

評価結果要約表（英文）

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: The Republic of Rwanda	Project Title: The Skills Training and Job Obtainment Support for Social Participation of the Ex-Combatants and Other People with Disabilities
Sector: Social Welfare / Peacebuilding	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in Charge: Division of Social Security, Social Security Division of the Higher Education and Social Security Group, Human Development Department	Total Cost: 196.7 million Japanese Yen (as of terminal evaluation)
Period of Cooperation: R/D signing : 22 December 2010 Period of Cooperation : 11 March 2011– 10 March 2014 (3 years)	Partner Country’s Implementation Organization: Rwanda Demobilization and Reintegration Commission (RDRC)
	Supporting Organization in Japan: None
	Related Cooperation Scheme: None
<p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>For the Republic of Rwanda (hereinafter “Rwanda”), it has been a urgent issue from the political, social, and economic aspects to reduce to a more appropriate size the Rwandan Patriotic Army (RPA; later shifted to the Rwandan Defense Force [RDF]) that became bloated through the long civil war, the 1994 genocide, and conflicts with the neighboring Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) and other countries, and to demobilize and repatriate members of Armed Groups (AGs) who had crossed from Rwanda to the DRC after 1994.</p> <p>To address the issue above, the Government of Rwanda (GoR) launched in 1997 the Rwanda Demobilization and Reintegration Program (RDRP) Stage I targeting the RPA. In 2001, the GoR began implementing the RDRP Stage II not only for the RDF but also the Armed Forces of Rwanda (FAR) of the previous regime and AGs that had been active outside of Rwanda since 1994. By the time of the termination of Stage II in 2009, the program demobilized more than 60,000 ex-combatants of the RDF, FAR, and AGs.</p> <p>A considerable amount of demobilized ex-combatants have disabilities. However, assistance for them in the RDRP was limited to the provision of medical assistance and rehabilitation instruments. The RDRP did not include skills training to facilitate their reintegration into civilian life. Moreover, agencies implementing skills training for persons with disabilities in Rwanda were limited. Therefore, the social and economic reintegration of ex-combatants with disabilities into communities faced major difficulties.</p> <p>In response to a request by the GoR, JICA implemented a project called the “Skills Training for the Reintegration of Demobilized Soldiers with Disabilities (DSwDs)” from December 2005 to December 2008. The project aimed to increase access to skills training for DSwDs, allowing them to acquire skills alongside civilians without disabilities. The project consisted of the following: (1) providing skills training for DSwDs; (2) providing training for Skills Training Center (STC) instructors (training of trainers [ToT]); and (3) installation of barrier-free facilities at STCs. 925 ex-combatants with</p>	

disabilities completed the skills training. In addition, JICA conducted in 2009 the follow-up assistance to the project and trained another 100 ex-combatants with disabilities.

In January 2010, the GoR started the RDRP Stage III, which will last until December 2013. At the time of the terminal evaluation, the extension of Stage III until June 2014 is being negotiated with the World Bank. Re-integration of ex-combatants into civilian life is essential for consolidation of peace in Rwanda. Accordingly, the RDRP is targeting not only the ex-RDF but also the ex-FAR and ex-AG to accelerate the national reconciliation and stabilization of the regions across the borders.

In addition, many civilians became disabled because of the 1994 genocide and other reasons. Based on the previous project that brought about effective outcomes, the GoR requested the Government of Japan for assistance on skills training and job obtainment for ex-combatants with disabilities as well as persons with disabilities (non-combatants with disabilities) in general.

1-2 Project Overview

The Skills Training and Job Obtainment Support for Social Participation of the Ex-Combatants and Other People with Disabilities (hereinafter the “Project”) has been implemented since March 2011 with the counterparts (C/Ps) of the Rwanda Demobilization and Reintegration Commission (RDRC). The Project has aimed to provide skills training for ex-combatants with disabilities and other persons with disabilities together and help them obtain jobs for social participation.

(1) Overall Goal

The social participation of the ECOPD (ex-combatants with disabilities and other persons with disabilities) who participate in the skills training is promoted.

(2) Project Purpose

The ECOPD who participate in the skills training obtain job.

(3) Outputs

- 1) Environment to provide the skills training for the ECOPD is strengthened.
- 2) Skills training for the ECOPD is improved.
- 3) Support services to obtain job of the ECOPD are developed.
- 4) Partnership among organizations related to social participation of the ECOPD is strengthened.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side: Total amount of inputs: 196.7 million yen (As of October 2013)

Experts: Two long-term experts: coordination and training; support for persons with disabilities

Two short-term experts: barrier-free environment; senior trainer of Disability Equality Training (DET)

A total of 60 man-months as of September 2013

Number of trainees received: nine participants in three courses (development of leadership and networking of persons with disabilities; technical and vocational education and training and job obtainment support; and mainstreaming of persons with disabilities for African

countries [independent living program])			
Equipment: None			
Local expenditure borne by the Japanese side: 13.67 million yen (As of the end of August 2013)			
Rwandan side:			
Number of C/P personnel including those of related organizations: 33			
Facility offered: office space			
Local operation cost borne by the Rwandan side: cost of a radio announcement, travel allowances for personnel of the RDRC and other organizations, etc.			
2. Evaluation Team			
Member	Ms. Eri Komukai Mr. Tomohiro Kuwabara Ms. Noriyo Aoki	Leader Cooperation Planning Evaluation Analysis	Senior Advisor (Peacebuilding), JICA Deputy Assistant Director, Social Security Division, Human Development Department, JICA Consultant, IC Net Limited
Period of Evaluation	15 September – 3 October 2013	Evaluation Type	Terminal Evaluation Study
3. Results of Evaluation			
3-1 Confirmation of Results			
3-1-1 Achievement of Outputs			
Almost all the Outputs have been achieved.			
The Output 1, which is, improvement of an enabling environment in which persons with disabilities acquire skills, has been achieved. Physical accessibility for trainees has been improved, and STCs' personnel, trainees, and other stakeholders for trainees have improved their understanding on disabilities. The indicators defined in Output 1 have been achieved.			
Regarding the Output 2, 1,546 trainees will complete their training by the end of the Project. According to a questionnaire survey, 95.3% of the trained ECOPD is satisfied with the course. (The survey targeted 1,246 ex-trainees who completed their training in 2011 and 2012. 837 people out of the 1,246 made valid responses, and 784 answered that they were satisfied.) The indicators defined in Output 2 have been almost achieved.			
Concerning the Output 3, 92.3% of the ex-trainees formed new cooperatives or entered existing cooperatives. (The survey targeted 1,246 ex-trainees who completed their training in 2011 and 2012, and all the target ex-trainees made valid responses.) As for the use of starter-kits that are provided to ex-trainees or cooperatives as basic tools, 93.3% answered that they use the kits provided by the Project. Moreover, 94.0% of the ex-trainees answered that they were satisfied with the job obtainment support provided by the Project. The indicators defined in Output 3 have been almost achieved.			
In relation to the Output 4, partnership among relevant organizations has been greatly strengthened for the purpose of social participation by persons with disabilities. Compiling experiences and lessons learned of the Project is still ongoing at the time of the terminal evaluation.			
3-1-2 Achievement of the Project Purpose			
Regarding income generation by ex-trainees, which is the target indicator of the Project Purpose,			

65.7% of the ex-trainees who completed their training in 2011 and 2012 generated income within six months after the training. The rate is calculated by dividing 818 (the number of ex-trainees who generated income) with 1,246 (the total number of the ex-trainees in 2011 and 2012). If 900, or the number of the ex-trainees who made valid responses, is used as the denominator, 90.9%, or 818 out of the 900, generated income within six months after the training by using the skills acquired in the training. Thus it is fair to conclude that the Project Purpose has almost been achieved.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The relevance of the Project is high.

The Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy (EDPRS) for 2008–2012 stressed the importance of national reconciliation. It also stated that the government would support the socially disadvantaged, such as ex-combatants with disabilities and persons with disabilities in general, in the framework of social security. Moreover, the EDPRS2 for 2013–2017 cites among its four priorities support to persons with disabilities and social integration. The Project is highly consistent with the policy of the GoR because it is directly related to capacity development and social participation of persons with disabilities. The RDRP Stage III will continue until December 2013. The GoR is negotiating with the World Bank for the extension of financing for RDRC activities after December 2013. The Project is also consistent with human resource development for supporting growth, which is a high priority in Japan's Country Assistance Policy to Rwanda formulated in April 2013.

The contents of the Project also match the needs of skills training for ex-combatants with disabilities and persons with disabilities in general. In Rwanda, the data of ex-combatants with disabilities are used because there is no data system of general persons with disabilities¹. In addition, the means of setting the range of activities has been appropriate because the Project has taken over the previous project.

(2) Effectiveness

The effectiveness of the Project is high.

Execution of the skills training (Output 1), improvement of a barrier-free environment for persons with disabilities to receive training, provision of allowance for transportation as well as support for obtaining jobs by providing starter-kits (Output 3), and strengthening partnership with organizations related to assistance to persons with disabilities (Output 4) have worked well and produced synergy effects. As a result, it was confirmed that the ex-trainees earned income by using the skills and knowledge acquired through the training. As stated above, the Project Purpose has almost been achieved, and it can be concluded that the four Outputs of the Project were set properly. The promoting factors in terms of effectiveness were a set of three items, that is, skills training, daily allowance for transportation, and starter-kits. The promotion of a barrier-free environment also contributed to effectiveness. The Project activities have been executed in a close working relationship among such parties as the RDRC, 11 STCs, National Council of Persons with Disabilities (NCPD), and Workforce Development Authority (WDA).

(3) Efficiency

The efficiency of the Project is slightly high. The expected Outputs have been smoothly achieved because the inputs from both the Rwandan and Japanese sides have been made as scheduled. Moreover,

local resources have been utilized to the maximum possible extent because the existing STCs have been used and the starter-kits have been procured locally. The formulation of an exit strategy has been slightly delayed, but it will be completed by the end of the Project. The documentation of the experiences and lessons learned is still ongoing.

(4) Impact

The impact of the Project is slightly high.

The ripple effects of the Project have been observed in a wide range of area even at the time of the terminal evaluation. Ex-combatants with disabilities and general persons with disabilities come to merge with their families and communities by receiving skills training, and their social participation has been promoted. They come to live a stable life in their society in order not to return to the battlefield. The reconciliation among the ex-combatants of different origins such as RDF, FAR, AGs, who were once enemies to one another, has been promoted. The mutual understanding among the ex-combatants and general persons with disabilities has also been promoted by working together in cooperatives or other activities. The ex-trainees share their skills with the general public, and cooperatives and other activities have contributed to community development. According to local officials, persons with disabilities tend to face difficulties in gaining income. Prior to the Project, some of them were beggars. However, after the Project began, they acquired skills and began to generate income with cooperative members from other communities, and they became remarkably independent. A series of these positive incidents have changed social recognition towards persons with disabilities. The promotion of a barrier-free environment in relevant stakeholder organizations is also recognized as a major positive impact. The promotion of a collaborative networking among organizations related to assistance to persons with disabilities has been another positive impact.

It is still uncertain whether the Overall Goal will be achieved in three to five years after the Project. The results of the survey on community and social participation by ex-trainees show that 68.3% of the ex-trainees participate compared to the target value of 70% (out of the targeted 1,246 persons in the survey, 851 responded positively). Thus there is a moderate possibility for continuous effect. However, to achieve the Overall Goal in three to five years after the Project, the relevant stakeholder organizations must help promote social participation of ex-trainees.

(5) Sustainability

The sustainability of policy is high because the continuity of the Rwandan policy for ex-combatants with disabilities and general persons with disabilities has been ensured by the RDRP and the EDPRS2. However, whether the present Project effects will continue depends on a detailed exit strategy for future activities with a relevant institutional framework that has a clear division of responsibilities. The capacity of STCs to receive persons with disabilities has improved. That means that there is no problem from a technical perspective. However, the sustainability in the financial aspect is low since there are no prospects for future allocation of financial resources for the skills development for persons with disabilities at the same level as during the Project period. With these factors taken into account comprehensively, the sustainability of the Project is judged fair.

3-3 Factors contributing to realization of effects

(1) Factors related to planning

- JICA implemented a technical cooperation project titled the “Skills Training for the Reintegration of Demobilized Soldiers with Disabilities” from December 2005. Its experiences have been utilized during the implementation of this Project.
- The previous project nurtured a partnership between JICA and the RDRC and established a favorable relationship with STCs. The Project has gained high effectiveness by using the existing STCs for persons with disabilities.
- The Project promoted a barrier-free environment for persons with disabilities to help them acquire relevant skills and knowledge, and elaborated the method of teaching those people.
- During the training, the trainees have been provided allowance for transportation. After the training, starter-kits are given to them and cooperatives in accordance with job types. Through activities of cooperatives, job obtainment has been promoted.

(2) Factors related to the implementation process

- To strengthen a working relationship with relevant stakeholder organizations, the Project appointed focal points at the NCPD and the WDA. During the selection of trainees as well as a series of guidance sessions and seminars, local government officials such as District Disability Officer (DDO), sector officials and the RDRC’s local-level officials collaborated smoothly.
- After the Mid-term Review, the Technical Working Committee (TWC) was launched for strengthening partnerships among various organizations and sharing progress and issues in relation to the skills training of STCs and support for job obtainment.
- Unlike the previous project, several STCs have accepted the hearing impaired and the visually impaired as trainees. Some STCs made Braille materials on training contents and employed a trainer with disability. Thus STCs took action for enhancing the environment for training for persons with disabilities.
- The JICA Advisory Mission was dispatched three times and gave essential guidance in a timely manner. In the first JICA Advisory Mission, the senior advisor clarified the screening criteria of trainees by forming a consensus with major stakeholders with regard to ex-combatants with disabilities as well as persons with disabilities in general. The second Advisory Mission played a monitoring role and adjusted the Project’s direction. In the third Mission, the JICA senior advisor on the disability conducted a Disability Equality Training (DET) session for trainers in various organizations’ personnel who deal with persons with disabilities.
- Rwandan persons with disabilities were employed in the Project office. The short-term expert on barrier-free environments was also a wheelchair user. The perspectives and ideas of persons with disabilities were reflected effectively for the Project. The recruitment of the persons with disability as the Project staff promoted communication with the beneficiaries of the Project, that is, persons with disabilities. It facilitated smooth implementation of the Project.

3-4 Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Factors related to planning

None in particular.

(2) Factors related to the implementation process

None in particular.

3-5 Conclusion

Almost all the Outputs have been or will be achieved during the Project period through the commitment and by great efforts of both the Rwandan and Japanese sides. Since the contents of the cooperation by the Project meet the policies and needs, it is fair to say that the relevance of the Project is high. The effectiveness of the Project is also high because the Project Purpose has almost been achieved. Inputs from both the Rwandan and Japanese sides have been provided as scheduled and the expected outcomes have been produced accordingly. The formulation of an exit strategy has been delayed, and the documentation of experiences and lessons is still ongoing. Therefore, the efficiency of the Project is slightly high. Extensive ripple effects by the Project have been emerging. Prospects for achieving the Overall Goal in three to five years after the Project are likely to be high. Therefore, it is judged that the impact as a whole is slightly high. Regarding the sustainability of policy, the Rwandan side has been strengthened through recent trends. the continuity of RDRP has been ensured according to the information the team obtained. With regard to the institutional sustainability, an exit strategy for future activities with a relevant institutional framework shall be formulated. There is no problem at the technical level because the STCs have accumulated sufficient knowledge and experiences for receiving persons with disabilities as trainees. It is no yet confirmed regarding future allocation of financial resources for skills development for persons with disabilities as same level as the Project did. Taking account of all these things in relation to various aspects of sustainability comprehensively, the sustainability is fair.

3-6 Recommendations

3-6-1 Tasks to be completed by the end of the Project

- (1) Formulation of a concrete exit strategy
- (2) Formulation of a practical manual and a guideline
- (3) Concretizing suggestions on support for job obtainment by relevant stakeholder organizations
- (4) Strengthening public relations on the activities and achievements of the Project in Rwanda

3-6-2 Tasks to be undertaken after the termination of the Project

- (1) Executing the exit strategy
- (2) Strong advocacy of social participation of persons with disabilities
- (3) Continuous support to job obtainment and improvement of business management skills
- (4) Utilization of a Standard Tracer Survey System of the WDA for a follow-up survey on ex-trainees

3-7 Lessons Learned

- (1) Effectiveness of skills training for persons with disabilities
- (2) Entry point to support to persons with disabilities in general at an early stage in the post-conflict society
- (3) Similarity and difference of assistance for ex-combatants with disabilities and general persons with disabilities.
- (4) Necessity of documentation on assistance to ex-combatants with disabilities
- (5) Significance of forming cooperatives that include persons with disabilities
- (6) Acceptance of persons with various disabilities as trainees
- (7) Strengthening management of small scale business development

- (8) Training for collaboration with multiple organizations
- (9) Process-oriented assistance for a project to support peacebuilding and general persons with disabilities
- (10) Administrative procedures on disbursement of budget