

Country Name		Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM) Human Capacity Development Project			
Republic of Philippines					
I. Project Outline					
Background	In 1996, a peace agreement between the government of the Republic of the Philippines and the Moro National Liberation Front (MNLF) was concluded which led to relative peace in the Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM). The ARMM was established in 1989 and now consists of five provinces and one city. It has a population of about 3.25 million and a poverty incidence of 48.7%. The setback in full-scale restoration and development stems from the protracted armed conflict in the region as well as delayed peace talks between the Government of the Philippines and the Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF), a breakaway group from the MNLF. Further, the lack of administrative capability of the ARMM government has been an obstacle. Following the above, JICA implemented the ARMM Administrative Resource Development Project from December 2004 – March 2007 to improve the basic skills of ARMM government executives and officials. As a result, these executives and officials have improved their basic knowledge about administration and regional development, and thus demonstrated better skills in planning and management. However, the administrative capacity of the ARMM government was still lacking in a number of aspects, thus, required the improvement on practical/technical skills in specific fields. In particular, there was a need to develop the skills of mid-level officers (technocrats). The government of the Philippines requested that a technical cooperation project be implemented for improving the capabilities of these technocrats as a priority issue. In response, JICA launched the project in May 2008 as part of the Japanese government’s peace and reconstruction support program known as the Japan-Bangsamoro Initiatives for Reconstruction and Development (J-BIRD).				
Objectives of the Project	The project aimed at capacitating the middle management and operating core in the target agencies of administration development, infrastructure development and economic development, thereby contributing to improvement of administrative capacity and promotion of economic development in ARMM. The project involved the following activities: (i) preparation of the Administration Code and Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR); (ii) Human Resource Information System (HRIS) for administrative development; (iii) trainings for trainers (TOT) for district engineers (infrastructure development); and, (iv) TOT on goat production for promotion of halal industry which is one of promising industries in the region, training for the extension service providers on goat production and marketing for economic development. The project objectives are set forth as follows:				
	1. Overall Goal: The administrative capacity is improved and economic development is promoted in ARMM 2. Project Purpose : The middle management and operating core are capacitated in the target agencies of Administration Development, Infrastructure Development and Economic Development.				
Activities of the project	1. Project sites: Cotabato and Davao 2. Main activities: i) Administration Development: drafting the Administration Code and its IRR, preparation of training manual for HRIS, ii)Infrastructure Development: delivering TOT trainings on infrastructure management and project proposal preparation, conducting training for the district engineers by Training of Trainers; iii) Economic Development: delivering TOT training on goat production and marketing, conducting training for the extension service providers by TOT trainers and compiling guidebook for business management and goat production 3. Inputs				
	Japanese Side (1) Dispatch of experts: 8 (2) Acceptance of trainees in Japan: 11 persons (3) Provision of equipment: PCs, printers, software, satellite phone, office appliance, etc.		Philippine side (1) Counterpart personnel: 122 persons (2) Land and facilities: Office space for the project and land, and computer in Cotabato City		
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	Project Period	May 2008 – March 2013 (Extension Period) April 2011 – March 2013	Project Cost	(Ex-Ante) 370 million yen (Actual) 606 million yen
Implementing Agency	Government of Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM)				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	IC-Net Ltd.				

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special perspectives considered in the ex-post evaluation>

[Change in the governmental body]

In October, 2012, the Government of the Philippines and Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF) signed the Framework Agreement on the Bangsamoro. Since then, both parties have been working to develop the Bangsamoro Basic Law which, if passed in Congress and ratified, will

establish the Bangsamoro Transition Authority and ultimately the Bangsamoro government. However, the Bangsamoro Law failed to gain approval in the last session of Congress under the Aquino Administration. Currently, the status of the peace process is uncertain as a new administration under the leadership of forthcoming President Mr. Rodrigo Duterte is set to take over on July 2016 as a result of the elections on May 9, 2016. This ex-post evaluation conducted analysis based on the situation of the ARMM Regional Government at the time of this evaluation. On the other hand, the analysis by this evaluation considered recommendations to be made in order to sustain the effects of the project.

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with Development Policy of Philippine Government at the time of ex-ante evaluation and the project completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with the Philippines' development policy prioritizing "peace and development in Mindanao" as set forth in the policy documents including the Regional Executive Agenda and Regional Development Program (2006-2008) and the Philippine Development Plan (2011-2016).</p> <p><Consistency with Development Needs of the Philippines at the time of ex-ante evaluation and the project completion></p> <p>The project met the development needs of the Philippines for improvement of administration system and human resource development of administrative officers including ex-soldiers and soldiers of MNLF as well as institutional building of ARMM.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy for the Philippines at the time of ex-ante evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with the revised Japan's Country Assistance Plan (2008) toward the Philippines prioritizing "peace and stability in Mindanao", in particular focusing on support for policy planning and implementation.</p> <p><Evaluation Results> In the light of above, the relevance of this project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact
<p><Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of project completion></p> <p>The Project Purpose, which was composed of the three components: (i) administrative development, (ii) infrastructure development and (iii) economic development, was achieved upon project completion.</p> <p>[Administration Development]</p> <p>The ARMM Administration Code and its IRR were drafted and 100% of the participating departments started to update HRIS. Also, the sustainable mechanisms for continuous revisions of the Administration Code and IRR and for HRIS were proposed.</p> <p>[Infrastructure Development]</p> <p>In-house technical trainings by the TOT trainers were introduced in the Department of Public Works ARMM (DPWH-ARMM) and delivered to technicians and engineers of the island offices. In addition, the institutional set-up for sustainable capacity development was prepared by DPWH-ARMM. Furthermore, the actual project proposals for three sectors of road rehabilitation, hospital rehabilitation and rural water supply were drafted.</p> <p>[Economic Development]</p> <p>Goat production was selected for promotion of halal industry, which was one of the promising industries in the region¹. Business support and technical support on goat production to farmers were provided through trainings for the farmers by the Extension Service providers. Also, the proper business and technical support for goat production were provided by the established sustainable institutional setting for extension services for goat production business.</p> <p><Continuation Status of the Project Effects at the time of ex-post evaluation></p> <p>[Administration Development]</p> <p>After the project completion, the Administrative Code was enacted into a law by the Regional Assembly and approved by the Acting Regional Governor in 2011. However, the approval of IRR was put on hold due to the following issues: a) budgetary constraints for the proposed positions under the Code; and b) deliberations on the Bangsamoro Basic Law have already begun in the Philippine Congress. Although there is no approved IRR, several provisions in the Code have actually been implemented by some ARMM Departments and agencies such as adoption of the roles and responsibilities defined in the Code for the Office of Assistant Regional Secretaries and the Regional Budget Management Office. The Human Resource Information Center (HRIC) has continuously performed its functions including conduct of trainings for personnel officers of various ARMM offices on operation and maintenance as well as updating of HRIS database.</p> <p>[Infrastructure Development]</p> <p>DPWH-ARMM officers prepared 5 project proposals (3 in 2013 and 2 in 2014). In the last 2 years, DPWH-ARMM officers were more occupied or engaged in formulation of Terms of Reference for contractors, review of proposals (feasibility studies) prepared by external consultants and supervision of infrastructure projects. Also, DPWH-ARMM implemented 345 projects of road, bridges, rural water supply and others in total for the period between 2013 and 2015 and plans 475 projects in 2015.</p> <p>[Economic Development]</p> <p>4 Local Government Units (LGUs), 3 target LGUs and 1 expansion LGU, have continuously supported 800 farmers in average per each LGU for goat production. The Municipal Agricultural Office of each LGU with the support of Department of Agriculture and Fisheries (DAF)-Maguindanao Provincial Office has provided extension support services to goat farmers such as distribution of stocks and providing technical advisory services. However, the agreed Action Plan for the Halal Goat Industry Promotion formulated towards the end of the project has not been implemented due to lesser priority given to the Plan and no budget support from the new ARMM administration.</p> <p><Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the time of ex-post evaluation></p> <p>The Overall Goal has been partially achieved. The dissemination and monitoring mechanism on the Administrative Code and IRR were not operationalized due to pending approval of the IRR despite that the Technical Working Group (TWG) members have</p>

¹ At the beginning stage of the project in June, 2008, the basic study on economic development was conducted by the project in order to identify a product to be promoted for the halal industry in the region. As a result of scoring by the four criteria of i) potentiality for halal certification, ii) market demand and growth potential, iii) size of labor population to be engaged in a target industry, and iv) competitiveness of a target industry, the livestock industry, including goat production, got the highest score. After the consultation at the Joint Coordinating Committee (JCC) for the project in January, the goat production was officially selected for the project activities of the Economic Development.

continuously disseminated the contents of the Administrative Code to their colleagues. The HRIS has continuously been operated and updated by all departments and agencies in ARMM except for the Department of Education using the other database developed by other donor's project. After project completion, there were some updating/enhancements done by HRIC to the HRIS database with the technical support of the Japanese expert dispatched to the ARMM. The in-house technical trainings on infrastructure project have been conducted in the form of mentoring workshops by 3 TOT trainers dispatched to the 8 District Engineering Offices (DEOs). The quality of trainings deemed sufficient for DPWH-ARMM engineers to properly manage infrastructure projects. In terms of the extension service for goat farming, the 4LGUs conducted the extension activities under the overall supervision of DAF Office of Maguindanao Province in 2014. However, from 2014 onwards, goat farming extension activities in the target LGUs significantly reduced because the Action Plan for the Halal Goat industry Promotion, which was formulated by the project, had lesser priority and did not get the necessary budget support from the new ARMM administration..

<Other Positive and Negative Impacts>

Some positive impacts were observed at the time of ex-post evaluation. The HRIS has been very useful in determining annual budget for personnel services and providing personnel data to national government agencies involved in the peace process. The project also contributed to capacity building of DPWH-ARMM engineers. The enhanced capacity of DPWH-ARMM engineers on infrastructure management proved use when the infrastructure budget of ARMM significantly increased in order to implement large infrastructure development in 2015. In addition, due to the project, income from goat farming increased in the target areas. According to the JICA study on Halal Goat Production Component² conducted in January, 2015, the number of goats increased to 9 per farmer in average and the estimated gross income from goat sales per farmer increased to 19,000-47,000 pesos. No negative impact on natural environment has been observed.

<Evaluation Results>

The project achieved the Project Purpose and partially achieved the Overall Goal. Also the project contributed to some positive impacts. However, under the new ARMM administration which is in transition process, unclear prospect on approval of IRR and the considerable reduction of goat farming extension activities in the target LGUs led to underachievement of the related indicators of the overall goal. Therefore, effectiveness/Impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Capacitation of the middle management and operating core in the target agencies of Administration Development, Infrastructure Development and Economic Development	(Administration Development) 1-1 Draft of Administrative Code and IRR is improved.	(Project Completion: Original Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Drafts of ARMM Administrative Code and IRR were elaborated. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Administrative Code was enacted and approved in 2011. Although the approval of IRR was put on hold, several provisions in the Code have actually been implemented by some ARMM Departments and agencies.
	1-2 75% of participating departments and offices start updating the HRIS	(Project Completion: Original Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 100% of participating departments started updating the HRIS. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The HRIS has continuously been operated and updated by all departments and agencies in ARMM except for the Department of Education.
	1-3 Three (3) staff (operator) can teach operation of. HRIS	(Project Completion: Original Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> More than 10 staffs from each department were trained as instructors to deliver operation guide of HRIS. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> HRIC has continuously performed its functions to deliver trainings for personnel officers of various ARMM offices on O&M and updating HRIS database.
	(Extension Period) 1-4 Institutional mechanism for tracking revisions of Administration Code and IRR is proposed by TWG (Technical Working Group)	(Project Completion: Extension Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The institutional mechanism for continuous revisions of the Administration Code and IRR was proposed by TWG. (Ex-post Evaluation) Partially continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Despite of no institutional mechanism for tracking revisions, TWG members have been functioning to disseminate and monitor the Administrative Code and IRR due to the pending approval of IRR.
	1-5 Periodical In-House Training Program on HRIS is started to execute in 80% of the core 17 departments/offices.	(Project Completion: Extension Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The core 17 departments/offices introduced periodical in-house training program on HRIS. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Same as 1-3..
	1-6 The sustainable mechanism on HRIS is proposed.	(Project Completion: Extension Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The sustainable mechanism on HRIS was proposed. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Same as 1-3.
	(Infrastructure Development) 2-1 Three (3) TOT trainers for in-house technical training.	(Project Completion: Original Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 10 TOT trainers who were able to deliver technical trainings on

² The JICA Philippine Office conducted a follow up study on the Economic Development Component in January, 2015 aimed at reviewing the outcomes and proposing recommended design for replication and expansion of goat production in ARMM.

		infrastructure management at DPWH-ARMM were trained. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none">There are 24 TOT trainers in DPWH-ARMM. 3 of them are engaged in in-house trainings and mentoring sessions and others are deployed to supervise and monitor various infrastructure projects..																				
	2-2 In-house technical training is introduced in DPWH-ARMM.	(Project Completion: Original Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">In-house TOT trainings on infrastructure management were delivered to technicians/engineers of the islands regional offices with limited training opportunities. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none">In-house technical trainings have been delivered by the TOT trainers in DPWH-ARMM. .																				
	2-3 Three (3) project proposals are completed and submitted.	(Project Completion: Extension Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">Three new project proposals, including road construction, hospital rehabilitation and rural water supply, were drafted by the project proposal group at project completion. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. [No. of project proposals prepared by DPWH-ARMM officers] <table><tr><td>Category</td><td>2013</td><td>2014</td><td>2015</td></tr><tr><td>Road</td><td>1</td><td>0</td><td>0</td></tr><tr><td>Hospital rehabilitation</td><td>1</td><td>0</td><td>0</td></tr><tr><td>Rural water supply</td><td>1</td><td>1</td><td>0</td></tr><tr><td>Others, port development</td><td>0</td><td>1</td><td>0</td></tr></table>	Category	2013	2014	2015	Road	1	0	0	Hospital rehabilitation	1	0	0	Rural water supply	1	1	0	Others, port development	0	1	0
Category	2013	2014	2015																			
Road	1	0	0																			
Hospital rehabilitation	1	0	0																			
Rural water supply	1	1	0																			
Others, port development	0	1	0																			
	(Extension Period) 2-4 10 TOT trainers for in-house technical training are further capacitated to plan, implement and evaluate trainings on infrastructure construction management.	(Project Completion: Extension Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">13 TOT trainers were trained. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none">There are 24 TOT trainers in DPWH-ARMM. 3 of them are engaged in in-house trainings and mentoring sessions and others are deployed to supervise and monitor various infrastructure projects.																				
	2-5 Institutional set-up (e.g. the in-house training unit, internal order) for continuous capacity development activities (e.g. in-house training) is established.	(Project Completion: Extension Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">The institutional set up for continuous capacity development was established at project completion. The DPWH-ARMM utilized its existing Human Resource Management Section to manage the conduct of trainings for DPWH engineers by the TOT trainers trained during the project. (Ex-post Evaluation) Continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none">In-house technical trainings, OJT and mentoring workshops for district and field engineers have been institutionalized.																				
	(Economic Development) 3-1 Business support by TWG/Extension Service Providers started to be operational.	(Project Completion: Original Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">Business support to farmers was provided through the training for the farmers by the Extension Service Providers trained by the TOT training. (Ex-post Evaluation) Partially continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none">Business support to farmers has been provided but significantly reduced since 2014.																				
	3-2 Technical support on Halal product (goat) started to be provided by TWG/Extension Service Providers.	(Project Completion: Original Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">Technical support to farmers was provided through the training on “Goat production technology” by the Extension Service Providers by the TOT training. (Ex-post Evaluation) Partially continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none">The extension activities related to goat production in the target LGUs were dramatically reduced in 2014.																				
	(Extension Period) 3-3 Business and technical support is operational in a limited number of target LGUs with the complete institutional set up in ARMM for sustainable implementation system on goat production/business management.	(Project Completion: Extension Period) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">The proper business support and technical support for goat production were provided by the established sustainable institutional setting for extension services for goat production/ business. (Ex-post Evaluation) Partially continued. <ul style="list-style-type: none">The extension activities related to goat production in the target LGUs were dramatically reduced in 2014.																				
(Overall goal) Improvement of the administrative capacity and promotion of economic development in ARMM	Indicator 1: Monitoring and dissemination on Administrative Code and Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) are in operation.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">The mechanism for dissemination and monitoring of the Administrative Code and IRR was not operationalized due to the pending approval of IRR.																				
	Indicator 2: Human Resource Information System (HRIS) for human resource management is widely utilized in ARMM government.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. <ul style="list-style-type: none">HRIS has been utilized by all departments and agencies of ARMM except for the Department of Education with own personnel database.																				

	Indicator 3: Human resource development activities on infrastructure management are constantly carried out by DPWH-ARMM.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. [No. of technical trainings by TOT trainers in DPWH-ARMM]			
		Topic	2013	2014	2015 (plan)
		Project proposal preparation	2	2	2
		Construction management	2	2	2
	Indicator 4: Target LGUs start to be able to conduct goat farming extension activities on a continuous base.	(Ex-post evaluation) Partially achieved. Extension activities on goat farming has been continued but significantly reduced since 2014. [Extension activities in the target LGUs]			
			2013	2014	2015 (plan)
		No. of LGUs supporting goat production	4	4	4
		No. of farmers supported by LGUs for goat production	800*	800*	800*
		*Average of 200 per LGU			

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Project Completion Report, Results of the focus group discussion with members of TWGs

3 Efficiency

The planned outputs for the original period were mostly achieved within the original cost and period (ratio against the plan: 101%, 100% respectively) While the additional inputs, including dispatch of the Japanese experts, were required for producing the additional outputs to expand the scope of the Project Purpose, and both of the project cost and the project period exceeded the plan in total (ratio against the plan: 163% and 169%, respectively), the additional project cost allocated for the extension period and the length of extension period were appropriate for producing the additional outputs to achieve the extended Project Purpose. Therefore, overall efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspects>

The current administration in ARMM that took over in December 2011 placed good governance on top of its reform agenda along with socio-economic development and peace and security. In line with this, the promotion of open, transparent and accountable governance became one of the priority thrusts of the Updated Regional Development Plan (RDP), 2013-2016. Among the major policies being pursued by the RDP which are deemed supportive of the development of administrative capacity in ARMM are: a) the policy on “streamlining and professionalizing of the ARMM bureaucracy through capacity building of ARMM agencies and gradual implementation of the Administrative Code” and b) policy on “institutionalization of database management system in support of sound planning and management of resources”. However, in terms of economic development, the Action Plan for the Halal Goat Industry Promotion formulated during the project period has lesser priority under the current transitional government body of ARMM.

<Institutional Aspects>

[Administration Development]

The capacity development system for ARMM officers introduced by the project has been continued. Presently, a total of 36 offices have operational HRIS including their provincial offices. Also, the HRIS operators have been increased from 34 in 2013 to 119 in 2015 and the number of them is sufficient to meet their work targets on time. 4 staff deployed at the HRIS Center is also sufficient since their task is shared with personnel officers and HRIS operators deployed in various ARMM offices. The HRIC has continuously performed its functions including conduct of trainings for personnel officers of various ARMM offices on operation and maintenance as well as updating of HRIS database. The high priority given by the new ARMM Administration to the automation of personnel records in preparation for the turnover of administration to the Bangsamoro Government is a major promoting factor. The dispatch of Japanese expert to assist in updating of HRIS database after project completion was also a contributing factor.

[Infrastructure Development]

24 TOT trainers have been deployed in DPWH-ARMM. Out of them, only 3 trainers have been engaged in in-house trainings and mentoring sessions while others have been engaged in supervision and monitoring of various infrastructure projects. In addition, all the DPWH-ARMM engineers trained by the project have been engaged in planning, implementation and management of infrastructure projects in the ARMM region and the number of engineers has been sufficient because of the 45 (5 from each of the 8 district offices and the regional office) engineers newly recruited.

[Economic Development]

Technical and business support activities for goat farmers have been continued by the LGU extension service providers as a part of their official function but when the budget is available. Although the extension officers of DAF-ARMM were actively engaged in providing technical advice to goat farmers when the budget was allocated for goat production under the Priority Development Assistance Fund (PDAF) in 2013, the extension activities including goat dispersal and farmers’ training were likewise suspended after the PDAF budget releases were suspended in 2014.

<Technical Aspects>

[Administration Development]

All the members of TWG are still working with their respective agencies in ARMM and have been active to disseminate the contents of the Administrative Code to their colleagues as mentioned above. Also, more than 90% of the trained HRIS operators remain working in the same positions during the project and have been applying the knowledge and skills for operating and updating the HRIS learned through the project.

[For Infrastructure Development]

Out of 30 TOT trainers of DPWH-ARMM trained by the project, 24 have been sustaining their knowledge and skills to deliver in-house technical trainings for district engineers and their knowledge and skills have been further enhanced by the trainings under

the Comprehensive Capacity Development Project (CCDP) in 2014 and 2015. More than 90% of the district engineers trained by the project have remained working within ARMM and sustained their skills and knowledge on infrastructure management. They also participated in trainings under CCDP in 2014 and 2015.

[Economic Development]

Only a few TOT trainers from DAF-ARMM had the opportunity to conduct trainings on goat production as a part of their regular function while others from other agencies were not involved in after the project completion. Almost all the extension service providers trained by the project remain working in their respective agencies as extension agent. They have sustained their knowledge and skills on goat farming and business management and applied them through the performance of their regular functions in their respective agencies but no opportunity to have further trainings after the project completion. According to goat farmers surveyed by the ex-post evaluation, about 90% of those who attended trainings by the project are still engaged in goat farming and applied knowledge and skills acquired through the trainings such as use of mineral supplements. The Guidebook on goat farming has been useful for extension service providers, in particular, for those who were mobilized for the PDAF supporting goat dispersal project of DAF-Maguindanao.

<Financial Aspects>

[Administration Development]

The budgetary requirements for maintaining the HRIS and its Center are included in the Annual Local Fund Appropriations of ARMM. The amount of budget for HRIS Center on HRIS, increased from 350,000 Philippine pesos (PHP) in 2013 to PHP 400,000 in 2015 which is deemed sufficient. Although no budget was allocated for training in 2013 and 2014 because of the training activities funded by JICA, budget for trainings is included in the budget for HRIS Center in 2015.

[Infrastructure Development]

The budgetary allocation for in-house technical trainings amounting to PHP 250,000 for the period from 2013 to 2015 is considered as sufficient. In terms of implementation of infrastructure projects, the amount of budget has dramatically increased from PHP1.5 billion in 2013, PHP 5 billion in 2014, to PHP 10.1 billion in 2015. The significant increase in DPWH-ARMM's budget can be attributed to the successful reforms for improvement in terms of implementation of infrastructure projects, transparency, capacity of personnel and management of funds under the current ARMM Administration. Given these improvements and the Aquino Administration's agenda of peace and development in Mindanao, the Department of Budget and Management under the President Office approved the successive increases in the budget of DPWH-ARMM.

[Economic Development]

DAF-ARMM's budget for extension and business support increased from PHP 800,000 in 2013 to PHP 1,250,000 in 2015. However, the budget is allocated not only for goat farming but also for other priority commodities and has to be shared with other municipalities within Maguindanao Province. Thus, the budget for extension and business support is deemed insufficient. In addition, no budget was allocated for trainings of extension service providers from 2013 to 2015.

<Evaluation Result>

Although there have been some problems observed in all the aspects of sustainability for the Economic Development component of this project, there is no other serious problem observed for the Administrative Development component and the Economic Development component. Therefore, sustainability of the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

This project has achieved the Project Purpose of capacitation of the middle management and operating core in the target agencies of administration, infrastructure and economic development and partially achieved the Overall Goal of improvement of the administration capacity and promotion of economic development in ARMM. As for sustainability, for administration development, HRIS has been continuously functioning by the sufficient skills of the HRIS operators and the budget for HRIS Center has increased. For economic development, the TOT trainers of DPWH-ARMM have been continuously engaged in trainings for the district engineers. However, for economic development, the budget for extension and business support for goat farming has not been sufficient. As for efficiency, the planned outputs for the original period were mostly achieved within the original project period and cost. The the additional project cost was allocated for the extension period, but they were appropriate for producing the additional outputs to achieve the extended Project Purpose.

In light of above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for the ARMM government:

- Establish a mechanism for review and monitoring of implementation and dissemination of the contents of the Administrative Code in preparation for transition to the new Bangsamoro Government
- Continue the strengthening of capacity of technical staff of DPWH-ARMM not only at the regional level but also at the district and provincial offices in anticipation of the need for competent managers of the accelerated infrastructure development program of ARMM and its successor political entity;
- Review of the implementation mechanism of the Halal Goat Cluster Industry Development Plan taking into consideration the weaknesses of the existing extension service delivery system and adopting the farmer-to-farmer extension approach whereby successful goat farmers are mobilized to transfer knowledge and skills to ordinary goat farmers in the target areas since the extension support system for goat farmers expected to be provided by the LGUs did not materialize after the project and most famers sought technical advices from successful goat farmers trained by the project in their area instead of the extension service by the LGUs
- Establish a directory of trainers who were trained under ARMM – Human Capacity Development Project (AHCDP) who can be tapped as resource persons in future capacity-building activities in the ARMM region. Such directory should include a profile of previous trainings conducted and fields of expertise of the trainer.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- The use of Technical Working Groups (TWGs) in the implementation of capacity development activities did not only secure

participation and sense of ownership among project counterparts but was also very helpful in building relationships and promoting communication among offices within the ARMM bureaucracy.

- Active participation of the DPWH-ARMM human resource development unit in training activities during the project helped build the capability of DPWH-ARMM in training management and ensured continuity of capacity development activities of the agency after project completion.



Staffs of Human Resource Information Center



Farmer raring goats