

## Summary of Terminal Evaluation survey results

<b>1. Summary of the project</b>	
Country : Republic of Indonesia	
Title of the Project : The Project on Mangrove Ecosystem Conservation and Sustainable Use in the ASEAN Region (MECS)	
Issue/Sector : Nature Conservation	
Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation	
Division in Charge : Forestry and Nature Conservation Division 1, Forestry and Nature Conservation Group, Global Environment Dept.	
Total Cost (as of 5 June, 2014) : 2.19 million Yen	
Period of Cooperation	(R/D) : 26 June, 2011-25 June, 2014
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Directorate of Land and Forest Rehabilitation (BRHL), Directorate General of Watershed Management and Social Forestry Development(BPDAS-PS), Ministry of Forestry(MoF), Mangrove Management Centers 1 & 2 (MMCs), administrative agencies of ASEAN member countries responsible for mangroves
	Supporting Organization in Japan : Forestry Agency
(Extension) : None	Other Cooperation Organization :
(F/U) : None	
<b>1-1 Background and overview of the cooperation</b>	
<p>Mangroves are the general term for a group of plants growing in the intertidal zones of tropical and subtropical coastal regions, in particular brackish water areas where seawater and freshwater are mixed. Mangrove ecosystems consisting of interrelationships between mangrove forests with organisms above ground, in water, and in soils therein, and abiotic environments occur uniquely only in limited areas, which are one of the valuable ecosystems that support the biodiversity. Mangrove ecosystems also attract attention from a viewpoint of both mitigation measures and adaptation measures against climate changes, given the fact that while they are also significant as sinks and storage locations of CO<sub>2</sub> with fast growing trees and in deposited mud, they are simultaneously the ecosystems most affected by the sea-level rise due to global warming.</p> <p>Moreover, mangrove forests represent essential natural resources that support livelihoods of coastal people including the value as a place of cultivating rich coastal aquatic resources that mangrove ecosystems contain, tourism resources such as eco-tours, and the value of mangrove forests as disaster-prevention forests contributing to the mitigation of damages caused by tsunami (seismic surges) and storm surges besides providing the value as economic forests such as timber and firewood. In addition, it can be said that mangrove ecosystems are "satoyama (rural natural areas) of the sea" that humans have utilized and maintained, as they have strong human linkages in tropical and subtropical regions, also emphasized as natural resources that the poverty groups left out of the development rely on especially in recent years.</p> <p>On the other hand, mangrove ecosystems are disappearing at a rate of 3-5 times higher than other forest ecosystems, because they occur on the flatland situated on the border of sea and land that is a convenient location for human use and thus are susceptible to the pressure of development by the agriculture, forestry and fisheries industry and other sectors such as the commerce and industry. For</p>	

this reason, there is an urgent need to make efforts for mangrove conservation in consideration of the balance between its protection, restoration, and sustainable use.

Under these circumstances, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) has provided assistance to the Republic of Indonesia (hereinafter referred to as "Indonesia") as the supported party and as the country holding the largest mangrove forests in the world, constituting about 21 % of the worldwide mangrove forest areas [approximately 15.24 million ha, Earthscan (2010)], for mangrove conservation since 1992. Among other things, the fact that the Mangrove Management Centers (MMCs) in Bali and Medan became the formal administrative organization under the jurisdiction of MoF in February 2007 is one of the notable achievements of the JICA cooperation. On the other hand, Indonesia places the conservation of mangrove ecosystems as a national agenda, by which MoF formulated the "National Strategy for Mangrove Ecosystem Management in Indonesia" as its own initiative in 1997. Furthermore, a national strategy was issued by the Presidential Decree in 2012.

In this manner, Indonesia has consolidated a certain system to promote the conservation of mangrove ecosystems within the country, but there are still many regions that require administrative support for conserving mangrove ecosystems in Indonesia having long coastlines. Likewise, urgent needs of conserving mangrove ecosystems are common to Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) countries, not only to Indonesia. Under these circumstances, MoF encompassing the two MMCs to which JICA has provided assistance has been accumulating knowledge and know-how for conserving mangrove ecosystems, expected to play a central role for promoting the conservation of mangrove ecosystems in ASEAN countries including within Indonesia in terms of facilitating the South-South Cooperation.

## **1-2 Content of cooperation**

In order to facilitate the sharing of good practices and lessons of conservation and sustainable use of mangrove ecosystems within the ASEAN region among related organizations and communities, this project aims to: strengthen the capacities of MoF of the Republic of Indonesia for shared learning and facilitation; propose a framework of cooperation required for self-reliant evolution of sharing good practices and lessons learned among related organizations and communities in the ASEAN region; and develop a system of cooperation around MoF of the Republic of Indonesia to contribute to the promotion of conservation and sustainable use of mangrove ecosystems in the ASEAN region.

### **(1) Overall Goal**

Cooperating mechanism to share the good practices and lessons learned regarding the mangrove ecosystem conservation and sustainable use in the ASEAN region is enhanced.

### **(2) Project Purpose**

The cooperating mechanism to share the good practices and lessons learned regarding the mangrove ecosystem conservation and sustainable use in the ASEAN region is developed with MoF of Indonesia becoming the focal point.

### **(3) Outputs**

#### **1) Output 1**

Capacities of Mangrove Management Centre Region I and II ("MMCs") are enhanced to

promote the shared-learning of the good practices and lessons learned regarding the mangrove ecosystem conservation and sustainable use (“the Practices and Lessons”) among the related organizations and communities (“the Stakeholders”) in Indonesia.

2) Output 2

Directorate General of Watershed Management and Social Forestry Development (“WMDSF”) and MMCs become capable to promote the shared-learning of the Practices and Lessons among some of the Stakeholders in the ASEAN region.

3) Output 3

The cooperating mechanism is proposed to the appropriate authorities of the ASEAN to share the Practices and Lessons among the Stakeholders in the ASEAN region.

(4) Inputs (As of 5 June, 2014)

1) Japanese Side: Total amount of financial input 2.19 million Yen

- a) Dispatch of Long-term Experts 3 persons
- b) Dispatch of Short-term Expert 0 person
- c) Acceptance of trainees in Japan 8 persons
- d) Provision of equipment (total amount of equipment in the list)  
Rp.148,685,600 (1,319,287Yen)  
Source of exchange rate: JICA’s official rate for May 2014 (Rp.1=¥0.008873)
- e) Coverage of local costs (total amount of local operating expenses)  
Rp.11,393,634,528.1 (101,095,719Yen) (as of 26/May/2014)  
Source of exchange rate: JICA’s official rate for May 2014 (Rp.1=¥0.008873)
- f) Others  
Rp.0 (0Yen)

2) Indonesian Side:

- a) Assignment of counterparts (C/Ps): 14 persons
- b) Purchase of equipment Rp.0
- c) Coverage of local costs Rp.2,366,389,645
- d) Provision of land and facilities:  
MMC-1 (Bali): Main Project Office; Headquarters of MoF in Jakarta: Sub-Office;  
MMC2 (Medan): Sub-Office
- e) Others: None especially.

**2. Outline of the Evaluation Team**

	Name	Duty	Position / Organization
Mission member	Mr. JINNAI Kei	Leader/ Head	Director, Forestry and Nature Conservation Division 1, Forestry and Nature Conservation Group, Global Environment Dept., JICA
	Ms.TANAKA Satomi	Planning/ Evaluation	Technical Adviser, Forestry and Nature Conservation Division 1, Forestry and Nature

		Analysis	Conservation Group, Global Environment Dept., JICA
Period of Evaluation	1-6 June, 2014		Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation
<b>3. Results of Evaluation</b>			
<b>3-1 Verification of Accomplishments</b>			
<b>3-1-1 Accomplishments of the Project Purpose</b>			
<p>The Project Purpose has already been accomplished.</p> <p>The Indonesian Ministry of Forestry had proposed the establishment of the ASEAN Mangrove Network (AMNET) at ASEAN Senior Officials on Forestry (ASOF) 14 and ASOF15, and the proposal was endorsed at ASOF 16 in Brunei in July 2013. MoF prepared the final version of the Terms of Reference (TOR) and the Rules of Procedure (RoP) for the AMNET intended for the ASOF 17 during the first AMNET meeting in February 2014 in Balikpapan. In addition, Indonesia as the AMNET Secretariat is making preparations to submit proposals and other documents to AFOF 17 which will be convened in Cambodia in June 2014.</p>			
<b>3-1-2 Accomplishment of the Outputs</b>			
<b>(1) Accomplishment of Output 1</b>			
<p>Output 1 has already been achieved.</p> <p>The MMCs and the JICA Project team have performed field surveys, preparation and implementation of workshops, preparation of reports, and other daily tasks together. Their understanding of shared learning was enriched, their coordination work with local governments has become more effective, and their reporting ability was strengthened through these tasks [On the Job Training (OJT)]. In addition, the Counterparts (C/Ps) and other concerned officers participated in the trainings in Japan, acquiring technologies and knowledge of sustainable management of mangrove ecosystems, environmental education, ecotourism, remote sensing, and so on. Moreover, they acquired know-hows and expertise concerning good practices of mangrove ecosystem conservation, services for shared-learning workshops within the ASEAN region, and services for collaboration with the ASEAN through 11 duty trips to ASEAN countries. Seven shared<sup>1</sup>-learning programs in Indonesia in total were carried out between 2012 and 2014, attended by a total of 337 persons and 92% of the participants in the shared learning workshop were satisfied with the contents of its program. Besides, a guideline for shared-learning programs has been prepared and published through reviewing shared-learning workshops, both in English and Bahasa Indonesia. Regarding Symposium, "The ASEAN Symposium on Mangrove Ecosystem Management in Southeast Asia" was held in Surabaya during 27 February – 1 March 2013.</p>			
<b>(2) Accomplishment of Output 2</b>			
<p>It can be determined that Output 2 has been fully achieved, although numerical values have not been set for its indicators in the Project Design Matrix (PDM). All of the activities have been carried out following the Plan of Operations (PO).</p> <p>Shared-learning programs for the ASEAN region were held three times, in which a total of 62</p>			

<sup>1</sup> It is referred to as mutual learning in the PDM, but it should be referred to as shared learning outside the PDM, because it has been termed so since the initiation of the project.

persons participated in workshops, and 87% of the participants in shared-learning programs were satisfied with their contents. In addition, "The ASEAN Symposium on Mangrove Ecosystem Management in Southeast Asia" was held in Surabaya from 27th February to 1st March 2013, in which 59 cases were presented from 12 Southeast Asian countries with more than 200 participants on the first day, 140 participants on the second day, and 150 participants on the third day. *The Surabaya Call for Action* was adopted. The direct observation and discussion with the participants showed their high interest and satisfaction, since most of the participants followed the whole program of the symposium.

**(3) Accomplishment of Output 3**

Output 3 has already been achieved.

The AMNET, the cooperating mechanism for sharing the Practices and Lessons of mangrove ecosystem conservation and sustainable use among the Stakeholders in the ASEAN region, was approved at ASOF 16 in Brunei in July 2013. In addition, the first AMNET meeting was held in Balikpapan, Indonesia in Feb., 2014.

**3-2 Summary of evaluation results**

**(1) Relevance**

The project is still relevant at present.

The Overall Goal meets the needs of Indonesia and the ASEAN. The project goal meets the needs of the executing agency and the target groups. In addition, the Overall Goal is consistent with the policy of Indonesia and Official Development Assistance (ODA) policy of Japan. Technical advantage of Japan was confirmed.

**(2) Effectiveness**

It is determined that the effectiveness of the project is high.

Some of the numerical indicators were not in the PDM, so that the qualitative evaluation was conducted in not all the activities.

Putting all the results together, it is concluded that all the Outputs have already been achieved.

In addition, the Project Purpose has already been achieved. Important assumptions have been fulfilled so far.

**(3) Efficiency**

The efficiency of the project is determined to be moderate.

Inputs were mostly appropriate in timing, quality, quantity, but after the first Chief Adviser and Project Coordinator returned to Japan in two years, there was no longer the input of their successors. Consequently, the expert on participatory ecosystem conservation also served concurrently as the Chief and the Coordinator, which is believed to have imposed a considerable amount of burdens on his multiple services. Outputs 1 to 3 have been already achieved.

**(4) Impact**

The Overall Goal has already been partly achieved. On the other hand, several positive impacts were identified.

With regard to the prospect of achieving the Overall Goal, it was partly achieved as the establishment of the AMNET was approved by the ASOF. The future prospect of achievement of the Overall Goal depends on the sustainability of AMNET. Important assumptions have been fulfilled so far.

Regarding other impacts, some positive impacts (a new unit for mangroves within the Department of Agriculture has established in Surabaya City, the target site for field visit of workshop in Surabaya City became the tourist destination for mangrove forests and the road was paved, Balikpapan City as a host for the workshops and the AMNET meeting, was deepening its linkage with the headquarters of MoF, resulting in an increased momentum for mangrove conservation in Balikpapan, etc.) were identified. Negative impacts were not identified.

#### **(5) Sustainability**

Sustainability of the project activities would be secured in certain activities, such as implementing shared-learning programs. Other activities, such as AMNET, may face some difficulties depending upon the potential donors and other surrounding conditions. Strong commitment from the Ministry is eagerly expected.

Organizational and institutional aspects: It appears that the policy support for conservation and sustainable use of mangrove ecosystems will be continued in the future. Post-project strategy was the development and management of database, implementation of “Surabaya Call for Action”. C/Ps and AMNET Secretariat staff will continue their duty in the future. In addition, the Directorate of Land and Forest Rehabilitation (BRHL), the Directorate General of Watershed Management and Social Forestry Development (BPDAS-PS), and MMCs are believed to have adequate capabilities for operation and management.

Financial aspects: The Indonesian MoF needs to secure a sufficient budget (annual budget, overhead cost and activity cost) for managing shared-learning programs, the AMNET and AMNET Secretariat. Rp.149,200,000 has been secured for the AMNET Secretariat for this year (June-Dec., 2014).

Technical aspects: BRHL, BPDAS-PS, and MMCs have so far carried out the planning, implementation, report writing, and other daily tasks jointly with project experts for shared-learning workshops, regional symposiums, and AMNET management, and it is thought that they already have adequate techniques and knowledge through practical work. It is uncertain whether or not the knowledge and skills that have been transferred to BRHL, BPDAS-PS, and MMCs will be utilized after the end of the project, because a budget required for a sufficient number of shared-learning workshops is not yet secured. As for AMNET management, furthermore, Indonesia has taken the leadership in preparing the TOR, the RoP and the proposal for ASOF 17, but its sustainability is uncertain as the coverage of its activity costs has not yet been ensured.

The deliverables such as the guideline for shared-learning workshops and workshop reports will be utilized, as resource books and references for future activities.

### **3-3 Factors that have contributed to the emergence of effects**

#### **(1) Issues concerning the planning**

Each activity implies the activity that is required to accomplish each Output, and each Output is the Output required to accomplish the Project Purpose “The Cooperating Mechanism is developed through the initiatives of Ministry of Forestry, Indonesia (MoF).”

#### **(2) Issues concerning the implementation process**

- BRHL, BPDAS-PS, and MMCs have so far carried out the planning, implementation, report writing, and other daily tasks jointly with project experts for shared-learning workshops, regional symposiums, and AMNET management, and it is believed that they have adequate techniques and knowledge through practical work.
- Field surveys in ASEAN region have been conducted 11 times, and thus it is believed that the C/Ps’ and stakeholders’ knowledge and capacities for conservation of mangrove ecosystems were strengthened.

### **3-4 Problem areas and factors causing them**

#### **(1) Issues concerning the planning**

Although there were some portions in which numerical values were not set definitely for the PDM indicators, it is thought that there will be no specific problems because project activities have been managed through the revision of the PO, and almost all activities have been carried out.

#### **(2) Issues concerning the implementation process**

The PO has been revised several times, but most of the activities have been in progress as planned, expected to be completed by the end of the project. However, Activity 1-9: National Symposium was cancelled with the intention on the side of the "The National Mangrove Working Group" and MoF.

### **3-5 Conclusions**

The project is still relevant to this day. It is determined that the effectiveness of the project is high, and that its efficiency is moderate. As for its impact, the Overall Goal has partly already been accomplished, while several positive impacts were identified. It is judged that its sustainability could be conceivable, if costs can be covered securely for managing AMNET and shared-learning workshops.

### **3-6 Recommendations (concrete measures, suggestions, advice relating to the project)**

#### **3-6-1 Secure a budget**

The Indonesian Ministry of Forestry shall allocate the operational budget for AMNET Secretariat, and necessary to find donors for financial support AMNET activities.

#### **3-6-2 Database Development**

- (1) Regarding documentation of case studies, good practices and lessons learned, some kinds of

measures should be adopted to accumulate data and information at MMCs and BRHL effectively and efficiently. Reports of surveys and business trips have been submitted, and maximum use of these reports should be explored.<sup>2</sup>

- (2) In order to facilitate data collection and accumulation, format of the report of surveys / business trips may need to be revised to make it easy to extract data fitting into the database. A nice design and format of the report may be developed, which encourages the officers to provide all the valuable information they have / discover, to improve their skills in report writing, and to manage the quality of the reports<sup>3</sup>
- (3) Other issues to consider would include; How to share and use information in the database, and who are allowed to access the database. Rules and Regulations should be developed on the management and utilization of the database.<sup>4</sup>

In addition, it is necessary to consider how to publish such database information on the website of MoF while limiting users that can access them and determine persons responsible for the database management, if possible.

### **3-6-3 A Guideline for Shared-Learning Workshops**

- (1) The Shared-Learning Workshops, that MECS Project has been organizing, are costly for organizer to bear expenditure of participants' flights and accommodations, transport for field visits, venues, etc. Shared-Learning, however, is not necessarily done in a form of workshop, but can be applied in daily activities. Depending on the budget and other resources available, the ideas in the guideline can be applied flexibly to any forms of activities. Further discussions and follow-ups may be required to fully explore the potential of the guideline.<sup>5</sup>
- (2) The guideline does not discuss logistic and administrative aspects of Shared-Learning Workshops. These aspects may vary widely based on conditions and environment, particularly in the times of rapid inflation and a transition period of de-centralization. The officers therefore need to arrange logistic and administrative issues according to the working conditions and environment. Such flexibility would be another issue for the management of the Shared-Learning programs in the future.<sup>6</sup>

### **3-6-4 AMNET**

- (1) In some ASEAN countries, governmental organization in charge of mangrove is different from that in charge of ASOF, which requires careful coordination and arrangements in invitation protocol and other administrative arrangements for AMNET-related activities. Even if National Coordinators/ Coordinating Units, who are supposed to be the focal point, are developed in respective countries, AMNET activities should be reported to ASOF in every country. Some kinds of measure/ system to secure such domestic coordination should be discussed and adopted.<sup>7</sup>
- (2) AMNET would encourage data collection and database development as discussed above. Including factsheet development, how to collect information, what information to collect,

<sup>2</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.

<sup>3</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.

<sup>4</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.

<sup>5</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.

<sup>6</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.

<sup>7</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.



who can access such information, and who and how to manage the database may need to be discussed further. AMNET Secretariat would be expected to take initiatives for compiling and drafting the idea and coordinating with the members.<sup>8</sup>

- (3) ASEC's support would be very helpful to smoothly operate and manage AMNET. Good coordination and close communication between ASEC and AMNET Secretariat should be maintained and further strengthened.<sup>9</sup>

### **3-6-5 Surabaya Call for Action**

"Surabaya Call for Action on Mainstreaming Mangrove Ecosystem Management in Southeast Asia" was developed in ASEAN Regional Symposium in March 2013. This is an achievement of the Symposium, and putting it into practice across the Southeast Asian Nations should be pursued. AMNET need to discuss its application to their concrete activities.<sup>10</sup>

## **3-7 Lessons Learned** (matters that will be helpful for exploring, formulating, implementing, and administering other similar projects, derived from this project)

### **3-7-1 Collaboration and partnership with ASEAN modality**

This Japan/Indonesia bilateral project has successfully contributed to the proposal and establishment of AMNET as an ASEAN knowledge network modality. In the course of the process, JICA, as an agency of non-ASEAN Members States, took cautious and indirect approach to discussions among ASEAN Members States (AMS) on the matter in respecting guidance of ASEAN Secretariat (ASEC) and intention of Indonesia. Such a protocol is a lesson learned by JICA, and is to be fed to future planning and management of project for support of ASEAN modality, whose ownership and responsibility is solely under AMS.

### **3-7-2 Shared-learning workshop**

- (1) A total of eight shared-learning workshops were held, for which the C/Ps carried out the coordination, workshop preparations and implementation, and report writing together with project experts and staff. It is judged that the C/Ps acquired the knowledge and techniques on shared-learning workshops sufficiently through a series of these kinds of collaborative work. It is believed that this type of participatory activity implementation can be applied to other projects.
- (2) Involvement of the host sites, particularly local governments, in preparation is crucial for good coordination, effective implementation, and functional follow-up and monitoring of Shared-Learning Workshops. Prior discussion on role sharing would facilitate the post-workshop activities effectively.

## **3-8 Follow-up situations**

None.

<sup>8</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia, and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.

<sup>9</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.

<sup>10</sup> Ministry of Forestry Indonesia and Japan International Cooperation Agency (2014). *Final report of the MECS Project*.