

Country Name	Integrated Community Development Project
Independent State of Papua New Guinea	

I. Project Outline

Background	Following from JICA's preceding technical cooperation project "The Integrated Community Development Project for the Settlement Areas in National Capital District", the Department for Community Development (DFCD) introduced the Integrated Community Development (ICD) Policy in January 2007. The second phase of the project promoted the establishment of Community Learning and Development Centers (CLDC) as the basic strategy and driving force for community development in local communities.						
Objectives of the Project	Through (i) establishing a system (Joint Implementation Committee: JICs and others) to supervise and monitor CLDC Focal Point (F/P) to support community development activities, (ii) providing training to DFCD and provincial governments (National Capital District Commission: NCDC and East Sepik Provincial Administration: ESPA) for implementation of sustainable community development activities, (iii) providing training to CLDC F/P and raising awareness of the communities by CLDC F/P at pilot sites, (iv) planning and implementing pilot activities and developing a guideline for ICD Policy and others, the project aimed that capacity of CLDC F/P for supporting CLDC/community activities is enhanced and capacity and implementation structure of DFCD, NCDC, ESPA and district governments for supporting CLDC F/P is strengthened (Project purpose level) and thereby contributing to rolling out of community development projects based on ICD Policy (making CLDC F/P play a key role in community development) to other areas in Papua New Guinea (PNG) (Overall goal level). The project objectives set forth are as follows:						
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Overall Goal: Community development in PNG is promoted based on the Integrated Community Development Policy (ICD Policy) 2. Project Purpose: Human resources, organizational capacity and structures which are required for promoting sustainable development based on the ICD Policy are strengthened. 						
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project site: Port Moresby (National Capital District (NCD)), and East Sepik Province 2. Main activities: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (1) The project supports governments establish a system (JICs and others) to supervise/monitor CLDC F/P to support/encourage CLDC/community activities, (2) The project provides training to DFCD on Project Cycle Management (PCM) and others for implementation of sustainable community development activities, (3) JIC provides training to CLDC F/P and CLDC F/P raises awareness of the communities at pilot sites, (4) The project provides training to Provincial governments (NCDC and ESPA) on PCM and others for implementation of sustainable community development activities, (5) JIC and CLDC F/P plan and implement pilot activities and develop a guideline for ICD Policy based on the experience of pilot activities, and (6) JIC and CLDC F/P disseminate information on ICD Policy 3. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Experts: 9 persons 2. Training in Japan : 5persons, Training in the Philippines: 3 persons 3. Equipment: PC, photocopy machines, AV equipment </td> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> PNG Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Staff allocated: 53 persons 2. Land and facilities: Office facilities, office space, telephones and others. 3. Local cost: Transportation (vehicle), fuel, cost for materials of water supply project, allowance for JIC, wages for project staff </td> </tr> </table> 					Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Experts: 9 persons 2. Training in Japan : 5persons, Training in the Philippines: 3 persons 3. Equipment: PC, photocopy machines, AV equipment 	PNG Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Staff allocated: 53 persons 2. Land and facilities: Office facilities, office space, telephones and others. 3. Local cost: Transportation (vehicle), fuel, cost for materials of water supply project, allowance for JIC, wages for project staff
Japanese Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Experts: 9 persons 2. Training in Japan : 5persons, Training in the Philippines: 3 persons 3. Equipment: PC, photocopy machines, AV equipment 	PNG Side <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Staff allocated: 53 persons 2. Land and facilities: Office facilities, office space, telephones and others. 3. Local cost: Transportation (vehicle), fuel, cost for materials of water supply project, allowance for JIC, wages for project staff 						
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	Project Period	March 2009 – March 2012	Project Cost	299 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Department for Community Development (DFCD), National Capital District Commission (NCDC) and East Sepik Provincial Administration (ESPA)						
Cooperation Agency in Japan	-						

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of PNG at the time of ex-ante and project completion></p> <p>The Integrated Community Development project was consistent with PNG's development policy. The project directly supported the implementation of the ICD Policy (2007-2011), the first national community development policy, which was enacted by parliament in 2007. The principles of promoting empowerment and community participation through CLDC in accordance with ICD policy were consistent with the country's overall goals specified in Medium-Term Development Strategy (MTDS) (2005-2010) for social development. The long-term policy "The Papua New Guinea Vision 2050" also stressed the importance on community and social development.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of PNG at the time of ex-ante and project completion></p> <p>The Integrated Community Development Project during ex-ante and project completion was consistent with the development needs of PNG. The Department for Community Development (DFCD) did not have direct outreach to local communities due to the role defined by the Organic Law on Provincial and Local Level Governments. This resulted in less-satisfactory pilot project outcomes despite the efforts made by the implementers. Therefore, further capacity enhancement for community development was needed. The project was also consistent with the needs at the project completion, as a larger portion of the population resided in rural areas where basic services were needed.</p>

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

The Government of PNG and the Government Japan agreed under the policy dialogue that Japan's ODA will focus on human resource development and capacity development for effective development.

<Evaluation Judgment> In light of the above, the relevance of the project is rated as high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The purpose of the Integrated Community Development Project was partially achieved at the time of project completion. The capacity of key personnel were enhanced (indicator 1), though it did not reach the level as envisaged in the project design. Various efforts to mobilize resources through the CLDC focal points were made including the East Sepik Provincial Government's project application to development partners, unfortunately external resources were not obtained (Indicator 2). DFCD secured some budget for the project, while NCDC and the East Sepik Provincial Government were not able to secure sufficient budget for the pilot projects in Port Moresby and Patiko in Wosera Gaui District in East Sepik Province (Indicator 3).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The ex-post evaluation confirmed that budget constraints and institutional weakness (weak ownership and insufficient staff allocation) resulted in little support provided to local communities to implement community projects on a continual basis. JIC meetings of NCDC were not conducted after NCDC withdrew from the project due to security issues in the settlement areas. JIC with Headquarters was not held after the project was completed. Ongoing monitoring of the pilot projects by DFCD, NCDC and the East Sepik Provincial Government is not consistent, mainly due to budget constraints. No additional community development activities were supported in the NCD and the East Sepik Province since the project was completed in 2012.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

DFCD rolled out the ICD policy to 16 provinces with very little financial support from the PNG Government to establish CLDCs. However, CLDC focal points were established in all 16 provinces as the basic structure to drive community development activities. The ex-post evaluation confirmed that only 5 out of the 16 provinces actually had community learning development centers. The other provinces have community development officers that act as focal points. The CLDC focal points were expected to be the channel for community development. However, the ex-post evaluation confirmed that the CLDC focal points were not resourced well to perform this function effectively. It only confirms that future roll-out will incur the same results unless significant improvements are done to the current arrangements.

<Other impacts>

Women community members from the Gorobe Settlement who participated in the training facilitated by the project are now engaged in small businesses. Basic management skills obtained through the pilot project equipped women with skills to manage business at micro level which is positive. No land acquisition occurred under this project, and no negative impacts on natural environment were observed.

<Evaluation Result>

The goal and purpose of the Integrated Community Development Project were partially achieved with some form of technical transfer been observed within the Department for Community Development, the National Capital District Commission and the East Sepik Provincial Government. The ex-post evaluation noted that insufficient budget and institutional weakness affected the continuation of project effects. Overall, the ICD policy was rolled out to 16 provinces while the in-efficiencies of the CLDC focal points have not been functional effectively. The effectiveness and impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Human resources, organizational capacity and structures which are required for promoting sustainable development based on ICD Policy are strengthened.	(Indicator 1) All key personnel at National, Provincial and District levels, who are involved in the Project activities, demonstrate their improved understanding and commitment to ICD Policy implementation	<u>Status of achievement: Partially achieved at the project completion</u> (Project Completion) Understanding of the ICD Policy by all key personnel increased. There was some level of technical transfer however technical demonstration was lacking. There was no clear evidence to confirm that improved understanding of ICD policy automatically resulted in improved project outcomes. There was a gap basically. (Ex-post Evaluation) There is very little evidence to assess if officers are able to demonstrate the skills obtained.
	(Indicator 2) Resources channeled through CLDC F/Ps increase in the Project activity areas.	<u>Status of achievement: Not achieved at the project completion</u> (Project Completion) Efforts were made, but not successful in mobilizing new resources. (Ex-post Evaluation) Not successful in mobilizing new resources.
	(Indicator 3) DFCD, NCDC/ESPA and District Administration secure and disburse appropriate budget to community development in line with ICD Policy.	<u>Status of achievement: Partially achieved at the project completion</u> (Project Completion) While DFCD secured the budget for the project period as well as for 2012 to conduct community development project based on ICD Policy. NCDC and ESPA could not disburse the promised budget during the project implementation. At project completion, DFCD and NCDC have some budget but it was not sufficient to fully roll-out the ICD Policy. (Ex-post Evaluation) Not sufficient budget is secured.
(Overall goal) Community development in PNG is promoted based on the Integrated Community Development Policy (ICD Policy)	Level of roll-out and coverage of ICD Policy	<u>Status of achievement: Partially achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) ICD policy was rolled out to 16 provinces. However, CLDC focal points have not been functional effectively.

Source : JICA internal documents, questionnaire survey and interviews with counterparts

3 Efficiency

Both project cost and project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 100% respectively). Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

The sustainability of the Integrated Community Development Project was assessed in terms of the likeliness of the continuation of the project benefits after completion and the factors that affected the ongoing benefits of the project. The assessment of project sustainability looked at four important aspects critical to ensuring sustainability:

1. **Policy Aspects:** It is positive that social development is still a priority of the PNG Government under the Medium Term Development Strategy 2011-2015 and the Development Strategic Plan 2010-2030. This was further strengthened with the enactment of the Integrated Community Development Policy in 2007. Updates from the DFCD confirmed that the Integrated Community Development Policy, 2007 is currently under review. The outcome of this policy review will determine if a superseding policy will be developed.
2. **Institutional Aspects:** The institutional and organizational structure of DFCD, NCDC and the East Sepik Provincial Government are appropriate. The ex-post evaluation confirmed that there are insufficient number of staff to effectively implement and coordinate the program. It is important to understand that institutional sustainability is dependent on the efficient operations of the central government. Staff allocations for the DFCD and NCDC are negotiated with the Department for Personnel Management (DPM) as the key central agency responsible for public service recruitment and the Department of Finance for staff salaries. DFCD and NCDC are not allowed to recruit additional staff unless the approval is granted through the normal budget process at the national level.
3. **Technical Aspects:** Some level of technical transfer has happened within DFCD, NCDC and the East Sepik Provincial Government, however there is very little evidence to confirm practical demonstration of technical skill in the implementation of the pilot projects. The ex-post evaluation noted that the internal training systems within these organizations are generally weak.
4. **Financial Aspects:** DFCD, NCDC and ESPA do not secure sufficient budget to promote ICD policy despite the above-mentioned policy support.

Overall the ex-post evaluation confirmed that no-additional community development activities were implemented due to budget constraints. This only reflects that project sustainability is low.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project purpose of the project was partially achieved upon completion with some level of technical transfer been observed within the DFCD, NCDC and the East Sepik Provincial Government. Though the project produced some good results, ongoing implementation of the community development activities was affected by in-sufficient budget and institutional weakness. The overall goal was partially achieved with the roll-out of the ICD policy to 16 provinces, despite the inefficiencies of the CLDC focal point in the provinces. It is uncertain to confirm at this stage if the Department will be able to secure funding for additional community development projects in the pilot provinces. Project sustainability is further affected by budget constraints and weak institutional systems within Government. The overall rating for the project is partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Lessons learned for JICA

Although the integrated community development approach was rolled out to 16 provinces, this roll-out exercise was conducted with very little financial support to establish community learning development centres in the provinces. Future interventions for community development must consider lessons from the pilot projects implemented in Port Moresby, National Capital District and the Wosera Gaui District in East Sepik Province. Ownership by counterpart agencies is crucial for the successful implementation of a community development project in PNG. Therefore, the sufficient level of local ownership should be ensured such as securing budget before any commitment from the Government of Japan is made.



Gorobe Womens Training Centre currently not in use. However Women who attended training are now conducting and managing small micro business activities



Sign Board for the Womens Training Centre at the Gorobe Settlement in Port Moresby