

Country Name	Project on Land Readjustment Promotion in Thailand
Kingdom of Thailand	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>Living conditions and efficiency of socio-economic activities have been deteriorated in urban areas in Thailand due to the increase of urban population and rampant development. In order to cope with this situation, the Government of Thailand implemented the “Project on the Development Method of Urban Development (DMUD)” from 1999 to 2005 in collaboration with JICA to introduce appropriate methods for urban planning and urban development. The DMUD project enhanced understanding of organizations concerning effectiveness of land readjustment for urban development, and established a base for implementation of land readjustment in Thailand. Although the Land Readjustment Law was enforced in 2004 through the activities of the DMUD project, ministerial regulations, other rules and regulations and specific implementation manuals and guidelines necessary for conducting land readjustment projects were not yet prepared.</p>				
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through establishing and authorizing rules and regulations of land readjustment, improving capacities of staff at provincial offices and local authorities to draft land readjustment master plans to formulate implementation plans and to manage land readjustment projects, and promoting private sector involvement in land readjustment projects, the project implemented in Bangkok and 10 pilot project sites aimed at the establishment of the institutional base and human resource base in both public and private sectors, thereby contributing to the continuous utilization of land readjustment as the most effective urban development method.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Land readjustment method is continuously utilized as the most effective urban development method, and urban environment is improved. Project Purpose: The institutional base and human resource base in both public and private sectors are established in order to promote land readjustment projects in Thailand. 				
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: Bangkok and 10 pilot project sites (Phayao, Nan, Lampang, Phitsanulok, Uthai Thani, Rama IX, Samut Sakhon, Cha-am, Yala, Narathiwat) in Thailand Main Activities: 1) establishment and authorization of rules and regulations on land readjustment, 2) improvement of capacities of staff at provincial offices and local authorities to draft land readjustment master plans, 3) improvement of capacities of staff at provincial offices and local authorities to formulate implementation plans, 4) improvement of capacities of staff at provincial offices and local authorities to manage land readjustment projects, and 5) promotion of private sector involvement in land readjustment projects. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 9 persons Trainees Received: 26 persons Equipment: PCs, projectors, visualizers, etc. Operation cost: traveling cost of experts, interpretation cost, print cost, etc. </td> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> <p>Thai Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Allocated: 18 persons Land and Facilities: Office space and meeting space including utility (electricity, water, telephone, etc.) Operation cost: cost for implementation of pilot projects </td> </tr> </table> 			<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 9 persons Trainees Received: 26 persons Equipment: PCs, projectors, visualizers, etc. Operation cost: traveling cost of experts, interpretation cost, print cost, etc. 	<p>Thai Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Allocated: 18 persons Land and Facilities: Office space and meeting space including utility (electricity, water, telephone, etc.) Operation cost: cost for implementation of pilot projects
<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 9 persons Trainees Received: 26 persons Equipment: PCs, projectors, visualizers, etc. Operation cost: traveling cost of experts, interpretation cost, print cost, etc. 	<p>Thai Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Allocated: 18 persons Land and Facilities: Office space and meeting space including utility (electricity, water, telephone, etc.) Operation cost: cost for implementation of pilot projects 				
Project Period	November 2005 – November 2009	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 350 million yen, (actual) 312 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Department of Public Works and Town & Country Planning (DPT), Ministry of Interior				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, and Transportation				

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Thailand at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with the development policies of Thailand aimed at the development of livable cities and communities for the improvement of living conditions of citizens stated in the “9th National Economic and Social Development Plan 2002-2006” at the time of ex-ante evaluation and the DPT’s “Strategic Plan 2008-2011” at the time of project completion.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Thailand at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion></p> <p>From the experience of the DMUD project, institutions such as DPT, the National Housing Authority (NHA), the Bangkok Metropolitan Administration (BMA) and local authorities highly expected land readjustment as one of the effective methods for urban development at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. However, while land readjustment projects implemented by the Thai Government following the DMUD project were planned and managed by public sectors, implementation of surveys, detail designs and construction were done by private sectors, the capacity and involvement of private sector were below the appropriate level at the time of ex-ante evaluation</p> <p><Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with Japan’s ODA policy for Thailand, which aimed at institutional and human resource development anticipating forthcoming challenges accompanied with social maturation of the country¹.</p>

¹ Source: ODA Data Book 2005.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion. Five land readjustment projects had been approved by provincial land readjustment committees, and out of five, three projects started their construction works in March 2009.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been continued. According to the Director General of DPT, from the time of project completion until the time of ex-post evaluation in 2017, more than 40 land readjustment projects have been implemented in more than 30 provinces for realizing comprehensive area development. In these projects, the manuals and guidelines prepared by the project have been used as reference materials. Private sectors such as consulting firms and construction companies have been hired by the Land Readjustment Bureau (LRB) of DPT and provincial governments, thus they were involved in those projects.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. The number of land readjustment projects all over the country per year was one on average during the period from 2010 to 2013 due to the limited budget of provinces (Table 1). From 2014 onward, the number of new projects has increased to 10 because the policy of DPT was changed by the newly assigned Director General to further promote area development. In 2014, DPT has set the target of having at least one road network project to be planned in every province by using the land readjustment method, and secured the budget accordingly each year.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No negative impacts have been observed on natural and social environment. There were land acquisitions and resettlements in land readjustment projects in three provinces, namely Phetchabun, Phitsanulok and Kanchanaburi, and 15 households were affected in total. DPT has compensated affected households according to the laws and regulations and agreements of the affected households, and there were neither complaints nor troubles about this operation. As for dissemination of the project effects, land readjustment method is still known by limited groups of public and private sectors.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, through the project, the Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion, positive effects by the project have continued, and the Overall Goal was achieved at the time of the ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project was high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																
(Project Purpose) The institutional base and human resource base in both public and private sectors are established in order to promote land readjustment projects in Thailand.	At least three land readjustment projects are approved by provincial land readjustment committees and start the construction work by utilizing the manuals and guidelines developed by the Project.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved. (Project Completion) The Project Purpose was achieved by three land readjustment projects started the construction work by the time of project completion. (Ex-post Evaluation) Since the time of project completion until the time of ex-post evaluation in 2017, more than 40 land readjustment projects have been formulated involving private sectors in more than 30 provinces.																
(Overall Goal) Land readjustment method is continuously utilized as the most effective urban development method, and urban environment is improved.	One land readjustment project starts the physical work* in each year on average. *Physical work includes replotting, land survey, land registration, and construction work.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. The average number of land readjustment projects started in a year all over the country has been increasing from 2014 due to the change of the policy of DPT (Table 1). <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <caption>Table 1. Number of land readjustment projects started in a year</caption> <thead> <tr> <th>2010</th> <th>2011</th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>0</td> <td>1</td> <td>1</td> <td>10</td> <td>8</td> <td>10</td> <td>10</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p style="text-align: right;">Source: DPT</p>	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	1	0	1	1	10	8	10	10
2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017											
1	0	1	1	10	8	10	10											

Source: Terminal Evaluation Sheet (2009), questionnaire survey to and interviews with the Director General and the staff of DPT

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 89% and 100%, respectively). Therefore, efficiency of the project was high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The “12th National Economic and Social Development Plan (2017-2021)” designates key strategic cities with major railway stations, and plans to initiate pilot projects on land reform, urban planning, and energy-efficient urban development. The Plan adopts the land readjustment to be applied to those pilot projects for realizing effective city planning of energy saving cities.

<Institutional Aspect>

The number of staff at LRB is 40 at the time of ex-post evaluation, which is insufficient for covering all the projects throughout the country. LRB is in short of technical staff as urban planners, architects, and draftsmen. Since LRB is not yet authorized as a formal division of DPT, the number of staff cannot be increased as formal divisions. However, according to the interview with the LRB Director, there is a possibility of LRB to be authorized once a land readjustment project is successfully completed. As of 2017, one of the projects in Chanthaburi Province is at its final stage. Along with the completion of the project in Chanthaburi, LRB is expected to be a formal bureau of DPT. The number of staff of provincial offices is also insufficient. While one planner and/or one architect are assigned to each provincial office, they are not only in charge of land readjustment projects but also in other development related works. The prospect of increase in the number of technical staff of provincial offices is unclear.

<Technical Aspect>

According to the interviews with DPT staff, the members of DPT and provincial officials trained by the project have sustained their knowledge and skills through the daily operations of project planning, execution and consultation. Adding to them, some regular training programs are provided by LRB in collaboration with the DPT Academy². There are two regular training courses conducted in a year. One is the course for project management, and the other for replotting. Participants are staff of DPT’s central office and provincial offices nationwide.

<Financial Aspect>

Annual budget and the LR (Land Readjustment) Fund for land readjustment projects have been prepared by DPT, and the amount is in an upward or constant trend (Table 2)³. LR Fund was established by the government in 1993 in order to realize flexible mobilization of fund for land readjustment projects⁴. According to the interviews with the staff of LRB, the amount of the budget is sufficient, while the Fund is becoming less sufficient due to the increasing number of land readjustment projects. Therefore, from 2016, the Cabinet started the annual allocation of 80 million Baht to the Fund.

Table 2. Budget and Fund for LR

unit: million Thai Baht			
	2015	2016	2017
Budget for LR	329	755	627
Annual allocation	(62*)	80	80

*Carryover of the capital fund from 1993

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of institutional aspect of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion. The project effects have been continuing and the Overall Goal was achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. As for its sustainability, while the number of staff of LRB and provincial offices of DPT is insufficient for the volume of work, LRB is expected to be authorized soon as a formal bureau of DPT and it will increase the number of staff as other formal divisions. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- In order to increase the number of staff members and assure the sustainability of the project effects, it is recommended for DPT and LRB to accelerate the authorization process of LRB to be a formal bureau of DPT. For that purpose, it is expected DPT and LRB to ensure the successful completion of the land readjustment project in Chanthaburi Province.
- Since the concept and methods of land readjustment are still known by limited groups of public and private sectors, it is recommended for DPT and LRB to promote its publicity and disseminate technology to provincial offices of DPT, local governments, and private-sector corporations through the implementation of training and seminars and distribution of PR materials.



Participants from all over the world to the “Training on Land Readjustment Method for Urban Development” held in Thailand in July 2017. The training was a program of JICA’s Knowledge Co-Creation Program (KCCP)



A BMA official explaining about a land readjustment project in Thailand. The participants benefited by learning land readjustment method of Thailand would adapt it to their social context.

² DPT Academy is a logistics support unit under DPT to organize seminars and workshops. The contents of seminars and workshops are considered and prepared by the bureaus in charge, and DPT Academy supports organizing and conducting of seminars and workshops.

³ The budget amount of 2017 was below the amount of 2016 due to the change of budget itemization took place in 2017. The budget amount of 2017 should be almost same as the amount of 2016 if the former itemization is applied to the budget of 2017.

⁴ DPT started studying land readjustment methods in 1983 by sending a staff to Japan. In 1992, the cabinet approved DPT to be the agency to implement land readjustment projects under the supervision of LR Committee chaired by the Permanent Secretary of Ministry of Interior. In 1993, the cabinet ordered the Bureau of Budget to extend a financial support of 50 million Baht as the LR Fund to DPT for promoting its land readjustment activities.