Evaluation Summary

1. Outline of the Project	
Country：the Republic of Rwanda	Project Title：Project of Strengthening School-based Collaborative Teacher Training（SBCT）
Issue/Sector ： Education （ Secondary education）	Cooperation Scheme：Technical Cooperation
Division in Charge：Basic Education Team II, Basic Education Group, Human Development Department, JICA	Total Cost：199,402,000 yen
Period of Cooperation （R/D）January 2013 to March 2015（2 years and 3 months）	Partner Country's Implementation Organizations：Ministry of Education（MINEDUC）, Rwanda Education Board（REB）
	Supporting Organization in Japan：PADECO Co. Ltd.

1-1 Background of the Project

The Government of Rwanda（GoR）recognizes education as one of its priority sectors. In 2009, the GoR executed two major reforms in the education sector. One is the change in language of instruction from French to English, and the other is the expansion of basic education from 6 years to 9 years. The change of language of instruction necessitates the training of in-service teachers while the expansion of basic education implies the increasing demand for teachers to teach the secondary level and their training.

Rwanda Education Board（REB）implemented the Project on Strengthening Mathematics and Science in Secondary Education（SMASSE）from 2008 to 2011 in collaboration with Japan International Cooperation Agency（JICA）. It aimed at lesson improvement of science and math teachers in secondary schools. SMASSE achieved its project purpose as the trained teachers improved their lesson performance significantly：however, several challenges remained. The trainees did not share the knowledge and skills acquired through the training with their colleagues, thus, as the project as a whole, it fell short of meeting the training needs which have now increased due to the expansion of basic education.

Therefore, GoR and the Government of Japan（GoJ）decided to implement a project which aims at improving the quality of lower secondary education by capacity development of teachers through revitalized School-based In-service Training（SBI）in lower secondary schools.

1-2 Project Overview

The objective of the Project is to promote SBI in order to enable teachers to actualize lessons that improve students' learning（"let students to be able to do it"）, aiming at the improvement of the quality of education at lower secondary level.

(1) Super Goal：Academic knowledge and skills of O-Level students are improved.

(2) Overall Goal：Lessons become more effective to "let students be capable to do it."
 	
 (3) Project Purpose：Planned School Based INSET（SBI） activities are implemented.
 	
 (4) Outputs
 	
   Output-1）Institutional framework to implement SBI is clarified.
 	
   Output-2）Implementation mechanism of SBI is strengthened at DEO, SEO and school levels.
 	
   Output-3）REB-TDM is able to coordinate DEOs, SEOs and schools to maintain SBI practice at school level.
 	
 (5) Input（As of the Terminal Evaluation）
 	
 Japan Side：（Total 199,402,000 yen）
 	
  ・Short-term Experts：6 persons（38.6MM）   ・Equipment：1.7 million Japanese Yen（JPY）
 	
  ・Training in Japan：2 persons（group trainings）・Third Country Training（meeting）：1 person
 	
  ・Local Cost：2.38 million JPY
 	
 Rwanda Side：
 	
  ・Counterparts：7 persons ・Local Cost：330 million Rwandan Francs（Approved Budget）
 	
  ・Land and facilities：Office space in the REB ・Equipment：Photocopy machine etc.	

2. Evaluation Team			
Members of Evaluation Team （Japanese Side）	Leader	Mr. Hideharu Tachibana	Director, Basic Education Team II, Basic Education Group, Human Development Department, JICA
	Cooperation Planning	Mr. Ippei Shimizu	Basic Education Team II, Basic Education Group, Human Development Department, JICA
	Evaluation and Analysis	Ms. Mariko Ikawa	Consulting Department, System Science Consultants Inc.
Evaluation Period	16th November 2014 to 3rd December 2014		Type of Evaluation：Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation
3-1 Achievement of the Project
(1) Achievement of the Outputs

> Output-1：Institutional framework to implement SBI is clarified

Indicator1-1 Tasks and duties for SBI are specified（REB-TDM, DEO, SEO, schools and SBI facilitators）

Indicator1-2 REB-TDM ensures budgeting, disbursement and reporting for SBI

  The Output-1 is almost achieved. Based on the findings of the baseline survey（BLS） conducted in 2013, the tasks and duties were clarified and defined in the SBI guidelines. The Project promoted stakeholders' understanding through the SBI induction workshops. According to the post-workshop questionnaire, over 90％ of participants responded that they were confident to explain their roles in SBI activities. With regard to the budget, the REB-TDM allocated sufficient budget to conduct the

nationwide induction workshops. The REB-TDM prepared a report for every workshop, with expenditure records.

However, some of the tasks and duties especially for the monitoring and reporting activities seem to be not yet fully acknowledged at different levels（REB, district, and sector）. Also, there is a further need to clarify the role of SBI in the entire INSET system.

Output-2：Implementation mechanism of SBI is strengthened at DEO, SEO and school levels

Indicator2-1：Designated personnel participates in induction workshop for SBI

Indicator2-2：Induction workshop programs and materials are prepared

The Output-2 is likely to be achieved by March 2015, the end of the Project period.

Nineteen（19）SBI induction workshops had been conducted in thirty districts as of the end of November 2014. It is expected that remaining 11 districts will receive the induction workshops by February 2015. According to the record of 17 workshops, head teacher（HT）'s participation rate was 83％ and that of DEO/SEO's was 99％. It can be said that the designated people participated in the SBI induction workshop. Regarding the programs and materials, the Project developed the SBI guidelines and related materials. Still, there is room to make them more teacher-friendly.

Output-3：REB-TDM is able to coordinate DEOs, SEOs and schools to maintain SBI practice at school level

Indicator3-1 Coordination activities for promoting SBI are conducted

Indicator3-2 Materials useful for SBI coordination and practices are issued

Output-3 will be partially achieved by March 2015. For the Indicator 3-1, monitoring activity is still limited to the data collection from the first five districts which received the SBI induction workshop in the first project year. The Project issued weekly reports, and also coordinated with other development partners（DPs）adequately. However, these have been initiated by the Japanese experts, and thus it is necessary to place the counterparts at the center of these activities.

The materials to raise awareness about SBI, such as newsletters, have been developed and distributed to schools. Social media was also utilized. On the other hand, the delivery rate of the newsletters to schools had to be improved, which was only 25％ due to weak coordination between the central and district governments. The key players of the SBI monitoring activities, DEOs/SEOs, had not been able to find enough time for monitoring. There was a general lack of experience and information sharing among DEOs/SEOs to enable them to support school-level SBI activities appropriately.

(2) Prospect of Achieving the Project Purpose

Project Purpose：Planned School-based INSET（SBI）activities are implemented

Indicator1 More than 80％ of the schools which attend district-level SBI induction workshops conduct school-level induction workshop at their school

Indicator2 More than 80％ of above schools implement SBI at their schools

It will not be possible to achieve the Project Purpose in the remaining four months, by March 2015. Although the Output-1 and 2 will probably be achieved in the Project period, activities for the Output-3 had just started in the first five districts. Nonetheless, the achievement level in these five districts is sound. One hundred seventy-seven（177）schools reported their SBI implementation status out of 215 schools which participated in the SBI induction workshop. Of those 177 schools, 172 （97.2％）implemented the SBI activities which they planned.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Result

(1) Relevance：High

The Project aims to improve the quality of education, which is one of the overarching goal areas of the development policies of the GoR such as Education Sector Strategy Paper 2（ESSP2）and Vision2020. The Project is also consistent with Japan's Education Cooperation Policy and country specific program for Rwanda.

Also, the Project purpose is meeting the increasing need of teacher's professional development, due to the greatly improved access to basic education, expansion of compulsory education, as well as the pressure to enhance teachers' English proficiency as a medium of instruction. The approach is also appropriate, since Japan's long experience in conducting SBI can be utilized for the Project.

(2) Effectiveness：Moderate

In the first five districts where SBI induction workshops were conducted, SBI activities were planned and implemented in over 90％ of schools which participated in the workshop. The result was higher than the target of the indicator. Other initiatives in the education sector supported by other DPs contributed to the installation of SBI activities at schools. There seemed to be a sound environment to ensure SBI practices at schools. Considering the limited achievement level of Output 3, onsite support to maintain SBI activities at schools, the effectiveness is rated moderate.

(3) Efficiency：Moderate

The inputs were utilized efficiently and contributed to the achievement of the Output-1 and 2 particularly. However, the issues relating to the budget approval and execution on the Rwandan side made the Project modify the SBI induction workshop method. This modification resulted in the delay of the activities for the Output-2, and the partial achievement of the Output-3. Therefore, the efficiency is rated moderate.

On the one hand, the time efficiency was not optimal due to the modification; on the other hand, it allowed the Project to conduct 30 district level workshops in the same budget. It also contributed to the increased efficiency of workshop contents delivery thanks to the appropriate workshop size. It can also be noted that the approach itself is cost-effective, considering the number of direct beneficiaries of the SBI induction workshop（expected to be around 3,000 people）and numerous indirect beneficiaries.

(4) Impact：High（expected）

　　The end-line survey（ELS）showed a favorable trend toward the achievement of the Overall Goal and Super Goal. However, without having achieved the Output-3, which is one of the factors to ensure the continuous efforts for the promotion of SBI, it is too early to conclude the impact as high at this moment.

　　Regarding the indicator 1 of the Overall Goal, students' satisfaction of the classroom teaching, ELS showed that the students of the SBI schools were more satisfied about the teaching than the students of non-SBI schools. For the indicator 2, teachers' perception on classroom improvement, the ELS revealed that the teachers of SBI schools were putting more effort to improve the classroom teaching. Regarding the indicator 3, DEO/SEO's perception on students' performance, DEO/SEO commented that since the teachers improved their teaching skills, students' performance should also be improved.

　　As for the prospect of achieving the Super Goal, a positive correlation between SBI and the result of national exam was found in the BLS. The same correlation was also confirmed in the ELS. Based on this finding, it can be said that there is a chance of achieving the Overall Goal and the Super Goal, as long as the REB-TDM staff and the district government（DEO/SEO）continue to work for the sustainable implementation of quality SBI.

　　There were some extended positive impacts. The district-by-district SBI induction workshops contributed to enhancing the relationship among the REB, DEOs/SEOs and schools. It also promoted the inter-school communication; some schools were sharing information and experience with nearby schools. In addition, despite the target of the Project, which was lower secondary level, the activities were implemented even at primary level.

　　No negative impact was found. Still, it is important to recognize that insufficient understanding or misunderstanding of SBI can lead to negative impact; a teacher in an interview mentioned that SBI used teaching hours, and it could jeopardize teaching if it happened frequently.

(5) Sustainability：Moderate

　　One of the most critical elements to ensure sustainability is the technical aspect. While the value of the Output-3 in maintaining the SBI practice is significant for sustainability, the activities for Output-3 is still in progress and the achievement level will be partial. Thus the sustainability is considered moderate.

　　For policy and system, the national policies, in which the priority is given to the teachers' professional development, will continue, as seen in ESSP 2, among other policy documents. Also, the draft Teacher Development and Management policy has proposed the compulsory continuous professional development days at school, which would encourage schools to take up the SBI.

　　On the institutional aspect, the REB, as the implementation agency of the Project, has increased

its capacity through its daily work and project activities. At the district level, the issue of understaffing of DEOs would be resolved, since the DEO post is to be increased from only one to three from 2014. Yet, there is a need for greater inter-ministerial coordination among the concerned ministries, namely MINEDUC and Ministry of Local Government（MINALOC）, and agencies, especially to enable better communication and coordination across different levels : REB-TDM, DEO/SEOs, and Schools together with other stakeholders.

As to the financial aspect, an equivalent budget to that of the current fiscal year is necessary to continue promoting SBI. To secure the budget, the REB-TDM has to prepare the budgeted annual action plan that includes activities for SBI.

Regarding the technical aspect, development of mechanisms for sustainable monitoring and experience sharing has not yet started. The mechanism consists of : a）gathering data of SBI activities, good practices, and challenges to the central level; b）analyzing the collected information at the central level; then c）providing information of the best practices and efforts to address the challenges back to schools. There is a need for capacity building of the concerned parties, to put the above mechanism into practice through the activities for the Output-3. It is particularly important to capacitate DEOs/SEOs for monitoring and supporting SBI, considering their key role to ensure and enhance the SBI activities at schools. It is also important to improve efficiency and effectiveness of SBI activities by better coordination within the REB-TDM.

3-3 Factors that Promoted Realization of Effects

(1) Factors Concerning Planning

 1) Coordination with other initiatives in the REB-TDM

The School Leadership and Management Programme（SLMP）aims at the improvement of school management through enhanced leadership of the HTs and other managerial-level staff. Coordination with this initiative has enhanced the strong commitment of the school leaders, key to proper implementation and installation of SBI.

School-based Mentorship Program（SBMP）assigned about nine hundred School-based Mentors（SBMs）to schools nationwide. SBMs were one of the crucial resources that promoted proper installation of SBI at school, as they utilized the SBI opportunities to exercise their roles.

 2) Effect of Rwanda's SMASSE Experience

The Project started following the completion of SMASSE. Several good effects for the Project were observed. First, the key concept of SMASSE, the cost borne by the recipient country, contributed to the full commitment of the REB-TDM. Second, the concept of PDSI（Plan, Do, See, Improve）and the idea of lesson study were well recognized by the counterparts and SMASSE trainees, which facilitated the induction of the SBI concept both at REB and at schools. Third, teachers who received SMASSE training seemed to be proactive at schools for SBI implementation. Lastly, SMASSE training materials were often used as one of the introductory

tools for SBI at school.

(2) Factors Concerning the Implementation Process

Thanks to the above-mentioned effects of SMASSE and the deepened understanding of the SBI by the counterparts through close communication between the Rwandan counterparts and the Japanese experts, the counterparts' ownership of the Project was fostered. REB has provided human, financial and physical resources adequately for the Project.

3-4 Factors that Impeded Realization of Effects

(1) Factors Concerning Planning

The most influencing factor for the SBI implementation at school was the leadership of HT and Dean of Study. Weak leadership sometimes have resulted in the failure to proper installation of SBI at schools. Other constraints at the school level mentioned in the interview and questionnaire survey were followings :（1）Conflicting teaching time and SBI time, which makes SBI an extra task :（2）Lack of financial incentive :（3）Insufficient subject knowledge/skills :（4）Insufficient budget for SBI :（5）Lack of proper support form DEO/SEO.

(2) Factors Concerning the Implementation Process

 1) Budget Allocation

The approved amount of the budget was smaller than the requested amount, and there was an unexpected time gap between the approval and disbursement. This situation initially constrained the progress of the project activities. This made the Project to modify the SBI induction workshop method, which, as a consequence, affected the activities for the Output-3.

 2) Coordination between different ministries and agencies

Despite the ongoing efforts under decentralization and public service reforms, coordination between ministries and agencies at different levels had some constraining aspects for project activities, particularly regarding information sharing and monitoring. Understaffing of DEO was one of the issues often raised, as well as various administrative tasks of the DEO/SEO, which prevented them from allocating time for the SBI monitoring and reporting.

3-5 Conclusion

The Project has made a steady progress in general. Although it is challenging to achieve the Project Purpose in the remaining four months by March 2015, there is a high prospect of achieving it in the foreseeable future, if efforts for achieving the Output-3 are maintained. It was observed through the interview and questionnaire survey as well as the ELS that SBI nurtured a culture of collaboration in school. In interviews, teachers mentioned that they considered their colleagues as supporters since SBI had started; they consulted with their colleagues when there was any challenge they faced. Some teachers mentioned that they were willing to share their knowledge gained at Off-the Job Training back

in their schools using the SBI opportunities.

It is recognized by the REB and other concerned stakeholders including DPs that the SBI is a highly effective and efficient method for continuous professional development of the teachers. Furthermore, the high commitment of the GoR and the strong ownership of the REB-TDM in allocating the resources to the Project have been largely contributing to the steady progress of the Project, as well as to the sustainability.

In summary, there are positive signs emerging in different forms and areas, as stated earlier. The Project is on the right track toward the improvement of the quality of education. However, to ensure the sustainable SBI implementation at all levels,（1）a good mechanism for monitoring and feedback （sharing of the good practices）, and（2）capacity development of the key persons, such as REB-TDM staff and DEOs/SEOs, are crucial.

Taking into account the above points, a nine-month extension of the Project period is recommended, which brings it to a three-year period –a complete phase for lower secondary education. This is also considered appropriate to observe the PDSI cycle.

3-6　Recommendation

(1)　Time Frame 1：By the end of the original Project period（the end of March 2015）

1）Implementing induction workshops as planned

It is necessary that the Project implement SBI induction workshops in the remaining 11 districts.

2）Delivering SBI newsletters to schools consistently

Current delivery rate of the newsletters to schools is 25%. The Project needs to find the cause of the delivery failure and take measures to deliver newsletters to school consistently. By doing so, it is expected that the communication among the concerned parties（REB-DEO-SEO-schools）is strengthened.

3）Revising SBI guidelines

SBI guidelines indicate the procedures for implementing SBI. There is room for improvement in making the guidelines more reader-friendly from the teachers' point of view to decrease the burden on the DEOs, SEOs and teachers.

4）Involving MINALOC as JCC member

For the effective and efficient promotion of SBI activities, district stakeholders such as the DEOs/SEOs play a key role in linking the REB-TDM and schools. Thus, the Project needs to involve MINALOC, which has jurisdiction over the DEOs/SEOs, as a member of the JCC.

5）Understanding the current implementation status of SBI by collecting quantitative data

The objective of the Project's SBI monitoring is to assess the process of PDSI for SBI activities. Therefore, the Project needs to collect quantitative data to assess the current implementation status of SBI as the first step of the monitoring. Through this activity, REB-TDM members are expected to develop their capacity in collecting and analyzing data.

6) Organizing information on INSET activities in basic education

The REB-TDM has implemented several good practices for the improvement of basic education, such as SBM and the SLMP. These activities are consistent with the philosophy of SBI. For the sustainable implementation of SBI, the REB-TDM needs to actively harmonize with prior activities using the system and framework developed by them. For this harmonization, the REB-TDM needs to first organize the information on INSET activities targeting the improvement of basic education.

7) Supporting the College of Education of the University of Rwanda（UR-CE）in introducing the concept of SBI in its pre-service course

In order for prospective teachers to understand the concept of SBI, the Project needs to support the UR-CE in introducing the concept of SBI in its pre-service course（activity 2.5 in the PDM）.

8) Preparing a budget plan for SBI activities for the next fiscal year

The REB-TDM needs to prepare an annual budget（activity）plans for the next fiscal year. The SBI annual activity plan should include SBI monitoring and experience-sharing workshops.

(2) Time Frame 2：During the nine-month extended Project period（by the end of December 2015）

1) Establishing an SBI monitoring system

The following actions are needed to establish a sustainable monitoring mechanism to assess the implementation of SBI activities. The actions take into consideration the capacity of the REB-TDM in terms of available time and human resources.

   a) Simplification and modification of monitoring tools.
   b) Incorporation of SBI monitoring items into the DEO/SEO performance contracts.
   c) Incorporation of SBI monitoring activities into stakeholders' daily routine tasks.
   d) Analysis of monitoring data by REB members and feedback results to the DEO and SEO.

2) Sharing good practice

For sustainable implementation of SBI, it is essential to establish a system for sharing good practice and deliverables of SBI with stakeholders.

3) Holding experience-sharing workshops

The Project needs to strategize to motivate teachers at each school to initiate SBI activities. To enhance teachers' internal willingness to implement SBI activities, the Project needs to provide opportunities for schools to know other schools SBI experiences.

4) Holding DEO and SEO follow-up workshops

For the sustainability of SBI activities initiated by each school, the role of the SBI external monitoring personnel is crucial. The SBI external monitoring personnel monitors and provides onsite consultation to schools, depending on their needs. The REB-TDM has limitations in terms of time and human resources, and cannot monitor all schools; the SEO is the appropriate personnel for the role. Therefore, it is necessary that the REB-TDM hold DEO and SEO follow-up

workshops to foster their monitoring skills.

(3)　Time Frame 3：No time limitation（i.e. regardless of the Project period）

1)　Generating value on school-based collaborative teacher training

It is important for the REB to continue to valorize collaborative teacher training in order to motivate teachers to initiate SBI to enhance their professional capacity. In addition, the Project needs to share the ultimate goal of SBI : to actualize the lesson for improvement of students' learning（"let students be capable to do it"）by shifting the focus from "how teachers teach" to "how students learn".

2)　Clarifying SBI activities among education policies and other initiatives

Aligning ESSP 2 with the District Development Plan enables DEOs and SEOs to promote and monitor SBI as part of their regular tasks. It is recommended that SBI activities be incorporated into the performance contract of District and Head Teachers, as well as into the School Improvement Plan at the school level. This would make implementation of SBI an official activity of schools.