expenses have been provided and training in Japan and Egypt has also been implemented as planned.

#### **(3) Contributing factors for achievement of the Outputs**

Starting from August 2012, the Project conducted the series of Vocational Training Forums inviting other developing partners working in the vocational training. Collaboration with "Project for Human Resources Development for Darfur and the Three Protocol Areas" and "Capacity Development Project for the Provision of Services for Basic Human Needs in Kassala" increased communication among SCVTA, VTCs under SCVTA and state VTCs. As for Output 1, cooperation by the private companies contributed to the development and implementation of the short-term model courses. As for Output 2, through Training Providers' Meetings,

collaboration with international and national NGOs and the private firms broadened SCVTA's channel to approach various disadvantaged groups with different training approaches.

#### (4) Hindering factors for achievement of the Outputs

As for Output 1, in 2011, there was no disbursement of local expenses for the model courses by the Sudanese side. Therefore, the activity was implemented in 2012. As for Output 2, due to the worsening of security condition in South Kordofan state and Blue Nile state since 2011 and in North Kordofan in 2013 hindered the implementation of the planned activities in these states.

### **3-2-4. Impacts**

The impact of the Project is high. The following positive impacts have been identified.

#### (1) Positive Impacts

- Inclusion of socially vulnerable groups in vocational training

Through the Project, trainings for disadvantaged groups were designed and conducted for the first time by SCVTA. The Project improved the training environment at the model site and increased accessibility of persons with disabilities and women to the vocational training center. As a result, those who had not been able to participate in vocational training have become beneficiaries of TOT and model courses with improved contents and facilities. Furthermore, some of them have already provided training to other vulnerable people for income generation, utilizing what they had learned in the training.

- Organizational aspect

In 2013, SCVTA started receiving inquiries on their capacity to provide vocational training from other organizations. As a result of promoting communication with VTCs, training providers, the private sector and donors, SCVTA's role has become more recognized by other stakeholders, which has led to their increased interests in utilizing its assets.

- Skill and Technical aspect

Effects of the Project activities at the model site as well as effects of trainings in Egypt and Japan can be seen in some of the ex-participants' VTCs. Ex-participants in K2VTC initiated 5S and KAIZEN and organized their working environment in the visible manner. These comprehensive activities have brought about positive impacts on other colleagues and trainees' attitude. Moreover, SCVTA and VTC trainers participated in the follow-up survey gained the practical knowledge of how to trace ex-trainees and find out the effects of the training and reflect the result analysis to the following training design (PDCA cycle) .

#### (2) Negative Impacts

There is no negative impact observed.

### **3-2-5. Sustainability**

Sustainability of this project is medium as evidenced by the following factors.

#### (1) Policy and institutional aspect

Human resources development through vocational training remains to be an important development agenda for Sudan as evidenced in various policies and strategies. In addition, SCVTA is now involved in the formulation of Sudan TVET Policy and the National Policy on Persons with Disabilities which stipulates vocational

training as a measure of social inclusion.

(2) Institutional aspect

SCVTA is going to recruit new 85 staff members and organize training by senior trainers to transfer their knowledge and skills to younger generation as well as to establish the General Directorate for VTCs aiming to strengthen its supporting function to VTCs not only in Khartoum but in other states.

Moreover, SCVTA C/Ps expressed that their confidence and motivation have been enhanced through active participation in the Project activities. They have come to feel more eager to improve their skills and strengthen SCVTA's function. Such change in their attitude has been also recognized by VTCs in increased communication. Therefore, it is expected that enhanced motivation of SCVTA will lead to the strengthening of ownership, which will be an important factor for General Directorate for VTCs to function and utilize the experience gained through the Project in a sustainable manner in the future.

(3) Financial aspect

SCVTA has strengthened its capacity to plan, request and negotiate the disbursement of necessary budget from MoFNE. However it remains to be a crucial issue that SCVTA secures the budget for the implementation of existing training courses and additional activities as well as for maintenance costs of machinery, equipment and the facilities for the coming years.

(4) Technical aspect

SCVTA has developed the capacity to utilize the curriculum development methods, guidelines and teaching materials of TOT and the model courses introduced by the Project. SCVTA is planning to continue follow-up survey. Department of Planning & Development is responsible for conducting survey, analyzing the results and sharing information with other departments so that survey results will be reflected in vocational training management.

### **3-3. Factors promoting better sustainability and impact**

#### **(1) Factor concerning to Planning**

- The Project design to strengthen the capacity of SCVTA through supporting K2VTC

Based on the SCVTA's project implementation experience through supporting K2VTC, the pilot site, SCVTA has started expanding its support to other VTCs by involving them in the development of the curricula as well as the implementation of TOT, model courses and follow-up survey. SCVTA has also strengthened its capacity to communicate with VTCs through these activities.

- Collaboration with other TVET stakeholders including the private sector, private training providers and state VTCs

The Project activities were designed to engage not only VTCs under SCVTA but also private training providers and state VTCs. Having a wider range of partners has enabled SCVTA to exchange information and expertise on vocational training issues and to expand the sphere of its activities by collaborating with them. The series of the Vocational Training Forum and the Training Providers' Meetings organized by SCVTA have brought positive impacts at the grass-root level as well as the inter-organizational level.

- Collaboration with other JICA technical cooperation projects

The Project has collaborated with other JICA technical cooperation projects with vocational training components. Collaboration activities provided opportunities for SCVTA officers and other TVET organizations to interact and learn the situation and resources in respective institutions. A positive impact of the strengthened relationship is seen in the increasing requests from state VTCs to SCVTA for assisting them in developing their training courses.

## **(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process**

- Enhancement of confidence and motivation of SCVTA C/Ps

SCVTA C/Ps expressed that their confidence and motivation have been enhanced through active participation in the Project activities. They have come to feel more eager to improve their skills and strengthen SCVTA's function. Such changes in their attitude have been also recognized by VTCs in increased communication.

- Transfer of skills

Various approaches have been taken to transfer knowledge/skills through the Project as below.

- In response to the installation of new machinery and equipment mainly in K2VTC, Japanese experts conducted training on equipment maintenance and management system. The Equipment Management Committee was also formed by SCVTA and VTCs to create manuals for machinery/equipment management and security check sheets for machinery operations.
- Curriculum development workshops were conducted to create short-term model course curricula by using CUDBAS and modular system.
- TOT were designed and conducted by utilizing Progressive Training System for Instructors (PROTS) for VTC trainers and relevant training providers.
- Follow-up survey skills were introduced to assess the impact of training and reflect the findings to following training courses.
- In addition to the activities in Sudan mentioned above, trainings in Japan and Egypt were conducted for SCVTA and VTCs to gain knowledge of vocational training management including PDCA cycle, KAIZEN and 5S in addition to the technical skills.
- C/Ps who participated the training in Japan on economic empowerment of persons with disabilities shared their knowledge at the Training Providers' Meeting.

## **3-4. Factors inhibiting better sustainability and impact**

### **(1) Factors concerning to Planning**

- Delay of budget disbursement

The austerity plan of the Government has led to the lack of budget disbursement from MoFNE to SCVTA in 2011. It hindered the implementation of the model courses which had originally been planned in 2011. Furthermore, in 2012, the delay in budget disbursement led to the postponement of the revision of the curricula of long-term training courses. Thus, uncertainty in financial situation had negative effects on the implementation of the Project activities according to the plan.

- Worsening of security condition in Blue Nile state and South Kordofan state

Due to the worsening security condition in 2011, the Project team has been refrained from visiting these states.

Output 2 activities in these two states could not be conducted as in the Plan of Operations.

### **3-5. Conclusion**

Among five evaluation criteria, *Relevance* and *Impact* of the Project are evaluated high. *Effectiveness* and *Efficiency* of the Project are evaluated relatively high. *Sustainability* is evaluated medium.

Especially *Relevance* could be favorably assessed, due to the fact that the Project, which aims to strengthen the function of the SCVTA for supporting VTCs and training providers, as the central role of enhancement of the vocational training system, aligns with the strategies of both Sudan and Japan.

As for *Effectiveness*, pilot activities managed by SCVTA improved its supporting functions for VTCs and training providers as well as relationship among them. SCVTA also developed the mechanism for curriculum development reflecting market needs. SCVTA is now able to support VTCs and training providers in the development and implementation of both short-term and long-term courses.

As for *Efficiency*, Output 1 and Output 2 have been achieved even within the relatively short Project period of 3 years. Through the Project, SCVTA has strengthened collaboration not only with VTCs and training providers but also with the private sector as well as other JICA technical cooperation projects. Such collaboration contributed to the efficiency of the Project.

As to *Impact*, the Project could be evaluated to have contributions on promoting social inclusion of people affected by conflicts and disadvantage groups by increasing their accessibility to vocational training opportunities.

In order to secure Sustainability, it is necessary for SCVTA to put continuous efforts in new recruitment, set up of new directorate supporting VTCs, and build partnership with other organizations to provide vocational training to various target groups as well as secure budget to continue Project activities. Taking into consideration pre-conditions of economic and security stability, the Team have evaluated moderate for Sustainability.

### **3-6. Recommendations**

#### 3-6-1. Recommendations for the activities until the end of the Project Period

- (1) Monitoring of the implementation of the long-term courses based on the revised curricula (including proper utilization of equipment)
- (2) Development of a plan for organizing Training Providers' meeting and Vocational Training Forum
- (3) Diffusion and utilization of the materials developed through the Project to VTCs

#### 3-6-2. Recommendations for the activities after the completion of the Project

- (1) Utilization and revision of the outputs of the Project
- (2) Development of a plan on sustainable human resource development
- (3) Securing additional financial resources for providing services through income generation at VTCs
- (4) Strengthening of collaboration with the private sector
- (5) Improvement of recognition of SCVTA through public relations activities
- (6) Promotion of technical exchange across VTCs at the trainer level



### **3-7. Lessons Learned**

#### **(1) Promotion of collaboration among a wide range of stakeholders through a program approach**

A well-coordinated program approach facilitates collaboration among the stakeholders and brings about positive impacts. The Project has been implemented in the framework of a program on the strengthening of vocational training in Sudan, which includes two other technical cooperation projects. Joint activities with the stakeholders of the three projects, such as trainings in Japan and Egypt and a workshop on vocational training, have been conducted. These activities provided opportunities for SCVTA and other TVET organizations to interact and learn from each other the situation and resources of respective institutions.

#### **(2) Difficulty of setting the employment rate as an indicator to measure the achievement of a project on vocational training**

The employment rate is an important target for TVET sector; however, it is greatly affected by external factors and does not always reflect the improvement in the quality of vocational training. It should also be noted that it takes time for the strengthening of the management capacity of a central government body such as SCVTA to result in the improvement of vocational training provided at VTCs. Furthermore, it is often difficult for jobseekers to find employment soon after the training. Therefore, the employment rate should be used carefully as an indicator for a project on vocational training and can be considered in combination with other indicators.