

Summary of the Evaluation Results

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Republic of Senegal	Project Title: Project on the Improvement of Educational Environment Phase 2
Issue/Sector: Education / Primary Education	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in Charge: Human Development Department / Basic Education Division2	Total Cost: approx. 320 million Japanese yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): September, 2010 – August, 2014
	Partner Country's Implementation Organization: Ministry of National Education
	Supporting Organization in Japan: None
	Other related cooperation: None
1-1. Background of the Project	
<p>In Senegal, Decennial Program of Education and Training (PDEF) was established in 2000, and achievement of 96% of Gross Enrollment Rate(GER) and 70% of completion rate in primary education level were set as target until 2011 in the PDEF phase 2 (2005-2007). Although GER improved from 67.2% in 2000 to 93.9% in 2011, completion rate remained still 66.5 % in 2011. It is required to improve educational environment of children such as housework, absence of teachers, commuting distance to school which affected completion rate.</p> <p>Presidential decree of July 2002 ordered, as part of the educational development policy, installation of the school management board (hereinafter, CGE) at each school level which consists of teachers, parents and the community members in order to improve school management through independent problem finding/solving by each community/school . The functional CGE is expected to help the community and the school to identify the problems that they are facing and improve the educational environment etc. However, CGE did not come to function effectively for reasons such as inappropriate selection of board members and absence of the knowledge for elaborating the school improvement plan.</p> <p>From such background, JICA carried out a technical cooperation project "Project on the Improvement of Educational Environment" (hereinafter, Project Phase 1) for three years from May 2007 to May 2010 in Louga in order to develop the model for the improvement of the school management by the functional CGE. As a result of the Project phase 1, at the elementary schools where the functional CGE were installed, improvement of access and quality, such as the increase in number of schoolchild by 4.4%(from 77,873 to 81,295) or rose in success rate of the examination for the certificate of elementary course completion by 18% (from 48% to 66%), were observed.</p> <p>Following the results of the Project Phase 1, the Government of Senegal requested the Government of Japan to implement a technical cooperation project that expands the model of functional CGE nationwide. Based on this request, JICA carries out the "Project on the Improvement of Educational Environment Phase 2" from September 2010 to August 2014 (4 years), with a counterpart organization, Direction of Elementary Education of Ministry of National Education.</p>	
1-2. Project Overview	
(1) Overall Goal	

The access and quality of primary education are reinforced through improvement of school environment and PDEF management system by the functional CGE.

(2) Project Purpose

The model of functional CGE is established and expanded nationwide.

(3) Outputs:

1. The CGE model developed in the Project Phase 1 is revised.
2. The effectiveness of the improved CGE model is verified in the target area of the Project.
3. The improved functional CGE model is prepared for the nationwide expansion.
4. The system is reinforced to establish and monitor the CGE model all over Senegal.

(4) Inputs (as of the moment of this evaluation)

Japanese side: Amount of total inputs: approx. 320 million yen

Long term Experts: 3 experts

Short term Experts: 4 experts

Training in Japan and/or in the third country : 19 participants

Provision of equipment: 62,596,928 FCFA (approx. 12.5 million Japanese yen)

Cost for the Project: Approx. 143,525,000 yen (including the estimated sum of the fiscal year 2013)

Senegalese side:

Counterpart Personnel: 10 C/P personnel at the Central level and 16 C/P personnel at the Regional level

Building and Facilities: Office space located in Ministry of National Education (furnished with desks, chairs, shelves, air conditioner, etc.)

Running cost for the project: 82,307,621 FCFA (including the estimated sum of the fiscal year 2013) (approx. 16.5 million Japanese yen)

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Leader: Hideharu TACHIBANA, Director, Basic Education Division 2, Human Development Department	
	Cooperation Planning: Takayuki MURAOKA, Basic Education Division 2, Basic Education Group, Human Development Department	
	Evaluation and Analysis: Yasuyo HASEGAWA, Consultant.	
Period of Evaluation	February 16, 2014 - March 4, 2014	Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

3. Evaluation Results

3-1 Project Performance

(1) Achievement of Outputs

Output 1: The CGE model developed in the Project Phase 1 is revised.

The CGE model developed in the Project Phase 1 was revised to integrate direction of PAQUET (2013-2015) and PAQEEB(Project for improvement of quality and equality in basic education) and 5 manuals(Establishment of CGE, Decision of action plan of CGE, Training for management of CGE, Training for establishment of union of CGE (UCGE), Trainig for monitoring of CGE/UCGE) and 2 audiovisual aids (enhancing UCGE etc) were developed and approved. Therefore, Output 1 is achieved.

Output 2: The effectiveness of the proved CGE model is verified in the target area of the Project.

As a result of the activities related to Output 2, 97.7% of schools in the pilot regions installed

CGE. 75.1% of all CGE submitted the school action plan to IEF (Inspectorate of Education and training) and implemented 3 activities on average annually with the communities such as campaign for improvement of enrollment rate of girls, building new classrooms and conduct a remedial class etc. In terms of UCGE (mass of representative of CGE a unit of municipality), all communes/village communities in the pilot regions set up UCGE. 94% of all UCGE submitted the annual report to IEF and 82.1% of UCGE whose annual report was submitted to IEF had held general assemblies at least three times per year. Therefore, Output 2 is almost achieved. However, the functionality of UCGE as a structure responsible for monitoring cannot be measured with the available data. The Project is still working for enhancing the functionality of UCGE.

Output 3: The proved functional CGE model is prepared for the nationwide expansion.

The functional CGE model was approved in a national workshop held in November 2012. The fund for the expansion of CGE model was obtained; 308,000,000FCFA (year 2013, about 400,000 USD) are assured in BCI (project budget) of the Senegalese Government and 2 million dollars are assured within the framework of the PAQEED financed by the World Bank. Although there was a delay in attaining external fund because it became difficult to acquire Japan Social Development Fund (JSDF) which was assumed initially, Output 3 is achieved.

Output 4: The system is reinforced to establish and monitor the CGE model all over Senegal.

The plan for nationwide expansion of CGE model was prepared and approved in the 5th JCC held in June 2013. Afterwards, this plan is updated according to the availability and the executing status of the fund. CGE establishment training and CGE enhancing training are the activities relating to Output 4. The former was held in 11 regions (about 7,300 schools) out of 12, but except for 2 regions (800 participants a region) the number of participants was not totalized yet. The latter was held only in 1 region out of 12. Therefore, Output 4 is not achieved yet.

(2) Achievement of Project Purpose

The model of functional CGE is established and expanded nationwide.

Since Output 4 is not produced yet, it is difficult to achieve the Project Purpose within the expected period of the Project.

(3) Achievement of Overall Goal (perspective)

The access and quality of primary education are reinforced through improvement of school environment and education management system by the functional CGE.

Improvement of educational environment as a direct effect of the CGE activity (such as renovation of infrastructure (school toilet) or provision of school lunch) were observed and these improved schools infrastructure and provision of school lunch could contribute improvement of access. In addition the effects which had been achieved as a result of the improved environment by these CGE activities (such as improvement in teachers' and students' motivation, or change in populations' consciousness about school) were observed.

In terms of improvement of educational indicators, the rank of the success rate of the examination for the certificate of elementary course completion in Kaffrine was improved from 13th out of 14(2009-2010) to 7th(2012-2013). Supplementary lessons or practice examinations held as CGE activities may affect the results of examinations. However, further study is needed in order to clarify the direct impact of CGE activities, for there are many factors that influence educational indicators.

3-2 Summary of the Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance: Very High

This Project responds precisely to the needs of the Senegalese Government to install CGE at every elementary school in the country and make it function as well as contributes to full completion of basic education which is targeted in the Senegalese new education and training sector programme, i.e. PAQUET(2013-2025). Also, the Project is consistent with the Action Plan of TIVAD V (Provision of education with good quality for 20 millions of children) and the Japanese aid policy to Senegal involved program of improvement of basic education and this Project plays principal cooperation which reinforces educational management in the program. Therefore, the relevance of the Project is very high. Furthermore, the Project is suitable as a means, for the Project makes good use of the experiences acquired from “The Project on Support to the Improvement of School Management through Community Participation (School for All),” which Japan executed in Niger.

(2) Effectiveness: Moderate

The model of functional CGE was established and approved, but execution of the training to expand the model nationwide is not finished. Therefore, it is difficult to achieve the Project Purpose within the expected period of the Project. However if the results of the 4 regions where the trainings on CGE establishment were completed are considered, 96.3% of the school completed to install CGE. This high ratio shows the possibility that the model of functional CGE would be expanded nationwide is quite high, if the training is executed properly. On the other hand, provision of the fund by any project or programme to the school before the execution of CGE enhancement training may damage the functionality of CGE.

Output 1: The CGE model developed in the Project Phase 1 is revised and output 2: The effectiveness of the improved CGE model is verified in the target area of the Project contribute to establishing functional CGE model. Output 3: The improved functional CGE model is prepared for the nationwide expansion and output 4: The system is reinforced to establish and monitor the CGE model all over Senegal play a part in expansion of functional CGE model nationwide. Then, project purpose: The model of functional CGE is established and expanded nationwide will be feasible to achieve through steady practice of output 1 to 4. Therefore, it can be said that project purpose and necessary outputs for the achievement of project purpose are fixed appropriately and relevantly. However, it is required to address continuously for expansion of functional CGE model nationwide because implementation of related activities of output 4 became difficult due to the delay of securing fund and disbursement for nationwide expansion of functional CGE model.

(3) Efficiency: Moderate

As already described in “Achievement of Outputs,” Output 1, 2 and 3 are mostly achieved. However, the delay in obtaining the fund and its disbursement hindered the execution of the activities related to Output 4 and as a result Output 4 is not achieved. In terms of Input, high competence and efforts of the Japanese experts have contributed to the great results achieved by the Project, whereas its number was minimized. The Project made the best use of experiences accumulated in the “School for All”²-related projects so that the functional CGE model would be installed effectively. Furthermore, the school action plan of the functional CGE model assumes the execution of the plan by the voluntary contribution of the community, which enhances the cost effectiveness of the Project.

² Community participated improvement of school management project had launched in Niger and this project have been implementing in Niger, Burkina Faso, Mali (Suspension), and Senegal

(4) Impact: Relatively High

As already described in “Achievement of Overall Goal,” improvements of educational environment as direct effects of the CGE activity were observed. These improvements allow teachers to spend more time to education and give lessons with better quality, and as a result, ease learning of students. In addition, population’s consciousness that the school is for the community is being enhanced while participating CGE activities. Therefore the possibility to achieve Overall Goal is high as far as each CGE continues to plan and execute activities though it depends on the varieties and quality of the activities which relates to the indicators of Overall Goals. As ripple effects, it was observed that UCGE offers an opportunity for concerned people to gather and discuss not only educational issues but also other various issues which the communes/villages communities were facing.

(5) Sustainability: Moderate

Enforcing decentralization/deconcentration of the management of educational programme for more effective, efficient and inclusive governance is one of the eight priorities and the role and responsibility of CGE as a body which manages the fund allocated to each school are defined in the PAQUET (2013-2025). Therefore, it is highly possible that the policy aid continues after the end of the cooperation period. On the other hand, organisational aspect of the sustainability is not wholly assured. The organizational structure to execute activities relating to functional CGE is well defined in the Project. However, the personnel responsible for these activities are assigned both at central and regional level as counterparts of the Project but not as personnel responsible for CGE related activities. Therefore, it is not certain that this organizational structure will be sustained after the Project period. In addition, model of UCGE is not approved yet, although the Project considers it as a major organ responsible for CGE monitoring. Therefore, further effort is necessary in organizational aspect. In financial aspects, it can be said that sustainability is secured based on the budget compilation(2013-2017, 26.7 million USD) which related to improvement of school management by Senegalese government such as distribution of subsidy 3,500FCFA (approx. 700 yen) par children and education sector program by world bank/ GPE. However, it is necessary to watch low rate of budget execution or distribution situation in school level closely. In technical aspects, established functional CGE model by the project is well evaluated in Senegal and training manuals (guides) decided by theproject are used effectively in each school. On the other hand, it can be assessed planification and execution abilities of each CGE are strengthened gradually, however, it is necessary to implement follow up training or strength of cooperation if CGE does not have sufficient abilities through monitoring of inspectors or CGE Unions in future.

3-3. Factors promoting the production of effects

(1) Collaboration and Experience Sharing with “School for All”-related Projects

The Project shares accumulated experiences like activities and progress of each countries and issues in future with actors involved in “School for All”-related Projects which implemented in West African countries such as Niger, Burkina Faso and Mali. In this project, necessary manual for school grant managemnt was established based on the manual which had been developed in Niger previously. These experience sharing allows Senegalese counterparts to have a concrete image of the Project approach.

(2) Flexibility of the Project

The Project respects the ideas of the Senegalese officials and the voices of the people in the field and responds to them with flexibility. Multiple modifications of manuals and finalization of the

functional CGE model except related part to monitoring temporarily in case of the difficulty of establishment of monitoring method of CGE influenced by the promotion of decentralization are examples that show the flexibility of the Project. Thanks to this attitude, consensus was formed not only central and local government, but also concerned people in school. Consequently, the “functional model” was established.

(3) Project office located in the Ministry of National Education

Japanese experts work physically close to the counterparts at central level and carried out the Project with the respect of their ownership. Such project management is considered to have led the prompt approval of manuals and the model by the Ministry of National Education.

3-4. Factors inhibiting the production of effects

(1) Troubles in Acquiring the External Fund.

The Project was supposed to use Japan Social Development Fund (JSDF) for the nationwide expansion of the model. However, JICA’s negotiation with the World Bank to use JSDF did not work well and the Project was forced to find a different fund. Acquisition of a different fund required time and efforts, which caused not only a delay in execution of training but also an additional burden to Japanese experts. (As a result, budget of world bank’s PAQEED was secured in 2013)

(2) Delay in Budget Execution (Central Level)

Even after the fund for the nationwide expansion of the model was ensured, it took time to coordinate among world bank, Ministry of National Education (MEN), and concerned direction in the MEN. Consequently, time-consuming procedure of the budget execution delays disbursement of the fund. This has hampered timely implementation of training.

(3) Complexity of Scheduling (Regional Level)

At IA/IEF level, it is necessary to adjust the schedule of various programmes within the limitation of time and human and financial resources. Therefore, if another program has been already scheduled at the time when the budget for the Project-related training is allocated, the Project-related training tends to be postponed.

3-5. Conclusion

The Project is implemented in accordance with Senegalese educational policy that aims to strengthen decentralization/deconcentration of the educational sector. The model developed by the Project is well appreciated by the Senegalese community, and the Team observed many positive impacts that the functional CGE has made. Functional CGE model are established gradually such as set of school action plan or establishment of UCGE in the region which implemented CGE establishment and functionalization training. However, trainings that allow nationwide expansion of the model are not yet implemented in all regions. In addition, in order to ensure sustainability, further efforts to strengthen the organizational aspect including the monitoring system are necessary. For these reasons, the Team judged that it would be difficult to achieve the Project Purpose by the end of August 2014, and agreed to recommend to the competent authorities of Senegal and Japan to extend the duration of the Project for an additional year.

3-6. Recommendations

(1) Short-term Recommendation (by August 2015, assuming the extension period)

- **Timely Organization of Training: Information Sharing between Stakeholders**
The delay in disbursement of funds has delayed the implementation of training. In order to avoid delays in disbursement of funds, information sharing between stakeholders (Department of Planning and reformation (DPRE), Department of general affairs and equipments (DAGE), etc.) is necessary.
- **Strengthening Monitoring**
 - 1) **Strengthening UCGE**
It is important not to delay the validation of UCGE model. After CGE enhancing training will be executed in the remaining eleven regions except 2 pilot regions (Fatick and Kaffrine) and Kaolack, installation of UCGE and strengthening the functionality of UCGE are essential. Regional Forum(Gathering by the people concerned in communities such as local authorities, local educational inspector(administrative official), teacher’s union, religious leader or local NGO to discuss educational issues and fix activities for problem solving of the issues) by community approach that the Project has launched in Fatick and Kaffrine can be one of the tools to strengthen UCGE.
 - 2) **Strengthening Implementation System**
 - a. **Establishment of a structure responsible for CGE at the central level**
The structure and roles of administrators at the central level need to be clearly defined in order to assure the sustainability of CGE-related services.
 - b. **Creating a permanent position responsible for CGE at the regional and departmental level**
To sustain monitoring of CGE and UCGE, it is recommended to create a permanent position responsible for CGE at regional and departmental level.
 - 3) **Integration of Monitoring of CGE and UCGE into Existing System of MEN**
The annual seminar of MEN and annual review of PAQUET at central level and the coordination meeting of inspectors at regional level could be opportunities to monitor the functionality of CGE and UCGE. It is also proposed to integrate the tasks related to CGE monitoring in the specifications of the inspectors. To achieve this integration, the Project must examine experiences in the pilot regions and compile the documents that indicate the overall monitoring system.
- **Testing a Model of Activities to Improve the Quality of Learning**
The disbursement of direct grant to each school is planned under the PAQEED of the World Bank. This grant aims to improve the quality of education. However, most of the CGE activities have focused on improving access and the school environment, and experiences on activities aimed at improving quality are limited. For this reason, it is proposed to test a model of activities to improve the quality of learning (testing mathematical tools in two pilot regions).
- (2) **Medium- and Long-term Recommendation (after September 2015)**
 - **Strengthening Monitoring by the person in charge of CGE in each level**
It is necessary to utilize annual seminar by the MEN or annual review of PAQEED in central level and to conduct monitoring continuously by using coordination meeting of inspectors or collaboration with Educational Forum and UCGE. Particularly, analysis of achievement of each activities by school grant and establishment of appropriate distribution of grant, method of monitoring (clarification of responsibility in decentralization) are essential.
 - **Enhancing the Quality of Learning in Collaboration with the PAQEED**
It is important to share with actors of MEN and development partners the results of the model of

activities to improve the quality of learning that will be tested during the extension period of the Project. Concretely, it is inevitable to promote a remedial class or family learning by CGE aiming to attain better education quality (learning achievement etc)

3-7. Lessons Learned (reference cases derived from the project for finding, planning implementation and management of other similar projects)

(1) Baseline and Endline survey

It is inevitable to show the improved school management as the outputs whether it's achieved or not because direct purpose of improvement of school management project is its improvement. However, considering that "improvement of school management" finally contributes to improving educational environment and that it is a "tool" to increase access or learning achievement of students, it is essential not only to explain success of the tool, but also to show and explain what has been changed with the tool. Therefore, it is important to incorporate these surveys in initial Plan of Operation aiming to set appropriate index and conduct baseline/endline survey in necessary timing.

(2) Utilization of the External Fund

The Project is a good practice in the sense that the functional CGE model developed by the Project is being expanded nationwide by the fund of PAQEED (joint financing of WB/ Global Partnership in Education (GPE)) and the Senegalese government. Taking recent situation of the ODA budget into consideration, this kind of approach, which is to develop an effective model by Japanese technical cooperation and scale it up using an external fund, is required. In the Project, the model developed by the Project was approved as the official model by the Senegalese government is considered as factors for success.