

External Evaluator: Sachiko Matsumoto (Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development)

Country Name	<b>Uzbekistan-Japan Center for Human Development (Phase 2)</b>
Republic of Uzbekistan	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	<p>Since becoming independent in 1991, Uzbekistan has gradually liberalized its economy toward a more market-oriented one. Accordingly, the country's government has prioritized the development of human resource to contribute to a market economy. Simultaneously, the idea to establish the Japan Center<sup>2</sup> as the base for training practitioners who promote market-oriented economic reform and realize "aid with a Japanese flag" in Asian and former Soviet Union countries on the road to a market economy. In Uzbekistan, the Japanese and Uzbekistani governments agreed on establishing the Uzbekistan-Japan Center (hereafter referred to as "UJC"). Following "the project for the Uzbekistan-Japan Center for Human Development" (December 2000 to November 2005, hereafter referred to as "Phase 1"), this project (hereafter referred to as "Phase 2") was implemented to further strengthen the functions of the UJC.</p> <p>Since the project newly rolled out training nationwide, UJC Bukhara opened in 2007 in collaboration with Bukhara State University. UJC Bukhara was expected to serve for assessment of training needs and consideration of effective and efficient management methods for training in other regional cities in Uzbekistan.</p> <p>After the project's completion, the following projects were continuously implemented: "Project for Capacity Development of Business Persons through Uzbekistan-Japan Center for Human Development" (December 2010 to November 2015, herein after referred to as "Phase 3") and "Project for Capacity Development of Business Persons and Networking through Uzbekistan-Japan Center for Human Resource Development" (December 2015 to November 2020, herein after referred to as "Phase 4").</p>														
Objectives of the Project	<p>The project sought to strengthen the UJC staff's capacity as well as build and institutionalize the management system to provide three main programs, which are business courses, Japanese-language courses and mutual understanding activities<sup>3</sup> effectively and efficiently. In so doing, the project was expected to develop the base for training business people and promote mutual understanding between the two countries at the UJC.</p> <p>1. Overall Goal:                  1) Human resources related to the private sector responding to the market economy in Uzbekistan will be developed.                  2) Mutual understanding between the people both of Uzbekistan and Japan will be promoted.</p> <p>2. Project Purpose:                  The function of the UJC as a base contributing 1) to human resources development in area of Small and Medium-sized Enterprises (SMEs) of Uzbekistan toward a market economy, 2) to mutual understanding between the people both of Uzbekistan and Japan, will be promoted.</p>														
Activities of the project	<p>1. Project site: Tashkent, Bukhara</p> <p>2. The main activities were as follows. 1) Development of an annual plan for the UJC and operation plans for each course. 2) Implementation of business courses, Japanese-language courses, and mutual-understanding activities in the capital city (Tashkent) and regional cities (mainly in Bukhara). 3) Capacity building of the UJC staff. 4) Enhancement of public relations etc.</p> <p>3. Inputs (to carry out above activities)</p> <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Uzbekistan Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Experts: 99 persons(cumulative)</td> <td>1. Staff allocated: 2 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Trainees received: 65 persons</td> <td>2. 2 floors in International Business Center in Tashkent, Facility of Bukhara State University in Bukhara</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Equipment: Audiovisual equipment, photocopy machines, personal computers, books for UJC libraries</td> <td>3. Expenses of utilities including water, electricity, heat and others (Expenses for UJC Bukhara were borne by Bukhara State University).</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4. Local operation costs</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>					Japanese Side	Uzbekistan Side	1. Experts: 99 persons(cumulative)	1. Staff allocated: 2 persons	2. Trainees received: 65 persons	2. 2 floors in International Business Center in Tashkent, Facility of Bukhara State University in Bukhara	3. Equipment: Audiovisual equipment, photocopy machines, personal computers, books for UJC libraries	3. Expenses of utilities including water, electricity, heat and others (Expenses for UJC Bukhara were borne by Bukhara State University).	4. Local operation costs	
Japanese Side	Uzbekistan Side														
1. Experts: 99 persons(cumulative)	1. Staff allocated: 2 persons														
2. Trainees received: 65 persons	2. 2 floors in International Business Center in Tashkent, Facility of Bukhara State University in Bukhara														
3. Equipment: Audiovisual equipment, photocopy machines, personal computers, books for UJC libraries	3. Expenses of utilities including water, electricity, heat and others (Expenses for UJC Bukhara were borne by Bukhara State University).														
4. Local operation costs															
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2005	Project Period	December 2005 to November 2010	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 650 million yen (actual) 740 million yen										
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Foreign Economic Relations, Investment, Trade (MFERIT)														
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Japanese language courses: The Japan Foundation Business courses: PADECO Co., Ltd.														

<sup>1</sup> As FY2015 external ex-post evaluation, 11 projects related to the Japan Center (technical cooperation projects) including this project in eight countries were evaluated together. This aimed at not only ex post evaluation of individual projects, but also comprehensive analysis of these projects, in order to draw comprehensive and versatile lessons to further improve the Japan Center projects. Since this project cost was less than 1 billion yen, the ex-post evaluation was conducted in accordance with the internal evaluation method without the field survey by a Japanese consultant, and therefore, the report format for the internal evaluation was used.

<sup>2</sup> At the time of the ex-post evaluation, 10 Japan Centers had been established in nine countries: Southeast Asia (Cambodia, Vietnam [Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh], Myanmar and Laos), East and Central Asia (Mongolia, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz) and Ukraine.

<sup>3</sup> Mutual understanding activities were periodic cultural events (Japanese calligraphy, origami, Uzbek traditional music instrument), showing Japanese movies, study-abroad fairs and management of UJC libraries.

## II. Result of the Evaluation

< Special perspectives considered in the evaluation of Effectiveness/Impact >

- The indicators of the project purpose and the outputs, which did not follow a logical relationship, were adjusted, and one of the indicator of the project purpose was replaced with the proxy indicator, for it was difficult to collect current data. Moreover, indicators without quantitative target numbers could not be analyzed using the basic evaluation principle of JICA, which entails verification of the level of achievement based on planned targets. In this regard, when there is an improvement at the time of ex-post evaluation relative to the situation during the project-implementation period, it is positively evaluated as an achievement.

### 1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Uzbekistan at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion >

Supporting SMEs and human resources contributed to a market economy is in compliance with the presidential decree of 1991 and the government's development policy known as "Welfare Improvement Strategies (2008-2010)." At the time of project completion, consistency with the development policy of the government of Uzbekistan was confirmed by the government's proclamation that 2011, the year after Phase 2 completion, would be the "year of small business and private enterprise."

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Uzbekistan at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion >

Regarding consistency with the development needs of training SMEs, between ex-ante evaluation (2005) and project completion (2010), there was an increase of number of companies from 268,600 to 459,500. Over this same period, share of SMEs in GDP increased from 38% to 53%, and share of SMEs in total employment from 67% to 74%<sup>4</sup>. SMEs account for a considerable part of the social economy of Uzbekistan, so this increase revealed significant need for human resource development of SMEs.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation >

In November 2001, Japan's study group for economic cooperation set support for Uzbekistan's gradual economic reform as one of assistance priorities. According to JICA's Country Cooperation Program, at the time of ex ante evaluation, this project was regarded as human-resource development for promoting a market economy. In August 2004, Japan initiated "the Central Asia plus Japan" dialogue and agreed on 5 areas including promotion of business relationships and cultural and human exchanges between Central Asia and Japan. Based on these policies and initiatives, the project was consistent with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Evaluation Result >

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

### 2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion >

The project purpose of promoting the function of the UJC as the base of human resource development to contribute to a market economy and mutual understanding between the people of Uzbekistan and Japan has been mostly achieved. Three main courses accomplished a stable amount of participants and high levels of satisfaction. The total number of visitors to UJC Tashkent and UJC Bukhara exceeded 70,000 every year from 2006 to 2010. At the end of Phase 2 in 2010, the Japanese language courses were decreased due to the expected termination of dispatching Japanese language experts to Uzbekistan (as discussed later, the dispatch was later renewed). However, one well-known business course, the Professional Management Program (hereafter referred to as "PMP") had a great number of applicants, reaching an application-to-enrollment ratio of almost 3:1.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation >

The function of the UJC as a base contributing to human-resource development of private sector and mutual understanding between both countries are strengthened and continuously being improved. The number of business course participants has increased considerably as a function of the increased number of seminars. In particular, the application-to-enrollment ratio has been greater than 2:1 for the PMP course. Japanese language courses<sup>5</sup> were provided continuously from December 2010 to August 2012 by only Uzbekistani staff; during that time, there was an absence of Japanese experts. In September 2012, an assistance dispatching Japanese language experts was renewed by the Japan Foundation. Since then, the number of participants has been growing. The total number of participants in mutual understanding activities varies every year given changes in event frequency and size. The total number of visitors to UJC Tashkent and UJC Bukhara exceeded 60,000 every year from 2011 to 2015.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation >

The overall goal of promoting human-resource development to contribute to a market economy and mutual understanding between the people of Uzbekistan and Japan has been mostly achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. With regard to the development of human resources for the private sector, according to the beneficiary survey<sup>6</sup> held during ex-post evaluation, approximately 60% of respondents experienced revenue growth and approximately 30% of respondents opened their own business. The primary reason for this growth in revenue and entrepreneurship was useful and concrete business knowledge acquired by PMP graduates during the course. For example, marketing advice, such as not carelessly setting low prices to maintain the quality and brand identity and improving packaging to make products more visually attractive, were practical and effective. According to the PMP graduates from the alumni association (A-club), the PMP course is grounded in the business environment of Uzbekistan and covers the necessary theories and skills for basic business management. In particular, they commented that making a business plan was the most useful exercise. In addition, approximately 80% of PMP graduates had attended other short-term specialized courses (from one day/ two weeks per seminar) after the PMP course<sup>7</sup>. In fact, there were many successful cases of opening a new business, including one producing one of the best-selling potato chips (called "Samurai

<sup>4</sup> CHUO ASIA CHUSHOKIGYO SHINKO NI KAKARU KISO JYOHU SHUSHU KAKUNIN CHOSA HOUKOKUSHO[Data Collection Survey on Small and Medium-sized Enterprises in Central Asia] (2012), JICA

<sup>5</sup> Japanese-language courses were provided as part of the JICA technical cooperation project with support from the Japan Foundation until Phase 2. After the completion of Phase 2, they have been conducted mainly with support from the Japan Foundation in the following projects.

<sup>6</sup> Data from two beneficiary surveys were used in this analysis. The first was a phone survey held in 2015 by JICA; the sample included 302 graduates of the PMP course during Phase 1, 2 and 3. Of these 302 graduates, we removed 102 graduates from Phase 2 period. The second was a phone-and-questionnaire survey held in 2016 by the ex post evaluation team; the sample included 24 graduates from the PMP course during Phase 2.

<sup>7</sup> Out of 22 respondents of the beneficiary survey at ex-post evaluation, 18 respondents had taken other short-term specialized course. 12 respondents among them had taken more than two courses.

Chips”) by making Japanese-style crunchy chips and another opening a book café, borrowing an idea from Japanese coffee shops. Based on this evidence, the business courses are confirmed to be practical, high quality and meet participants’ needs.

The other overall goal of promoting mutual understanding between the people of Uzbekistan and Japan has been achieved through the cultural exchange activities of students through a TV conference system continued from Phase 2. The number of graduates of the Japanese language course who professionally use Japanese could not be verified, although some graduates used Japanese when attending to Japanese tourists in souvenir shops near the World Heritage Site in Bukhara.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Numerous other positive impacts were confirmed. Examples include very active alumni clubs originating in business courses, with the clubs responsible for multiple activities. These club activities have become a good follow-up for the business courses, providing opportunities for additional learning and new business creation. As for the promotion of mutual understanding, as the effect of information giving activities related to studying in Japan, the number of students studying in Japan significantly increased to 471 in the year 2015 (25<sup>th</sup> in terms of world rank), up from 139 people in the year 2006 (29<sup>th</sup> in terms of world rank). Particularly, the study in Japan fair and seminars organized in collaboration with Japanese universities have become very popular: Approximately 1,800 people participated in one such fair in 2015. No negative impacts has been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, through the project, the project purpose has been achieved at the completion of Phase 2 and its effects have continued at the time of ex-post evaluation. The overall goal has been mostly achieved and other positive impacts have been observed. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project are high.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																																										
(Project Purpose) The function of the UJC as a base contributing 1) to human resources development in area of SMEs of Uzbekistan toward a market economy, 2) to mutual understanding between the people of Uzbekistan and Japan, will be promoted.	1. Degree of recognition of UJC business courses <sup>8</sup>	(Project Completion) Achieved. - The application-to-enrollment ratio for the PMP course in 2010 was 2.8:1 (341 applicants, 124 enrollees). (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. - The application-to-enrollment ratio for the PMP course in 2015 was 2.4:1 (148 applicants, 62 enrollees).																																										
	2. Number of users and members of the UJC <sup>9</sup>	(Project Completion) Achieved Table: Visitors to UJC Tashkent and UJC Bukhara <table border="1" style="margin-left: 20px;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2006</th> <th>2007</th> <th>2008</th> <th>2009</th> <th>2010</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Tashkent</td> <td>65,084</td> <td>73,646</td> <td>74,045</td> <td>69,376</td> <td>64,492</td> <td>346,643</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Bukhara</td> <td></td> <td>5,126</td> <td>9,718</td> <td>10,440</td> <td>13,238</td> <td>38,522</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> Note: Each year refers to the sum for January through December. The total number does not strictly show achievements of the project period, for the project started in December and ended in November. - The number of members at UJC Tashkent was 487 in the year 2010. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. Table: Visitors to UJC Tashkent and UJC Bukhara <table border="1" style="margin-left: 20px;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2011</th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Tashkent</td> <td>64,570</td> <td>59,049</td> <td>51,864</td> <td>57,587</td> <td>54,062</td> <td>287,132</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Bukhara</td> <td>13,840</td> <td>12,867</td> <td>15,887</td> <td>8,759</td> <td>9,660</td> <td>61,013</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> - The number of visitors to UJC Bukhara decreased from February 2014 to January 2016 as a result of moving to a temporary facility in February 2014, which was caused by renovations at Bukhara State University. After the renovations, it was moved to a new facility in February 2016. - The number of members at UJC Tashkent was 386 in the year 2015.		2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total	Tashkent	65,084	73,646	74,045	69,376	64,492	346,643	Bukhara		5,126	9,718	10,440	13,238	38,522		2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total	Tashkent	64,570	59,049	51,864	57,587	54,062	287,132	Bukhara	13,840	12,867	15,887	8,759	9,660	61,013
		2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total																																					
Tashkent	65,084	73,646	74,045	69,376	64,492	346,643																																						
Bukhara		5,126	9,718	10,440	13,238	38,522																																						
	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total																																						
Tashkent	64,570	59,049	51,864	57,587	54,062	287,132																																						
Bukhara	13,840	12,867	15,887	8,759	9,660	61,013																																						
3. Number of participants in business courses held in local cities and participants’ satisfaction level <sup>10</sup>	(Project Completion) Achieved Table: Number of participants and business courses held in local cities <table border="1" style="margin-left: 20px;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2006</th> <th>2007</th> <th>2008</th> <th>2009</th> <th>2010</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Participants</td> <td>194</td> <td>32</td> <td>115</td> <td>60</td> <td>107</td> <td>508</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Courses</td> <td>2</td> <td>3</td> <td>7</td> <td>5</td> <td>7</td> <td>24</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> Note: The number of participants in 2010 included one seminar (5 days) held across two projects (Phase 2 and Phase 3) from the project completion of November to the beginning of Phase 3 in December 2010. - Participants’ satisfaction level was 4.76 on a scale of 1 to 5 (average over 6 courses held in 2010). - In 2010, business courses were held in regional cities, Bukhara, Samarkand and Fergana. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. Table: Number of participants and business courses held in local cities <table border="1" style="margin-left: 20px;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2011</th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Participants</td> <td>785</td> <td>115</td> <td>119</td> <td>257</td> <td>133</td> <td>1,409</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Courses</td> <td>19</td> <td>4</td> <td>3</td> <td>6</td> <td>5</td> <td>37</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total	Participants	194	32	115	60	107	508	Courses	2	3	7	5	7	24		2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total	Participants	785	115	119	257	133	1,409	Courses	19	4	3	6	5	37	
	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total																																						
Participants	194	32	115	60	107	508																																						
Courses	2	3	7	5	7	24																																						
	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total																																						
Participants	785	115	119	257	133	1,409																																						
Courses	19	4	3	6	5	37																																						

<sup>8</sup> Data for this indicator were collected by interviewing people on the street in Tashkent, asking if they had hear of UJC business courses. However, according to the Terminal Evaluation Report of the project and hearings from Japanese experts, the project target group (i.e., businesspeople), commonly transport by vehicle. Hence, the data collection method was not appropriate. For this reason, “degree of recognition” was measured via a proxy indicator of application-to-enrollment ratio for business courses. Given that there are several business courses, we used the PMP course as the main business course. The ratio was calculated by dividing the number of applicants by the number of actual participants in the PMP course, which was held in 2 batches per year, with a day and night course for each batch. In 2015, there was only 1 batch.

<sup>9</sup> The primary benefit of membership is the ability to borrow books from the UJC library. There is no membership service at UJC Bukhara.

<sup>10</sup> This indicator was originally written as “Situation of establishment of UJC’s local office and achievement of its objectives.” These indicators refer to activities and, as a result, are not appropriate as indicator of project purpose. In light of this fact, we set the proxy indicator as previously mentioned. For the satisfaction level, we used the results of the course evaluation conducted at the end of each course.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Participants' satisfaction level was 4.8 on a scale of 1 to 5 (average over courses held between October 2014 and March 2015).</li> <li>- The number of participants and business courses increased drastically in 2011 because half-day courses were provided free of charge in 17 cities in response to a request from Uzbekistan to roll out business courses nationwide for the "year of small business and private enterprise," as the country's government called 2011.</li> <li>- In 2015, business courses were held in regional cities Bukhara, Samarkand, Fergana, Qarshi and Nukus.</li> </ul>																																										
4. Number of participants in business courses and participants' satisfaction level	(Project Completion) Achieved.	<p>Table: Numbers of participants in business courses and PMP course</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2006</th> <th>2007</th> <th>2008</th> <th>2009</th> <th>2010</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Business courses</td> <td>499</td> <td>354</td> <td>514</td> <td>590</td> <td>438</td> <td>2,395</td> </tr> <tr> <td>PMP course only</td> <td>112</td> <td>120</td> <td>132</td> <td>126</td> <td>53</td> <td>543</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: Each year refers to the sum for January through December. The total number does not strictly show achievements of the project period, for the project started in December and ended in November.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The average satisfaction level across all business courses in 2010 (excluding some specialized short-term courses) was 4.6 on a scale of 1 to 5.</li> <li>- The satisfaction level for the PMP course in 2010 was 4.7 on a scale of 1 to 5.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Continued.</p> <p>Table: Numbers of participants in business courses and PMP course</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2011</th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Business courses</td> <td>1,272</td> <td>1,402</td> <td>1,978</td> <td>1,762</td> <td>1,239</td> <td>7,653</td> </tr> <tr> <td>PMP course only</td> <td>130</td> <td>102</td> <td>94</td> <td>102</td> <td>62</td> <td>490</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The average satisfaction level across all business courses in March 2015 was 4.8 on a scale of 1 to 5.</li> <li>- The satisfaction level for the PMP course in March 2015 was 4.6 on a scale of 1 to 5.</li> <li>- The total number of participants in business courses from Phase 1 to fiscal year 2015 exceeded 11,000. Of these, total participants in the PMP course exceeded 1,300.</li> </ul>		2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total	Business courses	499	354	514	590	438	2,395	PMP course only	112	120	132	126	53	543		2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total	Business courses	1,272	1,402	1,978	1,762	1,239	7,653	PMP course only	130	102	94	102	62	490
	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total																																						
Business courses	499	354	514	590	438	2,395																																						
PMP course only	112	120	132	126	53	543																																						
	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total																																						
Business courses	1,272	1,402	1,978	1,762	1,239	7,653																																						
PMP course only	130	102	94	102	62	490																																						
5. Number of participants in Japanese-language courses and participants' satisfaction level	(Project completion) Achieved.	<p>Table: Number of participants in Japanese language courses</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2006</th> <th>2007</th> <th>2008</th> <th>2009</th> <th>2010</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Japanese language courses</td> <td>534</td> <td>686</td> <td>764</td> <td>716</td> <td>534</td> <td>3,234</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: Each year refers to the sum for January through December. Numbers do not strictly show achievements of the project period, for the project started in December and ended in November.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The average satisfaction level of Japanese language courses in June 2010 was 4.6 on a scale of 1 to 5.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Continued.</p> <p>Table: Number of participants in Japanese language courses</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2011</th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Japanese language courses</td> <td>524</td> <td>517</td> <td>545</td> <td>552</td> <td>637</td> <td>2,775</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The satisfaction level of Japanese language courses in June 2015 was 3.6 on a scale of 1 to 4.</li> <li>- Total participants in Japanese language courses from Phase 1 to fiscal year 2015 exceeded 6,000.</li> </ul>		2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total	Japanese language courses	534	686	764	716	534	3,234		2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total	Japanese language courses	524	517	545	552	637	2,775														
	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total																																						
Japanese language courses	534	686	764	716	534	3,234																																						
	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total																																						
Japanese language courses	524	517	545	552	637	2,775																																						
6. Number of participants for mutual understanding activities and participants' satisfaction level	(Project Completion) Achieved.	<p>Table: Number of participants in mutual understanding activities</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>FY2006</th> <th>FY2007</th> <th>FY2008</th> <th>FY2009</th> <th>FY2010</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Mutual understanding activities</td> <td>10,627</td> <td>8,429</td> <td>11,245</td> <td>11,960</td> <td>5,085</td> <td>47,346</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: Each fiscal year refers to the sum for April through March. The total numbers does not strictly show achievements of the project period, for the project started in December and ended in November.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- No data were available to confirm participants' satisfaction level.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Continued</p> <p>Table: Number of participants in mutual understanding activities</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>FY2011</th> <th>FY2012</th> <th>FY2013</th> <th>FY2014</th> <th>FY2015</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Mutual understanding activities</td> <td>9,978</td> <td>10,149</td> <td>6,778</td> <td>6,348</td> <td>4,205</td> <td>37,458</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- No data were available to confirm participants' satisfaction level.</li> <li>- Total participants in mutual-understanding activities from Phase 1 to fiscal year 2015 exceeded 90,000.</li> </ul>		FY2006	FY2007	FY2008	FY2009	FY2010	Total	Mutual understanding activities	10,627	8,429	11,245	11,960	5,085	47,346		FY2011	FY2012	FY2013	FY2014	FY2015	Total	Mutual understanding activities	9,978	10,149	6,778	6,348	4,205	37,458														
	FY2006	FY2007	FY2008	FY2009	FY2010	Total																																						
Mutual understanding activities	10,627	8,429	11,245	11,960	5,085	47,346																																						
	FY2011	FY2012	FY2013	FY2014	FY2015	Total																																						
Mutual understanding activities	9,978	10,149	6,778	6,348	4,205	37,458																																						
(Overall goal) 1) Human resources related to the private sector responding to the market economy in Uzbekistan will be developed. 2) Mutual understanding	1. Number of enterprises that increased benefits and efficiency <sup>11</sup> after attending UJC business courses	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- According to the beneficiary survey for PMP graduates of Phase 2, approximately 60% of respondents acknowledged the course has contributed to their profit increase. Of these, a growth level of 11-50% was the most common increase (accounting for more than 40% of respondents who saw an increase).</li> </ul> <p>Table: Profit increase (Did the course contribute to your company's profit increase?)</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Response</th> <th colspan="2">Phone Survey in 2015</th> <th colspan="2">Ex-post evaluation in 2016</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Number</th> <th>Percentage</th> <th>Number</th> <th>Percentage</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Yes</td> <td>61</td> <td>60%</td> <td>14</td> <td>58%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No</td> <td>20</td> <td>20%</td> <td>3</td> <td>13%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No response/I don't know</td> <td>21</td> <td>21%</td> <td>7</td> <td>29%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>102</td> <td>100%</td> <td>24</td> <td>100%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: Due to number rounding, the total may not be 100%.</p>	Response	Phone Survey in 2015		Ex-post evaluation in 2016		Number	Percentage	Number	Percentage	Yes	61	60%	14	58%	No	20	20%	3	13%	No response/I don't know	21	21%	7	29%	Total	102	100%	24	100%													
Response	Phone Survey in 2015			Ex-post evaluation in 2016																																								
	Number	Percentage	Number	Percentage																																								
Yes	61	60%	14	58%																																								
No	20	20%	3	13%																																								
No response/I don't know	21	21%	7	29%																																								
Total	102	100%	24	100%																																								

<sup>11</sup> Increased efficiency has been excluded, for the scope of such an analysis is vague.

between the people both of Uzbekistan and Japan will be promoted.	2. Number of people who started a business (of graduates of business course)	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. - According to the beneficiary survey for PMP graduates of Phase 2, approximately 30% of respondents opened their own business. - According to the same survey, more than 50% had salary growth and other positive effects in their careers, including promotion and career change.
	3. Number of cases that led to cooperation/exchange programs between the two countries' citizens	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. - 12 cases of exchange activities were confirmed between 2011 and 2015. Of these, Japanese students from schools for students with special hearing needs and Uzbekistani students with special hearing needs continue to engage in exchange activities through the TV-conference system from Phase 2. - In 2014, new cultural events (how to wear a kimono and small concerts, etc.) were initiated in collaboration with Japanese visitors to the UJCs. - Introducing the UJC's activities to Japanese residents and visits to the companies of PMP graduates by Japanese residents was done.
	4. Number of people utilizing Japanese-language skills for business (of graduates of Japanese language courses)	(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved. - No data of career choices by graduates from Phase 2 courses was available to confirm the number of graduates who utilized Japanese language skills for business. - At least two graduates from Phase 2 courses were working as Japanese language lecturers at the UJC. - Some graduates of UJC Bukhara used the Japanese language when attending to Japanese tourists in souvenir shops near the World Heritage Site in Bukhara.

Source : Documents provided by JICA, Beneficiary survey at the ex-post evaluation.

### 3 Efficiency

The project period was as planned, however the project cost from JICA side exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan:100% and 114%, respectively). The cause of the cost increase could not be specified by comparing the planned budget to the actual cost, for the detailed plan of the budget was not available. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

Human-resource development of SMEs in Uzbekistan remains the priority given the Uzbekistani government's support of SMEs and entrepreneurs under the development policy called "Welfare Improvement Strategy (2013-2015)" as well as a presidential decree (2015).

#### <Institutional Aspect>

The UJC is a nonprofit organization that is jointly operated by two co-directors, Uzbekistan and Japan. The staff allocation from Uzbekistan is a total of 24 people. Of these, 21 are in UJC Tashkent (1 co-director, 1 accountant, 1 administrator, 5 business course coordinators, 1 Japanese language coordinator, 3 Japanese language lecturers, 1 mutual understanding seminar coordinator, 1 IT coordinator, 1 librarian, 2 receptionists, 2 drivers and 2 security guards) and 3 people in UJC Bukhara (1 administrator/Japanese language lecturer, 1 mutual understanding program coordinator/ Japanese language lecturer, 1 accountant/receptionist). The staff allocation from Japan is 2 long-term dispatched experts (1 co-director, 1 coordinator) from the ongoing technical assistance project (December 2015 to November 2020) and 2 long-term experts from the Japan Foundation. The decision-making process and management systems of the UJC are all jointly designed and implemented. Regarding the operation of 3 programs, although Japanese experts give advices for the implementation of each course, local staff members are adequately allocated to encourage their initiatives, the operational procedures are established and the manuals are in place. According to the UJC and MFERIT, the UJC's legal status as a nonprofit organization and its tax exemptions will continue in the future.

#### <Technical Aspect>

From a technical aspect to continue three main programs, local coordinators and local lecturers have sufficient capability to manage the courses and teach in the classes. The staff capacity building is well considered and mechanisms are also in place. In particular, task allocations are appropriate and target-setting methods are used to enhance staff capability. As for the capacity building of local lecturers, the training of trainers (TOT) mechanism has been set up for the business course. For the Japanese language course, trial lessons are practiced to ensure quality in language courses. For the year 2014, the ratio of lecture hours provided by local lecturers was 82% for business courses and 94% for Japanese language courses, evincing sufficient usage of local human resources. In business courses, local lecturers teach business environment and institutions in Uzbekistan and localized Japanese-style business management. Japanese lecturers teach topics such as advanced marketing and advanced human resource management. Both local and Japanese lecturers have been highly praised according to the result of questionnaires by participants.

#### <Financial Aspect>

The revenue of the UJC's operation is covered by the UJC's self-generated income, allocation from MFERIT, JICA local operation costs and others. Strengthening the UJC's financial basis was an issue from the beginning, and, in the short term, this issue was not meant to be solved. It was recognized that financial self-sufficiency needs to be achieved strategically. One of the challenges of the financial aspect is the legal status of the UJC as a nonprofit organization, per presidential decree: A rapid increase in revenue would be considered profit-making activity, and such activity is not allowed for nonprofits. The

	FY2010	FY2011	FY2012	FY2013	FY2014	FY2015
UJC self-generated income	16,214	15,774	16,790	16,618	25,093	34,703
(income from business courses)	(10,888)	(10,669)	(11,922)	(10,704)	(16,242)	(20,263)
(income from Japanese courses)	(3,429)	(3,448)	(3,409)	(4,960)	(7,265)	(12,314)
(income from mutual understanding activities)	NA	(194)	(418)	(167)	(259)	(155)
(other incomes)	(1,897)	(1,462)	(1,041)	(787)	(1,325)	(1,971)
Allocation from MFERIT	5,174	8,197	4,627	4,500	4,800	4,000
JICA local operation cost	25,822	25,972	24,782	25,539	24,486	23,023
Others	NA	NA	6,195	17,507	16,466	15,385
Total of the revenue	47,210	49,942	52,394	64,163	70,844	77,110
Total of the expenditure	43,369	51,163	53,437	68,933	69,512	68,694
(expenditure from UJC self-generated income)	(12,373)	(16,995)	(17,833)	(21,388)	(23,761)	(26,287)
Balance	3,841	-1,221	-1,043	-4,770	1,332	8,416

(Source) Documents provided by JICA.

Note: Years refer to fiscal years (April to March). The cost of facilities provided by MFERIT is not included in the table. The figures above have been rounded down (to the nearest thousandth), which means that some figures do not add up to 100%.

percentage of the share of UJC's self-generated income in the total expenditure for its operation has gradually increased from 9% at the beginning of Phase 2 (2005) to 29% at the end of Phase 2 (2010) and to 38% during the ex-post evaluation (2015). Phase after phase, the UJC has steadily increased revenue by increasing self-generated income from tuition fees. Taking into account that tuition fees are still lower than the market price<sup>12</sup>, a certain degree of increase in tuition fees can be expected. Another positive feature is that the rent payment for the facility is granted to UJC<sup>13</sup> at MFERIT's behest (to the facility owner), allowing for good location with easy access for participants.

In addition to these situations, Japan's assistance is expected to continue at least for a while. Hence, there are no major financial problems that would hinder maintenance of the positive effects brought about by the project.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, no problem has been observed in terms of the policy, institutional, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project purpose has been achieved, and the effects have been maintained at the time of ex-post evaluation. For human resource development of SMEs, various positive impacts, such as revenue growth and opening of new businesses by PMP graduates, have been observed. For sustainability, the mechanism of joint management of the UJC has been established, and local operational staff and local lecturers are allocated adequately and necessary procedures are in place to work with their initiatives, resulting development and effective use of local human resources. In terms of efficiency, the project cost exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- Financial self-sufficiency has already been set as a long-term goal, but there is not enough discussion and documentation to share the recognition by stakeholders. Thus, it is recommended to set a long-term goal designed to embrace these issues (e.g., determining the ultimate goal to have costs covered by self-generated income and the time frame to achieve this plan). The ongoing project entails setting up a short-term target and executing new means to strengthen the financial base of the UJC; these activities should be considered in tandem with the long-term target.
- Based on results of the beneficiary survey, it can be said that PMP graduates think highly of the business courses; they have become great supporters of the UJC, recommending that employees, colleagues and friends take the courses. Likewise, they have established important networks of graduates. Although financial self-sufficiency of the UJC is very important (as already explained), reducing costs should be done carefully to avoid damaging the well-earned reputation of the UJC and the high quality training, which have been built over the years.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- Business courses offered by the UJC are focused on making concrete and practical contents as well as building a follow-up system for PMP course graduates. For example: i) planning and implementing short-term specialized courses that offer advanced knowledge for experienced businesspeople; ii) supporting club activities (e.g., the alumni club and topic-related clubs) to provide graduates a space for information sharing and collaboration; iii) providing consultation to solve the problems faced by graduates' companies. When designing a business course with a strong emphasis on the practical application of theory, a follow-up system, such as that offered by the UJC, should be established to encourage graduates to apply what they have learned and to promote network activities.
- The UJC is situated in the city center, at the International Business Center, and is easily accessible from the subway station. When designing to create a center/base that could accommodate frequent visits from the general public and busy businesspeople, a central location with solid accessibility is considered a priority.



Study Abroad Fair in 2015  
Universities set up information booths



Business course in UJC Tashkent  
Japanese expert instructing a workshop during specialized course  
“advanced marketing”

<sup>12</sup> In 2014 and 2015, the project researched tuition fees charged for business courses offered by universities and other language programs to determine an appropriate tuition increase for business courses and Japanese-language courses (documents provided by the JICA).

<sup>13</sup> The UJC is situated on the 6<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> floors of the International Business Center in the center of Tashkent.