

## Summary of the Terminal Evaluation

<b>1 Outline of the Project</b>	
Country: The Royal Government of Cambodia	Project Title: The Capacity Development for Implementing the Organic Law at Capital and Provincial Level (PILAC2)
Issue/Sector: Governance	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge: JICA Cambodia Office	Total cost: 448,000,000 yen (As of January 16, 2015)
Period of Cooperation: March 2010 – March 2015 (Five years)	Partner Country’s Implementing Organization: Sub-National Administration Capacity and Human Resource Development Office (SCHRDO), Policy Analysis and Development Division (PADD), National Committee for Sub-National Democratic Development Secretariat (NCDDS) <sup>4</sup>
<p><b>1.1 Background of the Project</b></p> <p>In the Rectangular Strategy and the National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP), the Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) regards good governance as a pre-condition to achieve the sustainable, steady, and equitable socio-economic development, equal opportunity, equality before law, and social justice. In those national development policies, the Decentralization and Deconcentration (D&amp;D) locates in one of the major reforms to promote good governance, namely the Public Administration Reforms.</p> <p>In this regard, for actual examples, the RGC promulgated the Law on Administrative Management of the Capital, Provinces, Municipalities, Districts, and Khans in 2008 which defines the roles and functions of the Sub-National Administration (SNA) except Communes and Sangkats; created the National Committee for Sub-National Democratic Development (NCDD) which is chaired by the Minister of Interior in 2009; and formulated the National Program for Sub-National Democratic Development (NP-SNDD) in 2010 and the First Three Years Implementation Plan of NP-SNDD (IP3) in 2011.</p> <p>Receiving the official request from the RGC, the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) implemented the technical cooperation project named the Project on Improvement of Local Administration (PILAC) for the purpose of the human resource development for the period of three years from January 2007 to January 2010. Through the PILAC’s support to strengthen the training management capacity on local administration at the Ministry of Interior and the Provincial Halls, JICA strived to enhance the knowledge of the central and sub-national government officers.</p> <p>At that time, there was a situation observed where most of development partners tended to support development of laws and institutions; and provision of various trainings at the Commune and Sangkat level while they did seldom work on the support on formulation, implementation, and management of the Capital and Provincial Five-Year Development Plan (CPDP) and the Capital and Provincial Three-Year Rolling Investment Program (CPIP). Acknowledging the situation, RGC requested the formulation and implementation of another technical cooperation project to strengthen local administrative capacity including the support for the system building on the human resource development. The project was expected to enable the national and sub-national administration officers; and the councilors at the capital and provincial level to formulate, implement, and monitor CPDP and CPIP of the localities, with full utilization</p>	

<sup>4</sup> The C/P of PILAC2 was changed from the Capacity Development and Information Unit (CDIU) to SCHRDO/PADD due to restructuring of NCDDS in early 2012.

of knowledge and experience of PILAC.

In this connection, the Project for the Capacity Development for Implementing the Organic Law at Capital and Provincial Level, alias PILAC 2, was formulated and being implemented for the period of five years from March 2010 to March 2015, in cooperation with the NCDD as the counterpart of the project.

## 1.2 Project Overview

**(1) Overall Goal:** A strategic system to formulate and manage 5-year development plans and 3 year rolling investment programs is operationalized at capital and provincial level with stronger ownership aiming at improving socio-economic situations.

**(2) Project Purpose:** Capacity of local administration at capital and provincial level to formulate and manage 5-year development plans and 3-year rolling investment programs is established.

### (3) Outputs:

1. Issues on human resource development and countermeasures in relation to local administration management and human resource development are identified by NCDD.
2. Operational procedures and practices related to formulation and management of 5-year development plans and 3-year rolling investment programs at capital and provincial level are structured by NCDD.
3. The capacity of capital and provincial councilors and relevant officers to implement local administration management to formulate and manage 5-year development plans and 3-year rolling investment programs are systematically enhanced by SCHRDO/PADD and supporting agencies.

### (4) Inputs (At the time of the Terminal Evaluation)

#### Japanese side

- Experts in five (5) specialized areas have been dispatched to Cambodia up to date.
- Personal Computer valued Japanese Yen 173,880 was purchased.
- Japanese Yen 7.2 million as allocated for training activities, employment of local staff, and project operation and maintenance cost as of January 2015, according to the Chief Advisor of the project.
- Thirteen (13) of C/P were dispatched for training in Japan.
- Five (5) of C/P were dispatched to third country training in Indonesia, eight (8) were to Singapore.

#### Cambodian side

- Twenty seven (27) officials from NCDD are appointed as main C/P.
- Project office including utilities in NCDD has been provided for Japanese experts and Khmer staff of the project.

## 2 Evaluation Team

Cambodian side	H.E. Sak Setha, Secretary of State, Ministry of Interior (MOI), Chairperson, NCDD Secretariat (Project Director) H.E. Duch Sonn, Director General of Local Administration, MOI; Deputy Chairperson, NCDD Secretariat (Project Manager)
Japanese side	Mr. Takeharu Kojima, Senior Representative, JICA Cambodia Office Mr. Hirofumi Kawakita, Senior Advisor, JICA Mr. Eiichiro Hayashi, Project Formulation Advisor, JICA Cambodia Office

Japanese side	Ms. Yuko Aoki, Consultant (Evaluation Analysis), Kokusai Kogyo Co., Ltd. Mr. Phok Phira, Program Officer, JICA Cambodia Office
Period	January 4 - 16, 2015

### 3 Results of Evaluation

#### 3.1 Achievement of the Project Purpose

Project Purpose: Capacity of local administration at capital and provincial level to formulate and manage CPDPs and CPIPs is established.

Stated as follows, PILAC2 has almost achieved its goal in terms of assisting all stakeholders at capital and provinces to formulate CPDP and CPIP.

<b>Indicator 1</b> CPDP and CPIP are formulated by capital and all provinces.	<i>The indicator 1 has been already achieved, as CPDP and CPIP were formulated by the capital and all provinces in 2011.</i>
<b>Indicator 2</b> CPIPs are revised by capital and all provinces every year.	<i>The indicator 2 has been already achieved, as CPIPs were revised in 2012 and 2013 by the capital and 17 provinces out of 20 collected answered of PILAC2 survey. Number of provinces is 24 in the country.</i>
<b>Indicator 3</b> Capital and provincial councils are able to monitor and analyze the changes of basic regional socio-economic situations for CPIP in capital and all provinces.	<i>The indicator 3 has not been achieved yet at the time of terminal evaluation. “Monitoring strategies of CPDP (2014) “which is the means of verification of the Indicator 3, in the capital and all provinces are in the middle of formulation. However, the dead line of the finalization of CPDP is May 2016 by law<sup>5</sup>. Capital and all provinces already formulated and approved by the council the Planning Calendar which shows formulation and monitoring schedule of CPDP and CPIP. It is prospected that CPDP (2014) will be formulated and monitored according to the Planning Calendar.</i>

#### 3.2 Achievement of Outputs

The following are the achievements of the three Outputs based on the Objectively Verifiable Indicators in PDM2.

Output1 was achieved. Situation analysis report on local administration management and human resources in local administration was formulated and approved by NCDD. And Human Resource Development Strategy for local administration management was also formulated based on situational analysis report, was formulated and approved by NCDD.

Output2 was also achieved. Operation guidelines on CPDP and CPIP were revised, and officially approved as an inter-ministerial Prakas<sup>6</sup> of MOI and Ministry of Planning (MOP) on 30 Oct. 2013. Operation manuals were submitted to NCDDS and utilized in the training courses as public documents. Leader of NCDDS

<sup>5</sup> “Sub-Decree on the Amendment of Article 12 of Sub-decree on Development Plan and Three-year Rolling Investment Program at Capital, Provinces, Municipalities, Districts, Khans” defines that CPDP and CPIP shall be formulated within two years after the provincial council election.

<sup>6</sup> Prakas means “Ministerial Order” in Khmer.

Working Group (WG) was deeply involved in formulation of the manuals.

Output3 was not achieved. Knowledge level was not improved by 25% in 2014. *The indicator 3-1 “Knowledge level of the training participants related to the 5-year development plan and 3-year rolling investment program is improved by 25% in 2014.” has not been achieved.* Analysis of the results on the knowledge test was conducted by PILAC2 though; the reason of the lower improvement could not be clarified.

### **3.3 Summary of Evaluation Results**

The Team confirmed that Inputs, Activities, Outputs and Project Purpose defined in PDM2 are mostly in progress or largely accomplished. The progress of the project from five evaluation criteria is summarized as follows:

#### **Relevance**

High. PILAC2 aligns with the laws and policies related to the D&D reform. PILAC2 met needs of NCDDS to promote formulation of CPDP and CPIP at the Capital and provincial level. The project also aligns with the policy of Japan to support RGC. The project meets the needs of NCDDS. The steadily progress of project activities are highly evaluated.

#### **Effectiveness**

High. CPDP and CPIP were formulated in 2011, at the capital and all provinces for the first time and approved by the respective councils, which proved the capacity of local administration is largely established. The new CPDP after the election in May 2014 are now in progress in the capital and all provinces by following the revised guideline of CPDP and CPIP. The dead line of the CPDP completion is May 2016. The Capital and all provinces completed formulation and approved the planning calendar for the new CPDP and CPIP. All the process of CPDP and CPIP will be proceeded on schedule.

#### **Efficiency**

High. The project activities of PILAC2 flexibly adopted the actual situation and changed the contents. It made the project’s input effectively utilized to deliver the outcomes. Output 1 and 2 were achieved, and it is highly prospected that Output3 will be achieved by the continuous efforts of all stakeholders. The training courses in Japan and the third county were also effectively implemented; the trainees are applying what they learnt from the training to their works. There were changes of plan at the middle of project period as a result of JICA Consulting Survey in January 2012 though, PILAC2 corresponded the change of activities by adjusting the dispatch of experts.

#### **Impact**

High. It is prospected that the Overall Goal will be achieved as the Planning Calendar was approved and the process is going on schedule at Capital and all provinces. Another remarkable impact was the establishment of the Training Department in MOI, most of the NCDDSWG member will be transferred to the department.

#### **Sustainability**

Moderate. The Training Department in MOI will succeed and develop the PILAC2’s experiences and knowledge. The department is expected to play central roles in the training system plan to be established

in IP3-II. However, financial sustainability to run the system needs to be well established. In addition to that, for realization of CPDP and CPIP, it is necessary to create financial sources for efficient and effective development planning and programming at the capital and provincial level.

### **3.4 Contributing / hindering factors for achievement of the Outputs**

#### **● Contributing factors**

- The cascade style of training functioned efficiently and effectively to disseminate skills and knowledge to formulate CPDP and CPIP for thousands stakeholders in short period of time.
- Based on the strong leadership and ownership of the Project Director, and the strong relationship of mutual trust between NCDDS/MOI and Japanese side since PILAC (2007-2010), PILAC2 was conducted. For example, with the initiative of NCDD, Inter-Ministerial Prakas of MOI and MOP for revision of the guideline was made.

#### **● Hindering factors**

- As coping with reorganization process of NCDDS, PILAC2 started a survey on situation analysis of organizations and human resource of SNAs a half year later than the original schedule.
- The project activities for revision of the operation guideline on CPDP and CPIP were behind the schedule due to the delay of signing of the Policy on Planning System at Sub-National Level. In order to follow the CPDP formulation schedule, the revision started prior to the policy endorsement with the approval of NCDD. However, the approval of the guideline as the inter-ministerial Prakas of MOI and MOP was also delayed. The Project activities had to be delayed for three months.

### **3.5 Conclusion**

The overall result of the evaluation is high except the sustainability because PILAC2 has achieved the project purpose of developing the capacity for development planning in the Capital and all provinces, where CPDP and CPIP were produced in 2011 and the second CPDP are in progress. As for the sustainability, the organizational sustainability is going to be ready as the Training Department is going to be established. However, the financial source for the actual activities is not clear yet. Also the financial sources to implement the CPIP listed project are necessary to continue conducting CPDP at Capital and provincial level.

### **3.6 Recommendations**

The Team has confirmed that the expected outputs have been achieved without any critical problem, though with some delay in the implementation of the project. The Team has also observed the progress and lessons learnt through this study. Based on these observations, the Team would like to make recommendations as below:

#### **(1) Efforts to internalize and further develop knowledge and experience acquired from PILAC2**

The Team already confirmed the effectiveness and impact of the PILAC2 activities. Therefore, the Team requests NCDD to succeed the achievements of PILAC2 through internalization into MOI and further develop them to improve the quality of the current guideline and manual to meet the local needs with the strong leadership and division of responsibility of relevant institutions at the national and sub-national levels. In this regard, the creation of the Training Department in MOI is perceived to be a positive sign of

the willingness of NCDD. The Team, moreover, emphasizes the financial allocation is critical to conduct for the cascade training and revise the guideline and manual of CPDP and CPIP.

**(2) Enhancement of financial and monitoring mechanism to implement CPDP and CPIP in the capital and provinces**

Although importance of financial capacity of SNA has been highlighted in several key documents of D&D, the financial resource is not sufficient currently to achieve the objectives of CPDP and implement the projects of CPIP. In order to establish the concrete development mechanism of CPDP and CPIP, the Team believes that the implementation of the projects listed in CPIP would be essential. Therefore, the Team recommends the concerned ministries under NCDD to establish the clear linkage between the budget formulation and the CPDP and CPIP implementation.

In addition to that, the monitoring of CPDP and CPIP is another necessary mechanism to ensure the impact of development at the capital and provincial level. In this regard, the Team requests that MOI and the capital and provincial administrations to strengthen the monitoring mechanism to examine the situation of existing CPDP and CPIP, as feedbacks and lessons learnt for formulation of the next CPDP and CPIP, with enough human and financial resources.

**(3) Efficient coordination and communication among the concerned ministries under NCDD**

Through this study, the Team has observed that there is a room to improve the coordination and communication on the planning system at the sub-national level among the concerned ministries, such as MOI, MOP and MEF under NCDD. The Team recommends, therefore, the concerned ministries under NCDD should organize a high level meeting at appropriate timing for the improvement of CPDP and CPIP from the practical and realistic viewpoint.