

終了時評価調査結果要約表（英文）

I. Outline of the Project		
Country : Republic of Tanzania		Project title : Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Capacity Development (RUWASA-CAD) Project Phase 2
Issue/Sector : Rural Water Supply		Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation
Division in charge : Tanzania Office		Total cost : 3.9 million yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D) : 23, May 2011 (Period) : August, 2011 – July, 2013 (24 month) , July 2014 - May, 2015 (10 months)	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Ministry of Water (MoW)
		Supporting Organization in Japan : None
Related Cooperation :		
<p>1. Background of the Project</p> <p>The Government of Tanzania sets the development of rural water supply as direct strategy for the improvement of poverty conditions, and makes a political target by revised National Water Policy (NAWAPO, 2002) and the Mid-term National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP, 2004-2007). Consequently the Government is trying to develop institutional and organizational capacities to be enhanced for the achievement of Second Term of National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (2005-2010) and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Based on the Policy, the Ministry of Water has prepared a Water Sector Development Programme (WSDP) which is designed under Sector Wide Approach to Planning (SWAp) in February 2007. The WSDP was constituted by the four main components. Among those components, the “Rural Water Supply and Sanitation” intends for the achievement of 90% of water supply, and 75% of sanitation facilities in the rural area by 2025 of the goal of Tanzania Vision.</p> <p>In such context, the Government of Tanzania requested the Government of Japan to implement the technical cooperation for the “Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Capacity Development (RUWASA-CAD) Project Phase 1” (hereinafter referred to as “Phase 1”), in order to strengthen the system for implementation, operation and maintenance of the rural water supply. The Phase 1 has started from September 2007 and completed in July 2010, as a result, IAs in pilot regions¹ had enhanced their capacity to manage RWSS services. Furthermore, the Phase 1 made clear future subjects such as dissemination of the “Training Package”, development of the training consultation guide and the complementary training materials. RUWASA-CAD Project Phase 2 (hereinafter referred to as “the Project”) has been started at September 2011, which has basic concept to disseminate the outcome of the Phase 1 to the nationwide.</p> <p>However, through the mid-term review of the Project held in January 2013, it was found that CD trainings were not implemented as originally expected because CD plans were not accessible from the</p>		

¹ Pilot regions are Coast, Dar es Salaam, Lindi and Mtwara.

perspective both contents and financial feasibility. The Project had been into one year suspension to modify the project design. In April 2014, the project design was modified in accordance with the actual condition of WSDP, and the 3rd year of the Project based on the revised Project Design Matrix (PDM) version 3 commenced in July 2014.

2. Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

The capacity of Implementing Agencies (IA's) to implement RWSSP is strengthened.

(2) Project Purpose

The system of supporting IA's Capacity Development is enhanced for proper implementation of RWSSP.

(3) Outputs

- 1) The existing PIM Annexes for RWSSP are improved and acknowledged among IAs of RWSSP.
- 2) The CD Implementation Guideline for RWSSP is authorized and acknowledged among IAs.
- 3) The supporting system of CD is verified through ToT training with the CD Implementation Guideline and PIM.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side :

Expert:10, Local cost (Estimation) : 37,659,201JPY. (in total, at the time of Terminal Evaluation),

Provision of Equipment : 796,340 Yen (in total), Trainees received (Training in Japan):5

Tanzania side :

Counterpart : 15, Local Cost:Tsh33,010,505².

Land and Facilities : the office space in Headquarter of MoW, Dar es Salaam

II. Evaluation Team

Japanese side	Mr. Akihiro MIYAZAKI Mr. Hirofumi YOSHITAKE Mr. Harumi Iida	Leader, Director of Water Resource Management Team, Global Environment Department, JICA Evaluation Planning, Assistant Director of Water Resource Management Team, Global Environment Department, JICA Evaluation Analyst, Global Link Management Co.
Tanzanian side	Ms. Catherine G. Bamwenzaki Ms. Prisca Henjewe	Asst. Director Community Management Support, Rural Water Supply Division, Ministry of Water Senior Community Development Officer, Rural Water Supply Division, Ministry of Water
Period of Evaluation	January 31, 2015 to February 22, 2015	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

1. Result of Achievements

(1) Achievement of Outputs

Output 1: The existing PIM Annexes for RWSSP are improved and acknowledged among IAs of RWSSP.

The revised PIM Annexes for RWS will have been ready and acknowledged by IAs by the end of April

² JPY 1.00 is equivalent as 0.070 Tsh and 1US\$ is equivalent as JPY 120.48 at JICA official exchange rate in January 2015.

2015. It is likely that the Project will be able to produce Output 1.

Indicator1-1: The improved PIM is prepared.

The improved (revised) PIM Annexes for RWS is going to be finalized in March 2014. The revised PIM Annexes for RWS are going to be uploaded in the website of MoW. The Project will conduct public hearing through internet on the contents of PIM Annexes, then the final version PIM Annexes for RWS will be submitted to MoW in March 2015 immediately.

Indicator1-2: The improved PIM becomes accessible to all IAs (RS:25, LGA:166) of RWSSP.

All Implementing Agencies will be able to access to the improved PIM Annexes for RWS after it is uploaded in the website of MoW at the end of February 2015. ICT division of MoW will be responsible to manage the website. Optical media will also be distributed to all IAs.

Indicator1-3: More than 80% of IAs of RWSSP (RS:25, LGA:166) participate in the dissemination seminar.

More than 80% of IAs are expected to participate. Dissemination seminar for the improved PIM will be organized by the Project at April 2015, participants of seminar will be all stakeholders of RWSSP including IAs. PS of MoW will issue the invitation letters to all IAs to participate the seminar.

Indicator1-4: More than 80 % of participants from IAs of RWSSP in the dissemination seminar rate “Excellent” or “Good” on the contents of the improved PIM.

It is expected that more than 80% IAs in the dissemination seminar would show positive response to modification of the contents. The Project will conduct public hearing about the contents of PIM Annexes in the dissemination seminar. PIM Annexes are being improved with the reflections from surveys before the improvement of PIM Annexes, therefore, positive response would be expected.

Output 2: The CD Implementation Guideline for RWSSP is authorized and acknowledged among IAs.

The Project is likely to produce Output 2, since CD Implementation Guideline has been prepared for all IAs and it was substantially authorized in CD sub-group meeting.

Indicator 2-1: The draft CD Implementation Guideline is prepared.

CD Implementation Guideline was finalized at the end of January 2015. New CD Implementation Guideline adapted the approach which reduces total amount of cost for implementation of CD plan by limitation of the range of activities.

Indicator 2-2: The draft CD Implementation Guideline is authorized by MoW for official use in the WSDP.

Assistant Director for Operation Planning of RWS in MoW cleared to utilize CD Implementation guideline and announced to prepare the budget for implementation of CD plan in CD sub-group meeting at December 2014. According to the announcement, MoW will secure US\$1.3million per year as a necessity cost for CD plan implementation.

Indicator 2-3: More than 80% of IAs of RWSSP (RS:25, LGA:166) participate in the dissemination seminar.

Dissemination seminar will be organized at April 2015, all IAs of RWSSP will be invited. PS of MoW will issue the letter to all IAs to attend the seminar.

Output 3: The supporting system of CD is verified through ToT training with the CD Implementation Guideline and PIM.

Output 3 will be achievable at this moment.

Indicator 3-1:

Two types of ToT trainings, “CD Implement Guideline and O&M” and “Planning and Implementation”, are conducted in February 2015. Former training was conducted from Feb. 9 to Feb.13, 2015 and the later will be conducted from Feb.23 to Feb.27, 2015. Regional water advisers in all RSs have been invited to participate in the trainings.

Indicator 3-2: More than 80 % of participants for ToT training rate “Excellent” or “Good” on the contents of the training.

According to the result of questionnaire survey by the Project , total 84% of participants in the “CD Implement Guideline and O&M” training rated Excellent” or “Good” on the contents of the training.

(2) Achievement of Project Purpose

The system of supporting IA’s Capacity Development is enhanced for proper implementation of RWSSP.

Project Purpose will be achieved by the end of the project period.

Indicator 1: The improved PIM Annexes (RWSSP) are authorized by the MoW for official use in the WSDP.

Official letter to IAs to introduce improved PIM Annexes for RWS will be issued by Permanent Secretary of MoW once contents are finalized in March 2015. The Project will propose the monitoring and update method of revised PIM Annexes in TWGs.

Indicator 2: The update method of the improved PIM Annexes (RWSSP) is formulated in TWG-2.

A proposal from the Project regarding the up-dating PIM was accepted and agreed by stakeholders in the preparatory meeting of modification of PIM in WSDP held in October 2014.

Indicator 3: More than 80% of RWST, which participated in ToT training provided by the Project, formulates the annual CD plan for their LGAs in line with regional scale CD implementation procedure stipulated in CD implementation guideline.

More than 20 regions out of 25 (80%) are expected to formulate CD plans. According to CD Implementation Guideline, each RWST is required to formulate the annual CD plan for regional scale activities which supports LGAs’ capacity development. In ToT training conducted in this February, all participants made action plans, in which the formulation of the annual CD plan for regional scale

activities was included.

(3) Achievement of Overall Goal

The capacity of Implementing Agencies (IA's) to implement RWSSP is strengthened.

Achievement of Overall goal is uncertain at this moment.

Indicator 1: The results of the questionnaire survey by Annual General Meeting (AGM) show that more than 80 % of IAs implement RWSSP by referring improved PIM Annexes.

Annual General Meeting (AGM), to be held between June and September, is an important opportunity where all Regional Water Advisors and all District Water Engineers gather. MoW is encouraged to conduct a questionnaire survey in order to understand a status of PIM Annexes utilization.

Indicator 2: The CD support to IAs of RWSSP is provided to more than 80% of CD activities planned in line with regional scale CD implementation procedure stipulated in CD implementation guideline.

Presently, it is difficult to expect the number of regional scale activities by RWST planned in line with CD Implementation Guideline. CD implementation committee has been formed as advisory council to PS in MoW. The committee intends to monitor and report the progress of CD plan implementation regularly. Biannual progress reports submitted from RSs would be useful resources to monitor implementation of regional scale activities for CD of LGA.

2. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

Relevance of the Project is very high.

The aim of the Project is consistent with several policies and programs in water sector of the Government of Tanzania. WSDP was constituted by the four main components and "Rural Water Supply and Sanitation (RWSS)" being one of the components. Also, RWS has been one of the priority sectors under Big Results Now initiatives, and capacity development is one of its pillars. On the other hand, according to Japanese Assistant Policy to Tanzania announced in June, 2012, "Water supply and management of water resource" is one of the objectives in the infrastructure development sector. Aim of the Project could contribute improvement of RWS through effective implementation of WSDP. And, the Project is correctly designed to achieve its purpose.

(2) Effectiveness

Effectiveness of the Project is high.

The Project has formulated the draft of PIM Annexes for RWS, which will be authorized by MoW after the finalization. Also, the Project will propose the way how to update the PIM Annexes to MoW and other members of WSDP. It would help to maintain PIM Annexes for RWS on optimal state. As an outcome of ToT training, the annual CD Plans for regional scale CD implementation are expected to be formulated by RWSTs in accordance with CD implementation guideline. The Project Purpose will be achieved finally, although further efforts are necessary to conduct perfectly for leading better results by the Project.

(3) Efficiency

Efficiency of the Project is modestly high.

Regarding implementation of the Project in the 3rd year, Inputs from Japanese side and Tanzania side are efficiently utilized in the project activities. Unlike the first half of the Project, the relationship between both sides has been kept well through implementing activities together and organizing JCC. Also, The Project has coordinated and cooperated well with other DPs in WSDP. However, some of activities have been delayed for few weeks to make results, and some indicators for Outputs have not fulfilled yet. In order to produce Outputs fully, the Project needs further activities by the end.

(4) Impact

Impact of the Project is fair.

Overall Goal of the Project would be achieved if necessity conditions are met for continuous utilization of PIM and CD Implementation Guideline. Firstly, the appropriate mechanism for monitoring and facilitating IA to utilize PIM is needed. Secondly, RWSD of MoW has announced the budget for CD plan implementation is USD 1.3 million for next fiscal year of Tanzania. Such budget is also necessary for coming years to implement CD activities continuously. On the other hand, a positive impact is observed along the project activities, revision of PIM Annexes under this Project has been seen as a good practice by other members of WSDP. But none of negative impact was found.

(5) Sustainability

Sustainability of the Project is fair.

Regarding policy and institutional aspect, as it mentioned in “(1) Relevance”, sustainability of the project outcome will be promising. However, concerning organizational and financial aspect, further efforts of MoW are necessary. Presently, the monitoring and updating mechanism for PIM has not yet been articulated in MoW as well as in the members of WSDP. And, securing necessary budget for CD throughout WSDP phase II is crucial for all IAs to keep activities for CD. Regarding technical aspect, C/Ps of the Project would maintain knowledge and skills but further supports by other DPs through TWGs would be effective to deal with issues arisen for PIM.

(6) Conclusion

The Project has almost succeeded to produce these tools within short implementation period by using the knowledge gained from the first half of the Project. However, by the end of project period, further activities would be required to fulfill all indicators of Outputs and to achieve Project Purpose. Regarding PIM Annexes for RWS, updating contents are essential in order to be an effective tool.

The establishment of appropriate mechanism for monitoring and updating of PIM is needed. Also, securing necessary budget for implementing CD activities is crucial. Furthermore, MoW is also required to monitor appropriateness of CD activities by IAs.

3. Recommendations

3.1 Recommendations toward the Project achievement

(1) Initiatives from MoW

In order to contribute sustainable capacity development in rural water supply service, MoW has to make further commitments and participations to the Project's activities such as not only at official meetings but also daily communications toward the achievement of the Project's goal. MoW also has to take initiatives for enhancing scheme of monitoring and evaluation.

(2) Ensuring accessibility of PIM Annexes

The Project has to propose the way how to update and manage PIM Annexes through WSDP-TWG, and ensure the accessibility of PIM Annexes from IAs in Tanzania, in order to fulfill indicators in the project.

(3) Establishment of the system for PIM management

WSDP-TWG is expected to commit proactive actions for monitoring and evaluation, and management of PIM Annexes. JICA, which is a member of WSDP, is also expected to support these activities. With supports from partners in WSDP-TWG including JICA, MoW has to consider a function of PIM Annexes management. The structure must be prepared before the end of the project to ensure smooth commencement of its utilization.

(4) Share the information of commencement of PIM utilization

PIM Annexes should be referred to all activities of rural water supply operations. In order to promote the new PIM Annexes utilization, MoW has to revise the PIM main documents with keeping consistency between PIM and its Annexes. MoW has to promote WSDP partners to sign the MoU for WSDP, which requires the agreement of MoU for disbursement of CD training budget. Also, MoW has to announce commencement of PIM annexes' utilization to all regions and LGAs.

(5) Monitoring management of CD implementation guidelines

At the commencement of utilization of CD implementation guidelines after the project, MoW has to monitor the management of it. According to such monitoring, CD Committee under MoW is suitable organization for the subject of monitoring its implementation. In order to monitor its activities effectively, the evaluation team recommends involving the co-lead of TWG 5 in CD Committee, in order to effectively secure monitoring and evaluation activities on CD implementation guideline.

3.2 Recommendations after the Project period

(1) PIM Management

In order to grasp the status of utilization, and to get information for improvement of PIM, MoW has to provide an opportunity, such as AGM (Annual General Meeting), where engineers in each region and district gather, for collecting such information continuously. After the project, MoW has to figure out the utilization status of PIM, promote its utilization and reflect various opinions from engineers to PIM.

(2) Promotion of CD training in LGAs

The Project conducts ToT only for RWST. After the project, the knowledge of these should be delivered to each LGA. This is supposed to be implemented by RWST. Therefore, MoW should promote and support them for its implementations of trainings to districts.

(3) Follow-up of CD trainings

The project assumes that the budget for regional scale CD would be allocated for only 10-15 regions with qualified proposals. At the same time, MoW has a responsibility for improvement of capacity building of rural water supply service in all regions of Tanzania. Therefore, MoW has to advise the regions which are not selected to ensure equal opportunities for them.

4. Lessons learned

The lessons below are extracted from the experiences of the Project, including the first and second year of its period.

(1) Ensuring preconditions

On the occasion of commencement of the project Phase2, JICA assumed that enough budget and counterpart would be allocated by Tanzanian Government, for implementation of the Project. However, the Project once faced difficulties to conduct activities without participation of counterpart and commitment for implementation of CD plans. So that JICA has to make further efforts to ensure the conditions and available resources of essential elements prior to the implementation of the project.

(2) Being effective project

Through designing of the Project, JICA should have considered the collaboration with other JICA projects in Tanzania. The collaborations with related projects might contribute to more effective outcome of the Project.

(3) Tackle for obstacles

In case that a project faces troubles, difficulties and obstacle of project management, appropriate information sharing and discussions among the interested parties could contribute to solve the problem. However, when the Project faced difficulties and obstacles to conduct the project activities in the first half of the Project, the Project could not overcome these obstacles, and modify the Project design easily because the Project did not have appropriate information to solve the obstacles. The Project should work proactively in such case to promote close communications among interested parties and try to find the better way to renovate the situation.

(4) Adjustment with big policies

The initiative, BRN (Big Results Now) during the project, had a serious impact for the implementation of the project from the perspective of decreasing the number of the counterparts for the Project and other resources which the project expected to be used. The launch of this initiative delivered prolongation of the Project, and lead redesigning the project framework. The Project has to keep contact with related parties through daily businesses, in order to acquire latest information from counterpart personnel. MoW also has to share important information, in order to implement the Project, with Japanese experts and JICA.

In addition to this, according to the fact that BRN policy emphasizes not only the promotion of developing facilities but also the importance of O&M, the Project concept, Capacity Development, could contribute simultaneously to the achievement of BRN. Therefore, MoW has to recognize the importance

of the Project outputs, and conduct proactive actions for promoting O&M with using outcomes in the Project.

(5) Basket fund utilization

The Project was designed to utilize basket fund to conduct some activities in the Project. However, it revealed difficulties for prompt disbursement and utilization of it in the first two years because of its complicated regulations and the necessities for harmonization among development partners. In case of setting basket fund for a financial resource of the project, JICA has to confirm its process of disbursement and its impact for the project implementation.

(6) Prepare the full-time counterpart for the project

In the beginning of the project, MoW did not designate the full-time staff or a team for the Project. This made its implementation ineffective with tangled procedures not only when the Project faces problems but also for daily tasks. JICA has to request MoW to set the full-time staff or the team for the project before starting the project. MoW also has to respond to such request, in order secure smooth implementation of the project.

(8) Existing resources

At the beginning of the project, existing PIM was supposed to be used as a resource of the project. However, the PIM was not well managed for use, therefore it needed to be revised. Project implementation without confirming possible resources related to project activities could produce the project outcomes ineffectively. So that JICA has to ensure not only its availability but also its status in case of using existing resources for an implementation of the new project.