

Country Name	Project on Gender Mainstreaming & Policy Development through Upgrading Informed and Research Capacity
Kingdom of Cambodia	

I. Project Outline

Background	Due to the internal conflicts which lasted from 1970 to 1993, 60% of the population aged 25 and over were female (1998). Although women played an important role in social and economic reconstruction and development, they were given a lower status socially and economically than that of men and faced various difficulties. Many of the households with women heads were poor. To tackle such gender issues, the Royal Government of Cambodia developed policies on poverty reduction strategies with gender viewpoints and gender mainstreaming in the Socio-Economic Development Plan II (2001-2005). The Ministry of Women's and Veterans' Affairs needed to upgrade their institutional capacity for promoting gender mainstreaming in the line ministries which have implemented development programs.				
Objectives of the Project	Through upgrading institutional capacity of the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) and selected target ministries* for promotion of gender equality, the project aimed at developing a mechanism for gender mainstreaming (PGM Method ¹) in order to promote gender mainstreaming. *Target ministries: Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF), Ministry of Industry, Mines & Energy (MIME), Ministry of Commerce (MoC), Ministry of Rural Development (MRD), Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training (MoLVT) and Ministry of Planning (MOP). Overall Goal: Gender mainstreaming, as one of the key factors to stabilize peace and development, is promoted in the Royal Government of Cambodia. Project Purpose: Effective mechanism for gender mainstreaming is developed through upgrading institutional capacity of the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) and the selected line ministries for promotion of gender equality in the Royal Government of Cambodia.				
Activities of the project	1. Project site: Cambodia (pilot project area: Kampong Cham Province) 2. Main activities: Establishing the Policy Analysis Task Force (PATF), training of PATF members and MoWA personnel on project management, developing gender statistics, implementing pilot gender responsive projects with line ministries, etc. 1. Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side 1) Experts: 17 persons 2) Training in Japan: 30 persons 3) Equipment: vehicle, PCs, projectors, printers, etc. 4) Operation cost for travel expenses, pilot project implementation, etc.) Cambodian Side 1) Staff allocated: 37 persons 2) Land and facilities: Office space and equipment, etc. 3) Operation cost for staff salaries, office utilities, etc.				
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2002	Project Period	April 2003 to March 2008	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 400 million yen (actual) 384 million yen
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) (Restructured from the Ministry of Women's and Veterans' Affairs in 2004)				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Gender Equality Bureau, Cabinet Office				

II. Result of the Evaluation

< Special perspectives considered in the ex-post evaluation >

- Based on the project achievement and experience, the successor project, Project for Gender Mainstreaming Phase 2 (PGM2), was implemented (2010-2015) to strengthen furthermore the gender mainstreaming mechanism, aiming at enforcing the target line ministries' capacity for implementing women's economic empowerment activities with coordination of MoWA. As the method and manuals developed by the project were utilized by PGM2, the effects confirmed by the ex-post evaluation survey include those brought by PGM2.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Cambodia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

The project was consistent with the Cambodian development policies, as gender-based poverty reduction strategies and gender mainstreaming were included as development principles in "the Socio-Economic Development Plan II (2001-2005)" and "the National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) (2006-2010)".

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Cambodia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion >

Due to the internal conflicts which lasted for 25 years, more than half of the population were female. Women played an important role in social and economic reconstruction and development, they were given a lower status than men. Women had other difficulties such as low literacy rate, domestic violence. Thus, there were great needs for gender equality.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

The Country Assistance Program for Cambodia (2002) describes that it is necessary to pay attention to women's participation in the development process for economic development and poverty reduction, and incorporate viewpoints of gender equity in various phases of the assistance.

¹ The PGM Method is a method for gender responsive policy formulation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation, developed by the project through trial implementation with pilot projects with the line ministries. Pilot projects included a project of micro credit management for male and female farmers implemented by MRD, a project for promoting female participation in vocational training implemented by MoLVT, etc.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved; an effective mechanism for gender mainstreaming was developed through upgrading institutional capacity of MoWA and the target ministries for promotion of gender equality. Based on the experience of trial implementation of pilot projects with the line ministries, some PGM Method manuals were developed and policy recommendations were presented to these ministries. Recommended policies include (i) a policy for MRD and its Provincial Departments on gender responsive micro-credit system resulting in reduction of the interest rate following the suggestions/request from the Village Development Committee members and borrowers, (ii) Policy for MoLVT² on women’s participation in non-traditional vocational training by exploring new skills for women and by changing social norm. Some of the recommendations were applied by the targeted ministries, which proved the effectiveness of the recommendations.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The mechanism for gender mainstreaming developed by the project has continued. The PGM Method has been diffused to other government agencies besides the 6 target ministries, and the Gender Mainstreaming Action Group (GMAG) has been organized in as many as 29 ministries and institutions. GMAGs conduct a gender analysis and policy recommendation, participate in the planning process, design the gender mainstreaming action plan (GMAP), and review the programs with gender perspectives. MoWA plays a role as a coordinator, facilitator and mentor in these GMAGs by encouraging them to integrate gender equality into the policies and programs.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was achieved; Gender mainstreaming has been promoted in the country. First, NSDP (2014-2018) mentions the gender-related efforts and achievement of such ministries as the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS), Ministry of Tourism (MOT), Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation (MOSAVY) and MoWA, and considers gender as one of the key cross-cutting issues. Gender perspectives are incorporated in the priority programs of the Ministry of National Assembly-Senate Relations and Inspection (MONASRI), Ministry of Justice (MOJ), Royal Cambodia Armed Forces (RCAF), and so on. Second, in the Neary Rattanak IV (2014-2018) (five-year strategic plan for gender equality and women’s empowerment of MoWA), gender relevance and women’s empowerment are underscored in all the development spheres. Third, gender perspectives have been reflected in other ministries’ policies such as the Agricultural Extension Policy in Cambodia (2015) of MAFF, the Policy on Labor Migration for Cambodia (2014) of MoLVT and the National Strategy for Rural Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene (2011-2025) of MRD.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Super Goal of the project was set as the promotion of gender equality and equity, and the indicator was set as the Gender Inequality Index² (GII). GII of Cambodia decreased from 0.672 (2008) to 0.477 (2014), but it is very difficult to concretely verify this decrease as the project impact, because GII is calculated considering various elements and gender equality is possibly influenced by many other factors than project implementation. However, several positive impacts have reported. First, gender mainstreaming and equality have been promoted through GMAGs’ efforts. The proportion of women in the civil service increased from 32% (2007) to 39% (2015), though it varies among agencies. On the other hand, the percentage of women in the management positions has not changed much (20% in 2013 to 21% in 2015). Second, the PGM Method was applied in ADB project with the Kampong Cham Provincial Department of Agriculture for promoting women’s participation in agricultural activities, with support from the Provincial Department of Women’s Affairs (PDWA). Third, some positive impacts such as the increase of the household income, more attention to the children’s education, expansion of the women’s participation in decision-making, and the decrease of the domestic violence were reported as changes brought by the pilot projects implemented by the PGM Method, according to the completion report of PGM 2.

No negative impacts on the natural and social environment caused by the project have been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the Project Purpose was achieved and has continued. The Overall Goal was achieved. In addition, some positive impacts have been observed. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Effective mechanism for gender mainstreaming is developed through upgrading institutional capacity of MoWA and the selected line ministries for promotion of gender equality in the Royal Government of Cambodia.	1. Recommendations from MoWA and PATF to the selected line ministries on incorporation of gender perspectives in their policy recognized.	(Project Completion) <u>Achieved</u> . - Policy recommendations were developed for the 5 selected ministries. Counterpart personnel and PATF members understood the contents and evaluated them practical. (Ex-post Evaluation) <u>Continued</u> . - GMAG has been organized in the 29 ministries and government institutions in coordination with MoWA.
	2. Developed method for gender responsive policy formulation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation (PGM method).	(Project completion) <u>Achieved</u> . - PGM workshop manual was developed and shared with relevant ministries by the project completion. (Ex-post Evaluation) <u>Continued</u> . - The manual was revised by JICA successor project and published in August 2015. It was distributed to all government agencies and institutions at national and sub-national level including PDWAs.
(Overall goal)	1. Developed gender responsive	(Ex-post Evaluation) <u>Achieved</u> .

2 GII was developed by UNDP. It measures gender inequalities in three important aspects of human development—reproductive health, measured by maternal mortality ratio and adolescent birth rates; empowerment, measured by proportion of parliamentary seats occupied by females and proportion of adult females and males aged 25 years and older with at least some secondary education; and economic status, expressed as labor market participation and measured by labor force participation rate of female and male populations aged 15 years and older.

Gender mainstreaming, as one of the key factors to stabilize peace and development, is promoted in the Royal Government of Cambodia.	policies and strategies, incorporated in NSDP and Neary Rattanak II.	<p>- In NSDP (2014-2018), the gender-related achievement in such ministries as MoEYS, MOT, MOSAVY and MOWA was mentioned. Gender is considered as one of the key cross-cutting issues, and gender perspectives are incorporated in the priority programs of MONASRI, MOJ, RCAF, etc.</p> <p>- In the Neary Rattanak IV (2014-2018), gender relevance and women's empowerment are underscored in all the development spheres.</p>
	2. The portion of gender budget allocation and disbursement.	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) <u>Partially achieved.</u></p> <p>- 466.6 million Cambodian riels (113.8 million USD) are budgeted for gender mainstreaming under NSDP (2014-2018) for the related ministries and institutions.</p>

Source: Interview with MoWA, MAFF, MRD, MoLVT, Kampong Cham Provincial Departments of these ministries, Provincial Training Center (PTC), and beneficiaries (including trainees at PTC, farmers, and borrowers of micro credit service). NSDP (2014-2018), Neary Rattanak IV (2014-2018), and other policy documents of the relevant ministries.

3 Efficiency

Both of the project period and cost were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 100% and 96%, respectively). Therefore, the project efficiency is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

As mentioned in Effectiveness/Impact, gender mainstreaming is prioritized in NSDP (2014-2018), and gender perspectives have been reflected in MoWA and other various ministries' policies

<Institutional Aspect>

MoWA's plays a more important role than that during the project period: facilitating other ministries and institutions, civil society and private sector to integrate gender equality into their policies and programs. The Department of Gender Equality is responsible for promoting gender mainstreaming in the policies of decentralization and for coordination with GMAGs, while the Department of Planning and Statistics is responsible for planning, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) and statistics. The number of the staff is 28 and 20 (4 more staff planned to be added), respectively, and it is sufficient to perform their responsibilities, according to these two departments. MoWA has branches: PDWA and District Office of Women's Affairs (DOWA). In case of Kampong Cham Province, PDWA has 44 staff members and 22 of them work at DOWAs. The staff number is not sufficient, as several staff members were transferred to the new PDWA in Tbong Khmum Province³ and a few staff members are going to be retired soon. In 2016, MoWA is recruiting 50 more staff for PDWAs in the country and 4 will be assigned to Kampong Cham to replace with the retired staffs.

The Technical Working Group on Gender (TWG-G) functions as a cross-institutional forum, chaired by MoWA with JICA and UNDP, as co-lead development partner facilitators, 31 government agencies, 14 development partners and 15 civil society organizations. They discuss for gender-related policies, laws and strategies. TWG-G supports GMAGs' activities such as preparation of GMAPs.

<Technical Aspect>

The staff of the Department of Gender Equality and Department of Planning and Statistics was trained by the project and PGM2 and they have sufficient knowledge and skills for gender-related data collection, planning, M&E, policy recommendation in accordance with the PGM Method, as they have conducted regular training on PGM Method to MoWA and PDWA and provided technical advices to GMAGs, even since the completion of PGM2. In 2016, the departments conducted training courses for PDWAs and DOWA of Battambang, Kamport and Prey Veng Provinces with training materials developed by the project. An interviewed GMAG member (of MoLVT) answered that they still sometimes need to hire consultants to planning and implementation of gender responsive projects. However, based on the experience of the project and PGM2 and also with MoWA's support, most of GMAGs members have developed their capacity for promoting gender mainstreaming. The PGM Method manuals have been utilized for training and project formulation, as well as the gender glossary developed by the project⁴.

<Financial Aspect>

The budget of MoWA comes from the national budget for the four programs (Change of Women's Socio-Economic Status, Legal Protection for Women and Girls, Gender Mainstreaming in National and Sectoral Policies, and Institutional Management and Development. The budget including the allocation to PDWAs has steadily increased for the last five years (Table 1). Since the budget covers also the staff's salary and office operation, it is only enough to conduct training and seminars for dissemination of MoWA's policies and strategies, according to MoWA. It still depends on donor funds to implement projects for gender mainstreaming such as the project and PGM2.

Table 1. Budget of MoWA (million Riels)

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Central	14,453	14,662	14,027	16,923	19,797
PDWAs	15,154	16,389	17,750	18,366	20,877
Total	29,607	30,851	31,777	35,289	40,674

Source: MoWA.

The budget for gender mainstreaming has been secured also at the line ministries. The gender responsive budget allocated to GMAGs has been increasing. For example, the budget of GMAG of MAFF has increased from 50 million riels (2012) to 120 million riels (2015), but interviewed GMAG members answered that the amounts are not sufficient. However, GMAG of MAFF cannot operate the budget flexibly, as there is no office such as the Gender Office at MAFF. In case of MoLVT, the gender responsive budget is allocated to the Gender Office under the Training Department, and the resources necessary for data collection or policy analysis depends on the donor. The budgets of MoWA and GMAGs are still far beyond the planned budget (466.6 million riels) in NSDP (2014-2018).

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, problems have been observed in terms of the financial aspect of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

³ Tbong Khmum Province was formerly the eastern part of Kampong Cham Province and became independent in 2013.

⁴ The glossary is released at MoWA's Facebook: <http://bit.ly/29ctlRB> (posted on 3rd July 2016).

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The effective mechanism for gender mainstreaming was developed through upgrading institutional capacity of MoWA and the target ministries for the promotion of gender equality. The PGM Method developed by the project was applied in all the government agencies. As a result, gender mainstreaming has been promoted as national policies with allocated budgets, and the gender balance has been improved at many government agencies. Regarding the sustainability, no major issues have been confirmed for continuity of MoWA's efforts for gender mainstreaming in other government agencies, except the financial aspect. Although the budgets of MoWA and other agencies have increased, they are not still sufficient to fully implement gender responsive projects.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- The situation for gender mainstreaming varies among ministries and institutions, in terms of the gender balance, budget amount, GMAG's flexibility of the budget execution, implementation of gender responsive projects, etc. In order to further foster gender mainstreaming, it is recommended for MoWA to conduct awareness raising trainings for the top management of the other government agencies. In addition, it is effective that MoWA suggests them to set up a gender audit within each agency to monitor its efforts for gender mainstreaming.

- The gender related budgets have increased but they are still far beyond the plan of NSDP (2014-2018) and insufficient for gender responsive projects. It is recommended that MoWA continues the discussion with the Ministry of Economy and Finance to secure more gender responsive budgets by emphasizing that gender is a crucial perspective in every development spheres such as education, health and economy.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- Based on the project experiences, the group for promoting gender mainstreaming has been established in as many as 29 ministries and institutions including the project target 6 ministries, and gender responsive policies and programs have been formulated and implemented. One of the biggest success factors is the project approach for preparing policy recommendations for the line ministries through implementing pilot gender responsive projects. Through the pilot projects, the local tacit knowledge was accumulated into an explicit mechanism (PGM Method) for policy formation of gender mainstreaming. This approach worked well in fostering the ownership of the line ministries and the continuity of the formulated policies, and also bringing positive impacts on the individual and organizational levels.



(Female and male participants in the training course on building electrical wiring)



(Interview with GMAG members of MRD)