

Country Name	<b>Project on Improving Access to Quality Primary Education by Community Participation</b>
Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	<p>Education in Ethiopia had achieved the significant progress, especially in terms of access i.e. gross enrolment rate. Challenges, however, remained to achieve the universal primary education (UPE). The issues of high repetition and drop-out rates, low completion rate, overcrowded classrooms, shortage of textbooks and qualified teachers had become more highlighted, particularly in rural areas.</p> <p>In order to address these issues, especially to tackle the problem of quality of education, the Federal Ministry of Education had formulated the General Education Quality Improvement Programme (GEQIP) which has the following five components: (1) curriculum, textbooks and assessment; (2) teacher development program (TDP); (3) school improvement program (SIP); (4) management and administration; and (5) program coordination, monitoring and evaluation. The Programme also encouraged community participation in school activities and aims to expand access to quality education through collaboration among communities, schools and local education offices.</p>														
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through (1) developing the Ho! ManaBU training (HM training)*, conducting training of trainers (TOT) under HM training and supporting pilot Cluster Resource Centers (CRC) to implement HM Training, (2) revising/developing monitoring and reporting system, (3) supporting Oromia Education Bureau (OEB) to develop and implement OEB Initiative plan (which is made to disseminate experiences and good practices of the project), the project aimed that the knowledge and skills acquired in HM training is utilized in the pilot CRCs and drop-out and enrolment of students improve in the pilot CRCs (Project purpose level ), and thereby project aimed that training on participatory school-based management (HM training) is conducted in the entire Oromia Region, and enrolment, drop-out, gender gap improve in Oromia Region (Overall goal level ). The project objectives set forth are as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall Goal: Participatory school-based management is promoted in Oromia Region.</li> <li>Project Purpose: Participatory school-based management is promoted in the target area through collaboration between school and community with support of educational administrative organizations.</li> </ol> <p>*HM Training is the training to be developed by the project to help schools and communities understand their respective roles and responsibilities in school improvement, and thus lead to their active participation in school improvement activities. ("Ho! ManaBU" stands for Hoggansa Mana Barnoota Ummataa (Management of Community-based School))</p>														
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site:104 pilot CRCs at 54 Woredas (districts)/Special Towns in 13 Zones, Oromia Region</li> <li>Activities: (1) The project develops the Ho! ManaBU Training (HM training), conducts TOT under HM training and supports pilot CRCs to implement HM Training. (2) The project revises/develops monitoring and reporting system, formats and guidelines of educational administrative organizations. (3) The project supports OEB to develop and implement OEB Initiative Plan (which is made to disseminate HM training and approach)</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities)</li> </ol> <table border="0" style="width:100%"> <tr> <td style="width:50%">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width:50%">Ethiopian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Experts: 11 persons in total</td> <td>1.Staff allocated: Project Director, Project Manager and additional four officers from OEB, One focal person from each target Zonal Education Office (ZEO), Town Administration Education Office (TAEO), and Woreda Education Office (WEO)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Training in Japan: 6 persons</td> <td>2.Land and facility: Project office, Office spaces at OEB and ZEOs in East Wellega and East Showa, Training venues at the Pilot CRCs</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Equipment 4WD vehicle and others</td> <td>3. Local cost 1,033,929Birr</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4. Operation Cost 124,074,000 yen</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>					Japanese Side	Ethiopian Side	1. Experts: 11 persons in total	1.Staff allocated: Project Director, Project Manager and additional four officers from OEB, One focal person from each target Zonal Education Office (ZEO), Town Administration Education Office (TAEO), and Woreda Education Office (WEO)	2. Training in Japan: 6 persons	2.Land and facility: Project office, Office spaces at OEB and ZEOs in East Wellega and East Showa, Training venues at the Pilot CRCs	3. Equipment 4WD vehicle and others	3. Local cost 1,033,929Birr	4. Operation Cost 124,074,000 yen	
Japanese Side	Ethiopian Side														
1. Experts: 11 persons in total	1.Staff allocated: Project Director, Project Manager and additional four officers from OEB, One focal person from each target Zonal Education Office (ZEO), Town Administration Education Office (TAEO), and Woreda Education Office (WEO)														
2. Training in Japan: 6 persons	2.Land and facility: Project office, Office spaces at OEB and ZEOs in East Wellega and East Showa, Training venues at the Pilot CRCs														
3. Equipment 4WD vehicle and others	3. Local cost 1,033,929Birr														
4. Operation Cost 124,074,000 yen															
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	Project Period	September 2008-September 2012	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 370 million yen (actual) 385 million yen										
Implementing Agency	Oromia Education Bureau (OEB)														
Cooperation Agency in Japan	-														

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

1 Relevance
<p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of Ethiopia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion&gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with development policy of Ethiopia both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, Education Sector Development Programme III (ESDPIII) (2005/06-2009/10) aimed at expanding quality access to education through collaboration between community and local education administration. At the time of project completion, ESDP IV (2010/2011 – 2014/2015) emphasized importance of community participation and improving management capacity at the Woreda, CRC and school levels as priority issues.</p>

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Ethiopia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion >

The project was consistent with the needs for education for all in Ethiopia both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, Ethiopia faced some challenges such as high repetition and drop-out rates, low completion rate, overcrowded classrooms, shortage of textbooks and qualified teachers, particularly in rural areas. At the time of project completion, improvement of drop-out and girls' enrolment, and quality of education were still issues.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy for Ethiopia. Under education sector of the policy, improvement of quality of basic education through capacity development of local government and community participation in school building and management was prioritized under the Country Assistance Program to Ethiopia (2008).

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The project purpose was achieved by the time of project completion as indicators set to measure the achievement of the project purpose such as "Reduction in the number of drop-out students in the pilot CRCs" (indicator 1), "Improvement in the enrolment (of girls in particular) in the pilot CRC" (indicator 2), and "The percentage of the pilot CRCs which implement activities utilizing the knowledge and skills acquired in HM Training (80% or over)" (Indicator 3) were attained.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

After the project was completed, the effects of the project have somewhat continued at the pilot CRC level. The pilot CRCs utilize SIP in which each pilot CRC incorporated HM Training elements to address their own local challenges under framework of SIP, which is contextualized to their specific conditions, and SIP is used as a means to attract girls to education and retain students so that they do not drop out. As a result, enrolment and drop-out improved in the pilot CRCs through active participation of Parent Teacher Association (PTA), according to CRC officials and Zonal Education official. Communities have been continuously engaged in school management through training and consultation to send their kids to the school. There is a case that a PTA committee went to village when one child repeatedly skipped class to address the challenge and discuss with the family what the reasons for his/her absence were. Also, during the education festival period, which is the beginning of each academic year, parents are encouraged to bring their kids to the school with the motto "no child should be left at home". This initiative increases the rate of enrolment of the students.

The pilot CRCs played a key role in coordinating training to the satellite schools by using supervisors to give community education on the need to send girls to education and to reduce drop-out. These activities reduce drop-out rate and increase enrolment of students in these satellite schools.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The overall goal was not achieved. HM Training and the OEB Initiative Plan developed under this project for disseminating the HM Training and approaches based on the experiences in the pilot CRCs are not being implemented. Instead, different TOT for improvement of school drop-out and improvement of school environment for girls' education is being implemented from ZEO to CRC level under SIP directorate with focus of creating enabling environment for students and Teachers Development directorate with focus of capacity building of teachers. Those TOTs have not incorporated key elements from HM Training either. The reason for not continuing HM Training as planned is because the initiative failed to have appropriate ownership of officials and establish an institutional arrangement for further training. High turnover of staff who were trained under the project could also be a reason.

Accordingly, no organized information is available as far as planning HM Training at the classroom is concerned. Nonetheless, HM Training somewhat provides a feedback and an input for SIP to focus on improvement of enrolment and drop-out of students in Oromia Region, according to the OEB, Zonal and Woreda Education officials. It is reflected in the SIP domain that the enabling environment for learning and teaching process can be created through improved school management and community mobilization for addressing specific challenges such as improvement of enrolment and drop-out. The issue of drop-out and girls' education are given prime attention in almost all schools under the SIP framework because the problem is common.

As HM Training and the OEB Initiative Plan are not implemented/expanded to the entire region, it is difficult to infer that the project contributed to the improvement in the education statistics in Oromia Region.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project, and no negative impacts on natural environment were observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the project purpose was achieved at the time of project completion as the pilot CRCs utilized the knowledge and skills under HM Training and drop-out rate and girl's enrolment improved there. The effects of the project have somewhat continued at the pilot CRC level. Overall goal was not achieved. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

### Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Participatory school-based management is promoted in the target area through collaboration between school and community with support of educational	Indicator1: Reduction in the number of drop-out students in the pilot CRCs	<p><b>Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued)</b></p> <p>(Project Completion)</p> <p>The number of drop-out students of the primary schools in the pilot CRCs reduced from 11,163 (Rate 8.4%, 2008/09) to 10,580 (Rate 8.1%, 2010/11). It is observed that the average drop-out rate of Pilot CRCs in 2010/2011 (8.1%) is better than that of 81 non-Pilot CRCs (10.0%) nearest to Pilot CRCs.</p> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <p>According to the target ZEOs the drop-out rate significantly reduced in pilot CRCs to 6.9% as compared to 7.5% in 81 non pilot CRCs in 2014/15 because of the continuous engagement of the community.</p>

administrative organizations.	Indicator 2: Improvement in the enrolment (of girls in particular) in the pilot CRC	<p><b>Status of the achievement: achieved (continued)</b> (Project Completion)</p> <p><b>Number of Grade 1 Students of the Primary Schools in the pilot CRCs</b> (Aggregated number in the target zones where pilot CRCs exist)</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Year</th> <th>Male + Female</th> <th>Female</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>2008/2009 (a)</td> <td>20,019</td> <td>10,264</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2010/2011 (b)</td> <td>22,693</td> <td>11,426</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Increase (b)-(a)</td> <td>2,674</td> <td>1,162</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <p><b>Number of grade 1 student of the primary Schools in the pilot CRCs</b> (Aggregated number in the target zones where pilot CRCs exist)</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Year</th> <th>Male + Female</th> <th>Female</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>2014/2015 (a)</td> <td>26,210</td> <td>14,110</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2015/2016 (b)</td> <td>29,319</td> <td>16,426</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Increase (b)-(a)</td> <td>3,109</td> <td>2,316</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>At the time of ex-post evaluation, the enrolment of the students in the pilot CRCs significantly increased with bringing more girls to the school because of the PTA active participation in mobilizing the community to send their kids to the school particularly girls.</p>	Year	Male + Female	Female	2008/2009 (a)	20,019	10,264	2010/2011 (b)	22,693	11,426	Increase (b)-(a)	2,674	1,162	Year	Male + Female	Female	2014/2015 (a)	26,210	14,110	2015/2016 (b)	29,319	16,426	Increase (b)-(a)	3,109	2,316
	Year	Male + Female	Female																							
2008/2009 (a)	20,019	10,264																								
2010/2011 (b)	22,693	11,426																								
Increase (b)-(a)	2,674	1,162																								
Year	Male + Female	Female																								
2014/2015 (a)	26,210	14,110																								
2015/2016 (b)	29,319	16,426																								
Increase (b)-(a)	3,109	2,316																								
Indicator 3: The percentage of the pilot CRCs which implement activities utilizing the knowledge and skills acquired in HM Training (80% or over)	<p><b>Status of the Achievement: achieved (partially continued)</b> (Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 91% of the pilot CRCs implemented activities utilizing the knowledge and skills acquired in HM Training. The total number of those activities since November 2009 reached 848.</li> <li>- Some examples of the activities are; establishment of drop-out /girls' education committee to follow up the issue, organizing tutorial class for girls, improvement of school facilities, etc.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <p>Knowledge and skills acquired in HM Training held during the project have been continuously used to improve enrolment of students and drop-out rate and increase in girls' enrolment.</p>																									
(Overall goal) Participatory school-based management is promoted in Oromia Region.	Indicator 1: Training on participatory school-based management developed by the Project is conducted in Oromia Region	<p><b>Status of the Achievement: not achieved</b> (Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <p>HM Training and the OEB Initiative Plan are not being implemented. Instead, different TOT is being implemented under a different directorate.</p>																								
	Indicator 2: Improvement of educational statistics (enrolment, drop-out rates and gender gap) in Oromia Region	<p><b>Status of the Achievement: not achieved</b> (Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <p>As HM Training and the OEB Initiative Plan are not implemented/expanded to the entire region, it is difficult to infer how the project contributed to the improvement in the education statistics in Oromia Region</p> <p><b>Net enrolment rate and drop-out rate of primary education in Oromia Region (%)</b></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Net enrolment rate (Total)</td> <td>83.6</td> <td>84.8</td> <td>85.2</td> <td>95.5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Net enrolment rate (Girls)</td> <td>80.6</td> <td>80.9</td> <td>83.4</td> <td>89.9</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Drop-out rate (Total)</td> <td>16.2</td> <td>7.8</td> <td>9.9</td> <td>13.0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Drop-out rate (Girls)</td> <td>16.1</td> <td>6.9</td> <td>10.0</td> <td>13.5</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		2012	2013	2014	2015	Net enrolment rate (Total)	83.6	84.8	85.2	95.5	Net enrolment rate (Girls)	80.6	80.9	83.4	89.9	Drop-out rate (Total)	16.2	7.8	9.9	13.0	Drop-out rate (Girls)	16.1	6.9	10.0
	2012	2013	2014	2015																						
Net enrolment rate (Total)	83.6	84.8	85.2	95.5																						
Net enrolment rate (Girls)	80.6	80.9	83.4	89.9																						
Drop-out rate (Total)	16.2	7.8	9.9	13.0																						
Drop-out rate (Girls)	16.1	6.9	10.0	13.5																						

Source : JICA internal documents, questionnaires and interviews with OEB, ZEO (3) and Woreda Education Offices (9), CRC officials (5).

### 3 Efficiency

Although the project period was as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 104%). Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

At the time of ex-post evaluation, ESDP V (2016-2019) regards that participatory school management as one of the strategies to ensure quality education, improvement of school environment and teaching and learning process at higher level.

#### <Institutional Aspect>

Sustainability in terms of institutional aspect is low. No clear organizational structure or staff is in place for specifically following up HM Training. OEB has created a directorate called SIP Directorate to promote participatory school improvement through providing among others, TOT. However, there is no clear evidence that shows HM Training substantially included as part of the process. Most of the staff members are new and they have little information on HM Training. Although the terminal evaluation recommended appointing focal persons from Supervision Department and TDP for OEB Initiative Plan related activities, no one is being appointed.

#### <Technical Aspect>

No cascading training system was made after project completion. HM Training has not been expanded and the training materials developed under the project were not in use at OEB, ZEO, WEO and most of the pilot CRCs.

#### <Financial Aspect>

SIP in which the OEB Initiative Plan was expected to be part of the activities are being carried out with the budget allotted through school grant under GEQIP, administered by the World Bank. The budget is not enough to deal with all the components of GEQIP,

however, the SIP directorate of OEB attempts to address mainly to improve enrolment rate and girls' education among others.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, problems have been observed in terms of the institutional, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is low.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project purpose was achieved at the time of project completion as the pilot CRCs utilized the knowledge and skills under HM Training and drop-out rate and girl's enrolment improved there and the effects of the project have somewhat continued at the pilot CRC level. Overall goal was not achieved as the outcome of the project did not expand to the entire region. As for sustainability, there are some challenges in institutional, technical and financial aspects. For efficiency, the project cost slightly exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Lessons Learned for JICA:

OEB managed to effectively implement the project while the project was active. However, OEB failed to ensure the sustainability of the project as it is. The Bureau head of OEB and his associates who were counterpart to the project and participated in counterpart training in Japan left the bureau with another assignment without putting a system for OEB Initiative Plan into place. During the project formulation, sustainability of the project need to have been well thought of by both JICA experts and their counterparts at OEB before the commencement of the project. During the project implementation, there was also no clear system/strategy put in place in advance to pursue the HM Training and OEB Initiative Plan with the view of scaling up to other ZEO, WEO and CRC level once the project is completed.

Institutionalization of HM Training/OEB Initiative Plan couldn't take place at OEB level partly because the project managers and counterparts were officials and administrators of the OEB (as opposed to the experts), when the senior officials are replaced or transferred to other area, there was lack of follow-up by the new officials and experts as a result of insufficient information and lack of awareness regarding the HM Training/OEB Initiative Plan, or the project.



Girls attendance in class room is increased.



Enrolment of children increased significantly.