

## Summary of Terminal Evaluation

<b>1 . Outline of the Project</b>	
<b>Country :</b> Socialist Republic of Vietnam	<b>Project title :</b> The Project for Strengthening the Traffic Police Training in People's Police Academy and Various Police Training Institutions in Vietnam
<b>Issue/Sector :</b> Transport	<b>Cooperation Scheme :</b> Technical Cooperation Project
<b>Division in charge :</b> JICA Vietnam Office	<b>Total Cost :</b> 350 million Japanese Yen
<b>Period of Cooperation</b>	June 2010~June 2013
	<b>Counterpart in Vietnam :</b> People' s Police Academy (PPA) <b>Supporting Organization in Japan :</b> Police Agency in Japan
<b>Related Cooperation :</b> Yen Loan Project 'Northern Traffic Safety Improvement Project in Vietnam'	
<p><b>1 – 1 Background of the Project</b></p> <p>In the Socialist Republic of Vietnam (hereinafter referred to as Vietnam), economic growth in recent years contributes to increase in the number of vehicles, and improvement of road infrastructure nationwide. However, the poor administrative situation in traffic safety sector caused careless traffic manner of the people and resulted in rapid increase in the number of traffic accidents. Then the number of fatalities exceeded 13,000 in 2007, and it has become a serious social problem here in Vietnam.</p> <p>In this background, even though the Ministry of Public Security (hereinafter referred to as MOPS) and local public security entities have devoted themselves to traffic safety improvement measures, which covers various activities including traffic instruction, traffic management, analysis of traffic accident data, and so on, the severe situation in traffic safety still remains to be improved.</p> <p>People's Police Academy (hereinafter referred to as PPA) under the MOPS, is a high-ranked institution for the training/education of police staffs under/post graduate students including traffic police, and re-training of senior police officials. And it also covers the training and education of trainers for local police public security training institutions as the supervising organization. However, the present educational contents/methods of traffic safety police in PPA do not fully reflect the above radical change of the traffic situation, and it requires the urgent improvement of their total training and educational system. Therefore, the Government of Vietnam requested the Government of Japan for the technical cooperation for PPA regarding the strengthening the capacity on training and education for traffic police. In response to this request, JICA started a three (3) year technical cooperation project in July 2010, titled "The Project for Strengthening the Traffic Police Training in People's Police Academy and Various Police Training Institutions in Vietnam" (hereinafter referred to as "The Project").</p> <p><b>I-2 Project Overview</b></p> <p>(1)Overall Goal Traffic police training in police training institutions in Vietnam is improved.</p> <p>(2)Project Purpose</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Education contents of the PPA Traffic Police Faculty will be improved</li> <li>2. PPA Teacher's training and research ability for traffic police will be improved</li> </ol> <p>(3)Outputs</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Improvement of training content on the "Road Traffic Law and Public Education", "Traffic guidance and control", "Traffic Enforcement", and "Collecting and Analyzing of Traffic Accident Data",</li> <li>2.Improvement of training method encouraging students' initiatives,</li> <li>3.Establishment of Traffic Safety Research Center and implementation of research and development activities, and</li> <li>4. Improvement of Training Program for the active traffic police.</li> </ol> <p><b>I-3 Inputs (as of December 2008)</b></p> <p><b>Japanese side :</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A total of fourteen (14)ten (10) Japanese experts have been assigned since the inception of the Project and will be continued for a total of 75.2 man months until termination of the Project period in June, 2013.</li> </ul>	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Equipment: Patrol Motor Bike, Patrol Car, Equipment for the training, Personal Computer.</li> <li>• Training Course in Japan, Thailand</li> </ul> <p><b>Vietnamese Side :</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A total of seventeen (17) C/Ps for Consultative Group and fourteen (14) C/P for Management Group have been assigned.</li> <li>• The office space and other facilities for the Project staff have been provided.</li> </ul>		
<b>2 . Outline of the terminal evaluation</b>		
<b>Evaluation Members</b>	<b>Team</b>	Mr. Hozumi Katsuta Team Leader Senior Advisor, JICA Mr. Masaya Omae Evaluation Analysis, Success Project Management Office, Co., Ltd. Mr. Yoshitomo Kubo Cooperation Planning, JICA Vietnam Office
<b>Mission period</b>	March 5 <sup>th</sup> ~13 <sup>th</sup> ,2013	<b>Type of Evaluation :</b> terminal evaluation
<b>3 . Outline of the evaluation result</b>		
<b>III-1 Project Performance</b>		
<b>(1)Project Purpose</b>		
<p>1. Education contents of the PPA Traffic Police Faculty will be improved.</p> <p>2. PPA Teacher’s training ability for traffic police will be improved.</p> <p>(Indicator 1)</p> <p>Three (3) textbooks of four (4) subjects have been approved and one (1) has been under examination as the official textbooks at PPA by the approval committee of PPA. All syllabus and supplementary materials, such as question examples and exercise books, and video clips were also approved as the teaching materials at PPA. Regarding the power point materials, it is not necessary to be approved for using them in class.</p> <p>(Indicator 2)</p> <p>Textbooks of four (4) subjects, Video Clips and other teaching materials provided through joint works with C/P and JICA experts have been utilized in class for higher quality of teaching. A set of Syllabus has been used effectively for preparing lesson scenario by teaching staff members.</p> <p>(Indicator 3)</p> <p>Study reports prepared by Traffic Safety Research Center (TSRC) were presented in seminars, in which MOPS, among others, participated. Regarding policy proposals in reports, it remains some way from high quality possessed to provide useful policy proposals in the presented reports . However, TSRC published “White Paper on Traffic Safety in Hanoi” which will be helpful of assistance for discussion on policy proposals as basic information.</p> <p>Project Purpose is evaluated to be achieved. All of the Indicators will be achieved within the Project duration. Through the process to achieve the respective outputs, C/P personnel have acquired knowledge and know-how, which testified the results of interview survey which was implemented in the terminal evaluation survey.</p>		
<b>(2)Outputs</b>		
<p>Output 1: Improvement of training content on the “Road Traffic Law and Public Education”, “Traffic guidance and control”, “Traffic Enforcement”, and “Collecting and Analyzing of Traffic Accident Data”</p> <p>(Indicator 1-1)</p> <p>A number of teaching materials have been developed as follows:-</p> <p>(1) Textbook</p> <p>Textbooks for four (4) subjects have been developed. Three (3) of them have been approved and one (1) has been under examination as the official textbooks by the approval committee of PPA.</p> <p>(2) Supplementary Material</p> <p>Supplementary Materials in order to develop teaching quality have been developed, i.e. “Question Examples and Exercise Book” for four (4) subjects, Video Clips for six (6) themes and forty-six (46) Power Point Materials for four (4) subjects.</p> <p>Output 2: Improvement of training method encouraging students’ initiatives</p> <p>(Indicator 2-1)</p>		

New syllabuses of four (4) subjects, i.e. “Road Traffic Law and Public Education”, “Traffic guidance and control”, “Traffic Enforcement”, and “Collecting and Analyzing of Traffic Accident Data” have been formulated for the usage of revising textbooks and preparation for pilot lessons. Furthermore, each teaching staff has prepared teaching scenario for teaching.

(Indicator 2-2)

Pilot lessons using new teaching methods and materials have been conducted jointly by JICA experts and C/Ps. It was highly appreciated by students who attended such pilot lesson according to the inquiry survey just after such lessons.

Exercise lessons for evaluating teacher’s capacity of using new teaching methods and materials Lessons to evaluate teacher have been conducted three (3) times in the third year.

Output 3: Establishment of Traffic Safety Research Center and implementation of research and development activities

(Indicator 3-1)

Traffic Safety Research Center (TSRC) started its operation under the Project in September 2010 with four (4) staff members and was officially established under the PPA with seven (7) academic staff members in August 2011. However, the Center has not yet received authorization by MOPS.

TSRC has been conducting the following six (6) researches under approval by the approval committee of PPA and worked for “White Paper on Traffic Safety in Hanoi” which was published. .

- 1) “Enhancement of traffic accident database in Hanoi City”
- 2) “Application of assessment method on economic loss due to traffic accidents in Hanoi City”
- 3) “Establishment of assessment criteria for traffic congestion in Hanoi City”
- 4) “Enhancement of potency of traffic patrol activities by traffic motorbike at the Hanoi City Police”
- 5) “Psychological element affecting to the behavior of traffic police against citizen at the Hanoi City Police”
- 6) “Countermeasure to dissolve at the high-accident location in Hanoi”

Output 3 has shown good progress on academic perspective as the research body; however the center cannot secure allocation of necessary budget and personnel because of budgetary constraint of PPA at this moment.

Output 4: Improvement of Training Program for the active traffic police

(Indicator 4-1)

Training program for the active police, aiming at development of training capacity of PPA, is designed as collaboration with one of the components of other cooperation project between Vietnam and Japan, “Northern Vietnam National Roads Traffic Safety Improvement Project (Yen Loan Project)”. The Project has conducted pilot trainings for the active police officers in collaborated with this Yen Loan Project for the northern eleven (11) provinces including Hanoi City.

Output 4 has made good progress; however PPA should secure necessary human resources and budgets to conduct same kind of level of pilot training without assistance like mentioned above.

### **III-2 Implementation Process**

Implementation process of the Project was reviewed from the various viewpoints, such as technical transfer, communications among stakeholders, and monitoring process, to see if the Project has been managed properly as well as to identify obstacles and/or facilitating factors that have affected the implementation process.

### **III-3 Summary of Evaluation Results**

#### **(1) Relevance**

The Project is highly relevant because of the following reasons.

##### **1. Consistency with policy of the Vietnamese Government**

For Vietnam, which has been suffering from an increase in traffic accidents with rapid growth in the number of vehicles, traffic congestions and accidents are serious problems. The Government has tackled with the traffic safety by issuing several decrees regarding traffic safety measures. Thus, the Project, aiming capacity development of traffic police training, perfectly matches the government policy. In addition to the above mentioned situation at the time of the mid-term review, the decision was made on “Approved National Strategy to ensure Traffic Order and Safety to 2020 and Vision to 2030 (1586/QD-TTg)” on 24th October, 20123. This decision is to approve the proposal from the Ministry of Transport by the Prime Minister for tackling on national traffic safety.

## 2. Consistency with needs of beneficiaries

The direct beneficiaries are Vietnamese C/P staff of Faculty of Traffic Police in PPA and the indirect beneficiaries are MOPS and staff of the other Faculty in PPA. They are in dire needs of capacity development by introducing new teaching materials and methods to respond to current traffic situation. Therefore the Project is consistent with their needs. Such component of activities for enhancement of teaching capability on above mentioned critical subject is absolutely essential to enhance capacity of PPA.

## 3. Consistency with ODA policy of Japanese Government

In Japan's the Official Development Assistance (ODA) program towards Vietnam, formulated in 2009, "acceleration of economic growth and strengthening international competency" is one of focal areas. Cooperation in the field of traffic safety is consistent with "urban development and improvement in transportation, and communication network" which is one of the sub areas under that focal area. Furthermore, the Government of Japan has been focusing on the traffic safety matter in Vietnam as the priority assistance area according to the assistance policy of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan for Vietnam in December 2012.

## 4. Advantage of Japan's cooperation in the Project

Japan, as a country which has long experiences in tackling traffic safety issues, has a comparative advantage in the field of traffic safety measures with abundant human resources. Especially various training institutions for police officers are precious resources for implementation of the Project. Moreover, regarding research in this field, Japan has been playing an important role for managing "International Association of Traffic and Safety Sciences" which has the main office in Tokyo, Japan. As a matter of course, from a standpoint of ODA in this sector, a series of assistance project has been implementing in Vietnam. It is obvious there are strong evidences, as mentioned above, for the advantage in traffic safety sector.

### (2) Effectiveness

The Evaluation Team considers that effectiveness of the Project in total is "High".

As mentioned in 3-4, the Project has made steady progress towards achievement of the Project Purpose.

Positive factors contributing to effectiveness of the Project are, among others: i) all the four (4) outputs of the Project have shown generally good results so far; ii) JICA Project Team (Japanese experts and Vietnamese staff) have good relations and communications with Vietnamese C/P, iii) top management of PPA are cooperative and quite positive for the Project, and iv) system for approval of syllabus and textbook was changed from MOPS's authority to PPA's autonomous management.

There was the negative factor at the time of Mid-term Review, such as the delay in MOPS's authorization of the TSRC for achievement of Outputs; however this factor is shifted to the matter of sustainability at present.

### (3) Efficiency

The Evaluation Team found that the degree of efficiency of the Project is "High" judging from performances of inputs and outputs.

#### 1. Appropriateness of inputs

The Project has so far had ten fourteen (140) Japanese experts. They have efficiently managed to conduct various activities with sincere and responsible manners. Apart from Japanese experts, several numbers of Vietnamese staff members, including experts, have been appointed for the Project and played a significant role in implementation of the activities.

Allocation of the Vietnamese C/P is mostly appropriate for the activities and only a few C/P members have left the Project because of transfer. However, it is noted by the Evaluation Team same as the Review Team in April 2012 that many of Project activities have been conducted by the initiative of JICA experts. One of the reasons is that many of C/P members are occupied with regular assignments such as conducting lectures and guiding students, unable to share spare sufficient time in the Project activities. It should be added, however, that the degree of C/P's active participation in the activities is increasing from the second year of the Project whereas now some of C/P, staff of TSRC, concentrate on the Project activities without having regular lectures.

Four (4) opportunities of counterpart training in Japan in 2010 and in 2012 were beneficial for participants in order for smooth implementation of the Project. The C/P's visit to Thailand in August 2011 as a third country training, including presentations in the international symposium and a visit to

Traffic Accident Research Center, also contributed to their capacity development. For the Project, Japanese side has provided equipment, all of which are properly maintained in good conditions and well utilized. However, as already mentioned in 3-1, the delay of provision of two (2) police cars and ten (10) police motorbikes has caused the delay in starting practical lessons. Regarding duration of the Project for such purpose as research activity enhancement, it is not easy to judge clearly for its appropriateness because researcher may not have any final goal in general.

#### 2. Achievement of outputs

As seen in indicators of Outputs in 3-3, most of the Project outputs have been duly achieved for completing the Project in June; however, Concerning the Output 3 ‘Establishment of TSRC and implementation and development activities’, since the Center will be upgraded in April 2013, it is observed that initial action is left to be implemented for securing sustainability of research activities supported by the Project Team to date. However it is necessary to allocate enough budget and personnel to achieve Output 3 “Establishment of TSRC and implementation of research and development activities” in the long run.

#### 3. Collaboration with the other activities

The Project has conducted pilot trainings for the active police officers collaborated in collaboration with the project for the northern eleven (11) provinces including Hanoi City.

#### **(4) Impact**

Impact of the Project is the most difficult task in the evaluation due to its nature. However, based on in-depth assessment and the following grounds, the Evaluation Team has concluded the Impact of the Project is “High”;

1. First of all, the most noticeable event was that PPA awarded “Hero of Army Force Medal” which was the prize for the highest educational institutes in Vietnam. The award ceremony was held in October 2012 in the presence of the Prime Minister, Minister of MOPS and the Japanese concerned parties from the Embassy of Japan, JICA office in Vietnam and the Project expert team. Such appreciation will draw the interest of the other educational institutes not only in the traffic safety sector. This event is very strong Impact for Overall Goal of the Project to achieve the first indicator, such as “University/Colleges begin to utilize Teaching Materials made by PPA”.

2. As mentioned in 4-1 Relevance, the decision was made on “Approved National Strategy to ensure Traffic Order and Safety to 2020 and Vision to 2030 (1586/QD-TTg)” on 24th October, 2013. This decision is to approve the proposal from the Ministry of Transport by the Prime Minister for tackling on national traffic safety. This means the Government of Vietnam accepts the Project as the important activity in line with the Government Policy to tackle on critical issue for preventing being damaged by the potential of traffic danger both economically and socially...

3. Although the important assumption from Project Purpose to Overall Goal i.e. “Necessary financial resources will be secured.” is necessary needs to be secured, TSRC does not have autonomous financial system. However, it is said that PPA is now making an effort to upgrade the status of TSRC; therefore such important assumption will be cleared by self-reliant efforts of PPA.

4. As Teaching Materials made by PPA have been distributed to Universities/College with high appreciation, it is expected that such Outputs will be valuable source for the education at the other institutions for propagating effect of Outputs nation widely. At the same time, PPA has been conducting lecturers’ training at PPA and travelling training at respective institutes related to traffic safety in Vietnam; therefore Outputs of the Project will be passed down to the institutions concerned.

#### **(5) Sustainability**

The Evaluation Team considers that sustainability of the Project is “Medium ” due to the following reasons.

##### 1. Policy aspect

Because traffic safety remains an urgent and significant issue, the government policy is unlikely to change and MOPS will continue to support the activities on capacity development related to traffic safety improvement. Furthermore, the Government of Vietnam has been accelerating traffic safety development by “National Strategy to ensure Traffic Order and Safety to 2020 and Vision to 2030” which was mentioned in 4-1 Relevance.

##### 2. Institutional and financial aspects

As an important police training institution PPA receives stable budget from MOPS annually and the

top management of PPA is very positive about the Project and is likely to continue to support the activities even after the termination of the Project. However the weakness of financial situation of current TSRC may interrupt stable continuation of research activities of TSRC to secure sustainability of the Project.

Teaching materials developed by the Project are already used in pilot lessons and in regular lectures because of their high quality and originality. Though As it was necessary to get approval by MOPS for revision of textbook at the time of Mid-term Review Survey; the system for approval of syllabus and textbook was changed from MOPS's authority to PPA's autonomous management. This change is some sort of witness of high capability of PPA related to education and training. PPA has authorized regarding syllabus and textbook in the field of traffic safety education in Vietnam.

The TSRC is yet to receive authorization as an official organization of PPA by MOPS. The authorization is required for financial sustainability of activities of the Center because current research activities are financed by the counterpart fund of the Project, which will terminate along with the Project period.

A series of pilot trainings of traffic police officers in actual service were conducted successfully collaborated in collaboration with the project for the northern eleven (11) provinces including Hanoi City under JICA. The effect of these pilot trainings is very much important because C/P personnel who do not have actual experience at site absorbed exact necessity for education and training at PPA. However, further pilot trainings are not planned as a regular base although necessity and importance are understood by PPA. It is expected to establish regular training system of traffic police officers in actual service.

### 3. Technical aspect

Since the inception of the Project, Vietnamese C/P staff has been upgrading their capacity and they themselves and Japanese experts recognize that technical capability of C/P on Project activities, including developing new teaching materials and methods and research on traffic safety is strengthened.

## **III-5 Conclusion**

The Evaluation Team conducted evaluation through literature and questionnaire surveys, and interviewed with the Vietnamese counterpart personnel, the Japanese experts and other persons related to the Project. The result is that the Project has shown appropriate progress as Outputs and Project Purpose will be achieved at the termination of the Project in June 2013.

From the viewpoint of five evaluation criteria, the Evaluation Team considers that "Relevance" of the Project is Very High as the Project is consistent with the Vietnamese policy as well as the Japanese aid policy, "Effectiveness" is High as all the four (4) outputs of the Project have shown generally good results "Efficiency" is High as inputs and outputs performance is logical, and "Impact" is High as PPA is highly appreciated as the top of educational institutes in traffic safety. As for Sustainability, it is evaluated as Medium because of the financial weakness of PPA especially for TSRC .

## **III-6 Recommendations**

I. It is recommended to finalize followings by the end of the Project

### (1) Familiarization of new contents of teaching materials and teaching method

Since formalization of textbooks were formalized recently, lecturers of PPA have just begun to conduct lectures based on new textbook and teaching materials using new teaching method. It is highly recommended that lecturers should utilize remaining time to get accustomed to contents of new teaching materials and teaching method with the necessary support of JICA Experts within the Project period.

### (2) Upgrading of Traffic Safety Research Center

Currently, the TSRC is under the faculty of traffic police of PPA, thus the center cannot secure sufficient allocation of necessary budget and personnel because of budgetary constraint of PPA. Therefore, PPA has made efforts now making an effort to upgrade the status of TSRC. According to PPA, a plan for upgrading and restructuring of PPA, in which the center will be located under Science Research Institute to be established in PPA, is now at final stage of decision to be made by the minister of MOPS. It is highly recommended for PPA to continue to take necessary actions to

push forward the plan as far as possible.

II. It is recommended to make more efforts to improve followings even after the end of the Project.

(1) Dissemination of new teaching materials and teaching method

As Now that teaching materials were authorized by PPA, PPA is requested to step forward to disseminate those materials through to related institutes. At the same time, lecturers of PPA should utilize fully the ordinary training course for lecturers of other police universities/colleges in PPA so that for the dissemination of the teaching materials including new teaching methods are fully utilized in related institutions.

(2) Strengthening of relationship with traffic police site

It is often argued that PPA lecturers do not have much actual experience at the site. Insufficient actual experiences and lack of practical experiences information of the staffs and information on the traffic police site are the site sometimes causing not only difficulty for staff of research center to finding appropriate research theme as well as , but also outdated lectures of lectures. PPA management should provide more opportunities to the staffs and lecturers to touch get the experience and information of the actual traffic police site.

(3) Regularization of training program for the active traffic police in actual service

The training conducted for actual traffic police was very meaningful both for active traffic police in actual service and lecturers of PPA. Actual traffic police in actual service were reeducated their ski34ll on one hand, lecturers of PPA learned necessity to upgrade their skills in order to teach the active traffic police in actual service on the other. It is suggested that the training for the active traffic police in actual service should be a permanent one.

END