

Country Name	Project for Establishment of National Port Policy and Administration System
Kingdom of Cambodia	

I. Project Outline

Background	The civil war in Cambodia, which lasted for almost 20 years, was ended in 1991, and the country joined in World Trade Organization (WTO) in 2004. In order to develop export industries, which is a key to economic development in Cambodia, a provision of competitive maritime transport cost based on a reliable and efficient international maritime transport system was necessary. However, planning, development and operation of individual ports were being carried out without a national port policy, a department solely responsible for port administration and management, a legal framework on port development and operation, and a framework on collection of port statistics.				
Objectives of the Project	Through drafting a national port policy, conducting a pilot project for port statistics survey, drafting port statistics for pilot project ports and preparing a draft port law and related regulations, the project aimed at enhancing the institutional capacity of the implementing agency on planning for national port policy and administrative management that would cover both public and private ports, thereby contributing to enabling ports in Cambodia to be developed and managed according to national port policy. The project objectives set forth are as follows:				
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Port development and administration can be conducted according to national port policy. Project Purpose: Capacity of planning for national port policy and administrative management is developed. 				
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Phnom Penh / Pilot project ports: (1) Autonomous Port of Sihanoukville (PAS), (2) Autonomous Port of Phnom Penh (PPAP), (3) Oknha Mong Port and (4) Tom Nop Rolok Port ((1) and (2) are public ports and (3) and (4) are private ports) Main activities: (1) Develop a method of and formulate required organizational system for national port policy planning through workshops; (2) Draft national port policy; (3) Draft manuals for port data survey method and processing; (4) Conduct a pilot project of port statistics; and (5) Develop key contents of and roadmap for establishment of port related laws and regulations. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 9persons Trainees received in Japan: 6 persons On-the-Job-Training (OJT) in Cambodia: 61 workshops, 15 sub-workshops, etc. Technical Visit to Thailand: 6 persons from Taskforce Team¹ Technical Visit to Vietnam: 6 persons from Taskforce Team Equipment: Lap-top computers and printers Cambodian Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 40 persons Land and facilities: Office rooms, desks, meeting tables, internet connections, etc. 				
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	Project Period	March 2009 to November 2011 ²	Project Cost	246 million yen
Implementing Agency	(main) Ministry of Public Works and Transport (MPWT) (participant) General Department of Transport (GDT) (participant) Autonomous Port of Sihanoukville (PAS) (participant) Autonomous Port of Phnom Penh (PPAP) (participant) Kampuchea Shipping Agency and Brokers (KAMSAB)				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism / The Overseas Coastal Area Development Institute of Japan (OCDI)				

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Cambodia at the time of ex-ante and project completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with Cambodia's development policy on 'improvement of port administration and management' as set forth in the "National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) (2006-2010)", "The Master Plan for Maritime and Port Sectors in the Kingdom of Cambodia (2007)", and "NSDP (update) (2009-2013)" at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Cambodia at the time of ex-ante and project completion></p> <p>The project met the needs for establishment and strengthening of the port administration system in order to strategically develop and manage ports in Cambodia.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy, as stated in the "the Country Assistance Program for Cambodia" (2002), which prioritized a development of institutional infrastructures including legal systems and promotion of internationally competitive industries for</p>

¹ The Taskforce Team is comprised of seven persons including (1) Under Secretary of State, MPWT (Project Director), (2) Deputy Director General, GDT, MPWT (Deputy Project Director), (3) Deputy Director General, PAS (Deputy Project Director), and (4) Deputy Director General, PPAP (Deputy Project Director) and three other members.

² Some reports say project period was up to December 2011. However, this ex-post evaluation defines the completion date to be November 2011 because (i) information source (the project completion report) shows no substantial activity took place in December 2011, and (ii) according to a JICA internal document, the project duration was 33 months (which means the completion date was November), not 34 months.

economic growth of Cambodia.

<Appropriateness of the project project design/approach>

In the ex-ante evaluation, it was assumed that the department in charge of port affairs would be established and the draft port law would be approved after project completion. These assumptions have not been met by the time of ex-post evaluation, and that has negatively affected the sustainability of the project effects (see "4 Sustainability" below). The timeframe of the project may have been underestimated in terms of the time required for organizational restructuring/creating a new department in the government and promulgation of a new law, although the project approach/design was appropriate considering the above-mentioned development needs to achieve project objectives.

<Evaluation Result>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion. Draft national port policy (Indicator 1), draft port law and related regulations (Indicator 2) and draft port statistics for pilot project ports (both public and private) (Indicator 3) were prepared under the project. Project counterparts also learned necessary matters for formulating and authorizing a national port policy and port law and acquired practical knowledge on port statistics.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The national port policy was approved by the Cabinet in May 2013, and there have been reviews of the draft port law at MPWT after project completion. Port data survey and analysis have been continuously conducted at the two pilot project ports (public ports), however, MPWT could not access ports other than these two public ports including the other two pilot project ports (private ports) to confirm whether they prepare port statistics, as MPWT could not access private ports after project completion for confirmation due to lack of legal basis which is expected to be provided by the future port law.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was partially achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. Regarding Indicator 1 "National port policy is authorized and embodied in National Strategic Development Plan", the national port policy was authorized and embodied in NSDP (2014-2018) and the Cambodia Industry Development Strategy (CIDS) (2015-2025). There are two public ports and seven private ports. According to MPWT, these ports are currently developed and managed according to the national port policy. Regarding Indicator 2 "National port statistics are published", the national port statistics³ have not been published yet as the Sub-Decree on Port Statistics, a prerequisite for publication of the national port statistics, has not been formulated and approved yet. According to the MPWT, the Port Law must be enacted before the Sub-Decree on Port Statistics. Regarding Indicator 3 "Authorization in port law progresses according to the roadmap for enactment of port law and related regulations", while the port law was planned to be authorized in 2013, there have been back-and-forth discussions at MPWT on the length and contents of the draft port law, and it has not been authorized yet. However, MPWT is committed to finalize and submit the port law to the Cabinet by the end of 2015. In this context, MPWT has recently established an internal Committee to review Port Law. This Committee is led by Secretary of State. In addition to these three indicators, the approved the National Port Policy also identified additional indicators to monitor, evaluate, revise and occasionally improve its implementation (refer to approved National Port Policy, point 6. Monitoring, Auditing and Evaluation).

<Evaluation Result> The project managed to prepare draft national port policy, a draft port law and draft port statistics for pilot project ports. The national port policy has been embodied in NSDP and CIDS, and several ports are being developed and managed according to the national port policy. However, port data survey and analysis have not been expanded to ports other than the pilot project ports. The degree of achievement of the overall goal is partial at the time of ex-post evaluation as the national port statistics has not been published yet, nor has the port law been authorized. Therefore, effectiveness and impact of the project are fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Capacity of planning for national port policy and administrative management is developed.	1. Draft National Port Policy is drawn up.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved (continued)</u> (Project Completion) Draft national port policy was prepared in October 2011 and accepted at the 6th Joint Coordination Committee (JCC) meeting. (Ex-post Evaluation) The national port policy was approved by the Cabinet on 10 May, 2013. MPWT, cooperated with JICA, conducted a dissemination seminar on 17 October, 2013.
	2. Draft Port Law and related regulations are prepared.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved (continued)</u> (Project Completion) Draft port law and related regulations were prepared in July 2011 and accepted at the 5th JCC meeting. (Ex-post Evaluation) There have been reviews of the draft port law at MPWT. To speed up this review, MPWT has established internal committee.
	3. Port Statistics for pilot project ports are drafted.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved (partially continued)</u> (Project Completion) Port statistics for pilot project ports (both public and private) was prepared in August 2011 and accepted at the 6th JCC meeting. (Ex-post Evaluation) Port data survey and analysis have been continuously conducted at the two pilot project ports, PAS and PPAP (public ports). Collection of data has been conducted daily and reported to relevant authorities on a monthly basis. However, due to lack of regulation on statistic (Sub-Decree), it is rather difficult to sustain statistic collection and report from the two pilot project ports, Oknha Mong and Tom Nop Rolok Port (private ports).
	(Supplemental information) Counterparts enhance their capacity of planning for national port policy and	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved at the time of project completion</u> (Project Completion) According to the interview conducted to the counterparts, their capacity of establishing a port management system and understandings on necessary steps for the national port policy and the port law to be authorized and for national port statistics to be

³ According to the interview with MPWT, the national port statistics should be applied to all ports including public ports and private ones.

	administrative management.	published were considerably enhanced through workshops, training, knowledge sharing and meetings conducted under the project.
(Overall Goal) Port development and administration can be conducted according to national port policy.	1. National Port Policy is authorized and embodied in National Strategic Development Plan.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) The national port policy was approved by the Cabinet in May 2013 and embodied in NSDP (2014-2018) and CIDS 2015-2025. It is available on the website of MPWT. According to MPWT, the national port policy has been utilized and practical in the port development activities in Cambodia.
	2. National Port Statistics are published.	<u>Status of achievement: Not achieved</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) National port statistics has not been published.
	3. Authorization in Port Law progresses according to the roadmap for enactment of Port Law and related regulations.	<u>Status of achievement: Not achieved</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) While the port law was planned to be authorized in 2013, it has not been authorized. MPWT is committed to finalize and submit to the Cabinet by the end of 2015.

Source : Project completion report, internal documents, interviews with MPWT, GDT, PAS and PPAP.

Notes: The project purpose aims to develop “capacity of planning and management”, and its indicators are almost the same as indicators of Outputs, which are to measure the progress of development of the system rather than capacity of human resources. Therefore, this evaluation interprets “capacity of planning and management” as institutional capacity of MPWT in port administration. This evaluation also checks capacity of concerned personnel at the time of project completion as supplementary information for Effectiveness, i.e., whether the counterparts were actually involved in the system development process.

3 Efficiency

The project cost was lower than planned (ratio against the plan: 88%) and the project period was asplanned (ratio against the plan: 100%). Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

NSDP (2014-2018) states that MPWT will enforce laws, provisions and rules related to maritime transport, and the importance of and the need for maritime transport are emphasized in NSDP (2014-2018)⁴, and CIDS (2015-2025) underlines the importance of the National Port Policy, thus calls for the effective implementation of the National Port Policy

<Institutional Aspect>

There had been no department solely responsible for port administration and management in MPWT by the time of project completion. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the structural reform of MPWT is being finalized and it includes the Department of Port Affairs, which is solely responsible for port administration and management, under the General Department of Waterway Transport and Port in MPWT. However, the revised organizational structure has not been approved yet and the Department of Port Affairs has not been officially established. It is a time consuming naturally because this restructuring is on whole ministerial context not individual department..⁵ On the other hand, MPWT established the Private Port Management Committee (PPMC) in April 2011, which is still operational at the time of ex-post evaluation. Major roles and responsibilities of PPMC are to formulate policies on private port development and operation, prepare and/or provide consent for laws and regulations related to private port development and operation to be consistent with the national port system, conduct researches and monitoring on development, operation and management of private ports, and facilitate relevant bodies or authorities to ensure smooth and effective operation and service of private ports.

<Technical Aspect>

The technical level of the Department of Port Affairs cannot be confirmed, as no staff has been assigned to the Department yet. On the other hand, the skill level of staff working for the two pilot project ports (public ports) is considered to be sufficient, as port statistics survey and analysis work have been continuously conducted. According to the two public ports, the Manual of Port Statistics Survey and Analysis, the Guideline for National Port Policy Planning and the Roadmap for Establishment of Port Act and Related Regulations that were produced under the project have been utilized such as for preparing the development plans of container terminals.

<Financial Aspect>

No budget has been allocated to the Department of Port Affairs, as the Department has not been officially established yet.

<Evaluation Result> Major problems have been observed in terms of institutional, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency due to the fact that Department of Port Affairs has not been established yet, despite MPWT’s efforts and works. Therefore, the sustainability of the effects of the project is low.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved its Project Purpose and partially achieved its Overall Goal. Port data survey and analysis have continuously been conducted only in the two pilot project ports and have not been expanded to other ports nationwide. The national port statistics has not been published yet, nor has the port law been authorized. In terms of sustainability, there are major challenges in institutional, technical and financial aspects, as the Department of Port Affairs has not yet been officially established, nor has necessary staff or budget been allocated to the Department.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be Partially Satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

<Recommendations for Implementing Agency (MPWT)>

1. It is recommended to accelerate the finalization of the draft port law, so that it will be authorized as soon as possible. Promulgation of the Port Law is also necessary so that MPWT could have sound legal background to access the private ports which is required to

⁴ Under the sections on “Maritime Transport” and “Transport Planning”.

⁵ In the interview for this ex-post evaluation, MPWT commented the reform of organizational structure of MPWT is already finalized and already includes the Department of Port Affairs under the General Department of Waterway Transport and Port.

prepare complete port statistics.

2. It is recommended to accelerate the approval process of the revised organizational structure of MPWT, which includes the establishment of the Department of Port Affairs.

<Lessons Learned for JICA>

1. Authorizing a law requires a lot of time. Therefore, the timeframe for necessary steps such as preparation of draft law, reviewing draft law, making modification of draft law, and authorization of draft law needs to be carefully set. It should also be noted that the authorization process may be affected by changes of government's priority on making of the concerned law. The progress of each necessary step should be well monitored together with consideration of providing appropriate supports to ensure the draft law is suited to the country's own situation.
2. When planning a project that assumes establishment of a new organizational unit as a condition for achievement of the objective, it is desirable to prepare an alternative plan or at least a temporary arrangement to produce (continue) project effects in case that assumption was not met.



Port Activities of PAS



Port Activities of PPAP