

Summary of Final Evaluation

1 . Outline of the Project	
Country: Pakistan	Project Title: Non-Formal Education Promotion Project
Issue/Sector: Education	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation
Division in charge: JICA Pakistan Office	Total Cost: 117 million Japanese Yen
Period of Cooperation	July 2011 to June 2014
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Literacy and Non-Formal Basic Education Department, Government of Punjab
	Supporting Organization in Japan: Other related Cooperation: Punjab Literacy Promotion Project Punjab Literacy Promotion Project Phase 2
<p>1 – 1 . Background of the Project</p> <p>In Pakistan, eradication of illiteracy is a priority issue. In Punjab Province, adult literacy rate (10 year old or older) is only about 60% in 2011 (Pakistan Living Standard Measurement: PLSM). To improve this situation, the Punjab Government has established the Literacy and Non-Formal Basic Education Department (LNFBED) in 2002. LNFBED has been providing non-formal education in two approaches, i.e., non-formal basic education (NFBE) for children of the school age of 5 to 14 and adult literacy center for the target age of 15 to 34. JICA implemented Punjab Literacy Promotion Project (PLPP) during the period of 2004 to 2007 and PLPP Phase II from 2007 to 2011 to assist LNFBED in promoting strategic data-oriented management through non-formal education management information system (NFEMIS). NFEMIS has been operational at LNFBED and contributing to improve its institutional capacity to manage the non-formal education services. Meanwhile, in terms of quality, there were many challenges still remaining; NFBE has neither customized curriculum nor standards. No assessment methods/tools to monitor the quality of education and thus no formal accreditation system. Taking these situations into account, in 2010, LNFBED requested for further assistance in improving the quality of non-formal education, and based on mutual agreement between the government of Pakistan and Japan, Non-Formal Education Promotion Project (the Project) was started in 2011.</p>	
<p>1 – 2 . Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p>Access and quality of Non Formal Education (NFE) are improved in Punjab.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose</p> <p>System for Quality Non Formal Education delivery is strengthened in Punjab</p> <p>(3) Outputs</p> <p>Output 1: Standards, curricula, teaching-learning materials and assessment methods/tools for Non Formal Basic Education (NFBE) are developed.</p> <p>Output 2: Standards, curricula, teaching-learning materials and assessment methods/tools for Adult Literacy are developed.</p> <p>Output 3: Provincial officers, District officers (Executive District Officers, District Literacy Officers, Literacy</p>	

Mobilizers, etc.) in Punjab Province and teachers in pilot projects are trained for newly developed outputs above.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side:

- Long-term expert (Project Advisor)
- Study visit to third countries (Indonesia and the Philippines): 8 participants
- Training for counterpart personnel (Japan and Thailand): 3 participants
- Local costs: 71 million Japanese Yen

1) Personnel assignment (3 technical staff and other supporting staff)

2) Development and printing of documents and materials

3) Training

4) Office equipment

Pakistani side:

- Counterpart personnel and the members of Steering Committee, Technical Advisory Group and Working Groups
- Office space for the project staff in the building of LNFBED
- Running expenses: 2.3 million Pakistan Rupees (as of December 2013) and monitoring and training costs for the pilot activities from the budget of different projects
- Security arrangements

2 . Evaluation Team

Members	Team Leader: Shinichiro Tanaka (Senior Advisor, JICA) Evaluation Planning: Yoshitaka Inagaki (Representative, JICA Pakistan Office) Evaluation and Analysis: Hiroshi Okukawa (Assistant General Manager, KRI International Corporation)	
Evaluation Period	January 12 to January 24 2014	Type or Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

3 . Result of Evaluation

3 – 1 . Project Performance

(1) Output 1

Standards, curricula and assessment methods/tools for NFBE have been developed. Teaching and learning materials (Package A) are being developed for sound implementation of the curricula. Development processes of Package B and C are behind schedule. Yet equivalency of Package A, B and C to formal education shall be assured by further approval of Punjab Curriculum Authority.

(2) Output 2

Standards, curricula, teaching-learning materials and assessment methods/tools for adult literacy have been developed. Bridging mechanism to further education for those who complete the basic literacy program is being discussed with relevant institutions.

(3) Output 3

A wide range of training programs have been provided for provincial and district officers and teachers for the proper implementation of the new standards, curricula and assessment methods/tools. Soon after lifting of ban on recruitment, District Training Officers will be appointed and trained.

(4) Project Purpose

There is a high probability for the Project to achieve its Purpose if necessary measures are taken to provide a sufficient project period. While results of pilot activities prove that the NFE delivery system is being strengthened, as stated above, progress of material development of Package B and C are behind schedule. It is indispensable for the Project to produce all the intended Outputs.

(4) Overall Goal

Overall Goal is likely to be achieved.

LNFBED continues to promote NFBE and Adult Literacy with its departmental budget, and there has been six projects to cater to in total of 1,570 thousand school-aged and adult illiterate population during 2014-17, utilizing the outputs of the Project. The Project has created favorable conditions for LNFBED to receive approval for new projects and collaboration with different partners, to allow greater access to NFE.

Results of pilot activities indicate that NFBE and Adult Literacy program are improved quality-wise too; Adult Literacy students of the pilot schools gained a better pass rate (89.4% to 97.1%) which indicates LNFBED has been equipped with a capacity to deliver a better service in the future. Meanwhile, learning outcomes of NFBE students (pilot) is yet to be verified during the remaining period of the Project.

3 – 2 . Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance: High

After the 18th amendment to the Constitution in 2010, the provincial government is given responsibility to provide basic education and eradicate illiteracy by developing its own curricula. The State's commitment to international initiatives including MDGs and EFA urges to address the issues of low enrolment and literacy rates. The Project is also aligned with Japan's Country Assistance Policy for Pakistan.

(2) Effectiveness: Promising

Effectiveness is promising while it is too early to judge because further verification is needed once all the Outputs are produced. While, standards, curricula, teaching-learning materials and assessment methods/tools, etc. developed through the Project are effective to provide quality NFE. Through numerous training at different levels, teachers are well equipped to provide a better, more conducive learning environment for the learners. According to a survey conducted by the Project, learning results of adult literacy learners at pilot centers are better than those of non pilot. Meanwhile learning outcome of learners of Package A is yet to be measured soon and learning materials of Package B and C are yet to be developed.

(3) Efficiency: Fair

Inputs have been appropriately provided by Japanese and Pakistani sides except for the appointment of insufficient counterpart personnel such as Capacity Building Project staff and District Training Officers crucial for proper technical transfer. A longer project period is required to accomplish all planned activities, particularly teaching-learning material development added through the mid-term review (Package B and C).

(4) Impact: High

Strengthened delivery system of LNFBED will certainly improve access to and quality of NFE in Punjab. Moreover, the developed standards, curricula, teaching-learning materials and assessment methods/tools attract different development partners, including national and international organizations and JICA's other projects, through which the project outcome may expand to other provinces and countries.

(5) Sustainability: High

LNFBED's strong commitment to the full implementation of the project outcome allows positive expectation for sustainability. Currently, LNFBED plans to utilize the project Outputs in six new and on-going projects, and further, is seeking a change of its operation mode from time-bound project to permanent program to create a stable infrastructure for education provision. Enhanced political support for and improved financial circumstances of LNFBED are also a good sign for sustainability.

3 – 3 . Factors that have promoted project

Understanding of the project purpose and approach has been deepened among counterpart personnel and other stakeholders through advocacy campaign, study visit to third countries and daily joint work. A good rapport between project staff and their partners has contributed to the efficient implementation. A conducive environment has been created based on the government's commitment to international initiatives. Innovative delivery models of LNFBED are highlighted as a mechanism to strengthen the system of quality non formal education delivery.

3 – 4 . Factors that have inhibited project

Vacancy of some counterpart personnel who are supposed to receive technical transfer has hindered smooth project implementation and assurance of sustainability. Limited human resources specialized in NFE subsector in Pakistan necessitated a certain length of time to reach them.

3 – 5 . Conclusion

Overall, the Project has been successful and is expected to contribute to improving access and quality of NFE in Punjab.

NFEPP has been developing standards, curricula, teaching-learning materials and assessment methods/tools which are effective to provide quality NFBE and adult literacy services. It also has provided training for provincial and district officers and teachers to be able to utilize the Outputs effectively through a variety of NFBE and Adult Literacy projects that LNFBED carries out with a range of innovative delivery models (workplace, community, etc). It also has a great deal of relevancy to the policy and needs of Pakistan and to Japan's ODA policy. Consequently, the project is likely to achieve its purpose and improve access to and quality of NFE in Punjab.

However, because of the prolonged absence of some counterpart personnel and the significant volume of activities added by the mid-term review, a longer period of time than originally planned is required to accomplish all activities. It is therefore suggested to extend NFEPP until March 2015. Once the project is thoroughly accomplished, a high level of sustainability will be ensured on the basis of the strong commitment of LNFBED

3 – 6 . Recommendations

(1) For financial sustainability

- LNFBED and the Government of Punjab to
 - Spare adequate budget for NFE even after completion of NFEPP
 - Discuss appropriate mix of budget allocation (e.g. increase number of schools vs. provide better textbooks, other materials, and teachers training)
 - Shift NFE activities from project mode to permanent program mode

(2) To foster readiness to take over the Project activities

- LNFBED to
 - Fulfill the vacant posts of Capacity Building Project and District Training Officers to strengthen capacity development system for teachers
 - Take the lead in developing and piloting package B and C
 - Develop the Operation Manual as soon as it can to guide its future timeline and demarcation of stakeholders for their operation, including revision of NFE standards, curriculum, assessment and related materials
 - Conduct a feasibility study on a permanent mechanism for teachers and staff training
- NFEPP and LNFBED to advocate various stakeholders for possible collaboration, including
 - Department in charge of school education, health, agriculture, industry, environment, social welfare, woman development, disaster management, labor, etc.
 - Government of other provinces
 - Civil society, private sector
 - National organizations such as National Education Foundation, National Commission for Human Development, etc.
 - International development partners

(3) Utilization of the Project Outputs

- NFEPP and LNFBED to ensure flexible and maneuverable application of the curriculum of NFBE and Adult Literacy according to requirement of target groups.
- LNFBED with support from NFEPP to conduct feasibility study for accreditation system for literacy certification

(4) Extension of the project period

- JICA to extend NFEPP's period for nine months, to accommodate time required to develop materials and carry out piloting related to Package B and C.

3 – 7 . Lesson Learned

(1) Hands-on and participatory capacity development for the counterpart personnel

The project has been implemented in a participatory manner with the counterpart personnel. For example,

- Pilot Project: Standards, Curricula, Learning materials, and Assessment have been piloted to examine their appropriateness to meet the needs of learners and improve learning situation and outputs. Counterparts have been involved in every step of the process of piloting and its OJT process to enhance

their capacities at provincial, district and center/school levels.

- Study Visit: Study visit to Indonesia and the Philippines was effective to stimulate motivation and foster sense of ownership of the counterpart personnel. At the beginning of the Project, majority of counterpart personnel were uncertain if it is possible to materialize the concept of NFBE and Adult Literacy Program that are equivalent to formal education. The visit dispelled the impression as it demonstrated existing practices in developing countries with some commonalities, and boosted their can-do spirits.

(2) Network and linkage with various stakeholders

In this project, a lot of stakeholders have been involved such as former Curriculum Wing of the Ministry of Education, Planning and Development Department, School Education Department, Punjab Examination Commission, Punjab Vocational Training Council, UNESCO, NGOs, etc. It is observed that the utilization of local resources contributes to making more applicable output such as assessment tool and learning materials at less cost, and that the involvement of counterparts contributes to developing their ownership. Collaboration with international organizations is promoting the expansion of project output. Thus, involving many stakeholders can make a potential to increase effectiveness and efficiency of projects.

(3) Policy dialogue facilitating conducive environment for project

The project personnel (counterpart and JICA expert) have been proactively involved in the development process of the NFE Sectoral Plan and Compulsory Education Act, to provide technical input. It eventually helped to reflect project activities to the policy and in turn the policy has become a powerful supporter of NFEPP contributing to generate a conducive environment.