	conducted by Pakistan Office: October 2016						
`	EPI/Polio Control Project						
nciden was sti mmun In t here w women by loca	istan has been one of the countries with the highest child mortality rate. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, ts of polio had been decreasing by donor's support. However, the regular immunization coverage in Pakistan II not optimal and unless this coverage increased, new polio case would be reported. Therefore, regular ization was needed to be further strengthened. Therefore, regular ization was needed to be further strengthened. Therefore including polio was extremely low as were many remote areas with limited access to health care facilities and conventionally it was difficult for to take children to the health facilities alone. On the other hand, health education and health service provided I Lady Health Workers (LHWs) in rural areas had been successful to some extent. Under this background, led Programme on Immunization (EPI) started with LHWs as vaccinators from 2005.						
The proservice LHWs 3) Tramprovemanage	oject aimed that children under the age of two are vaccinated in the target districts by (1) Training on EPI provision to EPI technicians, Lady Health Supervisors and LHWs, and conduct of actual immunization by in the target districts, (2) Awareness raising activities for parents/caretakers and others in the target districts, ining on quality control to Quality Control Laboratory (QCL)/National Institute of Health (NIH) for the ement of quality of vaccines, and (4) Training to Federal and Provincial EPI cells on logistics and data ement for the supply of appropriate vaccines, thereby contributes to reduction in morbidity due to geted vaccine-preventable diseases in the target districts.						
	erall Goal: Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in the target districts. oject Purpose: Children under the age of two are vaccinated in the target districts.						
(1) (2) (3) (3) (7) (1) (2) (2) (4) (5) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7	Swat, Shangla, Buner and Haripur districts in the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) Islamabad (QCL/NIH is located) Balochistan Province, Punjab Province, Sindh Province and KPK (Training on EPI logistics and data management was implemented) in activities: arget district level> Training on EPI service provision to EPI technicians, Lady Health Supervisors and LHWs, and conduct of actual immunization by LHWs. Awareness raising activities for parents/caretakers and others (Not implemented actually due to the worsening security situation) ederal level> Training on quality control to QCL/NIH for the improvement of quality of vaccines. Training on EPI logistics and on routine EPI data management for the supply of appropriate vaccines to Federal and provincial EPI Cells.						
	Pak nciden was sti mmun: In there we women by loca Expand The pro ervice HWs 3) Tra mprovenanage EPI-tar Ov (1) (2) (3) C. Ma <t (1)="" (2)="" (3)<="" (4)="" (5)="" (7)="" td=""></t>						

3. Inputs

<Japanese Side> (1) Dispatch of experts: 13 persons

(1) Staff allocated: 40 persons

<Pakistan Side>

- (2) Acceptance of trainees in Japan: 15 persons
- (2) Land and facilities: project office, cost of electricity and water supply
- (3) Provision of equipment: PCs, printers, projectors, cold chain equipment and others
- (3) Local Cost (for whole project period): 16.2 million Pakistan Rupees

Project Period September 2006 - September 2011 **Ex-Ante Evaluation** 2006 Project Cost 388 million yen Federal EPI of National Institute of Health (NIH), Quality Control Laboratory (OCL) of NIH, Directorate General **Implementing** Health Service of Government (DGHS) of KPK, Executive District Office-Health (EDO-H) in four districts; Swat, Agency Shangla, Buner and Haripur, and EPI cell-Provinces (Punjab, Baluchistan, Sindh) Cooperation Agency International Medical Center of Japan (IMCJ), The Research Foundation for Microbial Diseases of Osaka

in Japan

University (BIKEN)

II. Result of the Evaluation

Although the project was planned to be implemented in Swat, Shangla, Buner, and Haripur districts, the activities in Swat, Shangla and Buner districts were suspended in 2008 and never resumed due to the worsening security situation.

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Pakistan at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

The project was consistent with development policy of Pakistan at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project completion. National Health Policy 2001 prioritized measures against infectious diseases and strengthening of the system for primary health care service provision including immunization was set as the main strategy. At the time of project completion, National Emergency Action Plan for Polio Eradication (NEAP) 2011 and other documents cited that LHWs were obliged to conduct EPI service.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Pakistan at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

The project was consistent with the needs for immunization measures in Pakistan at the time of both ex-ante evaluation and project

completion. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, child mortality of 86/1,000 births (2003) in Pakistan was higher than other South Asian countries. Although many development partners supported immunization in Pakistan, no donors had supported activities in the project target districts except Swat district. At the time of project completion, Pakistan was one of the countries with the highest child mortality rate of infectious diseases and was also one of four countries where polio was not extinct. The regular immunization coverage in Pakistan was not sufficient.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation, as Country Assistance Programme to Pakistan 2005 identified three prioritized areas which included "Ensuring human security and human development". "Basic health service" was included in this area.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The project purpose was achieved in Haripur district by the time of project completion, as the following indicators set to measure the project purpose were attained: (i) The number of immunized children with measles and pentavalent vaccine (Combination of Hepatitis B vaccine & Hib & DPT (Diphtheria-tetanus-pertussis) vaccine)¹ under one year-old is increased, (ii) reported routine EPI coverage (Pentavalent) is increased and (iii) Drop-out (1st dose-3rd dose) rate of Pentavalent is reduced. Although the project contributed to this progress mainly by introducing LHWs' involvement in EPI service from 2009, it is difficult to attribute this results solely to the project as the number of vaccination started increasing earlier than the project implementation.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

After the project completion, the number of children with pentavalent vaccine under one year old slightly increased in Haripur except in 2012. The coverage of pentavalent was decreased in 2012, however, was increased again in 2013 and 2014. According to the EDO-H of Haripur, the activities under the project, such as training for EPI technicians and medical doctors, textbooks for EPI technicians and monitoring mechanism developed by the project, review/evaluation of outreach activities and others, contributed to the performance. As to the drop-out rate, although it was increased from 2011 to 2013, it was decreased in 2014.

LHWs keep providing vaccination services at their Health Houses where they are assigned approximately 200 households for taking care of their immunization, while Fix and Outreach activities are task of medical officers and EPI technicians. Vaccination of measles and BCG by LHWs is restricted. The number of vaccination of measles was decreased in 2014. This was not only because there was a shortage of vaccine but also LHWs' visits to outreach destination were restricted due to their active involvement in other assignment. LHWs have not been trained yet on vaccination of BCG to children. BCG is technically skillful task and needs intensive training. Secondly there are more chances of wastage, therefore only trained vaccinators perform BCG vaccination.

The Iceland refrigerators supplied to Haripur district are functional, but proper maintenance is not carried out.

As to the improvement in logistics and data management for the supply of appropriate vaccines, the stock-out days of vaccines and maximum interval of vaccine have been improved in all provinces. Although the project does not directly influence the improvement, the recording forms introduced by the project are still used by the provincial stock keepers and facilitate the procurement of vaccines.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The overall goal has been mostly achieved in Haripur district at the time of ex-post evaluation. Basically, Haripur district has been Polio free since the completion of the project. Conduct of quality campaigns and efficient and strong routine immunization was the main contributing factor. The incidence of neonatal tetanus is reduced in Haripur as a result of better coverage by LHWs. Also timely awareness raising campaign was the main contributing factor. The incidence of measles in Haripur had been reduced during the project period. Although, there was an upsurge in 2012 and 2013, it was reduced in 2014 again. The issues of vaccine procurement created instability in the KPK province. Furthermore, bureaucratic delays in operating the program in the field along with delays in supply of vaccine from federal to provincial government were responsible for the sudden increase of cases in 2012 and 2013.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post evaluation>

No negative impact on natural environment has been observed. No land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project. <Evaluation Result>

The project mostly has achieved its project purpose and overall goal in Haripur district. However, it is difficult to judge whether they were achieved in Swat, Shangla and Bruner because intervention was actually not carried out in these target districts². Therefore, effectiveness/impact of the project are fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim		Indicators					Results		
(Project Purpose)	1.	The number of immunized	Status of a	achievement	: Achieve	ed in Haripu	ır distric	<u>t</u>	
Children under the		children with measles and							
age of two are		pentavalent vaccine under	(Project C	Completion)					
vaccinated in the		one year-old is increased.	1) pentava	alent vaccina	ation				
target districts.				1st do	se	2nd do	se	3rd d	ose
				Number	%	Number	%	Number	%
			2006	18,608	62.5	18,500	62.1	16,757	56.3
			2007	23,283	72.6	21,018	65.6	21,295	66.4
			2008	27,537	90.7	26,291	86.6	25,975	85.5

¹ Indicators were DPT in 2006, Combination of Hepatitis B vaccine and DPT (2007-2008) and Pentavalent (2009-2010). The indicators changed since the types of vaccines in EPI in Pakistan changed from time to time.

²The data on project purpose and overall goal in Swat, Shangla and Buner district is not presented in this report since intervention was not made in these districts and therefore, the achievement/non-achievement of the project purpose and overall goal in these districts are irrelevant to the project. In these districts, lack of social mobilization/awareness was found.

			2009	26,454		5.2 25,	130 8	1.9	25,603	,	82.5			
			2010	31,111	. 111	.5 31,	189 11	1.8	30,692	2	110.0			
			2) Measle	s Vaccinati	ion									
			2) Wedsic		2006	2007	20	800	200	9	2010)		
			Number	Not a	available	21,0	51 2	4,404	26,	788	26,1	53		
			%	Not a	available	84	%	86%	8	88%	84	4%		
				- •										
				Evaluation) alent vacci		*-								
			1) I Ciliava	1st do			2nd dose		3rd dose					
				Number	%	Number	%	Num		%				
			2011	31,329	99	30,674	98	30	,827	99	9			
			2012	27,020	77	27,183	77	27	,020	77	7			
			2013	30,489		31,162			,489	84				
			2014	31,517	_				,517	88			1 . 1:	
				gures are			-	_				•	*	
			counterpar		other in	urcators).	riic reas	011 101	uiscic	parici	ics was	not answ	cred by t	
			•											
			2) Measle	s Vaccinati	ion						_			
				2011		2012	20		20					
			Number %		7,927 88%	28,589 81%	3	2,221 89%	3	0,202 84%				
	2.	Reported routine EPI		nchieveme	-		rinur di			84%	0			
	2.	coverage (Pentavalent) is	Status of t	icine venici	nt. / ten	icved iii ii	inpur un	strict						
		increased.	(Project C	ompletion	1)									
				coverage i										
				Although the coverage expanded, interpretation of this figure should be made ver										
				-				-			-			
			care	fully as th	ne cove	rage (imm	ınized p	opulati	on/targ	et po	opulatio	n) in Har	ipur distr	
			care	fully as th ved over 1	ne cove 100%. T	rage (imm The reason	inized pof the ca	opulationse opulat	on/targ	get po sume	opulatio d that th	n) in Har ne populat	ipur distr tion data t	
			care show cove	fully as th wed over 1 crage calcu	ne cover 100%. Tulation	rage (imm The reason	inized pof the ca	opulationse opulat	on/targ	get po sume	opulatio d that th	n) in Har ne populat	ipur distr tion data t	
			care show cove (Ex-post I - The	fully as the wed over 1 erage calcue Evaluation) coverage i	ne cover 00%. Talation in) is show	rage (imm The reason may be low n in the tal	inized pof the cater than a	opulation opulat	on/targ be ass umber tor 1.	get po sume base	opulation of that the	n) in Har ne populat e census i	ipur distr tion data t n 1998.	
			care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The	fully as the ved over 1 erage calcueration) coverage is coverage is	ne cover 100%. Tallation to) is show was dec	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tall creased in 2	of the caser than a sole in the colle, how	opulations	on/targ be ass umber tor 1.	get po sume base	opulation of that the	n) in Har ne populat e census i	ipur distr tion data i n 1998.	
	3.	Drop-out rate of	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The	fully as the wed over 1 erage calcue Evaluation) coverage i	ne cover 100%. Tallation to) is show was dec	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tall creased in 2	of the caser than a sole in the colle, how	opulations	on/targ be ass umber tor 1.	get po sume base	opulation of that the	n) in Har ne populat e census i	ipur distr tion data i n 1998.	
	3.	Drop-out rate of Pentavalent is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculustion) coverage is coverage which is coverage with the coverage of the co	ne cover 100%. Tulation in 100%. Tulation in 100	rage (imm the reason may be low in in the tal creased in 2	of the case than a sole in the color, horizontal distribution of the color of the c	opulations	on/targ be ass umber tor 1.	set posume base	opulation dependent on the design of the des	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013	ipur distrition data in 1998. and 2014	
	3.	•	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 grage calcude according to coverage is coverage which is completion.	ne cover 100%. Tallation in) is show was decent: Ach i) Drop-	rage (imm the reason may be low n in the tal creased in a ieved in H	of the case than a sole in the collent than a collent the collent the collent distributed been determined been determined been described by the collection of the col	opulations	on/targ be ass umber tor 1. was ind	set posume base creas	opulation dependent on the design of the des	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013	ipur distrition data in 1998. and 2014	
	3.	•	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage which is completion ased from	ne cover 00%. T ulation n) is show was decent: Ach a) Drop- 851 cas	rage (imm the reason may be low n in the tal creased in a ieved in H	of the case than a sole in the collent than a collent the collent the collent distributed been determined been determined been described by the collection of the col	opulations	on/targ be ass umber tor 1. was ind	set posume base creas	opulation dependent on the design of the des	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013	ipur distrition data in 1998. and 2014	
	3.	•	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 grage calcude according to coverage is coverage which is completion.	ne cover 00%. T ulation n) is show was decent: Ach a) Drop- 851 cas	rage (imm the reason may be low n in the tal creased in a ieved in H	of the case than a sole in the collent than a collent the collent the collent distributed been determined been determined been described by the collection of the col	opulations	on/targ be ass umber tor 1. was ind	creas 1 200	opulation dependent on the design of the des	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013	ipur distrition data in 1998. and 2014	
	3.	•	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a (Project C) was decre (Ex-post I	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage which is completion ased from	ne cover 100%. Tallation in) is show was decent: Ach a) Drop- 851 cas)	rage (imm the reason may be low in in the tal creased in 2 ieved in H out rate hases into 41	unized pof the carer than a see that a see than a see that a see than a see that a see thad a see that a see t	opulation opulat	be assumber tor 1. was incomed from 29 to 2	creas 1 200	opulation that the don the sed again	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013	ipur distrition data in 1998. and 2014	
	3.	•	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage vachievement completion ased from Evaluation cate (1st dos rict Haripu	ne cover 100%. Tallation in) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop- 851 cas) se-3 rd do ur provi	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tal creased in 2 ieved in H cout rate has ses into 41	unized p of the ca er than a ele in the 1012, ho uripur di d been d of cases fi n Haripur te" only.	opulations of the control of the con	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 29 to 2	creas 1 200	opulation d that the d on the sed again 188; The 1	n) in Har ne populate e census i n in 2013	and 2014 f drop-out	
*	3.	•	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculustion) coverage is coverage is coverage ompletion ased from Evaluation)	ne cover 100%. Tallation in) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop- 851 cas) se-3 rd do ur provi	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tal creased in 2 ieved in H cout rate has ses into 41	unized p of the ca er than a ele in the 1012, ho uripur di d been d of cases fi n Haripur te" only.	opulations of the control of the con	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 29 to 2	creas 1 200	opulation d that the d on the sed again 188; The 1	n) in Har ne populate e census i n in 2013	and 2014 f drop-out	
(Overall Goal) Morbidity due to	J.	Pentavalent is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage vachievement completion ased from Evaluation cate (1st dos rict Haripu	ne cover 100%. Tallation in is show was decent: Ach in Drop- 851 cas) se-3 rd do ur provi	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tal creased in A ieved in H ses into 41 ded the "ra ieved in H	unized p of the ca er than a ole in the ole in the ole in the ole of the ole	opulation use can actual number of the can act	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 29 to 2	get po get po base creas	opulation of that the door the sed again 188; The 1	n) in Har ne populate e census i n in 2013 number of	and 2014 f drop-out	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted	J.	Pentavalent is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post I Drop-out *The Dist	fully as the ved over 1 grage calculation coverage is coverage in coverage in coverage in coverage is coverage in	ne cover 100%. Tallation in) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop- 851 cas) se-3 rd do cur provi nt: Ach	rage (imm the reason may be low n in the tal creased in 2 dieved in H cout rate has ses into 41 ded the "ra dieved in H 2007 2	unized p of the ca er than a ole in the colla, hor uripur dis olid been d olid cases fi olid been d olid cases fi olid been d olid been d olid cases fi olid been d olid been	opulation opulat	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 1. 1.659	get possume i base creas 1 200 010.	opulation d that the d on the sed again and the sed again again and the sed again ag	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013 number of 2013 7.12%	ipur distrition data in 1998. and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00%	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable	1.	Pentavalent is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage vachievement completion ased from Evaluation crate (1st dos rict Haripunchievement)	ne cover 100%. Tallation in is show was decent: Ach in Drop- 851 cas) se-3 rd do ur provi	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tal creased in A ieved in H ses into 41 ded the "ra ieved in H	unized p of the ca er than a ole in the ole in the ole in the ole of the ole	opulation use can actual number of the can act	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 29 to 2	get po get po base creas	opulation d that the d on the sed again 188; The 1	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013 number of 2013 7.12%	ipur distrition data in 1998. and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00%	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 grage calculation coverage is coverage vachievement from Evaluation coverage vachievement (1st dos rict Haripun achievement)	ne cover 100%. Tallation in) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop- 851 cas) se-3 rd do our provi ent: Ach 2006	rage (imm The reason may be low n in the tal creased in 2 dieved in H cout rate hases into 41 ded the "ra dieved in H 2007 2 0	unized p of the ca er than a ole in the 1012, ho uripur di d been d o cases fi n Haripur te'' only, uripur dis 008 20	opulation opulat	on/targ be ass umber tor 1. was ine d from 09 to 2 2011 1.659	get possume base base 1 200 010.	2012 5.97%	n) in Har ne populate e census in in 2013 number of 2013 7.12%	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00%	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage vachievement completion ased from Evaluation crate (1st dos rict Haripunchievement)	ne cover 100%. Tulation 11) is show was decent: Ach 11) Drop-851 cas 11) is se-3 rd do ur provient: Ach 12006 0	rage (imm The reason may be low n in the tal creased in 2 dieved in H rout rate has ses into 41 sec/1st dose) ded the "ra dieved in H 2007 2 0 pooliovirus	unized pof the care than a set th	opulation opulat	on/targ be ass umber tor 1. was ind d from 09 to 2 2011 1.65%	eet possume base base creas 1 200 010.	2012 5.97% 2011 (1) han Set	n) in Har ne populate e census in in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% Camp. The	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post I Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a por parent's m	fully as the wed over 1 brage calculation coverage is coverage with the coverage of the covera	ne cover 100%. Tallation in 100%. Tallation in 100% is show was decent: Ach in 100% is se-3 rd do tallation in 100% i	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tal creased in A ieved in H cout rate hases into 41 cet 1st dose) ded the "ra ieved in H 2007 2 0 coliovirus a coli	nnized pof the care than a set th	opulation use can actual number of the can act	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 29 to 2 2011 1.659 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	eet possume base creas 1 200 010. Afglrus fint lea	bed again 188; The 1988; The 1989; T	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 ttlement C ghanistan	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 during 1	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained.	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post I Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a pop parent's m has been g	fully as the wed over 1 brage calculation) coverage is coverage with the coverage of achievement of the coverage of the covera	ne cover 100%. Tallation in 100%	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tal preased in A second in H second in H and the fraction of the f	nnized p of the ca er than a ole in the ole in the ole in the ole in the ole on the ole	opulation use can actual market and market a	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 0.9 to 2.011 1.659.00000000000000000000000000000000000	eet possume base creas 1 200 010. Afglrus fint lea	bed again 188; The 1988; The 1989; T	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 ttlement C ghanistan	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 during 1	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained. The incidence of measles	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post I Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a pop parent's m has been g	fully as the wed over 1 brage calculation coverage is coverage with the coverage of the covera	ne cover 100%. Tallation in 100%	rage (imm The reason may be low in in the tal preased in A second in H second in H 2007 2 0 pooliovirus and So it is e completi	nnized p of the ca er than a ole in the ole in the ole in the ole in the ole on the ole	opulation use can actual market and market a	be assumber tor 1. was income d from 0.9 to 2.011 1.659.00000000000000000000000000000000000	eet possume base creas 1 200 010. Afglrus fint lea	bed again 188; The 1988; The 1989; T	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 ttlement C ghanistan	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% Camp. The	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained.	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post I Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a pop parent's m has been g	fully as the wed over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage with the coverage of the covera	ne cover 100%. Tulation 1) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop-851 cas 1) se-3 rd do ur provient: Ach 2006 0 f wild part a cleo Pakistissince the ent: Part	rage (imm The reason may be low n in the tal creased in A ieved in H cout rate has ses into 41	nnized pof the care than a set th	opulation opulat	on/targ be ass umber tor 1. was inc d from 09 to 2 2011 1.65% om an the vin t that a t in 20 istrict	eet possume base creas 1200 010. Afgl rus finat lea 111.	population of that the door the deed again and the deed again	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 tlement C ghanistan our's local	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 0 Camp. The during I population	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained. The incidence of measles	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a por parent's m has been p	fully as the ved over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage in	ne cover 100%. Tallation 1) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop-851 cas 1) se-3 rd do 10 ur provient: Ach 2006 0 f wild proper at a cloo Pakististince them: Part	rage (imm The reason may be low In in the tal creased in A ses into 41 Sec/1st dose) ded the "ratioved in H 2007 2 ooliovirus mild might an. So it is e completically achies."	nnized p of the ca er than a ole in the col2, hor oripur di d been d o cases fi n Haripur te" only uripur di n 2012 o have bi establis on of the zed in Haripur 2009	opulation use can actual market are come 200 strict same fir cought hed face project aripur cought 2010	be assumber tor 1. was income and the virt that at in 20 district 201	eet possume base creas 1 200 010. Afglrus fi att lea 111.	population of that the door the ded again where the door the	n) in Har ne populate e census in in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 tlement C ghanistan pur's local	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 0 Camp. The during I population	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained. The incidence of measles	care show cove (Ex-post I - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post I Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a pop parent's m has been g	fully as the ved over 1 brage calculation coverage is coverage in	ne cover 100%. Tallation 1) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop-851 cas 1) se-3 rd do 10 ur provient: Ach 2006 0 f wild prata a cloo Pakistissince the 1006 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20	rage (imm The reason may be low n in the tal creased in A ieved in H cout rate has ses into 41	nnized p of the ca er than a ole in the col2, hor oripur di d been d o cases fi n Haripur te" only uripur di n 2012 o have bi establis on of the zed in Haripur 2009	opulation opulat	be assumber tor 1. was income and the virt that at in 20 district 201	eet possume base creas 1200 010. Afgl rus finat lea 111.	population of that the door the ded again and the door the ded again and the door the ded again and the door th	n) in Har ne populat e census i n in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 tlement C ghanistan our's local	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 0 Camp. The during I population	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained. The incidence of measles	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a por parent's rr has been r Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 brage calculation coverage is coverage in	ne cover 100%. Tallation 1) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop-851 cas 1) se-3 rd do air provient: Ach 2006 0 f wild prata a cloo Pakist since the ent: Part 1006 20 2	rage (imm The reason may be low In in the tall creased in 2 lieved in H see/1st dose) ded the "ratioved in H 2007 2 0 looliovirus and might an. So it is a completic in the completion of the completion in the completion of the completion in the completion in the completion of the completion in the completion of the completion in the compl	nnized p of the ca er than a ole in the col12, hor oripur did d been d o cases fi n Haripur te" only tripur did on 2012 of have by establis on of the ord in Haripur 2009 12	opulation use can actual market are come 200 strict strict same frought hed face project aripur come 2010 market aripur come 2	be assumber tor 1. was income and the virt that at in 20 district 201	eet possume base creas 1 200 010. Afglrus fi att lea 111.	population of that the door the ded again where the door the	n) in Har ne populate e census in in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 tlement C ghanistan pur's local	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 0 Camp. The during I population	
*	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained. The incidence of measles is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a por parent's rr has been r Status of a	fully as the ved over 1 brage calculation coverage is coverage in	ne cover 100%. Tallation 1) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop-851 cas 1) se-3 rd do air provient: Ach 2006 0 f wild prata a cloo Pakist since the ent: Part 1006 20 2	rage (imm The reason may be low In in the tall creased in 2 lieved in H see/1st dose) ded the "ratioved in H 2007 2 0 looliovirus and might an. So it is a completic in the completion of the completion in the completion of the completion in the completion in the completion of the completion in the completion of the completion in the compl	nnized p of the ca er than a ole in the col12, hor oripur did d been d o cases fi n Haripur te" only tripur did on 2012 of have by establis on of the ord in Haripur 2009 12	opulation use can actual market are come 200 strict strict same frought hed face project aripur come 2010 market aripur come 2	be assumber tor 1. was income and the virt that at in 20 district 201	eet possume base creas 1 200 010. Afglrus fi att lea 111.	population of that the door the ded again where the door the	n) in Har ne populate e census in in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 tlement C ghanistan pur's local	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 0 Camp. The during I population	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained. The incidence of measles is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a por parent's rr has been r Status of a	fully as the wed over 1 crage calculation coverage is coverage with a coverage	ne cover 100%. Tallation 1) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop-851 cas 1) se-3 rd do air provient: Ach 2006 0 f wild prata a cloo Pakist since the ent: Part 1006 20 2	rage (imm The reason may be low In in the tall creased in 2 lieved in H see/1st dose) ded the "ratioved in H 2007 2 0 looliovirus and might an. So it is a completic in the completion of the completion in the completion of the completion in the completion in the completion of the completion in the completion of the completion in the compl	nnized pof the care than a set th	opulation actual nuse can actu	on/targ be assumber tor 1. was income and from 0. 1.65% on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on at in 2011 1.50 on at in 2011 1.50 on	eet possume base creas 1 200 010. Afglrus fi att lea 111.	population of that the door the ded again where the door the	n) in Har ne populate e census in in 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 tlement C ghanistan pur's local	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 0 Camp. The during I population	
Morbidity due to EPI-targeted vaccine-preventable diseases is reduced in	1.	Pentavalent is reduced. Polio free is maintained. The incidence of measles is reduced.	care show cove (Ex-post F - The - The Status of a (Project C was decre (Ex-post F Drop-out *The Dist Status of a The nur polio case * The sing was a por parent's rr has been r Status of a	fully as the wed over 1 brage calculation coverage is coverage in	ne cover 100%. Tulation 1) is show was decent: Ach 1) Drop-851 cas 1) se-3 rd do ar provient: Ach 2006 0 f wild proper at a cloop Pakist since the one is since the control of the contro	rage (imm The reason may be low In in the tal Breased in H	nnized pof the care than a set th	opulation actual nuse can actu	on/targ be assumber tor 1. was income and from 0. 1.65% on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an the virt that at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on an attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on attention of the virtual at in 20 district 2011 1.50 on at in 2011 1.50 on at in 2011 1.50 on	eet posume base creas 1200 010. Afgl rus fint lea 111.	population of that the door the ded again and that the door the ded again and the ded again agai	n) in Har ne populate e census i nin 2013 number of 2013 7.12% 2 2013 * 0 ttlement C eghanistan our's local 2013 2013 360	and 2014 f drop-out 2014 5.00% 2014 0 Camp. The during I population	

Although the project period was as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan:

105%). Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The project is supported by the current policy as National EPI Policy 2014 and other policy documents support effective utilization of LHWs including immunization of children and pregnant women.

<Institutional Aspect>

After the devolution, each provincial government has more authority and responsibility for EPI implementation while the federal government still has the role of developing policies and guidelines for provinces. The KPK provincial cell is headed by one deputy director with three assistant directors and has various support staffs. Four EPI technicians are arranged to EDO-H of Haripur and at least four staffs are arranged to each EPI center. Nevertheless, the number of staff including EPI vaccinators/technicians of KPK province is insufficient compared to the population.

<Technical Aspect>

Most of the staff of the KPK provincial cell and EDO-H of Haripur have necessary skills, however, there is little chance to brush up their skills. In addition, though they have capacity to deal with logistics and data management, further enhancement of technical capacity is necessary as any kind of refresher training has not been conducted.

<Financial Aspect>

The budgets of both of the KPK provincial EPI cell and EDO-H of Haripur are insufficient. However, the World Bank will implement National Immunization Support Project of approximately US\$ 400 million including support for KPK province and all its districts in next 5 years.

<Evaluation Result>

Some problems have been observed in terms of institutional, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, sustainability of the project effects is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project has mostly achieved its project purpose and overall goal in Haripur district as the number of children immunized with measles and pentavalent vaccine has been increased and the Polio free has been maintained, and incidence of measles and neonatal tetanus has been reduced. However, the activities of the project could not be implemented in the rest of the target areas due to the security reason. Therefore, effectiveness/impact of the project are fair. Although the project period was as planned, the project cost exceeded the plan. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair. Some problems have been observed in terms of institutional, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, sustainability of the project effects is fair. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

< Recommendations for Implementing Agency>

- 1. An adequate amount of budget should be allocated to the provincial government for the refresher training of the LHWs, especially on improvement of their skills for BCG and measles vaccination.
- 2. The Iceland refrigerators provided to Haripur district have been in use for five years. Although they are still functional, EDO-H of Haripur should introduce proper maintenance manuals and assign persons who should check preserving condition constantly so that vaccines shall be stored at proper temperatures.
- 3. The districts should request the provincial government to assign personnel preferably female for the services of social mobilization, who will pay weekly visits to the communities to convince them of importance of immunizing their children and adverse consequences of neglecting this important lifesaving task.

<Lessons Learned for JICA>

The suspension of activities in the three project districts (Swat, Shangla and Buner) should have been reflected in the revised PDM. This could have showed appropriate evaluation results in terms of revised scope of the project. It could have been better if JICA had selected three another districts replacing the districts in which project activities were closed.



Meeting with the Health Authorities



Checking the data