

Country Name	Project for the Construction of Man Cesped National Music Academy
Plurinational State of Bolivia	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	The education reform prioritized basic subjects rather than specialized education such as music and art. Music education was not provided enough in preprimary, primary and secondary schools, and it was supplemented by specialized institutes such as music academies. Under such circumstances, the government made National Plan for Improvement of Music Education in 2005 for which the guidance and support of the Man Cesped National Music Academy (the Academy) was needed as a model music institute. However, the buildings of the academy were decrepit, and musical instruments and audiovisual equipment were insufficient in quantity and quality.				
Objectives of the Project	To improve educational environment of the Man Cesped National Music Academy, by constructing facilities (blocks for instruments, chorus and orchestra/ballet) and procuring musical instruments and audiovisual equipment.				
Outputs of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Project Site: Municipality of Cochabamba</li> <li>2. Japanese side: Construction of facilities (blocks for instruments, chorus and orchestra/ballet) and procurement of musical instruments and audiovisual equipment.</li> <li>3. Bolivian side: (i) ground levelling, (ii) construction of retaining walls and rainwater drainage systems, (iii) construction of other facilities (blocks for administration, normal classrooms, hygiene services and infants), (iv) constructions of outside facilities such as stairs and guards' box, (v) assignment of teachers (vi) installation of electricity, (vii) tax exemption, etc.</li> </ol>				
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	E/N Date	February 5, 2009	Completion Date	August 31, 2010
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 398 million yen, Actual Grant Amount: 367 million yen				
Implementing Agency	Municipality of Cochabamba				
Contracted Agencies	Yokogawa Architects & Engineers, Inc., Tokura Corporation, Mitsubishi Corporation				

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

1 Relevance	<p>This project has been highly consistent with Bolivian development policy at the time of both ex-ante and ex-post evaluation. Improvement of music education was emphasized in the Bolivian Plan for Music Education Improvement (2005), and the new Constitution of the Plurinational State of Bolivia (2009) describes that art education is to be promoted through technical institutes. The Law No. 294 (2012) declares the intangible cultural heritage of the Academy. The project has been in line with needs for appropriate infrastructure, sufficient instruments and specialized teachers for more effective and efficient music education. Also, the project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Priorities in the assistance for Bolivia included the education sector for the country's social development (ODA Data Book for Bolivia 2008). It was also relevant to the objectives of the Cultural Grant Assistance scheme, which are to promote culture and higher education and to preserve cultural heritages.</p> <p>Therefore, relevance of this project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact	<p>This project has partially achieved its objective of "improving the teaching environment of the Man Cesped National Music Academy," with full utilization of all the constructed facility and procured musical instruments audiovisual equipment. The number of the enrolled students actually increased but did not reach the target for 2010. Also, the hours of both the music classes and the time utilizing the specialized classrooms have not reached the target. A major reason for these is the shortage of specialized teachers, and the Academy had decided to receive up to 500 students at maximum to keep the quality of education. On the other hand, the number of the musical events conducted by the Academy reached the target (39 events<sup>1</sup> in 2005 to 88 in 2013). This has been brought about by the increasing request from the community. The events varied from cultural activities to seminars/workshops. Various seminars/workshops have been held for teachers and students both of the Academy and other institutions and also the community. The nearby residents now have more opportunities to enjoy the music, including the concert of the symphony orchestra which was delivered in 2012 for the first time.</p> <p>Much improvement has been observed in the quality aspect. The Academy has become able to conduct large-scale exercises with the constructed facility and procured instruments. Up to eight chorus classes can be performed together, even with the orchestra class. Also, exercises of symphony, wind and folkloric orchestra can be conducted. Besides, the quality of the class has been improved, as admitted by all of the interviewed teachers and students. Teachers commented that "the music classes have been much diversified," "class preparation and presentation have become more appropriate thanks to the audiovisual equipment," etc.. Also, students responded that "classes have become more efficient with improved pedagogic resources and equipment, which resulted in more specialized activities," "Classes are more practical with AV equipment," etc.</p> <p>As for the impacts, first, the Academy has contributed to curriculum development of other music institutes in the country, through experience sharing at the national meeting on the pedagogy of the art education in 2013. Second, the dropout rate has</p>

<sup>1</sup> Although it was mentioned in the Basic Design report that 6 events conducted in 2005, according to the Academy, it conducted 39 events in the same year.

been decreasing at the Academy (30.2% in 2009 to 20.1% in 2013). According to the Academy, well-equipped facility and high quality musical instruments have motivated students for learning in the higher stage within the Academy. No negative impact on the natural impact has been observed. There was no land acquisition or resettlement.

Therefore, effectiveness/impact of this project is fair.

#### Quantitative Effects

Indicator		Target value	Actual value					
		2010 (target year)	2005 (before the project)	2009	2010 (target year)	2011	2012	2013
Number of enrolled students	Preprimary	165	133	146	159	155	151	156
	Primary	400	186	351	382	402	345	334
	Secondary	90	23	31	59	60	50	55
	Tertiary	35	10	12	4	5	11	12
	Total	690	352	540	604	622	557	570
Length of time utilizing the specialized classrooms (hours per week)		500 <sup>(Note)</sup>	246	335	345	366	427	459
Number of events conducted by the Academy (per year)		Increased from 2005	6	n.a.	66	56	88	88

(Note) In the Basic Design Report (2006) P. 28, 679 was actually calculated as total value of time of utilizing the specialized classrooms. However, this figure seemed to be excessive since this figure would be appropriate in the only case that 690 students would fully use the classrooms. Therefore, 500 was calculated approximately twice as many as 246, which is the length of time in 2005, and it was adopted as a target value by JICA.

(Source) the Academy.

#### 3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 92%), project period slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 106%) because the procured equipment was kept in the warehouse for one month<sup>2</sup>. The outputs of the project were produced as planned. Therefore, efficiency of this project is fair.

#### 4 Sustainability

The constructed facility and procured musical instruments and equipment have been operated and maintained by the Academy, in collaboration with the Municipality of Cochabamba. For maintenance of the musical instruments, teachers are assigned by instrument and they also keep the stock of consumables and prepare purchase plans. For special maintenance such as piano tuning and repair of string instruments, luthiers are contracted out when necessary. The technician is sent from the Municipality for maintenance of the facility which was the same system planned at the Implementation Review Survey. As there was the shortage of specialized teachers due to the difficulty of hiring qualified teachers, the Academy has decided to receive up to 500 students at maximum to keep the quality of education. Therefore, at the time of ex-post evaluation, the number of the teachers and staff of the Academy is enough from the perspectives of Sustaining the project effect.

With regard to the technical aspect, teachers of the Academy have generally sufficient academic background and have improved classes by making use of the constructed facility and procured musical instruments<sup>3</sup>, while more expertise are needed for the wind and percussion instruments. For maintenance of the facility, the technicians sent by the Municipality are fully experienced. For the procured audiovisual equipment, the manuals have been available and utilized by the teachers. When there is personnel replacement, all necessary materials are taken over.

In the financial aspect, the Academy has increased both its revenue (US\$ 71,059 in 2010 to US\$ 125,000 in 2014) and expenditure (US\$ 76,920 in 2010 to US\$ 120,000 in 2014). Among the expenditure for 2014, US\$ 16,000<sup>4</sup> was sufficiently assigned for maintenance of the facility and musical instruments. Regarding the major repairs and developments for facility, while the information about the budget of the Municipality for development of school facilities is not available at the time of ex-post evaluation, the Municipality gave additional repair or development works in 2014. The Academy considers that these works are sufficient to cover the needs with regard to operation and maintenance (O&M).

So as to the current status of O&M, most of the procured musical instruments have been maintained appropriately. When there is a breakdown which cannot be dealt with the Academy, it can be asked for the agency of Yamaha or others without difficulty. The facility and equipment have been regularly cleaned and maintained by students and the academic coordinator, and they are all in good condition. There are a few small problems in door hinges, window handles, etc. but they can be dealt with by the Academy. When the Academy needs spare parts and consumables for the facility and equipment, it can be purchased without difficulty.

The project has no problem in the institutional, technical and financial aspects as well as the current status of O&M of the Academy. Therefore, sustainability of this project effect is high.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has partly achieved its objective of "improving the teaching environment of the Man Cesped National Music

<sup>2</sup> In Bolivia, tax exemption was not applicable to the imported goods under the Japanese Grant Aid. The project took time to release equipment from the custom's warehouse because Cochabamba municipal did not have the budget to pay the tax. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the law has modified and Bolivian side was still not allowed to pay for the tax but instead it is required to assure the budget of custom clearance in annual budget when receiving grant to avoid such delay.

<sup>3</sup> JOCV has been working in the Academy for giving advanced lessons and developing the curriculum regarding violin and viola.

<sup>4</sup> This value included US\$ 1,000 "school fund" from the budget of the Municipality which covered minor repair and purchase of consumables for facility and fees for electricity and water was sufficiently covered by the budget of the Municipality.

Academy.” The enrollment has been increasing but did not reach the target as the Academy admit limited the number of students less than the target to keep the quality of education under the shortage of specialized teachers. Also, the length of the specialized classes did not increase as planned due to the lack of skilled teachers, while the Academy has much increased conducted musical events for the community nearby. As for the impact, the Academy has contributed to curriculum development in other institutes, and also the dropout rate has decreased since the project completion. Regarding the efficiency, the project period exceeded the plan, although the cost was within the plan. As for the sustainability, the Academy has no problem.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to implementing agency:

To the Academy:

- It is recommended to identify outstanding students to be trained as specialized teachers so that they can be teachers of the Academy in the short term. Thus, the Academy could conduct sufficient specialized music classes.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- Assuring the budget for the process of tax exemption should be considered prior to the commencement of the Project according to updated law and regulation regarding tax exemption.



(Christmas Concert held at the Academy)



(Specialized Classrooms for Piano )