

Summary of Evaluation Results

| | |
|---|---|
| 1. Outline of the Project | |
| Country: Kingdom of Cambodia | Project Title: The Project for Facilitating the Implementation of REDD+ Strategy and Policy (CAM-REDD) |
| Issue/Sector: Nature Conservation - Revegetation of Degraded Land / Environmental Management - Global Warming | Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project |
| Division in Charge: Natural Environment Team 1, Forestry and Nature Conservation Group, Global Environment Department | Total cost: 320 million yen at the time of the Terminal Evaluation |
| Period of Cooperation | Record of Discussion (R/D): 27 May 2011 |
| | June 2011 - May 2016 (five years) |
| | Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Forestry Administration (FA), Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries Ministry of Environment (MoE) Fisheries Administration (FiA), Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries |
| | Japan's Implementing Organization: Forestry Agency |
| | Related Cooperation: Environmental Programme Grant Aid: "Forest Preservation Programme" (Mar. 2010 -) UN-REDD Programme ¹ : (2011 - Nov. 2015) UNDP/FAO: "Forest Carbon Partnership Facility (FCPF)" (Nov. 2015 -) USAID: "Supporting Forests and Biodiversity project" (SFB, - Jun. 2016) United States Agency for International Development (USAID): "Lowering Emissions in Asia's Forests (LEAF) ", (- 2015), etc. |
| 1-1 Background of the Project | |
| <p>The Government of Cambodia officially launched the Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan 2014-2023 in November 2013. It builds synergies with existing government policies to ensure a strategic cohesion to address a wide range of climate change issues linked to adaptation, Greenhouse Gases (GHG) mitigation, and low-carbon development. Promotion of REDD+² is stated as one of the major strategies to ensure climate resilience of critical ecosystem, biodiversity, protected areas and cultural heritage sites in the Plan.</p> <p>The stakeholders of REDD+ endorsed the Cambodia National REDD+ Roadmap in September 2010. In addition to historical support through international community to the protected forests and to the community forestry, UN-REDD Programme and Forest Carbon Partnership Facility (FCPF) endorsed their engagements to help the Government of Cambodia implement this Roadmap. The government's implementation structure for the Roadmap was also designed at that point shown in Annex IV. Based on the official request by the Government of Cambodia to the Government of Japan in 2010, a framework to support the implementation of the REDD+ Roadmap was agreed for the period of 5 years as CAM-REDD. The initial detail is defined in the "Record of Discussion (R/D)" signed between the Director-General of FA and the Chief Representative of Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) to the Government of Cambodia on May 27, 2011 in accordance with the standard procedure defined by the Government of Japan, and it has been operationalized since 1 June 2011.</p> <p>The Project Design Matrix (PDM) and the Plan of Operations (PO) of the Project are expected to be a base for the future multi-year work plan for Cambodia National REDD+ Taskforce Frameworks such as UN-REDD, CAM-REDD, FCPF, Supporting Forests and Biodiversity project (SFB) on Lowering Emissions in Asia's Forests (LEAF) funded by USAID and etc. have promoted their activities following this work plan.</p> | |
| 1-2 Project Overview | |
| (1) Overall Goal: | |
| Sustainable forest management as a mitigation measure against climate change is promoted based on the | |

¹ The collaborative initiative on REDD or REDD+ was launched in 2008 and builds on the convening role and technical expertise of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP).

² Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation in developing countries; and the role of conservation, sustainable management of forests and enhancement of forest carbon stocks in developing countries

experiences of REDD+ implementation.

(2) Project Purpose:
Capacity of related stakeholders is strengthened for smooth implementation of REDD+ strategy and policy.

(3) Outcomes
Outcome 1: Effective National Management of the REDD+ Readiness process and stakeholder engagement
Outcome 2: Development of the National REDD+ Strategy.
Outcome 3: Improvement of capacity to manage REDD+ at the subnational/national levels.
Outcome 4: Design of a Monitoring System and RLs³ / RELs⁴ framework and capacity for implementation

(4) Inputs
Japanese Side: approximately 320 million JPY (at the time of evaluation)
Experts: 2 long-term and 8 technical assistance experts
Equipment: USD 150,000
Local Cost: Demonstrations, etc., approximately USD 1,790,000
Number of Trainees Received: 12 participants in 6 Trainings in Japan
Cambodian Side:
Main Counterparts (C/P) : 29 people
Facilities: office space, meeting rooms for the experts
Local Cost: utility costs, etc.

2. Evaluation Team

| | | |
|----------------------------|--|---|
| Members of Evaluation Team | <p>< Japanese Side ></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Team Leader: Mr. Kenichi SHISHIDO, Deputy Director General, and Group Director for Forestry and Nature Conservation Environment Department, JICA 2. Cooperation Planning: Ms. Misa KEMMIYA (Shimizu), Acting Director, Natural Environment Team 1, Forestry and Nature Conservation Group, Global Environment Department, JICA 3. Evaluation Analysis: Dr. Makoto TANAKA, Senior Consultant, ICONS Inc. <p>< Cambodian Side ></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Team Leader: Mr. Bun Radar, Deputy Director of Department of Forest Industry and International Cooperation, FA 2. Sub Leader: Mr. So Than, Deputy Chief of Gulf's Forestry Administration Inspectorate, FA 3. Member: Mr. Lim Bunna, Deputy Chief of Planning, Statistics and Consolidation Office, Department of Administration, Planning, Accounting and Finance, FA 4. Member: Mr. Ouk Vibol, Director of Department of Fisheries Conservation, FiA | |
| Evaluation Period | 12 February 2016 - 3 March 2016 | Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation |

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Confirmation of Achievement
(1) Outcomes⁵

1) Outcome 1: already achieved
The National REDD+ Taskforce and its secretariat started its operation in February 2012. Technical Teams (TT) and Consultation Groups (CG) were also established in 2012. These are functional under advice by the Project. Thus the Indicator 1.1 was achieved.

2) Outcome 2: almost achieved
The National REDD+ strategy (NRS) has been drafted since 2014. The outline of the draft NRS was presented during the 21st Conference of the Parties (COP21) the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in December 2015. This includes a relevant section on REDD+ safeguards. Sub-national National Forest Programme (NFP) documents were endorsed by the governors of 12 provinces and sub-national NFP programmes were implemented in 4 provinces. Thus Indicators 2.1, 2.2, 2.4 and 2.5 were achieved. Although draft Law on Wildlife and Biodiversity (LWB) was prepared, it is still waiting for the approval by the Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and not yet submitted to the Council of

³ Reference Level

⁴ Reference Emission Level

⁵ The PDM of the project uses the term "Outcome" as meaning of "Output" to adjust the frameworks for REDD+ of another donors.

Ministers. Thus the Indicator 2.3 is not completely achieved.

3) Outcome 3: already achieved

Emission reduction was approved by the third party organizations in 1 demonstration. A document that summarized the experiences in Sub-national REDD+ activities was formulated and submitted to FCPF. The experiences on pilot sub-national approach was documented and shared to related members. Thus the Indicators 3.1 to 3.3 were achieved.

4) Outcome 4: moderately achieved

The plan to establish National Forest Monitoring System (NFMS) was described in NRS. Method of initial REL(s)/RL(s) calculation and a provisional REL/RL figure was developed and presented at COP21. Initial forest carbon measurement was proposed. Thus the Indicators 4.1 to 4.3 were achieved. However, the capacity of FA on improvement of forest reference emission level (FRELs) by itself needs to be further strengthened.

(2) Project Purpose: likely to be achieved

Necessary policies and measures are included in the draft NRS. Cambodia National REDD+ Taskforce and CG have enhanced consultation on draft NRS. Thus the Indicators 1 and 2 were achieved. However, the capacity of the stakeholders needs to be further strengthened especially in terms of assignment of officers and technical skills.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance: Very High

The National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) states the importance of the forestry sector. Addressing climate change is one of the strategic goals in NFP, where REDD+ is positioned as a major component. Thus the Project is quite relevant to Cambodia's policy. Paris Agreement, which was adopted in UNFCCC COP21 in December 2015, also emphasized the importance of REDD+. Cambodia is one of the highly prioritized countries for JICA to assist a REDD+ process. A measure against climate change through sustainable forest management is one of JICA's main fields in nature conservation.

(2) Effectiveness: Relatively High

Many REDD+ development partners cooperated and supported each other to implement their activities under Cambodia REDD+ Roadmap. Any of these activities contribute to filling gap between the goal of Cambodia's REDD+ and its capacities. However, the capacities need to be further strengthened so that the Cambodian side implements REDD+ by itself nationwide.

(3) Efficiency: Relatively High

Inputs from multiple entities caused multiplied effects: effective utilizations of facilities and equipment provided by Japan's Grant Aid "Forest Preservation Programme", coordination among REDD+ development partners and Japanese enterprises and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). On the other hand, considerable time and resources were spent for the coordination as a fact, especially at the earlier stage of the Project.

(4) Impact: Relatively High

Construction of the REDD+ mechanism was enhanced and the probability to receive economic inceptions became higher. Due to the Project efforts, FA, FiA and MoE have built a cooperative setup. However, it is difficult to predict whether the Overall Goal including "sustainable forest management" will be achieved within several years due to many external factors. For instance, a plan to reform the governmental structure concerning forestry sector was announced by the Prime Minister.

(5) Sustainability: Moderate

The Project is sustainable in terms of policy, institutional, social, cultural and environmental aspects. In financial aspects, budget allocation has been committed by any REDD+ development partners but is not sufficient in total, and FA still cannot cover even some of its basic activity cost such as allowance and fuel. In organizational aspects, it is difficult to predict an impact of the reform of the forestry sector. In technical aspects, the capacities of the Cambodian side need to be further strengthened especially in relation to the Outcome 4. In total, the sustainability of the Project is evaluated as moderate.

3-3 Factors Promoting Sustainability and Impact

(1) Factors Concerning Planning

- Mobilize relevant REDD+ development partners: The Cambodian side mobilized fund from many REDD+ development partners given the timely topic of REDD+. Existence of many REDD+ development partners would be a factor that negatively affects the Project but the Cambodian side has been making efforts in producing synergetic effects from inputs of various REDD+ development partners.

(2) Factors Concerning the Implementation Process

- Strengthened ownership and coordination ability: The ownership of the Cambodian side has been well established throughout the project period and led a steady coordination role. The Cambodian side has gradually understood and recognized REDD+ as its own important agenda while most of the related development partners respect the initiative and efforts on the Cambodian side.
- Clear target set by UNFCCC: FA, together with the other implementing organizations and the Project, accelerated a decision making process among government institutions by utilizing a window of opportunity to present its draft REDD+ strategy or draft NRS at COP21 held in December 2015 and to submit FRELS to UNFCCC. These targets also made the Cambodian side and REDD+ development partners strengthen their collaboration tie toward these same targets.

3-4 Factors Inhibiting Sustainability and Impact

(1) Factors Concerning Planning

- Complexity and uncertainty of REDD+: REDD+ has been a new political and technical agenda in an international society with complexity and uncertainty especially until UNFCCC COP21 in December 2015. For instance, there are no international standards for the technical methodology to collect and analyze data and information, which caused common difficulties for all the parties to prepare REDD+. Even though FA decided to adopt a specific methodology, FA has accepted different methodologies suggested by different REDD+ development partners at an operational level due to diplomatic concern, this caused delay and adjustment costs for the activities for Outcome 4.

(2) Factors Concerning the Implementation Process

- Decision making process: At the beginning of the Project, it took longer time for key Cambodian stakeholders in REDD+ to make policy decisions and share necessary information openly in Cambodian REDD+ concerned. Longer time was spent also in establishing the REDD+ management structure of the Cambodian side, which ended up considerable delay of Project implementation.

3-5 Conclusion

1. Paris Agreement of UNFCCC adopted in December 2015 clearly described the importance of sustainable forest management and promotion of REDD+ as a mitigation measure, while Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) has put high priority on preparation of REDD+ as one of its NFP programs. Under the circumstances, the Project has been implemented in accordance with Cambodia's REDD+ process together with other interventions by many REDD+ development partners.
2. The Project made a significant contribution to Cambodia's REDD+ process by almost achieving the Project Purpose and the four Outcomes at high levels. As for the five evaluation criteria, the Relevance is evaluated as very high, the Effectiveness, the Efficiency and the Impacts are evaluated as relatively high, and the Sustainability is evaluated as moderate.
3. The capacities of FA and the related organization and the structure in RGC to promote the REDD+ process have been strengthened to some extent. The probability of Cambodia to access REDD+ finance was increased as a result of the Project. The payment is expected to contribute to sustainable forest management as long as a benefit from REDD+ is allocated for sustainable forest management.
4. However, capacity building on the Cambodian side still needs to be further strengthened for implementation as well as securing its budget. In order to achieve the Overall Goal, furthermore, more assistance by REDD+ development partners are definitely essential even if the Project Purpose is likely to be achieved.

3-6 Recommendations

To the key REDD+ Stakeholders:

1. To promote access to REDD+ finance for implementing REDD+ from both Public Fund of international organization and Private Fund of market mechanism to fill a gap of government budget. Continuous efforts by the Cambodian side for fund raising are expected not to lose the momentum of international trend and interests for REDD+ and carbon credit.
2. To enhance capacity for implementation at national and sub-national levels, the capacity of relevant

stakeholders for implementation needs to be further developed on the basis of a short and mid-term plan according to the practical implementation plan and prioritized activities.

3. To upgrade the capacity to implement national forest monitoring system, especially FRELs by production of 2016 land use/land cover map to ensure the realization of results-based payment. More staff should be allocated for MRV activities.
4. To secure necessary budget for government officers for REDD+ implementation. REDD+ development partners have been supporting allowance for staff of the Project stakeholders such as travel cost and daily allowance. Compensation by development partners is not expected to be sustainable. Therefore, FA and other implementing institutions should make efforts to increase the government budget for REDD+.
5. To accelerate establishment of new integrated institutional setup in forestry sector during the transition time of institutional reform and to adjust accordingly expected assignment of an advisor from JICA on REDD+ strategy from JFY 2016.

To JICA:

1. To extend the Project period of the Outcome 4, especially FRELs technically and financially to produce 2016 land use/land cover map and FRELs documents to ensure the realization of results-based payment.
2. To allocate an advisor to support implementation of a national REDD+ strategy.

3-7 Lessons Learned

1. The single policy instrument: Cambodia National REDD+ Roadmap set at earlier stage of the project, made multiple stakeholders on the Cambodian side as well as REDD+ development partners to harmonize their activities.
2. The single work plan for all relevant REDD+ development partners contributes to aligning each effort for the same goal among Project stakeholders and REDD+ programs, mainly CAM-REDD, UN-REDD Cambodia Program and FCPF. From the donor's view point, however, it is sometimes difficult to identify a concrete outcome from its own specific input given the complexity of input from multiple partners in the same activities at even PO level. Consideration and effort for the accountability and visibility must be discussed throughout the project implementation.