

Country Name	Project for Strengthening Systems for Improving and Disseminating Child-Centered Teaching Methods
Mongolia	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The Government of Mongolia introduced the New Education Standards in 2005 within the framework of education sector reform, which focused on shifting from a 10-year basic education system to a 12-year education system, lowering the school entry age from 8 to 6, and introducing new subjects such as integrated learning, natural science (integrated science), etc. Moreover, teaching methods were expected to change from the conventional methods which emphasize memorization to the new methods which encourage children's imagination and ideas such as "teaching methods which support children's development" (hereinafter referred to as "Teaching Methods"). However, teachers were unable to grasp and use the new teaching methods since the contents of the Standards were too academic for teachers to put them into practice as well as they had been trained in conventional methods of teaching based on memorization.</p> <p>Against such a background, the Government of Mongolia requested Japan for a technical support to develop the Teaching Methods and the technical cooperation project "Teaching Methods Improvement Project towards Children's Development" was implemented from 2006 to 2009 where the Teacher's Guidebooks and Teacher's Guidebook Development Manual based on the Teaching Methods for 8 subjects (Arithmetic, Math, Primary Science, General Science, Chemistry, Physics, Integrated Studies and IT) were developed and distributed to all schools across the country. This project was implemented as the Phase 2 project in order for teachers to properly understand and practice the Teaching Methods.</p>												
Objectives of the Project	<p>The objective of the project is to strengthen the systems to disseminate the Teaching Methods introduced in the Phase 1 project with placing Songino Khairkhan District in Ulaanbaatar City, Bulgan Aimag^(Note 1) and Zavkhan Aimag as the model districts/aimags, thereby aiming at disseminating the Teaching Methods to all cities/aimags across the country.</p> <p>^(Note 1) Aimag is an administrative unit used in Mongolia</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: The child-centered teaching methods (Teaching Methods) are implemented in the model and other districts/aimags. Project Purpose: Systems to disseminate the Teaching Methods nationwide are strengthened. 												
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Whole of country (Songino Khairkhan District in Ulaanbaatar City, Bulgan Aimag and Zavkhan Aimag as the model districts/aimags) Main activities: 1) Training of District/Aimag Teams^(Note 2) in all districts/aimags (9 districts/21 aimags) by the Professional Team^(Note 3) to disseminate the Teaching Methods; 2) Development of models of Lesson Study in the model districts/aimags; 3) Implementation of Lesson Study based on the Teaching Methods in the model schools (14 schools) in the model district/aimags <p>^(Note 2) The representatives of each district/aimag trained by the Professional Team. They are composed of approximately 10 members of specialists who belong to the educational department of each district/aimag, school administrators and teachers.</p> <p>^(Note 3) Composed of members of the Institute of Education, Teaching Methods Improvement Centers (Mongolian State University of Education and National University of Mongolia), teachers, etc. for each subject, who have been engaged in the Phase 1 project. They conducted the development and revision of training packages, training and monitoring of Lesson Study in the model district/aimags.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Japanese Side</td> <td>Mongolian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Experts: 7 persons</td> <td>1. Staff allocated: 13 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Trainees received: 62 persons</td> <td>2. Office space for experts</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Equipment: Video camera, projector, web camera for skype, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>					Japanese Side	Mongolian Side	1. Experts: 7 persons	1. Staff allocated: 13 persons	2. Trainees received: 62 persons	2. Office space for experts	3. Equipment: Video camera, projector, web camera for skype, etc.	
Japanese Side	Mongolian Side												
1. Experts: 7 persons	1. Staff allocated: 13 persons												
2. Trainees received: 62 persons	2. Office space for experts												
3. Equipment: Video camera, projector, web camera for skype, etc.													
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2009	Project Period	March 2010 – August 2013 (Extension period: March 2013 – August 2013)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 300 million yen (actual) 319 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Education and Science												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	KRI International Corporation, Tokyo Gakugei University												

II. Result of the Evaluation

< Special perspectives considered in the ex-post evaluation >

- The technical cooperation "Project for Child-Centered Education Supports" (2016-2019) which is related to this project has been implemented after the completion of this project and the influence of the said project on the impact and sustainability of this project is considered in the ex-post evaluation.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Mongolia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

The project was consistent with the medium- and long-term national development plan of Mongolia "Comprehensive National Development Strategy" (2007-2021) which placed the improvement of education standard as one of the priority areas. Also, the "Educational Master Plan" (2006-2015) placed an introduction of re-training for teachers as one of the core actions to be achieved in order to strengthen teachers' professional capacity and teaching skills for implementing the New Education Standards and new curriculum.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Mongolia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion >

The project met the development needs of teachers both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion, who had difficulty in understanding and practicing the Teaching Methods under the New Education Standards since the contents of the Standards were too academic for teachers to put them into practice as well as they had been trained in conventional methods of teaching based on memorization.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's "Country Assistance Program" (November 2004) which placed support for institution building and human resource development necessary for promoting a market economy, especially the development of primary education, as one of the four priority areas.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the end of the project. It was confirmed that the quality of lessons utilizing the Teaching Methods for the 8 subjects were practiced in the all 14 model schools in Songino Khaikhan District of Ulaanbaatar City, Bulgan Aimag, and Zavkhan Aimag (Indicator 1) and that 100% of schools in Songino Khaikhan District of Ulaanbaatar City, 70% of schools in Bulgan Aimag, and 100% of schools in Zavkhan Aimag conducted Lesson Study more than twice a year (Indicator 2). In addition, all districts/aimags (9 districts/21 aimags) across the country formulated their respective training plan on the Teaching Methods (Indicator 3). Furthermore, the Ministry of Education and Science issued many directives or instructions on dissemination of the Teaching Methods and supported for institutionalizing the dissemination system (Indicator 4).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The effects have continued after the project completion. The "Curriculum to foster zest for living (commonly known as the Core Curriculum)" was introduced in Mongolia after the project completion and this is coincided with the concept of Teaching Methods in that the Core Curriculum improves the viewpoint of moving from emphasizing memorization to encouraging children's imagination and ideas. All the model schools were selected as the pilot schools to develop the Core Curriculum since they were recognized by the Ministry of Education and Science as practicing good quality of lessons with actively committed to introduce Lesson Study. Also, 100% of schools in Songino Khaikhan District of Ulaanbaatar City, 82% of schools in Bulgan Aimag, and 100% of schools in Zavkhan Aimag have conducted Lesson Study more than twice a year. Furthermore, the training plan on the Teaching Methods has been continuously formulated in all districts/aimags and the Ministry of Education and Science has continuously supported for disseminating the Teaching Methods.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. More than 80% of schools in the whole country have implemented Lesson Study more than twice a year against the indicator "60% of all schools in the whole country implemented Lesson Study at least twice a year." In addition, training on the Teaching Methods was conducted at all districts/aimags across the country.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

While the new subject of integrated learning was newly introduced with an introduction of the New Education Standards in Mongol, it was difficult for teachers to provide lessons on the new subject and there were some cases that teachers conducted prep and brushup of other subjects at the class of integrated learning. However, this subject was selected as one of the target subjects for Lesson Study and the quality of lessons of integrated learning has improved accordingly. Also, the integrated learning was clearly placed in the Core Curriculum to be developed. In addition, just prior to the project completion in August 2013, the "Mongolian Association of Lesson Study" was established as a NGO mainly by the members of Professional Team and the Association has provided the training, dispatched the lecturers on the Teaching Methods, etc. as part of the dissemination activities.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, through the project, the Project Purpose was achieved and systems to disseminate the Teaching Methods nationwide were strengthened. The effects has continued after the project completion and the Overall Goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation with the fact that training on the Teaching Methods was conducted at all districts/aimags across the country as well as more than 80% schools in the whole country have implemented Lesson Study more than twice a year. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Systems to disseminate the Teaching Methods nationwide are strengthened.	1. The quality of lessons utilizing the Teaching Methods for the 8 subjects are practiced in the model schools.	Status of the achievement: achieved (continued) (Project Completion) The Professional Team conducted monitoring of lessons of the 8 subjects in the 14 model schools in view of: 1) appropriateness of teaching materials; 2) appropriateness of composition of lessons; 3) appropriateness of questions; 4) appropriateness of instruction; and 5) reaction of students. They evaluated that the quality of lessons was improved in the 8 subjects. (Ex-post Evaluation) After the project completion, "Core Curriculum" which is the same concept as the Teaching Methods was introduced in Mongolia and all the model schools were selected as the pilot schools to develop the Core Curriculum since they were recognized by the Ministry of Education and Science as practicing good quality of lessons based on the monitoring above and as actively committed to introduce Lesson Study. The pilot schools consist of the representative schools in Ulaanbaatar City and all aimags. The Core Curriculum was introduced to the pilot schools before introducing on a nationwide scale and the Ministry of Education and Science received feedback of the pilot implementation.
	2. Lesson Study is conducted at least twice in at least 70% of schools in	Status of the achievement: achieved (continued) (Project completion) 100% of schools in Songino Khaikhan District of

	the model districts/aimags every year.	Ulaanbaatar City, 70% of schools in Bulgan Aimag, and 100% of schools in Zavkhan Aimag conducted Lesson Study more than twice a year in FY2012/13. While some schools in Bulgan Aimag did not conduct Lesson Study since they were too small to conduct, teachers of these schools participated in Lesson Study conducted in their neighboring schools. (Ex-post Evaluation) 100% of schools in Songino Khaikhan District of Ulaanbaatar City, 82% of schools in Bulgan Aimag, and 100% of schools in Zavkhan Aimag conducted Lesson Study more than twice a year in FY2014/15.																				
	3. All districts/aimags formulate their respective training plan on the Teaching Methods.	Status of the achievement: achieved (continued) (Project completion) All districts/aimags (9 districts/21 aimags) formulated their own training plan on the Teaching Methods. (Ex-post Evaluation) The training plan on the Teaching Methods has been continuously formulated in all districts/aimags.																				
	4. Political, financial and human resources commitments are made by the Ministry of Education and Science.	Status of the achievement: achieved (continued) (Project completion) The Ministry of Education and Science supported the institutionalization of the Teaching Methods with issuing a lot of directives or instructions on the project such as implementation of in-service and pre-service training to improve teachers' professional capacity, implementation of training in non-model aimags, utilization of Lesson Study in the basic training conducted at the Institute of Teacher's Professional Development (ITPD), etc., with disbursement of budget and allocation of personnel involved. (Ex-post Evaluation) The Ministry of Education and Science has continuously supported for disseminating the a Teaching Methods with issuing new relevant directives, such as the Core Curriculum, and revising the directives or instructions above as well as with disbursement of budget and allocation of personnel involved.																				
(Overall Goal) The Teaching Methods are implemented in the model and other districts/aimags.	1. 60% of all schools in the whole country implemented Lesson Study at least twice a year.	(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved The rate of schools which has implemented Lesson Study more than twice a year is as follows. <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>FY2011/12</th> <th>FY2012/13</th> <th>FY2013/14</th> <th>FY2014/15</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Number of schools</td> <td>747</td> <td>752</td> <td>767</td> <td>767</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Number of schools implementing</td> <td>476</td> <td>487</td> <td>634</td> <td>634</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate</td> <td>64%</td> <td>65%</td> <td>83%</td> <td>83%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> As shown above, the Lesson Study has been implemented twice a year in more than 80% of schools in the whole country.		FY2011/12	FY2012/13	FY2013/14	FY2014/15	Number of schools	747	752	767	767	Number of schools implementing	476	487	634	634	Rate	64%	65%	83%	83%
	FY2011/12	FY2012/13	FY2013/14	FY2014/15																		
Number of schools	747	752	767	767																		
Number of schools implementing	476	487	634	634																		
Rate	64%	65%	83%	83%																		
	2. Training on the Teaching Methods is conducted at all district/aimags.	(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved Training on the Teaching Methods was conducted at all 9 districts and 21 aimags across the country.																				

Source : JICA internal documents, Interviews with the Ministry of Education and Science, Department of Education and Culture of the model district/aimag, Institute of Teacher's Professional Development, etc.

3 Efficiency

The project cost as well as project period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 106% and 117% respectively). The Institute of Teacher's Professional Development (ITPD) established in September 2012 was determined to provide the in-service teacher training with a change in the educational administration systems in Mongolia in 2012. It was also determined that the project should support for capacity development on the Teaching Methods towards ITPD and that the project period be extended for 6 months. Therefore the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The Government of Mongolia has promoted a reform in the quality of education since 2012 and in order to carry child-centered method, not subject-centered, the Core Curriculum was introduced on a full-scale operation in 2016. Also, the "State Policy on Education Development" (2014-2024), the subsequent policy of the Educational Master Plan was approved by the national legislature in 2015 and shows "to provide people with environment and opportunity for doing lifelong education as well as to support and develop education forms intended for improvement in technical capacities tailored to characteristics such as age, physical and mental capacity, abilities, and interests." In such, it can be expected that the Government would continue its policy to disseminate the Teaching Methods.

<Institutional Aspect>

Regarding the system of disseminating the Teaching Methods in Mongolia at the time of ex-post evaluation, the Teaching Methods were reflected in the in-service teacher training conducted at ITPD. Also, the Mongolian Association of Lesson Study established in 2013 has provided the training, dispatched the lecturers on the Teaching Methods, etc. as part of the dissemination activities. In addition, the Professional Team organized by the project has been in existence as the members of the Association and approximately 10 members for each subject have continuously conducted trainings, monitoring and instruction on the Teaching Methods upon request of the government. Many applicants who participated in the academic meetings on Lesson Study want to become members of the Association, which recruits its members through its WEB site. The District/Aimag Teams have also been in existence and have continuously conducted the activities on dissemination of the Teaching Methods and implementation of Lesson Study in the respective districts/aimags.

<Technical Aspect>

Table 1: Numbers of Training held and Training Participants

The in-service teacher training on the Teaching Methods has been implemented mainly by ITPD and the Mongolian Association of Lesson Study as described above. The Table 1 shows the numbers of training held and training participants on the Teaching Methods at ITPD upto ex-post evaluation. The Mongolian Association of Lesson Study and the District/Aimags Teams have conducted monitoring and instruction on the actual practice of the Teaching Methods towards schools in their districts/aimags. The Mongolian Association of Lesson Study has made monitoring reports including the outcomes, challenges, solutions based on the results of monitoring and reported to the Ministry of Education and Science, Institute of Education, ITPD, etc. The Association has also promoted capacity development of its members through making a presentation at the World Academic Meeting on Lesson Study and conducting training with educational NPOs in Japan. The Teacher's Guidebooks developed by the project have been still used after the Core Curriculum was introduced. In addition, the Ministry of Education and Science has been developing the ICT training materials for teachers and distributing approximately 30 kinds of DVD materials on the child-centered teaching methods to schools nationwide. These materials have enabled teachers in rural areas where they have no opportunity for participating in the training to learn about an essence of the Teaching Methods and Lesson Study.

on the Teaching Methods at ITPD				
	FY2012/13	FY2013/14	FY2014/15	FY2015/16
Number of training held	14	14	14	14
Number of participants	2,277	6,017	4,205	4,365

Note: Participants are the teachers with the first year, the fifth year and the tenth year of working experience.

<Financial Aspect>

With the policy which gives importance to the quality of education in 2012, the Ministry of Education and Science has increased the capacity improvement budget for teachers since 2013. The budget for the Teaching Methods has substantially increased from approx. 700 million MNT (approx. 30 million yen) in FY2012/13 to approx. 4.5 billion MNT (approx. 0.2 billion yen) in FY2013/14 and approx. 3.5 billion MNT has been disbursed every year afterwards. In addition, approx. 1-3 billion MNT has been disbursed as the budget for the Core Curriculum every year from FY2012/13. Furthermore, the Project for Child-Centered Education Supports (technical cooperation by JICA) which started in 2016 is planned to be implemented till 2019 and it is prospected that the budget for Teaching Methods will be secured for some time to come. The financial sources of Mongolian Association of Lesson Study consist of membership fee from association members, income from the training, etc. The training has been conducted under contract with ITPD.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, no problem has been observed in terms of the policy/institutional/technical/financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is high.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Project Purpose was achieved and systems to disseminate the Teaching Methods nationwide were strengthened. The effects has continued after the project completion and the Overall Goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation with the fact that training on the Teaching Methods was conducted at all districts/aimags across the country as well as more than 80% schools in the whole country have implemented Lesson Study more than twice a year. Regarding the sustainability of the project, no problem has been observed in terms of the policy/institutional/technical/financial aspects and the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is high. On the other hand, the project cost as well as project period exceeded the plan since the project period was extended for 6 months in order to support for capacity development on the Teaching Methods towards ITPD established before the project completion.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Lessons learned for JICA:

- Prior to the project completion, the Mongolian Association of Lesson Study was established as a NGO mainly by the counterpart personnel and the Association has provided the training, dispatched the lecturers on the Teaching Methods, etc. as part of the dissemination activities. It is difficult in Mongolia to keep consistency of policy, budget security and fixing of officers due to the frequent changes in political administrations as well as to keep the technology transferred by the project. However, the establishment of NGO by the counterpart personnel who received technology transfer from the project contributed to sustaining and disseminating the necessary knowledge and skills transferred. It worked well that experts had provided the Association with technical supports such as making programs of academic meetings on Lesson Study held by the Association and providing advices on presentations at the academic meetings during the project implementation. In this way it is effective to provide technical supports for establishing associations such as NGOs by the project in case such supports can be recognized as effective based on the characteristics of technical field, target numbers of technology transfer, capability of the counterpart leader, etc.



Group photo at the academic meeting on Lesson Study held in December 2015



Teacher's Guidebooks developed by the project