

Country Name	The Project for Construction of Primary Schools in Phnom Penh (Phase III)
Kingdom of Cambodia	

I. Project Outline

Background	The enrolment rate at primary level (6 years) had risen since the 1990s in Cambodia. While the population growth rate was 1.5% on the one hand, the Net Enrolment Rate jumped up from 69% in 1991 to 91% in 2005 on the other. Consequently, the school facilities were in serious shortage. Especially in Phnom Penh, the student-classroom ratio was 63.9, surpassing the standard of 50 determined by the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS), and therefore, most of the schools ended up operating under the double or the triple shifts to meet the standard. Moreover, some of the existing classrooms were dilapidated, which negatively impacted the improvement of quality education in Phnom Penh.				
Objectives of the Project	To improve the quality of primary education environment in Phnom Penh by constructing school facilities (school buildings and toilets) and procuring furniture, and thereby to contribute to the improvement of education quality in Phnom Penh				
Outputs of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project Site: 7 schools in Phnom Penh 2. Japanese side: (1) Construction of school buildings (96 classrooms in 7 schools) and toilets (6 schools)*, (2) procurement of furniture (student desks/chairs and whiteboards) * Reconstruction of existing 7 schools 3. Cambodian side: (1) To obtain the necessary land to implement the project, (2) To demolish the existing buildings, and to fill and clear the land prior to the project construction, (3) to provide the necessary landscaping work, fence construction and other incidental exterior work and others 				
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	E/N Date	15 June, 2009	Completion Date	24 May, 2011
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit: 524 million yen, Actual Grant Amount: 436 million yen				
Implementing Agency	Phnom Penh Capital City				
Contracted Agencies	Mohri, Architect & Associates, Inc., Daiho Corporation				

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p>Consistency with development policy of Cambodia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and ex-post evaluation</p> <p>This project has been highly consistent with Cambodia's development policy as equal access to education and improvement of quality of education has been prioritized in policy documents such as Education Strategic Plan (ESP) (2006-2010), ESP (2014-2018), and Annual Operational Plan 2014 and 2015.</p> <p>Consistency with development needs of Cambodia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and ex-post evaluation</p> <p>The project has been also highly relevant with development needs of Cambodia both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and ex-post evaluation. Before the project implementation in Phnom Penh, the school facilities were in serious shortage, and the student-classroom ratio surpassed the standard of 50. At the time of ex-post evaluation, although the school environment has been improved a lot for which this project has contributed, there is still space and needs for further improvement as the current student-per classroom ratio of 51 in Phnom Penh as a whole still surpasses 45 which is newly set in ESP (2014-2018).</p> <p>Consistency with Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation</p> <p>The project was also consistent with Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation as Country Assistance Program to Cambodia (2002) prioritized Basic Human Needs under the category of support for the vulnerable.</p> <p>Evaluation result</p> <p>In light of the above, relevance of this project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact
<p>Effectiveness</p> <p>The project has achieved its objectives, "to improve the quality of primary education environment". It was observed that the number of classrooms which are in good education environment and the number of students have increased. As a result of the increase in the number of classrooms, the triple-shift operation was abolished at the target schools as the project envisaged. The number of students per classrooms has reached the target set in ESP as the average ratio of the target schools in 2011/2012 (project completion) and 2014/2015 (Ex-post evaluation) was 38 and 42 respectively. The number of students at the target school has not reached the target partly because the current economic and social development trend of Phnom Penh. Because of the gradual economic growth in the city center, people are tending to move outside the city and therefore the number of students in the schools in the city center is decreasing slightly, while there are plenty numbers of students are gradually increasing in outskirts target schools and they need to build more classrooms. Besides, some schools in the city center are piloting single-shift operation in accordance with the reform of MoEYS that aims to introduce single-shift in the near future to achieve the top agenda of MoEYS: improvement of the quality of education.</p> <p>The classrooms, toilets and furniture constructed and procured by the project are in good condition and fully used. Students, teachers and School Supporting Committees (SSC)¹ are satisfied with the quality of the classrooms and toilets as they are having large classrooms, clean, and good environment and sufficient water supply at the toilets.</p> <p>Impact</p> <p>As a result of improvement of educational environment, students are motivated, they come to class more often, and they are less absent relative to the situation before the project. Responses from the questionnaires informed that the number of students who are in bad health such as diarrhea has decreased significantly at each target school after the construction of toilets. In addition, there was a change in girls'</p>

¹ A school supporting organization which consist of teachers, parents, leaders in a community and others

attendance after the construction of toilets. After the project implementation, girl students come to school regularly and the number of girl student enrollment has increased, as some toilet booths has been appropriated to girl students.

No negative impacts on natural environment were observed and no land acquisition occurred under this project.

Evaluation result

In light of the above, effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Quantitative Effects

Indicator	Before the project School Year 2007/2008(*1) (Actual)	Target figure at target year (School year 2010/2011)	Actual Figure at project completion (School year 2011/2012)	Actual Figure at the year of Ex-post evaluation (School year 2014/2015)
Indicator 1: The number of classrooms in good education environment at the target schools and the number of students	29 (2,784)	125 (12,000) (*3)	123(*2) (8,681)	123 (9,722)
Indicator 2 The number of target schools which operates the triple-shift	3 schools	0 schools	0 schools	0 schools

Note : (*1) School year starts in October and ends in July. (*2) Two classrooms are used as teachers' rooms at one school. (*3) 48 students per classroom, double-shift

Source : JICA internal documents, questionnaires/interviews of the target schools

3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 83%), project period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 123%). The implementation delayed partly because the design for pile works needed to be changed. In addition, the land area of the project site was very small and sufficient space of construction yard was not secured, which in turn, lowered the construction efficiency. The outputs of the project were produced as planned.

Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

Institutional aspect

The number of teachers assigned to the target schools is mostly appropriate and no problem is observed. Operation and Maintenance (O&M) of school facilities and equipment is carried out by each school. The target schools and SSC have produced and implemented annual maintenance work plan and the target schools have developed regular maintenance and cleaning schedule. Regular cleaning of classrooms, toilets and schoolyard is carried out by teachers and students. Simple maintenance work such as repair of windows and furniture is undertaken by craft teachers, while difficult maintenance work is contracted out to companies. The roles of Phnom Penh Municipality of Education, Youth and Sports Department (PPDoE) are to instruct schools to maintain and repair equipment and facilities. If large repair is necessary, PPDoE will propose maintenance and repair work plan to MoEYS.

Technical Aspect

There is no problem in the maintenance skill as large scale of maintenance and repair is undertaken by contracted companies. Small scale maintenance is carried out by schools by referring to guidelines developed under the technical assistance (soft-component) of the preceding (phase 2) project.

Financial Aspect

Each school has appropriate budget for annual activities including budget for maintenance. Budget allocated by MoEYS to each school is somehow increasing. In addition, when the budget in shortage, each school uses other sources such as parking space income and vendors' monthly rent and/or asks local communities for donations through a SSC when necessary. Further, the schools are able to request more for Phnom Penh City Hall or PP DoE for the larger repair.

Current Status of O&M

The school facilities and equipment were found to be reasonably in good condition at the time of ex-post evaluation, although minor problems were observed such as conditions of windows, doors and lightning switches. Students break lightning switches too often so that the schools ended up with not replacing the unnecessary ones. All schools have some problems in drainage systems at floors of toilet areas².

Evaluation result

There is no problem in institutional, technical and financial aspects. Even though the current status of O&M seems to have room for improvement, sustainability of the effects of the project is high.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project has achieved its objectives, "to improve the quality of primary education environment" as it was observed that the number of classrooms which are in good education environment and the number of students have increased. As a result, the triple-shift operation was abolished at the target schools as the project envisaged. Positive impacts were observed in improvement in students' attendance, especially of girl students. As for sustainability, there is no problem in institutional, technical and financial aspects as well as the current status of O&M. Regarding efficiency, project period exceeded the plan.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to implementing agency:

PP DoE should continue conducting monitoring and supervision to each school for giving technical advice on operation and maintenance

² After cleaning the floor tile, dirty water was spilled over the floor and stair case because some drained holes are clogged with soil that is brought along with students' shoes. PP DoE has some technical discussion with contractors for the future measures.

of facility and equipment. In that process, PP DoE should utilize the guidelines on maintenance and repair developed under the technical assistance (soft-component) of the preceding (phase 2) project, and it shall be copied and distributed to each target schools of phase 3 if it is necessary.

Lessons learned for JICA:

In a school construction project, it is rather commonplace to have some minor problems in terms of the maintenance of facilities & equipment a few years after the project completion because their main users are young children and the frequency of use is very high. Therefore, the necessary measure to be taken first is to investigate the post-situation of schools which were constructed by past similar projects, to understand what kind of problems happened in those schools and to design accordingly on the observations. Then, it is necessary to take some concrete measures in a new project (ex. to use tougher materials, to set a cover on switch etc.) .

Moreover, it is also effective to develop a guideline for proper use of facilities & equipment under a “soft component” and to provide trainings to school principal and teachers about it in a project so that they can properly guide children afterward.



A front view of one of the school building



Learning activities in a new classroom