

| | |
|--------------------------------|--|
| Country Name | Project for Climate Change Adaptation for Sustainable Agriculture and Rural Development in the Coastal Mekong Delta |
| Socialist Republic of Viet Nam | |

I. Project Outline

| | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|----------------|------------------------|--------------|---|
| Background | According to investigative researches by Vietnamese and overseas research institutions, Viet Nam had been one of countries which were the most vulnerable to effects of climate change due to global warming. Particularly in the Mekong Delta region, it had been predicted that many areas would suffer from damages such as flood, salt water intrusion and a lack of freshwater etc. due to rising sea levels accompanying climate change, which in turn would affect livelihoods of local residents and cause major difficulties in agriculture and rural development. In order to minimize negative effects of climate change, the Vietnamese government formulated “the National Target Program to Respond to Climate Change” (approved in December 2008), which aimed at mainstreaming a climate change adaptation in social and economic, sectoral and regional development strategies/plans. However, a development plan taking into account effects of climate change had not yet been formulated in agriculture and rural development plans of the Mekong Delta region. In addition, while “the Action Plan Framework for Adaptation and Mitigation of Climate Change of the Agriculture and Rural Development Sector Period 2008-2020” was formulated following the above program, it was required to promptly formulate and implement regional development plans taking into account effects of climate change in order to efficiently achieve targets stated in the framework. | | | | |
| Objectives of the Project | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Expected Goals to be achieved by Utilization of Proposed Plan: Priority issues identified in the climate change adaptation Master Plan proposed under this project are solved and effects to reduce negative influences are exerted under climate change in future. Expected Utilization of Proposed Plan by the project: (1) Priority project plans proposed under the project are implemented. (2) Climate change adaptation Master Plan and climate change impact assessment proposed under the project are utilized in considering climate change adaptation solutions and formulating regional development plans in project-targeted areas. Project Purpose: Climate change adaptation solutions for agriculture and rural development in the coastal areas in the Mekong Delta (Master Plan and Priority Project plans) are proposed¹. | | | | |
| Activities of the project | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Seven provinces in the coastal Mekong Delta (Tien Giang, Ben Tre, Tra Vinh, Soc Trang, Bac Lieu, Ca Mau, and Kien Giang Provinces) Activities: (1) Collect information on rural socio-economy, agricultural and rural development policies and projects etc. of Viet Nam and the Mekong Delta region, (2) Formulate climate change adaptation Master Plan, (3) Implement case studies, (4) Formulate priority project plans, (5) Conduct trainings in Japan, and (6) Hold seminars and workshops etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div> <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 9 persons Trainees received: 4 persons Equipment (equipment and materials for surveys) </div> <div> <p>Vietnamese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 14 persons Land and facility: Office space </div> </div> | | | | |
| Ex-Ante Evaluation | 2011 | Project Period | July 2011 - April 2013 | Project Cost | (ex-ante) 215 million yen (actual) 214 million yen |
| Implementing Agency | Southern Institute of Water Resources Planning (SIWRP) | | | | |
| Cooperation Agency in Japan | Sanyu Consultants Inc., NEWJEC Inc., | | | | |

II. Result of the Evaluation

| |
|---|
| 1 Relevance |
| <p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Viet Nam at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion></p> <p>The project has been consistent with Viet Nam’s development policy on ‘conducting assessment of climate change impacts in various sectors and regions’, ‘developing a feasible action plan to effectively respond to climate change’, ‘ensuring the stability of regions and safety of residents’ and ‘stable agricultural production and food security’ etc. as set forth in “the National Target Program to Respond to Climate Change (NTP-RCC) (2008-2020)” and “the Action Plan Framework for Adaptation and Mitigation of Climate Change of the Agriculture and Rural Development Sector Period 2008-2020”, both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. Moreover, among plans formulated for each sector to promote NTP-RCC, “the Master Plan on Water Management in Mekong River Delta for period 2012-2020 and the orientation to 2050 in the conditions of Climate Change and Sea Level Rise (Decision No.1397/ QD-TTg)”, which was formulated as a plan for the water resource management sector, was approved by the prime minister in 2012.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Viet Nam at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion></p> <p>Both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion, the Mekong Delta region has been one of the most important regions for Viet Nam’s socio-economy, as approximately one-fifth of the country’s population (approximately 1.8 million people) has been</p> |

¹ This technical cooperation project was different from general technical cooperation projects in that it aimed to prepare a master plan. Accordingly, the project purpose and activities (especially “formulate climate change adaptation Master Plan” and “formulate priority project plans”) are synonymous.

concentrated, and over half of the country's food production has been in the region etc. Moreover, many regions have suffered from damages such as flood, salt water intrusion and a lack of freshwater etc. due to rising sea levels accompanying climate change.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

'Environmental conservation' is stated as a priority area in the Country Assistance Program for Viet Nam (2009), in which it is also stated that "in view of the fact that discussions on the climate change issues are becoming more and more vigorous within the international community, consideration will be devoted to climate change countermeasures in implementing cooperation in priority areas". Therefore, the project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The project purpose was achieved by the time of project completion: climate change adaptation solutions (Master Plan and priority project plans) for agriculture and rural development in the coastal areas in the Mekong Delta were formulated and the final report was submitted to the government of Viet Nam by the end of the project period.

Moreover, According to the interview with SIWRP, their capacities on planning and implementing climate change adaptation projects for agriculture and rural development, particularly their capacities on climate change analysis and spatial analysis, interview skills, and stakeholder consultation skills etc., were strengthened through on-the-job training (OJT) under this project.

<Status of the Expected Utilization of Proposed Plan by the project at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Master Plan formulated under this project has not yet been officially approved by the government of Viet Nam at the time of ex-post evaluation. This is because this project, as a Technical Assistance Project Related to ODA Loan, gave an emphasis to formulation of Japanese ODA loan projects based on priority project plans it formulates so that implementation of specific projects would be prompted, rather than immediately reflecting the proposed plan in Vietnamese government's policies. Even so, however, in all the project targeted provinces, the Master Plan has been utilized as a reference material and information source in formulating multiple plans and projects among action plans for climate change adaptation, agriculture and rural development plans, irrigation plans, projects for construction and rehabilitation of floodgates and dikes etc. Thus, while the Master Plan has not been officially approved, it has been incorporated to policies and plans of each province.

This project selected 30 programs and projects (hereafter referred to as "the constituent programs and projects of the Master Plan") in total for achieving climate change adaptation strategies based on priority issues of climate change², among which four priority projects ((1) Saline Intrusion Prevention Sluice Gate Construction Project, (2) Tra Vinh Fresh Water Recruitment Project, (3) Cropping System Improvement Program toward Climate Change Adaptation, and (4) Capacity Development Project for Flow Water Management in Mekong Delta) were finally proposed. The table below shows the status at the time of ex-post evaluation of four priority projects finally proposed under this project. On the other hand, at the time of ex-post evaluation, it was confirmed that each province in seven project targeted provinces selected around 13 programs and projects among the above 30 constituent programs and projects of the Master Plan and was making efforts to implement them. While progress status of these programs and projects differs in each province³, regarding programs and projects in which no progress has been made, its major reasons are that budgets have not been allocated, many organizations are involved, and/or a chain of instructions for implementation of programs and projects has been unclear due to lack of smooth information sharing in a department etc.

Status at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation of Four Priority Projects Proposed under this Project

| Priority Project | Tien Giang | Ben Tre | Tra Vinh | Soc Trang | Bac Lieu | Ca Mau | Kien Giang |
|--|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|---|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Saline Intrusion Prevention Sluice Gate Construction Project | No progress | Under implementation | Approved, Waiting for implementation (partly supported by the World Bank) | No progress | Under implementation | No progress | Under implementation |
| Tra Vinh Fresh Water Recruitment Project | Not targeted in this province | Not targeted in this province | Approved, Waiting for implementation | Not selected in this province | Not targeted in this province | Not targeted in this province | Not targeted in this province |
| Cropping System Improvement Program toward Climate Change Adaptation | No progress | Under implementation | Under implementation | Under implementation | No progress | No progress | Under implementation |
| Capacity Development Project for Flow Water Management in Mekong Delta | No progress | Under implementation | Under implementation | Under implementation | Under implementation | Under implementation | Under implementation |

Source: Questionnaire survey and interview with Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) and SIWRP

² Priority issues of climate change identified under the project in order of importance are; (1) saline water intrusion, (2) drought, (3) rising sea levels, (4) flooding, (5) changing rainfall patterns, and (6) increased temperatures etc.

³ Among the constituent programs and projects of the Master Plan in each province, the number of programs and projects in which some progresses have been observed (such as having been approved and being implemented etc.) by the time of ex-post evaluation is ten in Tien Giang Province, 13 in Ben Tre Province, six in Tra Vinh Province, eight in Soc Trang Province, six in Bac Lieu Province, eight in Ca Mau Province, and four in Kien Giang Province. The total number of programs and projects in which some progresses have been observed is 55 (approximately 60%) out of 91 (13 programs and projects x 7 provinces) in total.

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals by Utilization of Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The degree of achievement of the objectives of the priority project plans proposed under this project were not assessed at the time of this ex-post evaluation as they are expected to be achieved in medium- and long terms.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No negative impacts on natural environment were observed and no land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the project purpose was achieved by the time of project completion, and it was confirmed that utilization of the plans proposed under the project and the implementation of the priority project plans have partially progressed. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 100% and 90%, respectively). Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

“NTP-RCC (2008-2020)”, “the Action Plan Framework for Adaptation and Mitigation of Climate Change of the Agriculture and Rural Development Sector Period 2008-2020” and “the Master Plan on Irrigation in the Mekong River Delta from 2012 to 2020 and Orientations to 2050 in Relation to the Condition of Climate Change and Rising Sea Levels” (Decision No.1397/ QD-TTg) stated above are still effective at the time of ex-post evaluation, showing the continuation of the policy foundation to promote implementation of the Master Plan and the priority projects proposed by this project.

<Institutional Aspect>

Before project implementation, it was expected that a responsible organization of priority project plans proposed under the project would be Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD), and the implementing agencies would be Hydraulic Project Investment and Construction Management Board No.10 (HPICM (10)), Permanent Representative Office (PRO), Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD), Central Project Office Unit 10 for Mekong Delta regions (CPO (10)), Sub-national Institute of Agricultural Planning and Projection (Sub-NIAPP), SIWRP, and each province in Mekong Delta regions. However, as explained above, the Master Plan formulated under the project has not yet been officially approved by the government of Viet Nam, and it is not clear where the responsibility for promotion of the Master Plan lies and which organizations are responsible organizations and implementing agencies of priority project plans. Thus, it is difficult to judge whether institutional structures and the number of staff of organizations in charge are sufficient to properly implement priority project plans. On the other hand, according to interviews with seven project targeted provinces, while it is not clear which organizations are responsible for promoting the Master Plan formulated under the project at the provincial level, it has been confirmed that DARD is mainly in charge of promotion of projects stated in the Master Plan. In addition, as stated above, a certain progress has been observed in priority project plans proposed under this project, and thus, it is considered that a certain number of staff have been secured for implementation of priority project plans. In interviews with related organizations to the constituent programs and projects of the Master Plan (including those other than the priority projects) in each province, there were comments from six out of seven provinces that the progress is because of “existence of officers in charge of the project(s)” or “allocation of enough number of officers for implementation of the project(s)”.

<Technical Aspect>

As stated above, it is not clear where the responsibility for promotion of the Master Plan formulated under the project lies and which organizations are responsible organizations and implementing agencies of priority project plans. Thus, it is difficult to judge whether the technical levels of organizations in charge are sufficient to properly implement priority project plans. However, as a certain progress has been observed in priority project plans proposed under the project, it is considered that certain technical levels have been secured for implementation of priority project plans. As mentioned in “Effectiveness/Impact”, reasons for slow progress pointed out by the relevant organizations in each province were mainly budgetary or institutional issues, and there were no comments pointing out technical issues.

<Financial Aspect>

Detailed data on budgets for implementing priority project plans proposed under the project was not available except a few. While sufficient amount of budget for implementing all of the priority project plans are not secured, certain progress has been observed in priority project plans as stated above, and thus, it is considered that a certain amount of budget has been secured for implementation of priority project plans. Each relevant organization commented that the constituent projects and programs of the Master Plan (including the priority project plans) that are in progress are implemented with funding from the central budget, provincial budget and/or donors (individual assistance from JICA, the World Bank, ADB, Oxfam, etc. and through a platform (Support Program to Respond to Climate Change (SP-RCC)) funded by multiple donors) .

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project purpose was achieved by the time of project completion, and it was confirmed that utilization of the plans proposed under the project and the implementation of the priority project plans have partially progressed after the project was completed. As for sustainability, there are some problems in institutional, technical and financial aspects, as the Master Plan formulated under this project has not yet been officially approved by the government of Viet Nam, and it is not clear which organizations are responsible organizations and implementing agencies of priority project plans.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to Implementing Agency:

As pointed out in the Mekong Delta coordination meetings where each donor and Vietnamese government have dialogues, the fact that

responsible organizations for promotion of projects are not clear and coordination is not properly conducted within the Vietnamese government is an issue of the government. In order to continuously implement projects in the implementation stage and promptly implement projects in the planning stage among priority project plans proposed under this project, it is important to clarify responsible organizations for promotion of projects and establish a mechanism in which the Vietnamese government conducts overall coordination responsibly. Moreover, situations of climate change and accompanying priority issues may change over time, and thus, it is important to update the Master Plan and detailed plans of each priority project as necessary.

Lessons learned for JICA:

As stated above, it was found out that which organizations in the central and provincial governments are mainly responsible for the Master Plan formulated under the project is not clear since the government has not officially approved the Master Plan yet. When implementing a similar project in future, it is necessary to request the partner country to formulate a government plan on how to utilize project effects after project completion and to clarify organizations responsible for overall coordination and promotion of each project. This request should be made one year prior to its completion, i.e., when the master plan is being drafted.



Proposed Project Site of Saline Intrusion Prevention Sluice Gate

Construction Project in Ben Tre Province