

Country Name		<b>Capacity Development on Tourism Statistics In Local Government Units</b>				
Republic of Philippines						
<b>I. Project Outline</b>						
Background	<p>In the Philippines, tourism was one of the prioritized industries of the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (MTPDP) 2004-2010. The Department of Tourism (DOT) formulated an action plan in 2004 accordingly to pursue more tourism development efforts and expand marketing and investment promotions of the industry. Although it was necessary to compile and analyze accurate information in order to formulate more realistic and effective plan, it was difficult at that time to understand actual tourism development situations and potentials due to lack of necessary information. In addition, local government units (LGUs)<sup>1</sup> lacked the capacity and experience in collecting tourism data and in utilizing such data for the formulation of LGU Tourism Development Plans. In 2006-2007, JICA supported DOT by dispatching a Japanese expert who then formulated a “Tourism Statistics Manual for Local Government Units.” This JICA support also trained staff of some LGUs on basic tourism statistics and the proper usage of the manual. Based on the results, the Government of Philippines requested the Government of Japan for a technical cooperation project to enhance the planning and implementing capacity of LGUs in collecting, consolidating, analyzing, reporting and actual utilization of tourism statistics in the formulation of tourism development plans.</p>					
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through trainings on tourism statistics and tourism development planning for LGUs and through the installation of Tourism Statistics Database System, the project was aimed at improving the mechanisms for data collection, recording, reporting and dissemination of tourism statistics in a reliable, accurate and timely manner as well as developing the capacities of DOT and LGUs in formulating tourism development plans, thereby contributing to sustainable growth of the tourism sector.</p> <p>The project objectives are set forth as follows:</p>					
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Overall Goal: Sustain the growth of Tourism sector (by implementing the institutional mechanism for recording, collecting and disseminating tourism statistics)</li> <li>2. Project Purpose : To improve the mechanisms for collecting, recording, reporting, and disseminating tourism statistics in a reliable, accurate, and timely manner and develop the capacities of the DOT and LGUs in formulating tourism development plans</li> </ol>					
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Project site: The Provinces of, Palawan in Region IV-B, Negros Oriental, Guimaras, Iloilo, Capiz, Antique, Negros Occidental and Aklan (including Boracay) in Region VI, and Cebu, Bohol, and Siquijor, in Region VII</li> <li>2. Main activities: i) Revising the tourism statistics training manual for LGUs and the Basic Tourism Statistics Training Module, ii) Developing the training modules on Advanced Tourism Statistics, Tourism Development Planning and Tourism Marketing and Investments, iii) Conducting trainings on tourism statistics and tourism development planning for LGUs and Provincial staffs, iv) installing the Tourism Statistics Database System in the participating LGUs and conducting trainings on operation of the database system.</li> <li>3. Inputs</li> </ol>					
	<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) Dispatch of experts: 4</li> <li>(2) Acceptance of trainees in Japan: None</li> <li>(3) Third country trainees received (Malaysia): 17 persons</li> <li>(4) Provision of equipment: Projector, Video Camera, Printers, etc.</li> <li>(5) Cost for local consultants and project staff</li> </ol>		<p>Philippine side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) Counterpart personnel: 13</li> <li>(2) Land and facilities: Space for project office in DOT, space for local consultant in the Regional Office, space for mentoring and monitoring activities in the LGU Offices</li> <li>(3) Local cost: Transportation cost and travel expense for training, cost related to mentoring and monitoring</li> </ol>			
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	Project Period	April 2009 –March 2012		Project Cost	(Ex-Ante) 300 million yen (Actual) 216 million yen
Implementing Agency	Department of Tourism (DOT)					
Cooperation Agency in Japan	PACET Corporation					

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

<Special perspectives considered in the ex-post evaluation>

**[Verifiable Indicators for the Outputs and the Project Purpose]**

The Project Design Matrix (PDM) did not define or specify target values for each indicator to verify achievement. Therefore, this ex-post evaluation follows the results of the Terminal Evaluation Report based on the narrative summary defined in the PDM. This evaluation uses the term, “Tourism Development Planning Digest” when discussing Indicator 1 for the Project Purpose instead of the term, “Tourism Development Plan” because former project counterparts are using the term, “Digest” instead of the term, “Plan”.

<sup>1</sup> There are four levels of Local Government Units (LGUs) in the Philippines: Provinces (total 81), Cities (122), Municipalities (1,490), and Barangays (42,028). Barangay is the lowest unit. LGUs are administratively grouped into Regions (total 18) for better coordination with the central government. A Region is not an LGU.

Indicator 2 of the Project Purpose, which refers to the “standard data collection and report system for LGUs”, overlaps with the indicators for Output 3 concerning “database system introduced and used by LGUs”. Therefore, verification of achievement of the Project Purpose was based on the capacity of LGUs to formulate sound action plan for tourism development as the Terminal Evaluation Report had suggested.

## 1 Relevance

<Consistency with Development Policy of Philippine Government at the time of ex-ante evaluation and the project completion>

The project was consistent with the Philippines’ development policy prioritizing development of the tourism industry as set forth in the policy documents including the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (MTPDP 2004-2010), the Philippine Development Plan (PDP 2011-2016) and the National Tourism Development Plan (2011-2016) of DOT.

<Consistency with Development Needs of the Philippines at the time of ex-ante evaluation and the project completion>

The project was consistent with the development needs of the Philippines of collecting reliable tourism statistical data at municipal and provincial levels and in capacitating LGUs on managing tourism statistics to promote sustainable local tourism industry.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy for the Philippines at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan’s Country Assistance Plan (2008) which was geared toward supporting the Philippines development priority on achieving “sustainable economic growth for employment opportunities” including capacity for policy implementation and governance.

<Evaluation Results> In line with the above, the relevance of this project is high.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of project completion>

The Project Purpose was mostly achieved during project completion. Under the project, 76 LGUs including 11 target provinces and 65 municipalities in the three target regions, participated in the three levels of training courses on Tourism Development Planning Training (TDPT), Basic Tourism Statistics Training (BTST) and Advanced Tourism Statistics Training (ATST) developed by the Project. 44 cities/municipalities out of 58 cities/municipalities completing TDPT I-III submitted Tourism Development Planning Digests to their respective provincial offices. All the 76 LGUs that participated in BTST courses started utilizing the tourism database system for data collection, recording and reporting developed by the project.

<Continuation Status of the Project Effects at the time of ex-post evaluation>

After project completion, 5 provinces, 6 cities and 166 municipalities in the three target regions have formulated, approved and implemented their Tourism Development Plans consistent with the National Tourism Development Plan developed by DOT in 2013 to guide LGUs in crafting their own local tourism development plans. The approval and implementation of local tourism development plans was facilitated through supportive LGU leaders and officials. Also, all the 76 LGUs that participated in BTST courses during project implementation have continuously utilized the tourism database system for data collection and reporting to DOT Regional Offices. In addition, 2 of the 11 target provinces have conducted tourist surveys after project completion even though these surveys are not included in LGU’s regular data gathering functions. According to DOT Central Office, 17 LGUs have conducted tourist surveys in 2015. Furthermore, the standardized tourism data management system developed by the project was introduced by DOT to 17 regions except in the Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM) and many of LGUs in the 17 regions are utilizing the standardized formats of collecting and reporting tourism data. The tourism related trainings, such as BTST and ATST have been continuously delivered by DOT Regional offices with trainers from DOT Central office as lecturers. From 2012 to 2015, 61 BTST courses were conducted with 2,055 participants while 7 ATST courses were conducted with 177 participants. However, TDPT course was not conducted after project completion. While outputs from the data collection and compiling activities based on the methodologies delivered by BTST and ATST are pre-requisite for the conduct of TDPT, LGUs have yet completed the visitor surveys and basic and advanced tourism statistical data gathering. Although they have continued implementing the data gathering, they need to have one year (four quarters) worth of the visitor survey and regular compilation of basic tourism statistical data. Also, the fast turn-over of tourism officers and/or person in charge of tourism data gathering and statistical compilation is another reason for the delay of implementation of TDPT. LGUs, in particular small municipalities but with tourism development potentials, are clamoring for TDPT as statistics-based local tourism development plans are required of them to become competitive for accessing national government budgets for local tourism infrastructure projects. TDPT can be provided so long as it has approval and that the requesting LGUs have completed and shown the required outputs.

<Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the time of ex-post evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been mostly achieved. Through the database developed by the project, the recording and reporting on the number of visitor arrivals has been made more accurate in 11 target provinces. Visitor arrivals, which recorded steady increase from 2012 to 2014, have been realistically captured by the recording and reporting system reflecting real growths on visitor arrivals. The increase was found to have been caused by the following: a) aggressive marketing and promotion by DOT and healthy competition amongst provinces and regions, b) improved tourism infrastructure in most of the pilot provinces, and c) increases in the number of domestic flights from Manila to the target provinces as well as international flights in major tourist destinations, such as Cebu, Aklan, Palawan and Negros provinces.<sup>2</sup> However, because of the limited accuracy of data on AE (Accommodation Establishment) occupancies<sup>2</sup>, it is difficult for the ex-post evaluation to confirm real growths of AE occupancies in 8 target provinces which have available data. On the other hand, construction and establishment of new hotel facilities are observed evident in target provinces indicating growing number of tourist arrivals.

<Other Positive and Negative Impacts>

The project contributed to increasing awareness of key players in the government and the private sector on the importance of tourism statistics, in particular for planning of tourism development, including tourism infrastructure. Also, institutionalization of the tourism office in some LGUs has been promoted due to the project. For example, the Provincial government of Capiz passed an Ordinance in June 2015 enacting into law the Tourism Code of the Province. The law enabled the Provincial Government to officially establish and strengthen the Provincial Tourism and Cultural Affairs Office through which the employment of the provincial staff trained by the project was made regular and permanent. Negative impact on natural environment and other social indicators has not been observed.

<sup>2</sup> AE occupancy can be obtained by dividing the number of overnight stays for the total number of bed places by the number of days when the bed places are available in use in a year

<Evaluation Results>

The project achieved improvements on the tourism data management system of LGUs and mostly achieved the sustainable growth of the tourism sector in the target 11 provinces through recording and reporting the real growths of visitor arrivals and the number of establishments of hotel facilities. The tourism data management system introduced by the project has been continuously utilized by not only LGUs participating the project in making their local tourism development plans and programs but also has been used by other LGUs in other regions for collecting and reporting the tourism data. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																																																
<p>(Project Purpose) Improvement of the mechanisms for collecting, reporting and disseminating tourism statistics in a reliable, accurate and timely manner and development of the capacities of DOT and LGUs in formulating tourism development plans.</p>	<p>Indicator 1: Sound Action Plan for Tourism Development Planning.</p>	<p>(Project Completion) Partially achieved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>76 LGUs including 11 Provincial Offices and 65 cities/municipalities with TDPT started to prepare draft tourism development plans.</li> <li>44 cities/municipalities out of 58 cities/municipalities completing TDPT I-III courses submitted Tourism Development Planning Digests to their respective provincial and DOT-Regional offices.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Continued.</p> <p>The number of provinces, cities and municipalities that have formulated, approved and implemented their Tourism Development Plans in 3 target Regions are the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>DOT Region VI( Western Visayas): 2 provinces, 3 cities and 95 municipalities</li> <li>DOT Region IV-B (MIMAROPA): 2 provinces, 2 cities and 71 municipalities</li> <li>DOT Region VII (Central Visayas): 1 province and 1 city.</li> </ul>																																																
	<p>Indicator 2: Placement of the Standard Data Gathering and Reporting System for LGUs with counterpart database software</p>	<p>(Terminal Evaluation) Achieved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The tourism database system including data collection, recording and reporting developed by the project was introduced to and utilized by the LGUs with BTST and ATST trainings.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Continued.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All the 76 LGUs including 11 Provincial Tourism Offices and 65 cities/municipalities in the three target regions completing BTST have continuously utilized the tourism data base system for data collection and reporting to DOT regional offices.</li> <li>The standardized tourism data management system developed by the project has been introduced by DOT to 17 regions except Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM).</li> <li>Many of the LGUs in 17 regions, especially small municipalities, are utilizing the standard formats of collecting and reporting tourism data.</li> <li>DOT Regional Offices have utilized the system for determination of trends in visitor arrivals by nationality, supply and demand for tourism facilities, and provision of tourism statistics to the Department of Public Works and Highways (DPWH), Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) and to other LGUs not covered by the project for planning tourism infrastructure projects.</li> </ul>																																																
<p>(Overall goal) Sustainable growth of the tourism sector</p>	<p>Indicator 1: Growth of visitor arrivals</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In the 11 target provinces, the number of visitor arrivals has increased.</li> </ul> <p>[No. of visitor arrivals in the target provinces]</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="699 1458 1513 1861"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Cebu</td> <td>2,230,323</td> <td>2,616,250</td> <td>3,018,322</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Bohol</td> <td>356,370</td> <td>389,767</td> <td>455,155</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Siquijor</td> <td>33,408</td> <td>33,431</td> <td>40,485</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Palawan</td> <td>743,427</td> <td>791,371</td> <td>928,378</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Negros Oriental</td> <td>307,980</td> <td>470,438</td> <td>519,429</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Negros Occidental</td> <td>1,013,622</td> <td>1,126,583</td> <td>1,235,219</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Guimaras</td> <td>61,188</td> <td>63,421</td> <td>73,833</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Illoilo</td> <td>607,149</td> <td>745,095</td> <td>835,685</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Capiz</td> <td>95,037</td> <td>120,509</td> <td>146,559</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Antique</td> <td>14,506</td> <td>17,786</td> <td>28,097</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Aklan (including Boracay)</td> <td>1,307,516</td> <td>1,492,328</td> <td>1,634,373</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		2012	2013	2014	Cebu	2,230,323	2,616,250	3,018,322	Bohol	356,370	389,767	455,155	Siquijor	33,408	33,431	40,485	Palawan	743,427	791,371	928,378	Negros Oriental	307,980	470,438	519,429	Negros Occidental	1,013,622	1,126,583	1,235,219	Guimaras	61,188	63,421	73,833	Illoilo	607,149	745,095	835,685	Capiz	95,037	120,509	146,559	Antique	14,506	17,786	28,097	Aklan (including Boracay)	1,307,516	1,492,328	1,634,373
		2012	2013	2014																																														
Cebu	2,230,323	2,616,250	3,018,322																																															
Bohol	356,370	389,767	455,155																																															
Siquijor	33,408	33,431	40,485																																															
Palawan	743,427	791,371	928,378																																															
Negros Oriental	307,980	470,438	519,429																																															
Negros Occidental	1,013,622	1,126,583	1,235,219																																															
Guimaras	61,188	63,421	73,833																																															
Illoilo	607,149	745,095	835,685																																															
Capiz	95,037	120,509	146,559																																															
Antique	14,506	17,786	28,097																																															
Aklan (including Boracay)	1,307,516	1,492,328	1,634,373																																															
<p>Indicator 2: Growth of AE occupancy, and other tourism-related activities</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Due to limited accuracy of data, the real growths of AE occupancy has not been confirmed in all 8 target provinces which have available data. Most of the data made available by DOT central office during ex-post evaluation is different from the data collected from the target DOT-Regional Offices and LGUs</li> <li>Construction and establishment of new hotel facilities in LGUs participating in the project is confirmed evidently indicating real growths and growth prospects of tourist arrivals</li> </ul> <p>[AE occupancy in the target provinces]</p>																																																	

	2012	2013	2014	2015 (estimated)
Palawan	40.73%	40.42%	33.66%	N.A.
Negros Oriental	26.00%	46.90%	44.60%	N.A.
Negros Occidental	53.51%	48.23%	50.30%	51.00%
Guimaras	15.95%	5.43%	16.02%	20.00%
Iloilo	29.72%	40.27%	32.30%	34.00%
Capiz	14.50%	39.34%	21.29%	25.00%
Antique	24.16%	38.82%	41.98%	43.00%
Aklan (including Boracay)	31.05%	35.79%	38.54%	39.00%

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Project Completion Report, DOT Central Office, DOT Regional Offices

### 3 Efficiency

Both of the project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 72% and 100%, respectively). Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspects>

There has been no change in the National Tourism Development Plan (2011-2016). The Tourism Act of 2009 (the Republic Act 9593) supports the submission of tourism situations in local destinations and the integration of local and national tourism development plans.

#### <Institutional Aspects>

In terms of DOT, there has been no organizational change in DOT Central Office and Regional Offices. 9 out of 20 staff of the Tourism Statistics and Research Division of the DOT Central Office are in charge of domestic statistics. Both the Central and Regional Offices of DOT are authorized to hire temporary staff from time to time to cover insufficiency of the number of permanent staff. DOT plans to introduce an online/web-based system for data collection, reporting and storage of tourism statistics by 2016. It is expected that the new system will enhance the Tourism Data Management System introduced by the project. In compliance with the Tourism Act of 2009, DOT has continuously delivered the trainings developed by the project particularly BTST and ATST courses. Three of the target LGUs, the provincial government of Aklan and Capiz, and the City of Dumaguete in Negros Oriental province, have created permanent tourism offices in accordance with the Local Government Code of 1991 and assigned permanent staff for such purpose. Local tourism offices of other LGUs are operating with temporary offices and staff seconded from other LGU offices. In 10 provinces surveyed by the ex-post evaluation, LGUs assign at least 2 staffs to their tourism offices which are considered sufficient for data collection and reporting.

#### <Technical Aspects>

DOT personnel trained by the project at the Central and Regional Offices sustained their knowledge and learned skills by continuously conducting BTST and ATST training courses to LGUs. As mentioned above, no TDPT course was delivered after the project completion because no LGU has completed the compilation of the needed data to advance to the TDPT tier. DOT, on the other hand, has dedicated staff to act as lecturers and facilitators and a pool of outside partners for TDPT, if ever LGUs request to deliver TDPT after filling the requirements. The inadequacy in planning skills of LGUs has been slowly addressed by other donors, such as the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), which conducted related trainings from time to time. But the number of LGUs covered by the trainings is limited. The contents of the CIDA and USAID trainings are also different from those introduced by the project. As such, the issue of skills inadequacy of target LGUs on formulating tourism development digest or plans remains unaddressed. The training manual developed by the project was officially endorsed by the DOT Secretary and has been continuously utilized by DOT Central Office, Regional Offices and LGUs. Through continuous delivery of trainings, the DOT trainers have introduced enhancements to the training manuals, hand-outs and presentation materials for better understanding by training participants. In terms of tourism statistics, the DOT staffs at the Central Office became knowledgeable about various data management software applications due to their active participation in the implementation of the project. The DOT Regional Office staffs have sustained their knowledge and skills by conducting regular trainings and mentoring activities to LGUs. LGU staffs trained under the project have sustained their knowledge and skills about tourism statistics and tourism development planning by conducting actual data collection and reporting of local tourism statistics. Also, their knowledge and skills have been disseminated through the regular forums and meetings with AEs and other tourism officers in their localities and in the national level.

#### <Financial Aspects>

The main sources of the budget for the tourism related trainings and the operation of the Tourism Data Management System are the annual regular budgets of DOT and LGUs. While the specific amounts of budget were not made available during ex-post evaluation, it is sufficient to conclude that sufficient budgets are available because more and more LGUs within the target Regions are continuously organizing BTST and ATST courses inviting DOT-central and Regional trainers as lecturers. Also, DOT, in particular, the Central Office ensures budget for any trainings regularly including TDPT. More LGUs are also allocating more budgets for tourism-related activities, such as tourism related festivals and events.

#### <Evaluation Results>

There was no serious problem observed in most of the aspects of sustainability. But most of the municipalities in the 11 target provinces could not utilize the results of tourism data recording for tourism development planning because TDPT course were not delivered to LGUs by DOT after project completion. Therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has achieved the Project Purpose of improving tourism data management system for formulating tourism development plans by LGUs and achieved the Overall Goal of sustainable growth of the tourism sector. The Tourism Data Management System has been effectively utilized by LGUs for data collection and reporting to DOT-Regional offices. The improved quality of tourism statistics produced by the system has contributed to tourism development planning by LGUs and the private sector after the project completion. But trainings on tourism development planning were not delivered after project completion. Because of this, most of the municipalities in the 11 target provinces could not effectively utilize collected tourism statistics for formulating tourism development plans.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations for DOT:

- Review contents and formats introduced by the project for collecting and reporting local tourism statistics and revise as necessary with the view of making the form more user-friendly in line with on-going related projects implemented by DOT with support from CIDA and USAID
- Review training design/module introduced by the project for Tourism Development Planning Training (TDPT) in view of the current developments and priorities of the tourism industry, revise as necessary, pool competent trainers and initiate the conduct of such training to requesting LGUs
- Review and come up with a policy that can institutionalize the standard statistics system for LGUs nationwide and securing the cooperation of private stakeholders of tourism who are the sources of data. This policy could enhance the sustainability of the data compilation as well as ensure that LGUs advance to the next level of trainings on tourism statistics and tourism development planning.

#### Lessons Learned for JICA:

(Logical setting of adequate verifiable indicators for the Outputs, the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal)

- As mentioned in “the Special Perspectives Considered at the Ex-post Evaluation”, PDM for this project did not clearly define or specify the verifiable indicators and their clear target values. Also, some of the indicators for the Outputs, the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal were not logically consistent with each other. In order to adequately and fairly verify achievements by the project, it is inevitable to set logically adequate verifiable indicators for the Outputs, the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal with clear and rational target values at project planning stage.

(Delivery of more effective trainings developed by the project to prepare tourism development plan at the post project period)

- Many municipalities have not completed collecting and compiling basic tourism statistical data which is prerequisite to participate in TDPT and to prepare tourism development plans. In order to make trainings developed by the project more effective for the post project period, support for LGUs to compile basic tourism statistical data should have been incorporated as a part of the project activities. At the project planning stage, it is essential to carefully consider a project scope including training objectives and contents as well as activities related to the trainings introduced by the project.



(Construction of access road to Maruyog Resort in the municipality of Brooke's Point, Palawan province. The project was proposed by the Municipal Tourism Office and was approved and funded under DOT-DPWH Convergence Program.)



(Construction of access road to Maruyog Resort: The necessity of road was verified by the data collected by the Tourism Data Management System which shows an increase in the number of visitor arrivals in the municipality of Brooke's Point.)