Country Name
The Upgrading Information Technology Education Project (Information

Lao People's Democratic Republic	Technology Bridging Course)
I. Project Outline	

The government of Lao PDR (GOL) had faced the needs for developing the education system in order to provide human resources whose Information Technology (IT) skills would conform to international standards in modernized systems used in governmental and private sectors. The National University of Laos (NUOL) was established in 1996 and was the only university in the country at that time. Even though the Faculty of Engineering (FE), with a quarter of NUOL students, was the biggest faculty, there were only 50 graduates with a bachelor Background degree in electrical and electronic engineering in 2001 and 2002. In order to develop future human resources efficiently in the IT field, it was urgently needed to develop an education system which could produce graduates efficiently and quickly. In fact, a JICA-supported project, so-called Diploma Program NUOL-KMITL, which aimed at producing Bachelor degree holders in FE through dispatching 12 staff from FE to King Mongkut's Institute of Technology Ladkrabang (KMITL) in Thailand, was implemented from 1999 to 2001. As the successor to this Diploma Program, this project was implemented to establish the Bachelor's degree course by FE itself. Through developing a curriculum for a Bachelor degree course in the IT field, procuring and improving management of facilities and equipment, training teaching staff, developing teaching materials, properly implementing operation and administration of the course, and strengthening research capabilities of teaching staff, the project aimed at enabling FE to run the Bachelor degree course in the IT field, thereby contributing to Objectives of the producing IT human resources effectively to fill the demands of governmental/industrial sectors. The project Project objectives set forth are as follows: Overall Goal: FE will be able to produce IT human resources effectively to fill the demands of governmental/industrial sectors. Project Purpose: FE is capable to run a Bachelor degree course in Information Technology field. Project site: Vientiane Main activities: (1) Develop IT curriculum of NUOL; (2) Improve management of facilities and equipment for IT program; (3) Procure necessary facilities, tools and equipment for IT program; (4) Select and train teaching staff for IT Department; (5) Prepare IT glossary and teaching materials/textbooks; (6) Operate IT program (select students, invite foreign and local lecturers, monitor registration, orientation and enrolment of students and teaching and learning activities, and organize study trip for students, etc.); and (7) Strengthen research capabilities of teaching staff in IT related fields (train teaching staff on research methodology and promote academic exchanges with other universities and international joint research activities in IT related fields, etc.) Activities of the Project Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side Laotian Side1 Experts: 141 persons (Japanese:31, Staff allocated: 27 persons 1. Land and facilities: Necessary security for all laboratories Thai:110) 2. Trainees received in Japan: 5 persons and equipment, office space for the experts, computer 3. Training in third country (Thailand): 77 rooms and classrooms 3. Local cost 4. Provision of machinery and equipment Local cost April 2003 to March 2008 **Ex-Ante Evaluation** 2002 Project Period (of which extended period: April 2006 to **Project Cost** 341 million yen March 2008) **Implementing** Faculty of Engineering, National University of Laos (NUOL) Agency Cooperation Agency in Tokai University and Meiji University

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Issues to be considered at ex-post evaluation>

As one of the indicators for the Project Purpose was too general, supplemental information was used based on project reports to correctly assess the degree of achievement. Also, the target figures of some indicators for the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal related to the number of students and graduates were revised, as the project period was extended.

1 Relevance

Japan

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Laos at the time of ex-ante and project completion>

The project was consistent with Lao PDR's development policy on 'development of human resources in the IT field' as set forth in "the Fifth Five-Year National Social Economic Development Plan (NSEDP)(2001-2005)", "the policy for industrialization and modernization (January 2003)", and "the Sixth NSEDP (2006-2010)" at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Laos at the time of ex-ante and project completion>

The project met social needs for human resources in the IT field in order to enhance productivity, efficiency and optimum utilization of

 $^{^{1}\,}$ This includes inputs of the original period only due to unavailability of information.

resources, which would promote economic and national development in Lao PDR. According to the ten related government or private organizations surveyed for the ex-post evaluation, development of human resources in IT fields was continuously important at the time of project completion.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy, as stated in the "ODA Country Data Book" (2002), which prioritized higher education and human resource development in state-owned companies, private companies, and financial sectors, etc.

<Evaluation Result> In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was mostly achieved by the time of project completion. FE mostly became able to run a Bachelor degree program in IT by itself (Indicator 1), as trainings were continuously conducted to improve teaching skills of teaching staff, six papers from four research works were presented in the first Joint International Conference on Information Communication Technology (JICT), all the necessary administrative tasks were conducted by Laotian staff independently and sufficiently, and teaching materials required for most of the subjects of the IT Bridging Course were developed. The total number of graduates from the course reached 98 with approximately 90% passing rate on average, which exceeded the target figure (72 graduates and 80% passing rate) (Indicator 2). While the available data is limited, at least nine NUOL staff graduated from the course and all of them remained in the course to teach students (Indicator 3). According to the questionnaire survey conducted to students and graduates, most of them replied that the course was effective (Indicator 4).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The continuation status of project effects is partially achieved. Trainings for teaching staff have continuously been provided, however, it should be noted that training sessions are funded by donors and provided by external experts. No research was conducted from 2008 to 2011 due to lack of staff, equipment and financial support because many FE's staffs went abroad for study. As for equipment, FE could not use them for some specific areas of research because some researches need specific equipment and software license. However, one or two research works per year have been conducted since 2012. While, according to FE, all the necessary administrative tasks have been conducted by Laotian staff independently and sufficiently, IT Division, which was established in 2008 and has 12 staffs, has been responsible for running the IT course, conducting the research works and all activities related to the course. The teaching materials developed under the project are still used in the classes to teach basic IT. FE also supports some budget for lecturers in order to add or update some information in textbooks or teaching materials of the subjects they teach as necessary. In total, 326 students graduated from the IT Bridging Course during the period between project completion and this ex-post evaluation, with approximately 90% passing rate on average. Among nine NUOL staff who graduated from the course, two of them no longer remain in FE, as they currently work outside of FE. Appreciation of the course by students, graduates and organization or related governmental offices is high.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was mostly achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. The total number of graduates from the IT Bridging Course reached 424 with approximately 90% passing rate on average, which exceeded the target figure (408 graduates and 80% passing rate). Moreover, the total number of graduates from the "1+4 Years" Curriculum (a new curriculum of the IT Department which was established in 2006 based on the IT Bridging Course to produce additional 48 graduates each year) reached 321 with approximately 90% passing rate on average, which exceeded the target figure (288 graduates and 80% passing rate) (Indicator 1). A survey for the ex-post evaluation found that most of graduates from the IT Bridging Course with Bachelor degree have successfully utilized their IT skills and knowledge to their work (Indicator 2), and that most of organizations or related governmental offices have highly appreciated the IT Bridging Course and its graduates' IT skills (Indicator 3).

<Evaluation Result> The project managed to establish a training framework for teaching staff and administration and management framework of the IT Bridging Course, produce several outcomes from research works, develop necessary teaching materials, and produce sufficient number of graduates including those who remained in the course to teach students. The course was also highly appreciated by students, graduates and organizations or related governmental offices. Although research works were not conducted for four years after project completion, since 2012 at least one or two research works per year have been conducted. Nor have teaching materials been periodically revised but necessary information have been added when needed. The degree of achievement of the overall goal is mostly high at the time of ex-post evaluation as FE has become able to produce IT human resources effectively to fill the demands of governmental/industrial sectors. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

3 Efficiency

The project cost was significantly higher than planned (ratio against the plan: 227%) and the project period was significantly longer than planned (ratio against the plan: 167%), as the project period needed to be extended to enhance research and teaching capacity of teaching staff and to strengthen the administrative system of the IT Bridging Course. Therefore, efficiency of the project is low.

On the other hand, the terminal evaluation found the utilization of the third country experts/training (i.e. cooperation with King Mongkut's Institute of Technology Ladkrabang in Thailand (KMITL)²) and contracting out of part of project implementation to Japanese universities were a good combination of inputs in a way that the third country experts/training were for day-to-day technical transfer with minimum communication barriers for the Laotian counterparts, and the Japanese experts transferred more advanced technologies.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The Seventh NSEDP (2011-2015) states that Information and Communication Technology (ICT) units have to be established in the ministries, ICT trainings will be provided to staff in the priority ministries and expanded gradually to other ministries, and a legal framework has to be developed to support ICT development and use. Thus, the importance of IT education is supported by Lao PDR's development policy.

<Institutional Aspect>

At the time of ex-post evaluation, there are 300 staff in total in FE and 34 staff in total in the IT Department. 34 staff are comprised of one Head of IT Department, two Vice-Heads of IT Department, four Heads of Subject Divisions (IT Division, Computer Division, Student

² The KMITL experts had a good understanding of the Japanese technical cooperation, as Japan/JICA and the KMITL have bee in a more than 50-year cooperative relationship. This contributed to the smooth technical transfer in this project.

Administrative Division and LIBIC Center "Lao IT Business Incubation Center") and 27 teaching staff including eight staff continuing their Master's degree at FE and six staff continuing their PhD degree abroad. There are 12 staffs assigned for IT Bridging Course, as all of them belong to IT Division, all of IT Bridging Course staff have to teach the students in the course as well as to do administrative tasks due to the insufficient quota for administrative purpose. The current number of staff in the IT Bridging Course, which is allocated according to quota, is not sufficient to undertake all the necessary tasks of course management, therefore, FE does not periodically revise teaching materials and continuously uses the materials developed under the project and those prepared by experts. For future prospects, FE has a plan to separate from NUOL and will be established itself to be called as "University of Technology" start form 2017, when the numbers of staff is expected to increase to 1,160 in total (800 teachers, 160 administrative staff, and 200 assistant staff).

Pedagogical and research skill level of staff in the IT Bridging Course is sufficient (see also Effectiveness/Impact), but FE still faces the problem in terms of conducting research works due to the limited budget. According to FE, trainings on maintenance of the facilities and equipment procured under the project are conducted for staff of the IT Bridging Course before starting every semester, and the framework and mechanism for management of facilities and equipment established under the project are continuously utilized. All inventory lists are monitored by FE's Campus Division at the end of every semester, while regulations for using the Lab, equipment monitoring rules and a procedure with formats for renting equipment out are managed by the Administrative Division. However, many equipment among those procured under the project are out of order, especially PC since the life of PC is shorter than 7 years, and some of them were repaired but

others have been replaced. Other equipment such as Zoom-Type Microscope and Hot Plate (a device for heating experiment) are still in use. <Financial Aspect>

<Technical Aspect>

Since IT Department was established, the operation of the course has been at least covered by its own revenue. The revenue is from registration fees, tuition fees, and certificate fee, etc. In academic year 2014, the total revenue from these fees were 319 million LAK, and it covered the expenditures for personnel, maintenance of facilities/equipment and training that amounted to 138 million LAK. According to FE, however, the current amount of revenues in the IT Bridging Course is not sufficient to undertake all the necessary tasks such as research works and other activities. For example, needs surveys in IT industry, which was supposed to be periodically conducted to verify whether the curriculum of the IT Bridging Course is useful for Lao society but have not been conducted due to lack of budget. Some financial supports are available from Asian Development Bank (ADB), some equipment were donated by domestic private companies such as Phoubia Mining Company a few years ago as they aimed to promote their Company and some equipment are donated by graduates.

<Evaluation Result> Some problems have been observed in terms of institutional, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, sustainability of effects of the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project mostly achieved its Project Purpose and mostly achieved its Overall Goal. Sufficient number of graduates have been produced by both the IT Bridging Course and "1+4 Years" Curriculum. However, In terms of sustainability, there are some challenges in institutional, technical and financial aspects, as the number and manifestation of technical skills of staff and the amount of revenues of the IT Bridging Course are not sufficient. As for efficiency, both project cost and project period significantly exceeded the plan, as development of research and teaching capacity of teaching staff and strengthening of the administrative system required longer time than planned.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be Partially Satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

< Recommendations for Implementing Agency>

- 1. So far, FE has not conducted the Needs Surveys in IT industry in Lao PDR due to lack of budget. However, needs surveys are important to verify whether the curriculum of the IT Bridging Course is useful and appropriate for Lao society, thus efforts should be made.
- 2. Advancement of technology is fast, and thus FE should revise and update teaching manuals and textbooks by themselves, instead of continuously using teaching materials developed by experts.
- 3. Some necessary information on teaching materials and financial statements, etc. was not provided by FE. Information should be well managed through improvement of management and administrative system.

<Lessons Learned for JICA>

Although adjudged to have largely achieved the overall goal in such a way that the number of graduates and passing rate of the course supported by this project were larger than expected, the project has been evaluated as "partially satisfactory" as costs and implementation periods significantly exceeded planned allocations. This was because the project period needed to be extended to enhance research and teaching capacity of teaching staff and to strengthen the administrative system of the course. As such, JICA must consider to set adequate project period (e.g. as many as five years or in two phases) for a higher education project that aims to support a new course or institution in a university.

On the other hand, utilization of third country experts/training and the contracting out of dispatch of Japanese short-term experts to Japanese universities could enhance technical transfer in an educational project with smaller inputs than only dispatching Japanese experts/accepting trainees only in Japan. In such a case, however, the appropriateness of the source of the third country experts should be sufficiently considered based on past experience (e.g. in case of this project, good understanding of Japanese technical cooperation based on the long history of cooperation with Japan/JICA).







Photo 2. Library in Computer Engineering and Information Technology Department, FE $\,$

Aim	Indicators	veinent of 11	Toject i uipose	and Overall Goal	Results				
(Project Purpose)	NUOL FE is able to run a Ba	achelor degr	ee program in						
FE is capable to run a	(Supplemental information)	Status of achievement: Achieved (continued)							
	Training framework for new	(Project Completion) Training sessions were conducted every year before starting a semester							
in Information	and current teaching staffs is	especially for new teaching staff and for new subjects. Other methods were also utilized such							
Technology field.	utilized in FE to continuously			ining (OJT) schen	nes and teachers	' meetings to sha	are colleague's		
	improve their teaching skills.	teaching sty							
				-	-	-	Japan, Singapore		
		and the Philippines for approximately ten teaching staff in FE every year for two to three							
		weeks. The training is financed by donors. Other methods such as OJT and Teaching							
	(Supplemental information)	Assistance (TA) have also been utilized. Status of achievement: Achieved (partially continued)							
		(Project Completion) Four research fields were set up and six papers from these research							
	conducted, several research								
	groups are set up and research	fields were presented in the first JICT in 2007. A Robot contest was continuously organized during the project period.							
	promotion activities are	(Ex-post Evaluation) Though, no research was conducted from 2008 to 2011 due to lack of							
	regularly held.	staff, equipment and financial support, one or two research works per year have been							
		conducted since 2012. Since the project completion, a robot contest also has been conducted once a year.							
	(Supplemental information)			hieved (partially o	continued)				
	-			letion) All the necessary administrative tasks were conducted by IT Division					
	tasks including financial	_	-	ifficiently. FE esta					
	management, personnel	_		hing and learning	_	-			
	management, admission of		-	onducting relevan					
	students, information/data management and organizing			he necessary admittly and sufficiently			-		
	academic events are conducted		-	ff in charge at the		-	_		
	independently and sufficiently.			-		-	_		
		their education abroad while the detailed information was lost due to the computer being broken down.							
	(Supplemental information) Status of achievement: Mostly achieved (partially continued)								
	Teaching materials required for	(Project Completion) Ten textbooks and 20 teaching manuals were to be developed under the							
	all the subjects of IT Bridging			and 18 teaching r					
	Course are developed and	(Ex-post Evaluation) While FE has added and updated some necessary information to the							
	periodically revised.	_	eaching materials developed under the project, these materials have not been periodically						
	2. At least 80% of admitted	revised.							
	students are graduated every	Status of achievement: Achieved (continued) (Project Completion) The number of graduates from the IT Bridging Course by project							
	year, and the total graduates	completion was 98 with approximately 90% passing rate on average.							
	from the IT course reaches		Enrollment	Graduation	Number of	Number of	Passing Rate		
	about 50 by the end of the		Year	Year	Entrants	Graduates			
	project (=72 graduates by the	Group A	2003	2005	31	26	83.9%		
	end of the extended period).	Group B Group C	2004 2005	2006	38	36	94.7%		
		Total	2003	2008	109	98	89.9%		
		(Ex-post Evaluation) The number of graduates from the IT Bridging Course since project							
		-		proximately 90%			r i j		
			Enrollment Year	Graduation Year	Number of Entrants	Number of Graduates	Passing Rate		
		Group D	2006	2009	39	39	100.0%		
		Group E	2007	2010	38	36	94.7%		
		Group F	2008	2011	39	37	94.9%		
		Group G	2009	2012	51	36	70.6%		
		Group H	2010	2013	71	63	88.7%		
		Group I	2011	2014	73	73	100.0%		
		Group J Total	2012	2015	56 367	326	75.0% 88.8%		
		The reason for the lower passing rates in 2012 and 2015 than the other years is unknown.							
	3. Through the IT course, many	Status of achievement: Achieved (partially continued)							
	teaching staff with a Bachelor	(Project Completion) While data on Group A was not available, all the NUOL staff in Group							
	degree are developed and	B who grad	luated from the	Number of NU		Of which Num	ber of Staff who		
	remained in the course to teach students.		Year	Graduated from IT		remained			
	oradonia.	Group A	2003		N/A		N/A		
· '	İ	2004		9		9			

		Group C	2005		9	2			
				staff from Group B h	ave left FE (one works fo				
		` .			siness). There are 12 per	•			
			-						
	4. Most of current students and	in IT Course including those who graduated from the course. d Status of achievement: Achieved (continued)							
	graduates highly appreciate the	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·							
	IT course.				-				
	IT course. C students in 2005, approximately 90% of a total of 67 respondents on average repositively as "very effective" or "effective". The questionnaire survey conducted								
		in 2005 (ex-Group A students, but the number of respondents is unknown) also revealed that							
		more than 90% replied that the course was effective for their jobs.							
		(Ex-post Eva	luation) Ac	cording to the simple	questionnaire survey cor	nducted to 15 current			
		students at the time of Ex-Post Evaluation, all the students answered the questionnaires as							
		appreciated the IT Bridging course because it helped and improved their knowledge and their							
		skills a lot, and among them, 93% (14 students) responded as highly appreciated ("very							
		effective").							
(Overall Goal)	1. By the end of year 2010,	Status of achievement: Achieved							
FE will be able to	there will be approximately 300	(Ex-post Evaluation) The total number of graduates from the "1+4 Years" Curriculum is 321.							
produce IT human	IT human resources (as a total	The total number of graduates from the IT Bridging Course is 424 (See Indicator 2 of Project							
resources effectively to fill the demands of	of 7 graduates' groups with a 80% passing rate) for	Purpose).							
governmental/industrial									
sectors.	(=408 graduates from IT	Year	Year	Number of entrants	Number of Graduates	Passing Rate			
sectors.	Bridging Course and 288 graduates from "1+4 Years" Curriculum by 2015).	2006	2010	37	35	94.6%			
		2007	2011	35	27	77.1%			
		2008	2012	35	34	97.1%			
		2009	2013	84	78	92.9%			
		2010	2014	132	110	83.3%			
		2011	2015	45	37	82.2%			
		Total		368	321	87.2%			
	2. Most of the graduates from	Status of ach	ievement: Me	ostly achieved					
	the IT course with Bachelor								
	degree successfully utilize their								
	skills of IT at their own office.	Bridging Course have successfully utilized their IT skills at their own office in Laos as they							
		can develop software, security protection system etc., in their own office.							
	3. Most organizations or related								
	governmental offices highly	(Ex-post Evaluation) According to the simple questionnaire survey conducted to 10							
	appreciate the IT course and its								
	graduates' IT skills.	highly appreciated the IT Course and its graduates' IT skills as its graduates' IT skills have							
	documents Terminal Evaluation	improved a l							

Source: JICA internal documents, Terminal Evaluation Report, Questionnaire survey to FE, Questionnaire surveys to students, graduates and organizations/governmental offices.

Notes: 1) Indicator 1 of Project Purpose ("By the end of year 2005, NUOL FE is able to run a Bachelor degree program in IT by itself.") is a rephrasing of the Project Purpose itself. Thus, supplemental information was used based on project reports to correctly assess the degree of achievement. 2) The target values for the Indicator 2 of Project Purpose and Indicator 1 of Overall Goal were revised according to conditions set in project reports, as the project period was extended. Indicator 2 of Project Purpose: the target number of graduates is at least 72 by March 2008, calculated as 30 entrants/year (quota) x 3 batches = 90 entrants x 80% passing rate = 72 graduates. Indicator 1 of Overall Goal: the target number of graduates from the IT Bridging Course only is calculated as 30 entrants (quota) in 2005, 2006 and 2008, and 60 entrants (quota) from 2009 onwards = total 510 entrants by 2015 x 80% passing rate = 408 graduates by 2015, and that of the "1+4 Years" Curriculum is calculated as 60 entrants/year from 2010 onwards x 6 years = 360 entrants x 80% passing rate = 288 graduates.