

## Summary of Terminal Evaluation

1. Project Overview	
Country: People's Republic of China	Project Title: Environment Construction at Co-existent Areas of Human Beings and Crested Ibis
Issue/Sector: Forestry and Nature Conservation	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation
Division in Charge: Forestry and Nature Conservation Group, Global Environment Department	Total Cost: 490 million JPY
Cooperation Period (R/D): January 29, 2010 to September 24, 2015  (F/U) :	Partner Country's Implementation Organization: International Cooperation Department of China's State Forestry Administration, National Forestry Administration Wildlife Conservation and Nature Reserve Management Division
	Supporting Organization in Japan:
	Related Cooperation:
<p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>The People's Republic of China (hereinafter referred to as "China") has achieved rapid economic development since its reform and opening-up in the late 1970s, but simultaneously faced the challenge of mitigating loads on the natural environment as well. In recent years, conservation of the natural environment and sustainable development is becoming a challenge that draws attention from the entire Chinese society. The Asian crested ibis among others is an endangered species that are also designated in the Red List of the International Union of Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (IUCN). The cooperative relationship between Japan and China for protecting the crested ibis has been continued for nearly 30 years from 1985. The wild population of the crested ibis in China has increased from 7 birds when rediscovered in 1981 to more than 1,000 birds at present (as of the end of 2014). The crested ibis in Japan has also resurrected from individuals granted from China, where the wild population of the crested ibis exceeded 100 birds. The cooperation between Japan and China to protect the crested ibis has become a symbol of protecting endangered species, enhancing biodiversity at a global level, and facilitating the friendship and exchange between both countries. In addition, the Ministry of Environment in Japan and the State Forestry Administration in China formulated the "Japan-China Joint Crested Ibis Conservation Plan" in 2003, in which it was already confirmed that the two countries would advance programs to protect the crested ibis in their authorities and promote the mutual cooperation.</p> <p>China had a policy of expanding crested ibis's habitats in provinces other than Shaanxi Province where the 7 birds rediscovered in 1981, in view of risks like as the bird flu prevalence. Yang Prefecture in Shaanxi Province was designated as a protected area for the crested ibis, where systems of protection activities have been put into place relatively well. On the other hand, staff of the Dongzhai National Nature Reserve in Henan Province are less experienced in protection activities, where the breeding and propagation of crested ibis was just started in</p>	

2007 and there was an urgent needs for strengthening its structure as they had not experienced releasing the crested ibis to wild at the time of the project commencement. In addition, ecological surveys at each site have not yet been carried out sufficiently, and thus measures to secure the compatibility between the protection of crested ibis and the development of rural areas were also less satisfactory. Therefore, the “Environment Construction at Co-existent Areas of Human Beings and Crested Ibis” was started on 25 September 2010 for the planned period of five (5) years in order to cope with those matters.

## 1-2 Project Overview

### (1) Cooperation Period

September 25, 2010 to September 9, 2015 (60 Month)

### (2) Target Area

XhaanxiYang prefecture /Ningshan Prefecture • Henan province Luoshan Prefecture

### (3) Target Groups

Local residents in Yang/Ningshan Prefectures in Shaanxi Province and Luoshan Prefecture in Henan Province, persons concerned such as government officers involved in nature conservation, including crested ibis protection

### Overall Goal:

Contribute to the promotion of the national environmental protection plan in China and the implementation of the SATOYAMA Initiative through the development and dissemination of a symbiotic model for people and crested ibis in the target area and other related areas.

### Project Purpose:

The environment for the coexistence of people and crested ibis is provided in the target area.

### Output:

1. Environmental information (natural environment and social environment, including crested ibis) is in place.
2. A system is developed to perform the release of crested ibis into the wild.
3. A model is developed for community-participation-type projects.
4. Stakeholders' awareness of nature conservation is improved, including the protection of crested ibis.

## 1-3 Input (as of Terminal Evaluation)

Input provided by the Japanese side : 490 million JPY

- The inputs of 6 Experts ( long- term experts 4 persons, short-term experts 2 persons (Chief Advisor, Preservation and Diffusion of Birds, Monitoring of Birds, Ecological/Environmental Education, Community Development, operational coordination and etc.)
- Provision of equipment in the amount of 8.23 million RMB (160 million JPY)
- Local activity cost in the amount of 11.64 RMB (230 million JPY)

- Acceptance of Training Participants : 26 persons etc.

Input provided by the Chinese side:

- Total 34 Counterpart (C/P) 34 staff
- Office space in 1.Beijing, Local cost and etc.

## 2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	• The Japanese side:			
	Name	Duty	Position/Organization	period
	Kei JINNAI	Leader	Director, Forestry and Nature Conservation Division 1, Global Environment Department	4/16~4/25
	Masahiko YOSHII	Nature Conservation	Former Ministry of the Environment, Environmental Information Analyst	4/16~4/25
	Koji MITOMORI	Evaluation Plan	Forestry and Nature Conservation Division 1, Global Environment Department	4/16~4/25
	Shinichiro YOSHIDA	Evaluation Analysis 1	JICA China Office	4/17~4/24
	Li Feixue	Evaluation Analysis 2	JICA China Office	4/17~4/24
	• The Chinese side:			
	Name	Organization	Duty	
	Liu Lijun	International Forestry Cooperation Center State Forestry Administration	Deputy Director General	
	Lu Baozhong	Management office of Shaanxi Hanzhong Crested Ibis National Nature Reserve	Former Deputy Director-General	
	Xiong Linchun	Xinyang Municipal Wildlife Protection Association/ Wildlife Protection Section, Xinyang Municipal forestry Bureau, Henan Province	Secretary General/ Section Chief, Senior Engineer	
Period of Evaluation	April 16 to 25, 2015		Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation	

## 3. Result of Evaluation

### 3-1 Project Performance

#### (1) Level of achievement of the outputs

The four items of the outputs are expected to be all achieved, and thus the project purpose is expected to be generally achieved by the end of the cooperation period. Model projects for protecting crested ibis and local residents' participation generally attain a high level of satisfaction at participating villages. With regard to the

consultations on creating a symbiotic environment by concerned agencies and persons, additionally, results reporting meetings and exchange meetings have been held more than once in each district for implementing a model project.

Performances in each output are as follows:

Output 1: Basic surveys of habitat environments for the crested ibis at the three sites and basic surveys of social environments at target villages for implementing model projects in Yang and Ningshan Prefectures were carried out, and related reports were distributed to the C/P agencies.

With regard to the management and sharing of monitoring information, recording methods for monitoring were introduced through the project guidance at Dongzhai in Luoshan Prefecture, which was also referred to in Yang and Ningshan Prefectures. In addition, information on the status of inhabitation and breeding of crested ibis at each site and others were shared among C/P officers through joint monitoring workshops, project's regular meetings and other similar opportunities. Furthermore, a monitoring data management system operated by C/P officers was developed during the project period, and the mission team received their explanation of its mechanism and how to improve it.

Output 2: Facilities and equipment, such as acclimation cages, were developed and provided by the project. Water use facilities (repaired), loach farming facilities, and monitoring equipment which were provided by the project have been used and maintained properly. Acclimation cages are used for acclimated breeding of crested ibis at the three sites. Repaired waterways and others have been provided by the project, and they are maintained by the C/P agency or villages for contributing to production activities of farmers.

Technicians for monitoring of the crested ibis have improved their competence through training sessions and field guidance, undertaking tasks at their respective sites nowadays. A total of 21 mid-level technicians: 13 in Yang Prefecture, 2 in Ningshan Prefecture, and 6 in Dongzhai participated in the training and other events, continuing to engage in their services. In particular the improvement of a technique for representing individual numbers in the banding enabled the identification of wild individuals at each site, which came to provide a variety of information required for protection measures.

Output 3: Seven model projects were carried out at three sites. An organic pear cultivation project was carried out at the Caoba Village in Yang Prefecture, where a ripple effect is found, including a situation in which farm households cultivated through the training provide technical guidance to other farm households. In addition, projects were carried out for restoring waterways and others in four districts, which restored and repaired 380 mu\* of paddy fields for 300 households.

In Ningshan Prefecture, model projects were carried out at Zhaigou Village, including the cultivation of organic Chinese chestnuts and herbal medicine (*Polyporus* and *Gastrodia tuber*) and parent-child nature experience activities. The number of farm households cultivating *Polyporus* increased from 11 households at the start to 50 household farmers, while the number of farm households is stable for cultivating Chinese chestnuts

and *Gastrodia tuber*. Parent-child nature experience activities in collaboration with non-governmental organizations (NGO) are continued through participants' support, becoming well established at the villages. In addition, waterway repair projects were carried out at Zhaigou and Zhujiazui Villages, in which a total of 90 mu of paddy fields were restored and improved for 90 households. Contract cultivation of pesticide-free rice is implemented for 140 mu of paddy fields by a cooperative at Zhaigou Village.

A model project for cultivating organic tea was carried out by a tea garden of a cooperative at Dongzhai. In addition to the improvement of cultivation technologies and the diversification of marketing channels, trial tea-picking tours was conducted. Training workshops are conducted by local research institutes at the tea garden as a base of organic tea cultivation. The donated equipment has been used continuously by the cooperatives (\* 15 mu = 1 ha).

Output 4: A total of 29 staff for environmental education including primary school teachers performed explanations and commentaries with the use of teaching materials prepared in the project at the three sites. Teaching materials, guidebooks and others that were prepared are used in environmental education and publicity activities at protected areas, schools, villages, and the like.

With regard to public relations, subscribers to a social networking service (SNS) exceeded 2,300, and it was verified that participants in seminars and symposiums were highly satisfied with them. An exchange meeting on outcomes of the model projects at Ningshan and a reporting meeting on the model project for organic tea cultivation at Dongzhai were also introduced at the web site of the prefectural government.

## (2) Level of achievement of the project purpose

All of the four outputs are expected to be achieved, and it can be determined that the project purpose will be largely achieved by the end of the cooperation period.

Model projects have contributed to improvement of the environment for coexistence people and crested ibis, seeing that they were highly rated in general at villages as a result of the third-party evaluation study shows, accompanied with the high level of satisfaction at all of the interviewed villages.

With regard to the consultations on the creation of symbiotic environments by related agencies and stakeholders, result reporting meetings and exchange meetings were held several times in each area of model project implementation, intended to disseminate the results to prefectural governments, private organizations, companies, cooperatives, etc.

## (3) Expected achievement of the overall goals

The achievement of overall goals is subject to the continuous utilization of outcomes produced during the project period, including the elaboration of a manual based on technical documents to be prepared in the project. It is believed that their possible attainment after the end of the project would be prospected to a certain extent, if project outputs are shared widely through a final project meeting.

### 3-2 Verification of the implementation process

#### (1) Selection of project sites and collaboration

The three locations where there was a plan to release crested ibis was selected as the project activity sites. A plan was formulated at each site for implementing project activities. Technical exchanges, information sharing and others among the project sites were expedited through the project.

#### (2) Establishment of the project office

The project offices were established at the National Bird Banding Center (NBBC) of China in Beijing as the secretariat on the Chinese side and in Xi'an City, Shaanxi Province. Although the Xi'an office was located far from the Beijing office within the National Bird Banding Center, close communications were established between the two offices, and thus the project made progress smoothly.

#### (3) Response to the restricted foreign access

Foreign access restrictions are imposed on the two project sites (in Yang and Ningshan Prefectures, Shaanxi Province), where Japanese experts needs to obtain permission in advance for their access. It became more difficult to obtain the permit during the second half of the project period, and the direct technology transfer by Japanese experts was made difficult at these sites despite the appeal to various organizations of the Chinese side including the State Forestry Administration. The method of project operation needed to be changed from the technical guidance by Japanese experts to that by the Chinese C/P, the project staff and local experts. Although the direct guidance by the Japanese experts in the project was partly limited, there was still the effect of transferring methods of organizations management and project management through the participation of various actors that had been fostered in the restoration of socio-ecological production landscapes and seascapes (“satoyama”) in Japan.

#### (4) Effective public relations activities

Proactive approaches were taken to have effects of the environmental education by making project activities better known, including the transmission of information on project activities through a quarterly journal and Weibo (SNS), painting contests on the crested ibis in which local elementary school students participated, and story-telling of picture books. In addition, there were also effects that publicity activities could provide a connection with an implementing organization of nature tours and also that witness information on the crested ibis was provided from local residents.

### 3-3 Evaluation Results

#### (1) Relevance: High

This project is consistent with the objective, policy and method of the Japan-China Joint Crested Ibis Conservation Plan and also coincides with the National 12th Five-year Plan on Environmental Protection, the

Wildlife Protection Law, and the policies and measures of the crested ibis protection in China. In addition, it is the project that assists international commitments of both countries to the Convention on Biological Diversity (Aichi Target, SATOYAMA Initiative), the Ramsar Convention, etc.

(2) Effectiveness: High

It was found that the field survey results showed the stakeholders including local residents came to understand the importance of balancing the improvement of habitats for the crested ibis and livelihood improvements or regional development more deeply through the model projects and awareness building activities. Furthermore, the promotion of organic farming, the restoration of paddy fields, and the strengthening of a monitoring system for wild crested ibis achieved solid results at each site, undertaken by the government, educational institutions, and local residents in cooperation. Since the promotion of agriculture which is friendly to the ecosystems in the area, improvement of habitat of the crested ibis by securing waterways, and improving the people's environmental awareness through environmental education are confirmed by the study team. Thus the prospect of achieving the project purpose was determined to be high.

(3) Efficiency: Relatively High

Local resources, like academic professionals, were utilized effectively in the project under its limited financial resources. Limitations on Japanese experts' activities in some project sites were mostly overtaken through by counterpart and local staff activities. Efficient inputs were verified in constructing the acclimation cage for the crested ibis through the combination of the donation of some materials by the project, the Grant Assistance for Grassroots Projects by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan, and the burden of construction costs by the Government of China. In addition, part of the donated equipment was provided and managed through agricultural cooperatives in accordance with written agreement on their use.

Meanwhile, it is likely that the efficiency of the project would be further improved by monitoring the status of utilizing project equipment, and their effects with attention to its needs and cost-effectiveness.

Japanese experts' actions were limited in some areas due to the travel permission to some project sites.

(4) Impact: High

With regard to ripple effects of livelihood improvement activities, etc., village development projects which are mainly focusing on organic agriculture and eco-tourism at Zhaigou Village in Ningshan Prefecture and at Dongzhai in Roshan Prefecture have been carried out by the cooperatives. It is also noted that the Roshan Prefectural Government sets forth a policy to convert all of tea cultivation in the prefecture into organic cultivation at Dongzhai within the next five years.

Sites of the crested ibis release were increased from two to six locations during period of project implementation, and procedures are being taken to establish provincial nature reserves at the project sites in Ningshan Prefecture. For the technologies of crested ibis release and monitoring, a handbook written by C/P

was prepared, and such technologies are expected to be disseminated through holding training workshops at various places in the future.

In addition, the efforts made by the project have been delivered externally at various opportunities such as the 30<sup>th</sup> anniversary symposium on the crested ibis protection in China, the joint meeting on the protection of migratory birds in Japan, China, Korea and Australia, the meeting of the Conference of the Contracting Parties to the Ramsar Convention on Wetlands, and the World Parks Congress.

#### (5) Sustainability: Moderate

Capacity improvements are verified through technical exchanges and training programs. It is expected that budgets and human resources will be allocated to the C/P organization in the future. In addition, the equipment for monitoring and breeding of the crested ibis is expected to be utilized continuously with maintenance expenses. It is expected that the China side will take necessary budgetary measures in recognition of the importance of bearing its maintenance expenses in the future.

The monitoring methods proposed by the project are introduced at Dongzhai, where it is expected to be utilized in the future.

In some of the model projects such as organic farming promotion and eco-tourism, efforts have made progress for putting them on a commercial basis while involving agricultural cooperatives and NPOs, and agricultural products (organic rice and organic tea) have been commercialized.

In addition, people are aware of the importance of technology exchanges and information sharing as well as regular exchange programs among the sites at each site of project implementation. Local governments are expected to continue their support for the activities carried out by the project such as environmental education and eco-tourism.

### 3-4 Conclusion

The project has been carried out in accordance with its plan, and achieved as expected. While the target project areas are dispersed with many related organizations, facilities required for breeding, acclimatization and monitoring of the crested ibis were developed, and capacities of the C/P organizations were also strengthened. In addition, the presentation of a model of livelihood improvement and regional development with the crested ibis have worked for the improvement and transformation of people's consciousness to realizing the "coexistence between humans and crested ibis."

In addition, the project's efforts have focused on public relations activities both within China and for the Japanese side, which have not only enhanced the presence of the project but also contributed to promoting the publicity for citizens and decision makers regarding the protection of crested ibis and also enhancing technology exchanges and friendship between Japan and China through the protection of the crested ibis.

In the project, moreover, several initiatives from the perspectives that the SATOYAMA Initiative considers significant have been implemented in practicing the utilization and management of natural resources in a



sustainable manner.

### 3-5 Recommendations (specific measures, proposals, advice to the project)

#### (1) Compilation and sharing of project outcomes

For continuing Monitoring techniques, livelihood improvement activities and environmental awareness building activities at the project sites in the future, project outcomes should be properly to be shared among concerned parties; therefore, the compilation of draft proposals, the preparation of sectoral reports, and their sharing at each project site need to be conducted before the end of the project.

#### (2) Effective use of awareness building tools for protecting the crested ibis

It is necessary the project to consider how to make use of Public Relations tools, such as picture books, prepared by the project by the end of the project. It is essential for the prefectural forestry bureaus and the protected areas at the project site to make efforts for continuing the environmental education for expanding its effects by sustaining its relationships with local communities and schools in the future.

#### (3) Maintenance of equipment provided by the project

It is necessary to designate an appropriate officers in charge for equipment management to ensure the sustained maintenance of the equipment provided by the project.

#### (4) About the field of local development

For the continuation of programs/activities co-existence of local stakeholders economic activities and the crested ibis protection, a system for implementing activities should be strengthened at each project site by the end of the project, and the crested ibis protection authority need to take a role for a main actor in the collaboration among various stakeholders including, related government agencies, elementary schools, agricultural cooperatives, and private organizations.

#### (5) Ensuring the self-reliant development of livelihood improvement activities

For the purpose of self-sustaining development of livelihood improvement activities at the target sites, it is expected that project experiences will be compiled and be widely shared.

### 3-6 Lesson Learned (the useful matters from the project for exploration/formation, implementation and operational management of other similar projects)

#### (1) Publicity activities by the project

The project assigned a local staff in charge of materials preparation, as a result of it the project drastically produced a lot of materials of public relations. It is important for the project to regard Public relations activities as one of the top priority matter.

(2) Effective use of local professional resources

Because livelihood improvement activities that this project aimed at covered a wide range depending on the sites, local expert resources corresponding to local conditions were searched for and utilized preferentially. Such utilization was effective in terms of the technical suitability and costs.

(3) Collaboration with ministries/agencies in charge of environmental education

Environmental education activities at elementary schools or the like using a variety of teaching materials and techniques, including picture books, were welcomed by children, bringing substantial educational effects. In order to continue and expand this effort, it is desirable that a system will be secured for facilitating the collaboration between the natural environment conservation sector and the school education sector by including school education-related departments in the members of the Joint Coordination Committee (JCC).

(4) Selection of model projects for livelihood improvements

This project led model projects to success by making a sufficient comprehension and analysis of current situations, including by accurately understanding local residents' livelihoods and needs, existing initiatives for making livelihood improvements and sales channels of products and additionally local governments' potential for policy support at the target sites in order to maximize effects of such model projects for livelihood improvements. While sufficiently considering backgrounds of each site, the improvement of conventional techniques such as farming practices experienced by local residents in addition to the introduction of new means of livelihood improvements would enable the project to produce effects during its limited period.