

Summary of the Joint Terminal Evaluation Sheet

1 Outline of the Project	
Country: Socialist Republic of Vietnam	Project Title : Project for Strengthening Capacity of Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics and the National Academy of Public Administration in Training of Public Leaders and Civic Servants
Thematic Area : Governance	
Division in Charge : Public Policy and Financial Management Team, Governance Group, Industrial Development and Public Policy Department	
	Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation Project
Project Period : May 2013~May 2016	Total Cost : 370 Million JPY (as of the moment of Terminal Evaluation)
Supporting Organization in Japan : National Personnel Agency, Japan Association for Public Human resources Development (JAPHD), Tokyo University, Waseda University, National Institute of Population and Social Security Research and National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies (GRIPS).	Counterpart Agency : Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics (HCMA), and National Academy of Public Administration (NAPA)
1-1 Background of the Project	
<p>HCMA, as a unified specialized body under the Central Committee of the Communist Party and the Government with a mandate to manage training program for public leaders and civil servants of director level and higher in the whole country, plays an essential role in the capacity development for government officials. With total of 2,700 lecturers, HCMA supervises 63 provincial political schools targeting local government officers with total number of training participants from 14,000 to 15,000 each year.</p> <p>After its merger with National Academy of Public Administration (hereinafter referred to as “NAPA”) in May 2007, HCMA was responsible for training of both politics and state administration and expected to be the leading training institution to implement education and training of both theories and practical skills.</p> <p>While public leaders and civil servants faced difficulties upon policy making and implementation to deal with various issues that had arisen with the country’s transformation to market economy, many of the trainings provided by HCMA had traditionally been theoretical in nature, focusing on the exposition of policy theories and laws. It was difficult for trainees to apply the knowledge acquired in the trainings to the practice in their work.</p> <p>To transform the nature of civil service training and improve HCMA’s training programs, the Government of Vietnam (hereinafter referred to as “GoV”) and the Party issued the Prime Minister Decision 1677 on the “Program for Renovation of Training Program for Leaders and Managers” in September 2010. In implementing the Decision, GoV requested the Government of Japan (hereinafter</p>	

referred to as “GoJ) a technical cooperation project, now called as the “Project for Strengthening Capacity of Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics and the National Academy of Public Administration in Training of Public Leaders and Civil Servants”. The Project started in May 2013 for three years.

In January 2016, before the end of the cooperation period, the Project is required to undergo the Joint Terminal Evaluation in accordance with the article IV of the Record of Discussions signed for the Project in March 2013.

1-2 Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

Capacity of public leaders and civil servants is enhanced after participating in Capacity Development Programs conducted by HCMA and NAPA.

(2) Project Purpose

Framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA is enhanced.

(3) Outputs

1) Capacity of HCMA to implement and manage Training Program for Potential National Leaders is strengthened.

2) Capacity of NAPA to formulate Master of Public Policy Program is strengthened.

(4) Inputs

<Japanese side> Total Amount: 370 Million JPY
 Assignment of Experts: Long-term experts: 2 persons (50.9 MM), Short-term experts: a total of 55 persons (14.4 MM). Among which, 26 persons (8.6MM) for HCMA, and 29 persons (5.8 MM) for NAPA
 Training in Japan: 187 persons (67.6 MM)
 Equipment and Machineries: none
 Local Operation Cost: Approximately 53.4 million yen (462.490 USD)

<Vietnamese side> Allocation of Counterparts: 57 persons in total
 Local Operation Cost : Approximately 16.2 million yen (30 billion VND)
 Others : Office space for JICA experts in HCMA and NAPA, and the seminar rooms

2 Evaluation Team

Member of the Evaluation Team	<Japanese side>		
	Name	Position in the Team	Title
	Mr. Ryuichi TOMIZAWA	Team Leader	Deputy Director General and Group Director for Governance, Industrial Development and Public Policy Department, JICA
	Mr. Yoichiro KIMATA	Evaluation Planning	Acting Director, Public Policy and Financial Management Team,

		Governance Group, Industrial Development and Public Policy Department, JICA
	Ms. Ayako NAMURA	Evaluation Analysis Consultant, Tekizaitekisho LLC
	<i><Vietnamese Side></i>	
	Name	Position Organisation
	Dr. Hoang Van Nghia	Acting General Director, International Cooperation Department HCMA
	Ms. Pham Thi Quynh Hoa	Director, International Cooperation Department NAPA
Period	11 to 22 January 2016	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation
3 Results of Evaluation		
3-1 Achievements confirmed through evaluation		
(1) Output 1: Capacity of HCMA to implement and manage Training Program for Potential National Leaders is strengthened.		
<p>All of the targets set up for Output 1 will be fulfilled by the end of the cooperation period and it can be concluded that HCMA has enhanced the capacity of implementing and managing training programs for future national leaders through the Project activities. A total of 511 political leaders/civil servants participated in the six Policy Research Modules of Japan, which exceeded the target of 500 participants (Indicator 1-3). JICA experts formulated the teaching plans¹⁰ and materials on the six Policy Research Modules of Japan, incorporating the inputs and the opinions of HCMA (Indicator 1-2). HCMA's top management approved the contents of all six modules before each module was commenced (Indicator 1-1). In response to the recommendation made in November 2014 by the Mid-term Review Team, HCMA has been working on compiling a collection of lecture notes of the six modules aiming to utilise the relevant reference information among lecturers at HCMA. Currently, the collection of lecture notes is in process of re-editing within HCMA and will be published by March 2016 for further utilization. Through the implementation of Policy Research Modules of Japan as well as other modules supported by other foreign supporters, HCMA learned about how to design and implement effective training programs, combining lectures, group discussions and presentation, and incorporating active learning methods in the programs.</p> <p>The textbook on training management is almost finalised at this moment. It was already utilised in the trial training management courses delivered by the ToT team members of HCMA at the Academy of Politics Region I (Hanoi Campus) and Academy of Journalism and Communication in October 2015 and Region III (Da Nang Campus) in November 2015. The Project has a plan to carry out more trial classes in Region II (Ho Chi Minh City) and Region IV (Can Tho City) in March 2016. Incorporating the results and feedbacks from these trial classes, the textbook will be finalised by March 2016 (Indicator 1-4). The ToT team members of HCMA will equip capacity to disseminate their enhanced knowledge</p>		

¹⁰ "Teaching plan" refers to a plan in which the format of respective six Policy Research Modules is described.

and skills of training management to the Member Academies or the Political Schools at provinces.

(2) Output 2: Capacity of NAPA to formulate Master of Public Policy Program is strengthened.

Through the Project activities, NAPA has enhanced their capacity of formulating the MPP program as expected. The gist of basic plan of MPP program was formulated in August 2013, and is now in process of final approval from the top management of NAPA (Indicator 2-1). A curriculum of the MPP program is compiled with the basic plan of MPP program (Indicator 2-2). MOET approved the basic plan of NAPA's MPP program in June 2014 and the Vice Minister of Home Affairs issued the Decision on MPP Program¹¹ in September 2015, which identifies the compulsory and optional subjects, and the academic credits to be given for each subject. Based on the discussion between NAPA and JICA experts, the Project decided to support for 10 model subjects. At this moment, the syllabuses for all subjects are almost finalised. The teaching materials for the seven subjects are almost finalised. On two subjects of "Economy in Public Policy" and "Philosophy in Public Policy", NAPA will discuss more integration of the contents supported by the Project into "Economics in Public Sector" and "Philosophy" which are subjects set under MPP program, and the contents of "Scenario Planning" will be improved incorporating more information of case studies by March 2016. NAPA currently has an intention to publicize the formulated syllabuses and teaching materials by April 2016 (Indicator 2-3).

In the process of formulating the syllabuses and the teaching materials, the NAPA counterpart personnel has deepened the knowledge level on the subjects and significantly enhanced their skills of preparing syllabuses and teaching materials. Since the ten model subjects have been supported by Japanese professors of authorities on the respective subjects, NAPA can have good start of delivering the specialized subjects of MPP Program with quality ensured.

(3) Project Purpose: Framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA is enhanced.

The Project Purpose is likely to be achieved by the end of the Project term. Since this Project focuses three different components, namely 2 components for Output1 and one component for Output 2, the achievement level of Project Purpose is verified respectively.

With regard to Policy Research Modules of Japan

To verify the achievement level of the Project Purpose related to Policy Research Modules of Japan, the Project set up the indicator of "satisfaction ratings for the Policy Research Module reach average more than 85%". The participants' satisfaction level with six Policy Research Modules of Japan was very high, recoding 88.3% of the average rate of satisfaction level of the modules conducted in Vietnam, and 97.7% of the average rate for the training in Japan. The results of questionnaire survey distributed to the 113 ex-participants of Policy Research Modules of Japan showed that all of 58 respondents were satisfied with the modules (satisfaction level was 100%). In sum, the Policy Research Modules of Japan supported by the Project brought great satisfaction to these respondents and HCMA enhanced the

¹¹ Decision No. 3652 /QD-HCQG by the Ministry of Home Affairs dated on 17 September 2015.

framework to promote capacity development of public leaders.

With regard to the capacity development of training management

To verify the achievement level of the Project Purpose related to capacity development of training management, the Project set up the indicator of “satisfaction ratings for the training management courses, delivered using the draft textbooks compiled by the HCMA lecturers, reach average more than 85 %”. The participants’ evaluation was carried out at the end of the trial courses of training management organized in October and November 2015 at Hanoi and Da Nang Campuses. Then, overall satisfaction rating for the courses at these two campuses was 85.9% on average, exceeding the target value of 85%. Although this is the result of the trial courses for training management, HCMA equips the capacity of enhancing training course management.

With regard to the formulation of MPP program

To verify the achievement level of the Project Purpose related to the formulation of MPP program, the Project set up the indicator of “syllabuses and materials for nine subjects prepared with the assistance from the Project are utilised for NAPA’s MPP program”. NAPA held the entrance ceremony of MPP program on 10 December 2015. The classes on the liberal arts started in December 2015 and the specialized subjects will be started in March 2016 according to the schedule. In the Project activities, the trial lectures on “Public Policy Formulation”, “Public Policy and Politics”, and “Cost-benefit Analysis” were carried out and the syllabuses and teaching materials on these subjects have been further elaborated reflecting the results of the trial classes. NAPA will implement the classes of MPP program utilising the finalised syllabuses and materials (seven subjects as of Terminal Evaluation and three subjects in the process of finalization by the end of the Project).

In short, all indicators of the Project Purpose will be fulfilled by the end of the cooperation term, it can concluded that the framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA will be enhanced.

(4) Overall Goal: Capacity of public leaders and civil servants is enhanced after participating in Capacity Development Programs conducted by HCMA and NAPA.

Although the Overall Goal is the positive impacts to be realized in about three years after the Project term is ended, the Joint Terminal Evaluation Team confirmed the current achievement level of the Overall Goal. To verify the first indicator of “More than 75% participants of the Policy Research Modules respond in follow-up survey that they have applied what they have learnt through Policy Research Module program”, the Team asked a question to the ex-participants of Policy Research Modules, whether they can utilise what they have learnt in Policy Research Modules, by distributing the questionnaire to 113 participants. Among 58 respondents, 11 persons (19.0%) have already utilised it to great extent and 42 (72.4%) have utilised it to some extent. In sum, over 90% of the respondents have utilised what they learned from the modules of Japan for their work in some way. This implies that the Policy Research Modules of Japan brought great benefits to the future leaders of Vietnam and the

utilization of what they have learnt will be further promoted in the future.

Since the MPP program of NAPA was just started, it is not possible to measure the satisfaction ratings on the participants of the program. NAPA has elaborated the formulated syllabuses and teaching materials incorporating the feedbacks from the trial classes. In addition, the NAPA counterparts significantly enhanced their skills of preparation of the classes and acquired the deeper knowledge on the responsible subjects. It is expected that satisfaction level of the students of NAPA's MPP program may be good.

3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The relevance of the Project is assessed as relatively high. The Project components are still aligned with the policies of GoV and GoJ. The GoV addressed the importance of developing the adequate qualities, capabilities and qualification of cadres, civil servants and public employees to meet the requirements of serving the people and national development. This was clearly stated in *the Resolution No. 30c/NQ-CP of 8 November 2011, on promulgating the Master Program on State Administration Reform in the 2011-2020 period* and in *the Decree No. 18/2010 ND-CP of 5 March, 2010 on the Training and Retraining Public and Civil Servants*. The Country Assistance Policy for the Socialist Republic of Vietnam includes “Good Governance” in the three prioritized areas¹², and emphasizes to support for strengthening administration, recognizing the needs to improve the capacity for policy formulation and implementation.

HCMA and NAPA¹³ were acknowledged as the major training institutes to develop refresher training for high-ranking officials and equivalent ranks in *the Decree No. 18/2010 ND-CP of March 05, 2010*. In this context, HCMA had strong needs to develop effective training programs for high-ranking officials to meet the expectation of GoV. Since 2010, NAPA had an intention to launch a master program of public policy to satisfy the needs and match the background of Vietnamese civil servants. The Project aimed to develop MPP program meeting the Vietnamese context along with the NAPA's opinions. In sum, the Project has met the needs of Vietnamese target groups.

As pointed out by the Mid-term Review Team in November 2014, the overall design of the Project including the implementing structure of the Project was deemed appropriate at the planning stage; however there was an opinion that the different design might have been applied. The components of Output 1 and 2 were quite independent from each other, especially after NAPA's separation from HCMA, and this brought complication of decision-making process in the Project. In addition, after the Project activities started, it turned out that more manpower and time of the short-term experts to work together with NAPA counterparts needed to be allocated for quality assurance of the program¹⁴, since 10 model subjects were to be developed. While it was not easy to predict these issues in advance without

¹² These three pillars are: (1) Promotion of Economic Growth and Strengthening International Competitiveness, (2) Response to Fragility (Response to the Negative Impacts Brought by Economic Development), and (3) Good Governance.

¹³ As of 2010, the name of organisation acknowledged was “Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics and Public Administration”, since the document was issued before NAPA's organisational transition.

¹⁴ The original design of the project was to provide several numbers of the short-term experts and mostly to be monitored remotely such as via email with support of long-term experts.

more detailed planning survey, this affected the appropriateness of the project design.

(2) Effectiveness

The effectiveness of the Project is assessed as high. Although the Project supported two targets as one project and Japanese input for NAPA support has been insufficient at the beginning of the Project, the Project activities has been promoted with enough inputs for both two targets. As stated in “3-1 Achievements confirmed though evaluation”, the Project has enhanced the framework to promote the capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA. The Policy Research Modules of Japan was highly successful gaining high satisfaction level from the participants. The capacity of training management at HCMA has been also enhanced through the Project activities, equipping the textbook and knowledge/skills of managing training courses effectively, and incorporating the active and interactive learning approaches in SLT. Now, HCMA applies PDCA cycle strategically and comprehensively in training management.

NAPA also enhanced the capacity of formulating MPP Program customizing it to meet the demand and needs of Vietnamese civil servants. Through the Project activities, the lectures of NAPA acquired the knowledge and skills of formulating the good quality of syllabus and teaching materials. By the end of the cooperation term, NAPA will be ready to deliver 9 model subjects¹⁵ supported by the Project under the MPP program. While MPP program has just started in December 2015 and all materials developed by the Project have not been utilised yet, they will be utilised in MPP program once the classes on these subjects are started.

(3) Efficiency

The efficiency of the Project is assessed as relatively high. As described in “3-1. Achievements confirmed though evaluation”, the Project mostly met the targets set for Output 1 and 2 in the PDM. The capacity of HCMA to implement and manage training program for potential leaders and the capacity of NAPA to formulate MPP program are strengthened through the Project implementation.

All inputs provided by the Project were utilised for Project activities. The inputs for Output 1 have been relatively efficiently utilised to generate intended outputs under the strong leadership of HCMA’s top management. For Output 2, NAPA counterparts’ understandings of the responsible subjects became deeper and as they used to working with GRIPS experts in the latter half of the cooperation period, the progress of Project activities was accelerated with the great efforts from NAPA counterparts and the JICA experts and the outputs expected have been produced.

On the other hand, the three issues were identified which have adversely affected the Project efficiency. These are: 1) it was turned out that the inputs of JICA experts for Output 2 was in short to formulate the syllabuses and teaching materials for 10 model subjects and the expert team from the National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies (GRIPS) began working with NAPA after approximately 10 months since the Project was started, 2) NAPA faced the organisational transition as a result of its merger to the Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA) in December 2013 and the change of the NAPA’s top

¹⁵ Except “Philosophy in Public Policy”

management in July 2014, which caused slow progress of formulating the syllabuses, and 3) the counterpart funds which GoV would disburse to the counterpart organisations have not been allocated to NAPA after the organisational transition of NAPA to MOHA, which caused the difficulties for NAPA to carry out the Project activities in a timely manner and also lowered the motivation of NAPA counterparts.

(4) Impact

The impact of the Project can be judged as relatively high. Overall Goal of the Project, “capacity of public leaders and civil servants is enhanced after participating in Capacity Development Program conducted by HCMA and NAPA”, is likely to be fulfilled in the future as described in “3-1. Achievements confirmed through evaluation”. Since the Project focuses three different components, the major issues of the Project positive impacts are described respectively. The negative impacts have not been observed.

Impacts to be brought by the Policy Research Modules of Japan (SLT)

The participants of SLT are all future leaders of Vietnam, and many of those will be selected as the Central Party Committee members at the 12th National Party Congress in 2016 and they are in position to directly utilise what they learnt for public policy formulation or execution. Therefore, there is a high possibility that what they have learnt through SLT would be utilised for their work in the future. Besides, many impacts of the Project have been observed through the interview with and the results of questionnaire distributed to the ex-participants of the module of Japan. Those are: 1) sharing his knowledge and experience on the safety standards of the railway in Japan with the officials of Ministry of Transportation and the Railway Corporation of Vietnam, the SLT participant initiated upgrading the safety standard of railway in Vietnam, and the Railway Corporation is now testing the safety guard system and will conduct the intentional competitive bidding after the test is completed, 2) At Hung Yen province, the ex-participant proposed a local version of SLT to the provincial Committee of Communist Party, and HCMA has provided the support for the Member Academies to implement SLT for more than 20 provinces in response to the requests from provinces, and 3) The Vice Minister of Finance/President of Vietnam Social Security (VSS) invited the former official of the National Personnel Agency to Vietnam as a lecturer and organized the seminar on the civil servant ethics targeting VSS officials. In addition, HCMA prepared the report on the activities of SLT supported by foreign countries and it stated that the foreign lecturers emphasised preparation of the teaching materials of SLT and some of them including the topics on Japanese Civil Servant System could be good reference to promote their regular work. This indicates that those teaching materials would be utilised for their work in the future.

Impacts to be brought for training management

HCMA provides various kinds of training programs to high-ranking officials at the central level, and the Member Academies also provide various kinds of training programs. To improve the training management at Member Academies, HCMA has a plan to distribute the formulated textbook on training management to Member Academies. The PDCA cycle of training management is systematically

introduced to HCMA now, utilizing the textbook prepared by the Project. When HCMA keeps paying attention to strengthening the training management system including the update of the formulated textbook on training management, this will bring further improvement of the quality of training programs at HCMA.

Impacts to be brought to NAPA

NAPA is ready to provide the classes of the MPP program meeting the Vietnamese needs and context. To maintain the good quality of master program and to acquire the high satisfaction level from the students of MPP program, there are several key issues to consider. One is that the lectures who have been engaged in the Project activities will keep teaching the classes under MPP program since the assistance from Japan is one of the evidences of assuring the quality of NAPA's MPP program. Another issue is that NAPA needs to consider the institutional mechanism to continuously ensure the quality of developed MPP program.

Other several impacts were observed as a result of Project implementation.

Strengthening of human network: As stated in the Mid-term Review Report, the participants of SLT now have much stronger human network among Vietnamese high-ranking officials compared with the situation before participating in SLT and it has been maintained to date¹⁶. SLT contributed to strengthening the human network between the central and local officials as well. The human network was also created between Vietnamese and Japanese stakeholders who were involved in during the training program in Japan and this provided an opportunity for them to contact each other and meet to exchange information or opinions.

Changing of the working attitude and commitment toward own work: The counterparts of HCMA and NAPA pointed out that their working attitudes, commitment to, and responsibility for work have changed through working with JICA experts. The lecturers of HCMA and the participants of SLT, ToT and other training at HCMA learned the teaching and learning attitudes from JICA experts. They have realised that these matters greatly influence the quality and effectiveness of their work.

Application of what the NAPA counterparts learnt for other courses: NAPA counterparts has started to apply how to prepare teaching plan, syllabuses and teaching materials learnt through the Project activities for other courses they are in charge. Now, many of lecturers are able to prepare for classes more systematically and effectively.

(5) Sustainability

The sustainability of the Project is assessed as relatively high.

■ Policy and institutional perspective

¹⁶ According to the interview with ex-participants in SLT, the reunion of respective SLT is periodically organized among ex-participants.

The policy environment is still likely to be very favourable for public policy sector during the Project implementation period. The GoV has stressed the needs of strengthening capacity of future public leaders and civil servants together with the policy of institutional reform for civil servants and administration authorities to formulate and implement better policies for priority issues. With regard to the issue of institutional sustainability, it is expected that HCMA's top management will authorise the textbook on training management by the end of the Project cooperation and the printed textbook will be shared among the lecturers of HCMA widely. The key issue for institutional sustainability for MPP Program is that NAPA needs to consider the institutional mechanism to continuously ensure the quality of developed MPP program. There can be several ways to do it by clearly defining a body to review the quality of MPP program or to institutionally determine to undertake course evaluation by the students at the end of each course and review the results.

■ **Financial/organisational perspective**

Since dissemination of the textbook on the training management and sharing knowledge and skill of training management do not require a lot of costs, the financial issue would not be critical for HCMA. With regard to organisational sustainability, HCMA may need to keep itself open to incorporating new ideas or methods in formulated textbook to further improve the training programs and management. As NAPA improves the formulated MPP program, it may need to look for other financial sources in the future. With regard to organisational sustainability, the strong leadership and commitment of NAPA's top management continuously need to be shown to encourage discussion and further improvement of the contents of syllabuses and teaching materials on several subjects toward finalization and further elaboration. Besides, it is expected that NAPA will officially assign the lecturers who have been engaged in the Project activities as MPP Program's lecturers in charge since the assistance from Japan is one of the evidences of assuring the quality of NAPA's MPP program. Another issue is that NAPA needs to keep itself open to incorporating new information or policy matters in the formulated syllabuses and materials in the future.

■ **Technical perspective**

The counterparts of HCMA and NAPA have acquired sufficient knowledge and skills of training management and formulating the MPP program through the Project activities. They also well accept the values and significance of knowledge and skills introduced by the Project and recognise the importance of maintaining what they have learnt. Since the counterparts of HCMA and NAPA have worked by formulating teams respectively to pursue the Project activities, the necessary knowledge/skills of training management or formulating syllabuses/teaching materials have been shared within the team members. As described in "(4) Impact", an important issue for HCMA is to keep strengthening training management system including the further enhancement of updating the formulated textbook on training management and further enhancement of the evaluation system on training programs.

3-3. Factors Promoting Project Effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

No particular issues are identified.

(2) Factors concerning to Implementation

The top management of HCMA showed the strong commitment to successful implementation of SLT including the Policy Research Modules of Japan. This promoted the high motivation of the HCMA's counterparts toward the Project activities. Besides, JICA experts/Japanese professors greatly devoted themselves to the successful implementation of the Policy Research Modules of Japan, which substantially promoted the Project implementation.

3-4. Factor Inhibiting Project Effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

The components of Output 1 and 2 were quite independent from each other, especially after NAPA's separation from HCMA, and this brought complication of decision-making process in the Project.

(2) Factors concerning to Implementation

NAPA faced the organisational transition as a result of its merger to MOHA in December 2013 and the change of the NAPA's top management in July 2014, which caused slow progress of formulating the syllabuses. In addition, the counterpart funds which GoV would disburse to the counterpart organisations have not been allocated to NAPA after the organisational transition of NAPA to MOHA, causing the difficulties for NAPA to carry out the Project activities in a timely manner and also lowering the motivation of NAPA counterparts.

3-5. Conclusion

In sum, the Project has successfully enhanced the framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA. The participants expressed high level of satisfaction with the Policy Research Modules of Japan and HCMA counterparts also enhanced their capacity of training management through formulation of textbook on training management. Although the Project encountered some difficulties in pursuing the activities to formulate NAPA's MPP program, the activities were accelerated in the latter half of the cooperation period with the dedication of Project members. In sum, NAPA's capacity to formulate MPP program certainly has enhanced through Project activities. Therefore, it is expected that the Project will achieve its Project Purpose to a relatively high degree by the end of the planned Project period.

The relevance of the Project is evaluated as relatively high. The Project highly met the needs of Vietnamese stakeholders, including HCMA, NAPA and future public leaders and civil servants and the Project is aligned with the policies of GoV and GoJ. On the other hand, the project design needed to be carried out more carefully; therefore this affected the relevance of the Project. The effectiveness of the Project is high and the Joint Terminal Evaluation Team found a lot of impacts derived from the Project. The efficiency of the Project is assessed as relatively high since the progress of Project activities accelerated in the latter half of the cooperation period. While the sustainability of the Project is evaluated as relatively high, there are several important issues for HCMA and NAPA to consider.

3-6. Recommendations

Joint Terminal Evaluation Team recommends that the Project be terminated as schedule as the Project Purpose would be achieved.

3-6-1. Recommendations for sustaining the achievement of Project Purpose and Outputs in HCMA

(1) Maintenance of human network built by SLT

As described in “(4) Impact” under “3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results”, SLT contributed to creating the human network between Vietnamese and Japanese high-ranking officials/stakeholders. It resulted in trustful environment for exchanging information and opinions. It is highly expected to strengthen the human network by updating information and strategic utilization for promoting further cooperation and collaboration between two countries.

(2) Utilization of information provided in SLT

The Joint Terminal Evaluation Team recognised that HCMA was compiling the lecture notes which have been delivered by Japanese experts/trainers in SLT for their publication by March, 2016. HCMA is expected to take necessary measures for their editing and approval by the timeline. They must be useful for training and studies in the institutes concerned in HCMA as well as for future implementation of SLT. That is why the team recommends HCMA to consider the plan for their full utilization (target, contents, methodology, etc.).

(3) Promotion of training management courses at Central and Member Academies in HCMA

A textbook on training management will be finalised and approved by revising the drafts through trial training in Can Tho and Ho Chi Minh City. Replication of the approved textbook by training management courses to institutes at Central Academy and provincial schools through Member Academies could contribute to capacity enhancement on training provision of HCMA as a whole.

(4) Training cycle management of training management courses

ToT team is in learning process of upgrading the course contents by its trials and revisions. Those experiences must be effective for continuous improvement of the course after its approval, too. Periodical revision of contents by monitoring the course implementation would enhance the provision of training on training management.

3-6-2. Recommendations for sustaining the achievement of Project Purpose and Outputs in HCMA

(1) Clarification of timeline on improving syllabuses and materials for their finalization

As shown in “3-1 Achievements confirmed though evaluation”, all ten subjects with focus on “Economics in Public Policy”, “Philosophy in Public Policy” and “Scenario Planning” still have a room of further improvement in syllabuses and materials for their finalization by March 2016 to be fully utilised for NAPA’s MPP program. It is recommended that NAPA clarify the concrete procedure and

timeline for revision and finalization on each subject concerned.

(2) Institutional set-up and measures for securing quality of MPP curriculum

As mentioned in “(5) Sustainability” under “3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results”, an upcoming challenge for NAPA after initial formation of syllabuses and materials in March 2016 would be establishment of the institutional mechanism to continuously ensure the quality of developed MPP program. NAPA plans to conduct the review of MPP program as a whole in 2017. It is high time that NAPA sets up bodies with clear functions and decides necessary measures for monitoring and evaluation of each subject in MPP program.

(3) Measures for further enhancement of MPP program reputation

Target of students for newly opened MPP program is not only civil servants but also staffs from enterprises and newly graduated students. That is why promoting understanding and reputation of such wider actors would be one of key factors for further development of MPP program. It is expected that NAPA take concrete measures like making a brochure of MPP to introduce basic plan and curriculum for enhancing reputation of MPP program.

(4) Continuous development of MPP program

Nature of public policy is always changing with social transition. MPP has a mission to develop human resources to create and implement public policies to tackle against the new challenges in the society. In order to maintain MPP as an up-to-date prestigious program, it is required for NAPA to make a continuous effort for catching the social trend, analysing the issues of public policy and revising the curriculum through the local and international networks developed by the Project.