

Country Name	Project on Enhancement of Local Governance and Community Empowerment on Micro-Watersheds in Misamis Oriental
Philippines	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	The Province of Misamis Oriental is situated in the northern part of Mindanao Island designated as a part of “forests” which are essential areas for conservation to preserve water reservoirs. On the other hand, the Province has serious poverty situation, particularly in the mountainous areas where small pockets of watersheds (less than10,000 hectares) are located. The poverty induced serious environmental problems on soil erosion that results to deterioration of reservoirs and quality of water sources. The central government made several efforts to conserve, preserve and protect forests but could only focus meanwhile on large watershed areas (more than 10,000 hectares). The management of micro-watersheds was decentralized to local government units (LGUs) in 1991 as mandated by the Local Government Code but LGUs have limited resources to formulate participatory barangay development plans for watershed management and implement conservation activities with active involvement of upland farmers. In addition, there was no functional watershed management system which would facilitate cooperation between LGUs and NGOs that were working with upland communities especially on participatory development planning and implementation.												
Objectives of the Project	1. Overall Goal: Management of micro and small-watersheds <sup>1</sup> is improved in Misamis Oriental by collaboration of Local Government Units (LGUs), NGOs and communities. 2. Project Purpose: Management of micro-watersheds is improved in the pilot barangays <sup>2</sup> by collaboration of LGUs, NGO <sup>3</sup> and communities.												
Activities of the project	1. Project site: 8 pilot barangays (Tugasnon, Sungay and Tula in the Municipality of Alubijid and Bakid-bakid, Murallon, Tinulungan, Kipuntos and Kalagunoy in Gingoog City) and 2 additional barangays (Sinai and Lapad) in the municipality of Laguindingan in the Province of Misamis Oriental 2. Main activities <sup>4</sup> : 1) LGU/NGO facilitate participatory planning of barangay development plan and micro watershed management action plan. 2) LGU/NGO implement trainings of conservation farming, agroforestry and alternative livelihoods for the local people. 3) Project implements trainings of participatory planning, conservation farming and micro-watershed management for LGUs and supporting agencies. 4) The municipalities conduct Inter-barangay small-watershed action planning. 5) Project develops manuals for micro-watershed management and participatory barangay development plan. 6) The municipalities Implementation of watershed management-related activities 3. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table><tr><td>Japanese Side</td><td>Philippines Side</td></tr><tr><td>1) Experts: 4 persons</td><td>1. Staff allocated: 46 persons</td></tr><tr><td>2) Trainees received: 6 persons</td><td>2. Land and facilities: Project office in the Provincial Planning and Development office (PPDO) in Cagayan de Oro City, land/space for rainwater harvesting tanks in pilot barangays and in expanded barangays in Alubijid and Laguindingan municipalities</td></tr><tr><td>3) Equipment: PCs, printers, audio visual devices, GPS, GIS software, digital camera, vehicles, and so on.</td><td>3. Cost for project activities</td></tr></table>					Japanese Side	Philippines Side	1) Experts: 4 persons	1. Staff allocated: 46 persons	2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2. Land and facilities: Project office in the Provincial Planning and Development office (PPDO) in Cagayan de Oro City, land/space for rainwater harvesting tanks in pilot barangays and in expanded barangays in Alubijid and Laguindingan municipalities	3) Equipment: PCs, printers, audio visual devices, GPS, GIS software, digital camera, vehicles, and so on.	3. Cost for project activities
Japanese Side	Philippines Side												
1) Experts: 4 persons	1. Staff allocated: 46 persons												
2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2. Land and facilities: Project office in the Provincial Planning and Development office (PPDO) in Cagayan de Oro City, land/space for rainwater harvesting tanks in pilot barangays and in expanded barangays in Alubijid and Laguindingan municipalities												
3) Equipment: PCs, printers, audio visual devices, GPS, GIS software, digital camera, vehicles, and so on.	3. Cost for project activities												
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2007	Project Period	January 2008 to January 2011	Project Cost	230 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Province of Misamis Oriental and Balay Mindanaw Foundation Inc. (BMFI)												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	IC Net Ltd.												

**II. Result of the Evaluation****1 Relevance**

At the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion, the project was found highly relevant to the Philippines' development policy of "environmental conservation and sustainable use of natural resources" as expressed by the Mid-Term Philippine Development Plan (2004-2010) and the Misamis Oriental Provincial Development and Physical Framework Plan. The project was also found consistent with the local development needs of the Province of Misamis Oriental, which emphasizes

<sup>1</sup> Micro-watershed is less than 1,000ha and small-watershed is 1,000 – 10,000ha

<sup>2</sup> Barangay is the smallest unit among the local government units. The others are Provinces, Cities and Municipalities. The provinces are composed of cities and municipalities. The cities and municipalities are composed of barangays.

<sup>3</sup> The counterpart agencies are the Province of Misamis Oriental and Balay Mindanaw Foundation Inc. (BMFI) (NGO)

<sup>4</sup> The activities in Gingoog City were mainly implemented by the staff of BMFI and those in the Municipality of Alubijid were implemented by the municipality with assistance from PPDO and the Provincial Environment and Natural Resources Office (PENRO) staff of the Provincial Government of Misamis Oriental.

proper watershed management to prevent forest degradation and soil erosion caused by illegal logging and slash-and-burn cultivation of most farmers in micro-watershed areas. The project was also consistent with Japan's Country Assistance Plan for the Philippines (2008) which is prioritizing cooperation areas on "supporting self-reliance of the poor" and "improvement of living conditions" at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Therefore, relevance of this project is high.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

The project aims at implementing micro-watershed management activities based on the Barangay Development Plans (BDPs) and Micro-watershed Management Action Plans (MMAPs) in 8 pilot barangays in Alubijid municipality and Gingoog City both in the province of Misamis Oriental through formulation of BDP and MMAP in pilot barangays, enhancement of knowledge and skills of staff of LGUs and NGO to be able to facilitate participatory planning as well as improvement of knowledge and skills of barangay beneficiaries on micro-watershed management.

The Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion. In all 8 pilot barangays, most of the micro-watershed related activities contained in the BDPs, the Annual Investment Plans (AIPs) and MMAPs, which were formulated by the project through participatory planning processes, were implemented. In Alubijid Municipality, the inter-barangay micro-watershed management planning resulted to the formulation of "the Rehabilitation and Protection of Alubijid River Project (REPRAP) which was initially implemented in 11 barangays including 2 pilot barangays. In Gingoog City, all 5 pilot barangays continued their Natural Resource Management (NRM) activities, such as nursery seeds growing to reinforce fruit trees production and thereby sustaining the promotion of agro-forestry and forest protection activities.

For the Overall Goal, all the 8 pilot barangays have been continuing the MMAP-related activities, such as tree growing, fruit tree planting, and vegetable production through the collaborative efforts of people's organizations (POs), barangays officials and municipal government personnel. The benefits deriving from those activities, such as increase in revenue, cooling farms, prevention of soil erosion and improvement of farm utilization, encouraged more participants to join those activities. In Laguindingan municipality, 11 barangays, which received planning workshop and rainwater tanks from the project, have been practicing micro-watershed management activities introduced by the project. REPRAP in Alubijid Municipality is still valid and small-watershed management practices are implemented under REPRAP.

In addition, 1 barangay each of 12 other municipalities have started micro-watershed management activities after the project completion and have sustained activities. 123 of the 171 (72%) barangay beneficiaries interviewed during the ex-post evaluation in Alubijid, Gingoog and Laguindingan municipality recognized improvement of their livelihood through such activities as fruit tree planting, vegetable growing and contour farming. The number of PO members who are engaged themselves in forest conservation and natural resource management increased after project completion owing to the increase in awareness of the need to conserve natural resources. Furthermore, according to interview with respondents, the activities introduced by the project contributed to decreased incidence of landslides and illegal logging activities. There was no negative impact observed during the ex-post evaluation.

Therefore, effectiveness/ impact of the project is high.

Total number of pilot, additional and replicating barangays in the Province of Misamis Oriental

No. of barangays <sup>5</sup>	During the project			After the project	Total
	Pilot	Additional	Replicating	Replicating	
Municipality/City					
Alubijid municipality	3	0	13	0	16
Gingoog city	5	0	1	0	6
Laguindingan	0	2	8	1	11
Other municipalities	0	0	0	12	12
Total	8	2	22	13	45

Source: BMFI & PPDO of the Provincial Government of Misamis Oriental

## Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Improvement of micro-watershed management in the pilot barangays	Indicator1: Micro-watershed management action plans are implemented in collaboration with supporting agencies (LGUs and NGO) at more than six pilot barangays.	(Terminal Evaluation) Achieved. In all the 8 pilot barangays (3 in Alubijid and 5 in Gingoog City), most of the micro-watershed related activities were implemented. (Ex-post Evaluation) All the 8 pilot barangays have been continuing the implementation of MMAP related activities after the project completion.
(Overall goal) Improvement of micro and small-watershed management in Misamis Oriental	Indicator1: Micro and small-watershed management practices are sustained at barangay and small-watershed levels in collaboration with supporting agencies (LGUs and NGOs ) in Misamis Oriental	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. Watershed management practices are sustained in the following barangays: - In Alubijid, 3 pilot barangays 13 remaining barangays which formulated their own Barangay Development Plans by the end of the project. - In Gingoog city, 5 pilot barangays and the replicating barangay (Barangay Lunotan) - In Laguindingan , 2 additional barangays and 9 replicating barangays Watershed management practices are started and sustained in 13 barangays after the project.

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Interviews with counterparts and direct observation at the time of ex-post evaluation

<sup>5</sup> There are 16 barangays in Alubijid municipality, 79 barangays in Gingoog city, and 11 barangays in Laguindingan Municipality in total.

### 3 Efficiency

The project was implemented within the planned period (ratio against the plan: 100%), but the project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 123%) because the project scope was expanded to cover additional sites (2 barangays in Laguindingan municipality, 1 in Gingoog city and 13 other barangays in Alubijid municipality) to ensure larger impact and sustainability of the project. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

### 4 Sustainability

In the policy aspect, there is no significant change in micro and small watershed management in the environment conservation program of the Province of Misamis Oriental.

Institutionally, the facilitating role for local participatory planning and monitoring of micro-watershed management activities was turned-over by BMFI to the Provincial Government of Misamis Oriental since the capability of the Provincial Government was improved through the project activities in addition to lack of funding of the provincial government for development partnerships with NGOs. Since then, the Provincial Government, in collaboration with municipal agriculture offices, took the lead in monitoring MMAP activities in pilot barangays and replicating barangays including BDP and MMAP activities in 12 other barangays of 12 other municipalities which started MMAP activities after project completion. There are only 8 trainers available for micro-watershed management in the Provincial Government (3 staff in PPDO and 5 in ENRO). However, the Provincial Government plans of conducting trainings for trainers in future to sufficiently reach out and effectively encourage all 23 municipalities and 3 cities in the province in order to implement micro-watershed management activities. The Provincial Government is also planning of requesting the Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) to lead the processes of formulating/updating BDPs at the city/municipal and barangay levels in cooperation with related agencies and NGOs. DILG is the responsible agency tasked in recent years to collect BDPs and approve barangay governments' climate change action plans and disaster risk reduction management plans. The POs assisted by the project remain active and are still continuing most of the activities introduced by the project.

In the technical aspect, the materials developed by the project, such as two publications on micro-watershed management and manuals of NRM and BDP formulation, have been utilized as references in conducting workshops and trainings. Most of the counterpart staff of the project are still working for watershed management activities and continuously receiving related trainings that are conducted by the Department of Agriculture (DA) and the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR)<sup>6</sup> from time to time. The POs have been utilizing the skills learned from the project, such as contour farming, fruit and falcata<sup>7</sup> growing, among others.

As for the financial aspect, the Provincial Government of Misamis Oriental has allocated sufficient budget every year for training and monitoring activities of PPDO and PENRO personnel. There is no budget allocated only for the preparation and implementation of BDPs, MMAP activities and NRM activities because the BDP implementation and NRM activities are self-help initiatives of the POs and barangay governments. Each barangay government allocates 5% of their Internal Revenue Allotment (IRA) provided by the central government every year for disaster preparedness and environmental conservation. Approximately ranging from 30,000 to 50,000 pesos every year, this amount is used by barangay governments for activities mostly related to NRM and MMAP activities. The budget for monitoring and training activities of PPDO and PENRO staff is a regular item of the annual provincial government budget.

Based on these findings, it is considered that there are some problems observed in institutional and financial aspects to sustain the project effects; therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project has achieved its purpose and overall goal through the continued implementation by 8 pilot barangays and 37 replicating barangays with most of the micro-watershed management activities introduced by the project. As for sustainability, while the micro-watershed management has been one of key issue in the province, the capacity of the stakeholders including PPDO and PENRO as well as the POs has been sufficient to implement micro-watershed management activities, and the Provincial Government continues its training and monitoring activities for participatory BDP, the institutional mechanism has not been functioning enough. That's because the partnership between the Provincial Government of Misamis Oriental and the BMFI on micro-watershed management was discontinued after project completion due to the insufficient funding. The project cost exceeded due to the expansion of project activities to 16 other barangays for the purpose of achieving larger impact and of securing sustainability.

In the light of above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

## III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

### Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- As most of the BDPs of pilot and replicating barangays are only having a planning horizon of 5 years and therefore expire by 2015, it is recommended that the Provincial Government of Misamis Oriental together with other supporting partner organizations<sup>8</sup> first conduct participatory updating of BDPs for watershed management.

### Lessons learned for JICA:

- In planning a similar project, it is important that budget to sustain collaborative support mechanism of LGU and NGO is secured so that it continues to function even after the phase out of JICA assistance. In this project, the collaboration of the Provincial Government of Misamis Oriental and BMFI was discontinued after project completion because of lack of budget to finance support activities which is necessary to facilitate continuous implementation of micro-watershed management activities in barangay levels.
- In implementing a similar project, it is important that decisions to cover additional areas be based on the budget allocated for the project or on the confirmed availability of budgets of implementing organizations. In this project, the project cost

<sup>6</sup> DA and DENR are departments of central government.

<sup>7</sup> "Falcata" is a kind of broad-leaf tree belonging to the family Fabaceae and genus Albizzia.

<sup>8</sup> Such as NGO (BMFI), the POs which were organized by the project, DENR, DA.

exceeded from the project's plan because the Provincial Government and BMFI decided to expand project activities to new areas without securing local budgets.



Vegetable Growing in Barangay Tinulongan, Gingoog City



Fruit Tree Growing in Barangay Tugasnon, Alubijid Municipality