

Summary of the Terminal Evaluation Results

1. Project Summary		
Country: Republic of Philippines		Project Name: The Project for Capacity Development on Transportation Planning and Database Management in the Republic of the Philippines (MUCEP)
Issue/Sector: Transportation		Type of Cooperation: Technical Cooperation
Department in charge: Infrastructure and Peacebuilding Department		Total cost (as of June 2015): Approx. 322 million yen
Project Period	01 September 2011~31 March 2015 (R/D):29 July 2011	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Department of Transportation and Communication (DOTC)
		Supporting Organizations in Japan: ALMEC Corporation and Oriental Consultants Co., Ltd.
		Other Related Cooperation: Non
1-1 Background of the Project <p>The acceleration of economic activities and the concentration of population in Metropolitan Manila and other cities in the Philippines have caused severe social problems such as traffic congestion, traffic accidents, and deterioration of the living environment. In particular, the increase in private vehicle numbers has generated traffic congestion. In 2009, the number of registered vehicles in Metro Manila reached 1.77 million, or an increase of 11% from 2007 levels. In the same year, the number of traffic accidents was reported to have reached 64,747 cases. The development of the public transportation (PT) network is therefore crucial in tackling not only these problems, but global warming issues as well which have recently captured the attention of leaders and policy makers. In addition, investment in infrastructure development is essential in realizing a sustainable economic growth. With these considerations, it is important to create a favorable environment for private investment by developing and integrating transportation networks and strengthening linkages between and among transportation modes for land, sea, and air.</p> <p>The development of transportation infrastructure should be planned comprehensively and should include all transportation modes. In the Philippines, the Department of Transportation and Communications (DOTC), the overall entity responsible for national transportation policies, has managed air, rail, road, and sea transportation separately and the relevant databases, which are required for solid national transportation planning, have also been managed independently of each other. To illustrate, the database related to transportation planning is managed not only by the DOTC but other agencies as well, such as the Light Rail Transit Authority, Philippine National Railway, and others. Compounding the situation is the lack of coordination between and among these agencies regarding such database aspects as data storage, sharing, and updating. Therefore, being the agency responsible for comprehensive transportation planning, the DOTC's capacity to develop and manage a transportation planning database and to formulate transportation policies should be strengthened. A</p>		

transportation policy to facilitate a modal shift from private cars to public transportation is highly needed, especially in Metro Manila, to alleviate traffic congestion and the various environmental problems it has spawned. Toward this end, the capacity for developing the transportation database based on that developed in the “Metro Manila Urban Transportation Integration Study” (1999, Japan International Cooperation Agency) and the capacity for utilizing such database in planning the public transportation network have to be strengthened.

In light of the above, the Government of the Philippines requested the Government of Japan to provide technical assistance to develop a policy framework on national transportation planning, comprehensive national transportation data building, and decision-making support system based on geographical information through this project entitled “Project for Capacity Development on Transportation Planning and Database Management in the Republic of the Philippines” or MMUTIS Update and Capacity Enhancement Project for short (MUCEP).

For this project, the plan was for the DOTC to serve as the counterpart (CP) agency. However, in the Detailed Planning Survey for the project which JICA conducted from February to March 2011, it was found that the DOTC itself needs to develop its capacity in policy making. In that survey too, the target project area was changed from nationwide to Metro Manila, particularly Manila city only. In addition, the objective of the project was revised: From developing a policy framework on national transportation planning, comprehensive national transportation data building, and decision-making support system to strengthening the capacity on transportation database management and public transportation network planning. Following the results of the survey, a Record of Discussion (R/D) was exchanged on 29 July 2011 between JICA and the DOTC.

1-2 Project Overview

- | | | |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|
| (1) | Overall Goal: | Public transportation plan for Metro Manila is prepared by the DOTC. ⁶ |
| (2) | Project Purpose: | To improve public transportation planning for Metro Manila, including coordination among relevant agencies, spearheaded by the DOTC. |
| (3) | Outputs: | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Improved capacity to manage the Metro Manila transportation database. 2) Improved capacity to plan the public transportation network of Metro Manila. 3) Improved capacity to coordinate and formulate policies on public transportation network development in Metro Manila. |
| (4) | Inputs (as of the end of June 2015): | |

Japanese Side

⁶ The overall goal was clarified by the DOTC and JPT during the terminal evaluation. The “public transportation plan for Metro Manila” stated in the overall goal refers to a public transportation plan (targeting 2–3 years after MUCEP completion) for strategic corridors in Metro Manila that have important transportation issues. As a result, the Terminal Evaluation Team recommended to the JICA Project Team (i.e., MUCEP experts) to modify Project Design Matrix (PDM) version 3 based on the actual situation. The Project would thus be evaluated based on PDM-version 4, while the preparation of a comprehensive public transportation planning for Metro Manila will continue to be a long-term goal for the DOTC (targeting 5–10 years after MUCEP completion).

a) Personnel:	11 short-term experts
b) Equipment	8.7 million yen
c) Local Cost	16,028 thousand yen
d) Person Trip Study	20,590 thousand yen
e) Training in Japan	25 persons
<u>Philippine Side</u>	
a) Assignment of Counterparts	31 persons including alternate representatives
b) DOTC funded HIS	Approximately PHP 34,000 thousand
c) Office Space Rental	Approximately PHP 2,160 thousand
d) Personnel ⁷	Approximately PHP 1,890 thousand
e) Equipment, Supplies and Furniture	Approximately PHP 500 thousand

2. Evaluation Team			
Leader/Evaluation Planning	Tomoki KANENAWA	Transportation and ICT Group, Infrastructure and Peacebuilding Department, JICA Evaluation Department, International Development Center of Japan Incorporated	
Evaluation Analysis	Mimi SHEIKH		
Schedule of the Evaluation	5 July 2015～18 July 2015	Type of Evaluation	Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation			
3-1 Achievement of Outputs			
<u>Output 1 (Improved Capacity to Manage the Metro Manila Transportation Database): Mostly Achieved</u>			
Indicator 1-1 “Updated MMUTIS transportation database” and Indicator 2-2 “Proposed plan on public transportation network for Metro Manila” are mostly achieved. The transportation database of MMUTIS was updated along with the development of the MUCEP database by the project team, and related manuals on traffic survey were prepared by the Project. The Database Management Manual will also be prepared before the project completes.			
<u>Output 2 (Improved Capacity to Plan the Public Transportation Network of Metro Manila): Mostly Achieved</u>			
Indicator 2-1 “Prepared manual on public transportation planning” has been mostly achieved when the first draft of the “Manual on Urban Transportation Planning” was completed. The manual will be finalized after the CPT members have submitted their respective inputs. Indicator 2-2 “Proposed plan on public transportation network for Metro Manila” is in progress. The plan for the public transportation network for Metro Manila will assumed as achieved when the pilot studies have been completed and recommendations were considered by the CPT based on the results of the pilot studies. Both Indicators 2-1 and 2-2 are expected to be achieved by the time MUCEP ends.			

⁷ This is only for personnel expenses for DOTC. Actual amount is larger than the stated amount.

Output 3 (Improved Capacity to Coordinate and Formulate Policies on Public Transportation Network Development in Metro Manila): Partially Achieved

The achievement level of Indicators 3-1 “Effective agreements among stakeholders made in relevant meetings” and 3-2 “Agreed recommendations on transportation policy issues” are in progress at the time of the Joint Terminal Evaluation. Two outcome indicators will be achieved when project outputs, such as the results of pilot studies⁸ and recommendations for future steps to develop a public transportation plan for Metro Manila, are presented at the upcoming two seminars (July 2015 and October 2015). Therefore, both indicators are expected to be achieved by the end of the Project.

3-2 Achievement of Project Purpose

Project Purpose, “To improve public transportation planning for Metro Manila, including coordination among relevant agencies, spearheaded by the DOTC”: Mostly Achieved

As regard the indicator “The management system⁹ for the new transportation database is established by 2014”,

A transportation database, MUCEP database, was newly created and the transportation database of MMUTIS was updated. A request form for MUCEP database was also created in the Project. The management system for the MUCEP database will be completed once the Database Management Manual is completed and the system for utilizing MUCEP data is announced to public transportation-related agencies and institutions at a seminar. All of the remaining tasks will be conducted by the end of the Project. Thus, the Project is likely to achieve its purpose by its end.

3-3 Evaluation Results by Five Criteria

(1) Relevance: High

The Project is in line with development policy of Philippines because Philippine Development Plan (PDP) pointed out that one of the critical elements in the realization of the PDP is the development of an efficient, integrated, and coordinated transportation system. Further, the Project is in line with the principal mandate of the DOTC, which is to formulate and recommend national policies and guidelines for the preparation and implementation of integrated transportation systems.

The Project is consistent with Japan’s official development assistance (ODA) policy for the Philippines, as well. “Improvement of Traffic and Transportation Network of the Greater Capital Region” as one of the priority development areas to overcome these challenges, and this Project is one of the measures included on the project list in the rolling plan.

⁸ 1. CNG Bus Introduction Study 2. Study on the Bus Exclusive Lane on Ortigas Avenue, and 3. Bonifacio Global City Public Transportation Improvement Project were selected as pilot studies to apply skills and knowledge on Cube software transferred by MUCEP,

⁹ It refers to a situation that a system to lend MUCEP database is established and the database are ready to be shared with other public transportation planning related agencies.

(2) Effectiveness: High

Most important achievement of the Project is creation of MUCEP database and update of MMUTIS database. The transportation database of Metro Manila which was last updated in 1990s by JICA was finally updated by the Project after a long wait. Not only the DOTC, but other related agencies as well, will be able to use the new database in making effective plans that respond to the present conditions in Metro Manila. Not only the DOTC, but other related agencies as well, will be able to use the new database in making effective plans that respond to the present conditions in Metro Manila.

On the other hand, 1) a system for sharing the new database outside of the DOTC is still under preparation and 2) the development of the CPT's transportation planning skills and techniques is still in progress while the remaining activities will be completed within the project period.

As for capacity development of public transportation network planning based on the average scores based on self-examination taken by C/P, the level of knowledge and skills for each output have clearly improved compared from the early phase of the Project to the time of the terminal evaluation.

It is concluded that outcome has reached to satisfactory level, thus, the Project purpose, "To improve public transportation planning for Metro Manila, including coordination among relevant agencies, spearheaded by the DOTC." is mostly achieved.

(3) Efficiency: Fair

Inputs from both the Japanese and Philippine side have been mostly completed as planned in terms of quantity and quality, and all of the inputs have been contributed to achieve the project purpose. As regards the timing of inputs, while Japanese inputs were provided as scheduled, some of Philippine inputs were delayed. The formation and mobilization of the CPT were delayed for six months as against the original plan, while the DOTC-funded HIS was delayed by 15 months due to problems in sourcing the funds and procuring the services of the local survey firm. These delays caused the extension of the project period for 15 months.

(4) Impact: Expected to be High

There are two indicators to measure the achievement of the Project's overall goal "Public transportation plan for Metro Manila is prepared by the DOTC¹⁰". As regards the first indicator, i.e., "Prepared public transportation plan for Metro Manila based on an analysis of the new transportation database," using skills and knowledge learned through three pilot studies prepared in the Project, it is expected that continuous efforts will be made by the DOTC and other counterpart agencies and that further reports/ presentation materials on public transportation plans for strategic corridors in Metro Manila in relation to important transportation issues will be produced even after the Project ends. As regards the second indicator, i.e., "Utilization of the new transportation database," a request form for accessing the new transportation database has already been prepared. According to the

¹⁰ Public transportation plan for Metro Manila denotes for example public transportation plan for strategic corridors in relation to important transportation issues in Metro Manila (target 2-3 years).

DOTC, the new database was already shared with two DOTC offices. For agencies outside the DOTC, the MUCEP database and MMUTIS database will be officially introduced in the final seminar scheduled in October 2015. According to interviews with the CPT and their supervisors, all are eager to access the new database. Thus, there is no doubt as the utilization of the new database after the Project ends.

As regards unexpected impacts, 1) Dissemination of skills and knowledge in transportation planning transferred by the JICA Project Team (JPT) through project participants, 2) building a collaborative relationship among public transportation related agencies were confirmed.

(5) Sustainability: Fair

<Policy and institutional aspects>

The development of an efficient, integrated, and coordinated transportation system is considered to be one of critical challenges in the transportation sector of the Philippines. The principal mandate of the DOTC is to formulate and recommend national policies and guidelines on the preparation and implementation of integrated transportation systems at the national, regional, and local levels. The DOTC will continue working to meet this mandate even after the Project ends. Thus, the enhancement of the transportation planning capacity of the DOTC, as well as related agencies, is going to be continuously supported by the Government of the Philippines. The sustainability of the Project in the aspects of policy making and institutional support is considered to be very high.

< Organizational aspect>

Major project activities including transportation database management and public transportation network planning on important transportation issues for strategic Metro Manila corridors have been undertaken by Transport Planning Unit (TPU) in the Project and these activities will remain to be TPU's tasks even after the Project ends. The DOTC has confirmed that the TPU will be maintained under the DOTC's Road Transportation Planning Division (RTPD). The RTPD personnel is expected to be augmented soon by four new staffs. However details on TPU's tasks and responsibilities after the Project ends have not yet been clarified. Thus, the organizational sustainability of the Project is considered to be "fair."

< Financial aspect>

Whereas information on budget allocation and expenditure is not publicly available, the budget of the DOTC's RTPD has been stable since 2011 and is going to be the same after the Project ends, according to DOTC management. The necessary budget to continue the Project outcomes will be approximately PHP 700,000 per year including costs for upgrading software and outsourcing various transportation studies to support planning activities. DOTC management confirmed that the stated budget will be ensured after the Project. Thus, the financial sustainability of the Project is considered to be "high."

< Technical aspect>

Regarding the technical skills of TPU members, their knowledge and skills to develop transportation plans using the new database have improved, as discussed in Section 5.2 on effectiveness. Also, various manuals were produced in the Project to assist them. However, the JPT believes that the TPU members must continuously use and apply the skills they learned in the Project by preparing public transportation plans for strategic Metro Manila corridors after the Project ends. The skills and knowledge will be easily forgotten if they don't apply them on a daily basis, according to one of the lecturers in the Project.

The TPU members who are currently assigned fulltime for the Project is going back to DOTC office once the Project ends. They will continuously analyze public transportation plans for strategic Metro Manila corridors by using MUCPEP database, however at the same time they are expected to undertake regular daily tasks of DOTC as well. A concern is that they might not have enough time to analyze strategic Metro Manila corridors because their majority of time would be occupied by their regular workloads. Because of this, the technical sustainability of the Project is considered to be "fair."

< Other Aspects Affecting the Sustainability of Project Outcomes>

The next Philippine presidential election is scheduled in May 2016. This may affect the sustainability of project outcomes.

3-4 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Planning

Flexible response of JICA Project Team to needs of Counterpart Team

Whereas the Project needs to follow a plan of operation in principle, the JICA Project Team flexibly changed the schedule and project approach in response to the needs of Counterpart Team as long as the changes did not negatively affect the ultimate objective of the Project. This approach was effective to improve capacity of Counterpart.

(2) Implementation Process

Strong needs for the creation of a new transportation database

The latest transportation database for Metro Manila before the Project was that developed in MMUTIS which was based on the HIS conducted in 1996. Since then, the transportation database has not been updated. The dynamic of Metro Manila has changed significantly in the last 20 years. The DOTC and other related agencies strongly need an updated database to make transportation plans for Metro Manila which are in accordance with the actual situation. Since all the public transportation planning-related institutions want to have access to an updated transportation database, all of the stakeholders have willingly cooperated in implementing MUCPEP.

Strong ownership of the DOTC

The DOTC as the coordinating body for the Philippine stakeholders has showed a strong

ownership of the Project throughout its implementation. Some of the examples which show this are the following: 1) the DOTC staff have attended MUCEP trainings and JCC meetings more often than other institutions; 2) they have actively participated in trainings and meetings—changing the training style from lectures to question-and-answer sessions was proposed by the DOTC members; 3) they sometimes accompanied the HIS Team to learn more about actual site situations; and 4) the DOTC assigned four full-time staff for the TPU. These reflect the DOTC’s strong commitment as a leading institution to successfully complete MUCEP.

Good relationship among MUCEP members

The stable partnership and communication among the DOTC, Department of Public Works and Highways, Metro Manila Department Authority, University of the Philippines National Center for Transportation Studies, Light Rail Transit Authority, Land Transportation Franchising and Regulatory Board, Bases Conversion Department Authority, North Luzon, BCDA, North Luzon Railways Corporation, Philippine National Railway, local staff, and JICA experts have gradually developed in the process of project implementation, especially the weekly trainings every Thursday, and the training in Japan, contributing much to fostering a good relationship among them. The implementation situation of various activities under the Project has been also promoted as a result of their joint work on their tasks with diligence and commitment.

3-5 Factors that constrained realization of effects

(1) Planning

So far, the Project has experienced only one major challenge, and that was the difficulty of conducting the pilot studies without the full-time commitment of the TPU staff. “Establish a Transportation Database Management” was the first activity to be conducted in the Project. Initially, the Transportation Database Management Unit (TDMU) was supposed to be established upon project commencement. This, however, did not materialize. The Counterpart Project Team (CPT), in particular, could only devote a little time for MUCEP much less than the Project expected because they have official duties in the DOTC. On 5 February 2014, the DOTC issued Special Order No. 2014-040, creating the Transport Planning Unit (TPU) within the Road Transportation Planning Division and three full-time staffers were assigned to the TPU accordingly. While the project activities, especially pilot studies, have been conducted smoothly after the establishment of the TPU, the Project could have proceeded more effectively had this been created much earlier in the project period.

(2) Implementation Process

An issue related to implementation process was not identified.

3-6 Conclusion

Based on the findings of the Joint Terminal Evaluation, the Evaluation Team concludes that with the concerted effort of both the Philippine and Japanese side, the Project has been successfully

implemented, has achieved sufficient effects, and is expected to end by November 2015 as planned. Moreover, the Project is expected to achieve its purpose within the project period and is mostly on the right track to achieving its Overall Goal in the post project period. Based on the five evaluation criteria, the Project has generated mostly good and positive results despite some concerns about its efficiency and sustainability. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

3-7 Recommendation

(1) For the Remaining Project Period

Establish a management system for the new transportation database

The Project Purpose has not been fully achieved. It will be so only when the system to access the MUCEP database is announced to public transportation-related agencies and institutions in a forthcoming seminar. Any concerns about database management should be explained in that seminar. For example: 1) Who will manage the database?; 2) Can the MUCEP data be used with no restrictions?; 3) Can users change or modify the data?; and 4) Who will be responsible for updating the database?

Clarify the TPU's responsibilities and expected tasks after the Project

The DOTC management has confirmed that the TPU will remain with the department's Road Transportation Planning Division, but its responsibilities and expected tasks have not yet been discussed in the Project. The JPT and the DOTC should thus clarify this issue before the Project ends and the outcomes of discussions should be incorporated in the Project's final report.

Modify PDM3 based on the actual situation

The JPT and the DOTC clarified that the "Public transportation plan for Metro Manila" stated in the Overall Goal refers, for example, to the public transportation plans for strategic Metro Manila corridors with important transportation issues. The means of verification should be reviewed and modified, if necessary.

(2) For the Post Project Period

Continue applying the transportation planning skills and techniques learned

TPU members should continuously apply the skills they learned in the Project through the preparation of public transportation plans for strategic Metro Manila corridors even after the Project ends. Most importantly, it has not been sure that the present TPU members will be assigned continuously after the Project. The DOTC should undertake appropriate measures regarding these concerns.

3-8 Lessons Learned

(1) Specify the achievement time of the Overall Goal in the PDM

The Overall Goal was not discussed well between the Japanese and Philippine side in the Project. The Japanese experts and Philippine counterparts should regularly confirm the

relevance of the Overall Goal to the level of Project Purpose and important assumptions after the Project ends.