

Summary of Terminal Evaluation

1. Outline of the Project									
Country : Islamic Republic of Afghanistan	Project Title : Project for Strengthening of Teacher Education Program Phase 3 (STEP 3)								
Issue / Sector : Education	Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation Project								
Division in Charge : Human Development Department	Total Cost : 278 million yen								
Period of Cooperation	February 2011 – January 2015 (4 years)								
	<table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 33%;">Partner</td> <td style="width: 33%;">Country's</td> <td style="width: 33%;">Implementation</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Organization : Ministry of Education, Teacher Education Department</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Cooperation Organization (Japanese side) : Naruto University of Education</td> </tr> </table>	Partner	Country's	Implementation	Organization : Ministry of Education, Teacher Education Department			Cooperation Organization (Japanese side) : Naruto University of Education	
Partner	Country's	Implementation							
Organization : Ministry of Education, Teacher Education Department									
Cooperation Organization (Japanese side) : Naruto University of Education									
1-1 Background of the Project									
<p>In an effort of reconstructing the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, the “Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS)” regards education as one of the most important sectors in need of assistance from international community. Furthermore, the Ministry of Education (MoE) set force the “National Education Strategy Plan (NSEP)II” which identifies various assistance needs in the education sector from 2010 to 2014 including the improvement of access and quality of education and capacity building of MoE itself.</p> <p>In line with the strategies above delineated by the Government of Afghanistan, the Japan International Corporation Agency (JICA) implemented technical cooperation projects, namely “Strengthening Teacher Education Program”(STEP) and Phase 2 (STEP 2) to improve teaching skills of primary school teachers from 2005 to 2010. After STEP and STEP 2, JICA has implemented the “Strengthening Teacher Education Program Phase 3 (STEP 3, “the Project”) since 2011. Originally, STEP 3 aimed to strengthen school-level activities for improving lessons according to the Teacher Standards in the Model Areas and Sub-Model Areas. However, due to deteriorated security situation of Afghanistan, the project modality was forced to be changed and STEP 3 narrowed its focus to the improvement of lessons at TTCs and primary schools in the Model Areas.</p> <p>From August to October, in 2014, the Japanese Terminal Evaluation Team, headed by Mr. Satoru Takahashi, conducted the terminal evaluation study together with the Afghan Review Team to ascertain the outcomes of the Project from the five evaluation perspectives and to provide recommendations for the remaining period of the Project and lessons learnt for other similar projects.</p>									
1-2 Project Overview									
(1) Overall Goal									
Lessons at TTCs and primary schools are improved in the Model Areas.									

(2) Project Purpose

Lessons on Science and Mathematics at TTCs and primary schools are improved in the Model Areas.

(3) Output

Output 1: The foundation of quality lessons on science and mathematics at TTCs in consolidated.

Output 2: Primary school teachers become familiarized with TGs through pre & in-service training of nationwide TTCs.

Output 3: The effective utilization of TGs is implemented by school managers and supported by local education officers* (*School Principals, Heads of Subject Departments, Provincial and district Supervisors).

(4) Inputs

【Japanese side】 278 million yen

- **Personnel :** Eight experts in nine areas 20m/m (1 m/m in Afghanistan, 19 m/m in Japan)
- **Equipment :** n/a
- **Local cost :** Cost for workshops, Contract with NSC and WCC, delivery cost of TGs and TTC materials to 42 TTCs.
- **Training in Japan :** Three (3) trainings in 2012 and one (1) training in 2014.

【Afghanistan side】

- **Personnel :** Three (3) counterparts and others as necessary
- **Local cost :** Office space and all utility charges

2. Evaluation Team

Members	Team Leader : Mr. Satoru Takahashi (Senior Advisor (Education), JICA) Education Planning : Mr. Takuya Hakoda (Human Development Department, JICA) Education Planning : Mr. Yoshihiko Chujo (Human Development Department, JICA) Evaluation and Analysis : Ms. Mayako Takahashi (Consultant, Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu LLC) Planning Management (1) : Mr. Chigiru Yamashita (JICA Afghanistan Office) Planning Management (2) : Mr. Najibullah Koshitani (JICA Afghanistan Office) Information Collection : Mr. Hameed Rasuli (Local Consultant)	
Period of Evaluation	4th August to 1st October, 2014	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1. Achievement of Outputs

3-1-1. Output 1: The foundation of quality lessons on science and mathematics at TTCs in consolidated.

Achievement Level: Achieved.

Output 1 has been achieved through trained TTC instructors and developed DVDs to consolidate the foundation of quality lessons on science and mathematics at TTCs.

A total of 122 TTC instructors from across the nation participated in the “42 TTC Workshop” held in March 2012. They really appreciated the importance of TTC materials, and TTC materials have been widely used to improve teaching in the Model Areas. In addition, in June 2014, a workshop at STTC was conducted for TTC instructors with attendance of 87 TTC instructors. The purpose of the workshop is to disseminate effective use of TGs.

The trainings were also held in Japan in FY2011, FY2012 and FY2013. In all, four (4) workshops were held and a total of 27 instructors participated in the trainings. A total of 236 TTC instructors learned teaching method by using TGs during the Project.

In addition to these workshops/trainings, another workshop will be held in November 2014 with attendance of 84 TTC instructors. The purpose of the workshop is to disseminate the effective use of TTC materials.

According to the interviews, several positive comments were made on the quality improvement in science and mathematics lessons in TTC. TTC instructors became confident in conducting lessons in a more active and participatory manner so that teacher trainees will be able to implement similar lessons in the classroom when they go back to school in the future.

Also, DVD materials on the following five topics were developed during the counterpart training in Japan in both Dari and Pashto languages and distributed to 173 participants at the “42 TTC Workshop”.

- 1) Methodology of Mathematics
- 2) Solving Problems of Mathematics
- 3) Methodology of Physics
- 4) Methodology of Chemistry
- 5) Methodology of Biology

3-1-2. Output 2: Primary school teachers become familiarized with TGs through pre & in-service training of nationwide TTCs.

Achievement Level: Achieved.

Output 2 has been achieved. More and more teacher trainees as primary school teachers become familiarized and are becoming familiarized with TGs through developed training package. They learn at TTCs where TGs have been integrated into the subject and syllabus of “Training Method”.

First, the training package was completed mainly during Training in Japan, to introduce TGs to pre- and in-service teacher trainees at nationwide TTCs. This package is designed for both two-week and shorter-period training.

Second, TGs have been integrated into the subject of “Teaching Method” of TTCs in the Model Areas as well as Herat, Balkh, Parwan, Kapisa, and Maidan Wardak. Its integration was officially approved by TED.

Third, the number of teacher trainees is increasing as the number of TTCs that have adopted TGs is increasing nationwide.

3-1-3. Output 3: The effective utilization of TGs is implemented by school managers and supported by local education officers* (*School Principals, Heads of Subject Departments, Provincial and district Supervisors).

Achievement Level : Achieved.

Output 3 has been achieved. TGs are duly utilized in the classroom under the proper support and monitoring of school managers and education officers who experienced training organized by NSC.

First, the training package was developed, which was the same one as described in the indicator of 2-1. Through this package, school managers and local education officers came to understand the effectiveness of TGs.

Second, the “Education Management Workshop” was conducted by NSC in Kabul, Nangarhar, Bamiyan, Kapisa and Pakiya in 2012 and 2013. A total of 4,302 school principals, science and mathematics teachers attended there. There were 3,292 participants from Model Area and 1,010 participants from other provinces. In some schools, school principals regularly encourage the use of TGs in collaboration with academic members of supervision department at PED.

Third, from June to July 2012, NSC implemented a pilot monitoring in Bamiyan to measure the outcome of the workshop conducted in January 2011 by NSC, as a part of follow-up activity of STEP2. A total of 96 schools received the monitoring. NSC also implemented monitoring in five provinces (Kabul, Nangarhar, Kapisa, Pakiya and Balkh) for the same objective. They visited 502 schools and interviewed 511 teachers and 8,578 students. The results revealed that 1) nearly 90% of teachers who participated in the workshop utilize TGs and 2) teacher performance was improved based on the rubric assessment. Compared to the baseline survey, scores seem to be higher in general. No less than 70% of the NSC workshop participants shared their learning with their colleagues. Even after the follow-up monitoring was over, it was found through a questionnaire survey that academic members of supervision department in PED regularly observe the lessons of teachers and report to TED if TGs are properly used in the classroom in the Model Areas.

3-1-4. Achievement of the Project Purpose

Lessons on Science and Mathematics at TTCs and primary schools are improved in the Model Areas.

Achievement Level: Achieved.

The quality of lessons has been improved and awareness/perception on lessons has been enhanced at TTCs and primary schools in the Model Areas.

Positive changes have been observed. In primary schools, teachers started to prepare lessons carefully, conduct lessons focusing on students’ activities, check a level of students’ understanding, ask and answer questions more clearly, and reflect their own teaching behaviors after their lessons. All these

things show that quality of lessons has been elevated based on change of school teachers' awareness/perception. In TTCs, instructors started to make a correct lesson plan, use teaching materials properly, use lab materials and conduct experiments in order to enhance knowledge and skill of students. Besides, through the workshop organized in June 2014, they deepened their recognition on the importance and effectiveness of TGs.

3-1-5. Achievement of the Overall Goal

Lessons at TTCs and primary schools are improved in the Model Areas.

Prospect for achievement of the Overall Goal: In progress.

The Overall Goal is considered to be attained in three to five years after completion of the Project. However, some favorable signs have been observed in the Model Areas. For example, most of the teachers have improved their teaching by utilizing TGs. Students' learning has improved, and school-level activities (periodical sessions to study TGs) have started in some schools. In addition, participants of the workshop held in June 2014 at STTC insisted that TGs should be developed for all the subjects in G7-G12 with JICA's future assistance. Furthermore, TGs have been adopted into the approach of UNICEF's Child Friendly School in Afghanistan which is also supported by JICA through a Grant Aid Project. All these things are signs toward achieving the Overall Goal. The Overall Goal is expected to be achieved with a continuous initiative of TED in promoting teacher education.

3-2. Evaluation Results by Five Perspectives

(1) Relevance (High)

The Project is addressing the issue of strengthening teacher education which is a priority of MoE to improve the quality of education. The Project Purpose and Overall Goal remain relevant to the education policies of Afghanistan and aid policies of Japan. The Project fits into the needs of the primary school teachers and TTC instructors, who had no supporting materials to conduct lessons. To respond to their needs, during STEP and STEP 2, TGs and TTC materials were developed. Inheriting the assets of the two previous projects, STEP 3 aims to expand the outcomes by enhancing teaching capacity of TTCs, disseminating TGs through workshops, and improving the management capacity of principals and local education officers.

(2) Effectiveness (High)

Under difficult circumstances, the Project tried to take all possible measures to achieve the Outputs and Project Purpose by combining training in Japan and dissemination workshops (on TGs and TTC materials) to produce better and more results. TGs were disseminated to more than 2,000 schools in the Model Areas and former Sub-Model Areas of Kapisa and Paktia province, and are now utilized by nearly 90% of teachers there. Upon the modification of PDM in December 2013, the enhancement of the capacity of TTC instructors and primary school teachers was stipulated to be achieved through TTC materials and TGs. In line with the modified PDM, the Outputs and Project Purpose depicted in the PDM Version 2 have been achieved.

(3) Efficiency (Fair)

The deteriorating security has affected the efficiency of the Project. The opportunity for Japanese experts to physically work together with Afghan C/Ps became limited. Consequently, almost all the activities were forced to be managed remotely from Japan and locally by JICA Afghanistan Office. Despite such circumstances, dissemination workshops (on TGs and TTC materials) were properly conducted by core human resources who received training in and outside Japan. Now TTC instructors and primary school teachers are utilizing TGs in their daily lessons. As such, the Outputs have been maximized in spite of a limited volume of the Inputs.

(4) Impact (High)

It seems to take more time to achieve the Overall Goal at this point in time. However, not a few favorable signs are observed in the Model Areas. For example, most of the teachers have improved their teaching skills by utilizing TGs not only in the Model Areas but also in other areas. Students' learning has improved, and school-level activities (periodical sessions to study TGs) have started in some schools. TGs have been integrated to the "Teaching Method" at TTCs even in non-model areas. In the end, approximately 70,000 teacher trainees will learn how to use TGs in 44 TTCs and 178 affiliated TTCs. In addition, participants of the workshop held in June 2014 at STTC insisted that TGs should be developed for G7-G12 covering all the subjects with JICA's future assistance. Furthermore, TGs have been adopted into the approach of UNICEF's Child Friendly School. All the data of TG are in the progress of being uploaded to the website developed for free access of teachers in Afghanistan. All these things are signs toward achieving the Overall Goal.

(5) Sustainability (Fair)

TGs have been extensively utilized in primary schools and officially integrated into the subject of "Teaching Method" in TTCs. However, there seems to be three major challenges lying ahead. First, TGs have become insufficient because the number of primary school teachers increases every year. Second, there has been a skill gap of utilizing TGs between teachers who attended TTCs and/or NSC workshops and those who did not. Third, monitoring has not been regularly conducted by PED in some provinces due to the lack of budgets and means of transportation. A continuous support and commitment of MoE to tackle these issues will contribute to enhancing the sustainability of the Project.

3-3. Conclusion

The Project aims to improve lessons on science and mathematics at TTCs and primary schools in the Model Areas (Kabul, Bamiyan and Nangarhar) through the use of TGs and TTC materials by enhancing the capacity of TTC instructors, school teachers and education officers. In this process, it was designed to develop the training package and conduct dissemination workshops (on TGs and TTC materials).

The deteriorating security situation affected the implementation of the Project. Despite such difficulties, through the combination of training in Japan and remote instruction from Japan to national staff, the "42

TTC Workshop” and “Introductory Workshop of TGs for TTC instructors” were systematically organized with attendance of 122 and 87 TTC instructors respectively to disseminate TTC materials. Also, the “Education Management Workshop” was successfully implemented with attendance of approximately 4,300 school principals and teachers in the Model and former Sub-Model Areas. As a result, 1) nearly 90% of teachers came to utilize TGs, 2) teacher performance was improved based on the rubric assessment and 3) teachers are more positive and enjoying teaching with students. Considering such achievements and the situation in Afghanistan, it was judged that the Outputs and the Project Purpose described in PDM Version 2 have been achieved.

Concerning the review from five evaluation perspectives, each of them is summarized below.

Perceptive	Evaluation	Note
Relevance	High	The Project is consistent with policies and needs of Afghanistan.
Effectiveness	High	Outputs and Project Purpose are achieved.
Efficiency	Fair	Outputs have been maximized despite a limited volume of the Inputs.
Impact	High	Some favorable signs are observed towards further impacts.
Sustainability	Fair	A continuous leadership of MoE is expected to enhance sustainability.

Lastly, JICA’s major contributions to strengthening of teacher education in Afghanistan since 2005 are summarized into the following eight points.

- 1) TGs for G1-6 covering all the subjects were developed and distributed nationwide for the first time ever in Afghanistan.
- 2) TTC instructors learned how to use TGs and TTC materials for their lessons.
- 3) TGs are officially approved by TED and integrated into the subject of “Teaching Method” at TTCs.
- 4) Lessons at TTCs and primary schools were improved through effective use of TGs.
- 5) Awareness/perception on lessons of TTC instructors and primary school teachers were changed in a positive manner.
- 6) Students became more active, understand lessons, ask questions, participate in group work, and show interests in receiving lessons.
- 7) The importance of TGs was widely recognized by relevant parties for the betterment of lessons.
- 8) The capacity of staff members in TED and PED was developed through close collaboration with Japanese experts, especially in the TG development, workshop arrangement, and supervision and monitoring on schools.

3-4. Recommendations

(1) Printing and Distribution including Updating of TGs

TGs are highly evaluated and keenly demanded by primary school teachers and TTC instructors. Also, more and more teachers and instructors are newly assigned to schools and TTCs every year. Besides, TGs should be updated based on revision of a curriculum. In this regard, MOE is strongly recommended to explore and ensure every possible fund for printing and distribution of TGs from both national and international financial resource. Furthermore, TED is expected to take the proactive and timely

initiative in revising TGs in accordance with the curriculum revision, utilizing its capable human resources developed through the Project activities.

(2) Enforceable Instructions toward the Improvement of TGs Utilization Skills

Skills of utilizing TGs vary from teacher to teacher depending on training experiences he/she has received. That is, there is a huge gap in teaching skills among teachers even in the same primary school, causing the varied quality in lessons. To address this issue, MOE should give clear and enforceable instructions to all school managers in Afghanistan to organize a regular school-based meeting in which teachers can share each other's struggles and good practices of utilizing TGs. Such an inconspicuous but continuous effort is expected to improve TG utilization skills of teachers across the country.

(3) Proactive Planning and Regular Implementation of Monitoring and Supervision by Local Education Offices

Monitoring and supervision on teaching and learning in primary schools should be regularly implemented by local education officers. If there are financial constraints, monitoring and supervision can be flexibly designed for a school to biannually receive a visit from local education offices. The point of monitoring and supervision is its implementation on a regular basis even if there is an interval of some time. In this regard, local education offices should plan school visit well in advance and implement it as planned. To this end, TED is expected to continuously provide pedagogical and financial support to local education offices.

3-5. Lessons Learned

(1) Fostering of Core Human Resources

The Project has been heavily affected by the worsening security, which prohibited Japanese experts from staying in Afghanistan. However, even in such a difficult condition, core national human resources attentively fostered by Japanese experts since 2005 played a vital role in conducting various activities. Although the number of them was small, these well-trained persons performed at their full potential in hard times. Such capable, attentive and trustable personnel are genuine assets of Japanese technical cooperation.

(2) Hand Delivery of Materials under Uncertain Circumstances

In this Project, TGs were distributed via hand delivery to school teachers and TTC instructors when they physically attended training and workshops in person. This simple but sure approach of delivering developed materials to recipients can be adopted by similar projects implemented in other countries that are faced with deteriorating security, poor access, financial constraints and limited means of transportation.

(3) Involvement of Other Development Partners from the Formulation Stage of the Project

Although it was not planned, TGs were printed and distributed to other non-targeted areas by other development partners. This suggests that close and regular communication with other development

partners, even from the formulation (or before an official launch) of the Project, may raise their interests and win their trust and complementary support to JICA's technical cooperation projects in the course of time.

(4) Technical Assistance from Japanese Experts

Naruto University of Education has kept monitoring the project activities, and given technical advice to the project through e-mail and TV meeting even after the dispatch of Japanese to Afghanistan stopped. This technical assistance has contributed to secure the quality of the workshops and other project activities. Technical assistance from Japanese Experts can contribute significantly to secure the quality of project activities even when it is provided remotely.