Country Name: Republic of the Union of Myanmar

**Project on Strengthening of Rehabilitation**

I. Project Outline

**Background**

In Myanmar, approximately five million people, which was accounted for 10% of the total population in the country, had disabilities due to infectious diseases, landmine accidents, malnutrition, lack of health care services and medical supplies, etc. The Government of Myanmar had provided special education, social services like vocational training and employment for persons with disabilities (PWDs) via efforts of the Ministry of Social Welfare, Relief and Resettlement (MSWRR). Also the Ministry of Health provided medical services for prevention and rehabilitation. However, provided services were not sufficient in terms of quantity and quality, and there were urgent needs for increasing opportunities of basic medical rehabilitation services for PWDs and upgrading techniques of the service providers.

**Objectives of the Project**

Through the improved training system of the National Rehabilitation Hospital (NRH), upgraded NRH’s system to provide quality rehabilitation services and enhanced collaboration among NRH and related institutions, the project aimed at strengthening the system for providing quality rehabilitation services in NRH, thereby contributing to improvement of the quality of rehabilitation services in Myanmar.

**Overall Goal:** Quality of rehabilitation services in Myanmar is improved.

**Project Purpose:** The system for providing quality rehabilitation services in NRH is strengthened.

**Activities of the project**

1. Project site: Yangon.
2. Main activities: development of training materials, training of the trainers on rehabilitation services, development of monitoring and evaluation of rehabilitation services at NRH, conduct of the seminars on referral, etc.
3. Inputs (to carry out above activities)
   - Japanese Side
     1) Experts from Japan: 16 persons
     2) Training in Japan and third country: 33 persons
     3) Equipment: rehabilitation equipment, PC, books for rehabilitation purposes, etc.
     4) Operation cost for holding trainings and seminars, NRH rehabilitation, etc.
   - Myanmar Side
     1) Staff allocated: 19 persons
     2) Land and facilities: Office space, lodges for training participants, etc.
     3) Operation cost for electricity and telephone bills, etc.

**Project Period:** July 2008 to July 2013

**Project Cost**

(ex-ante) 340 million yen, (actual) 300 million yen

**Implementing Agency**

Ministry of Health and Sports (MoHS) (Renamed from the Ministry of Health in May 2016)

**Cooperation Agency in Japan**

National Rehabilitation Center for Persons with Disabilities, Japanese Physical Therapy Association and Japanese Association of Occupational Therapists

II. Result of the Evaluation

[Special perspectives of evaluation considered at the ex-post evaluation]

- Indicator 2 of the Project Purpose (Health and mental condition of discharged patients are improved.) did not have any target value to be achieved or any baseline data to verify improvement. In the ex-post evaluation, it was judged as achieved if the actual status was improved compared with the beginning of the project.

- Indicator 3 of the Project Purpose was set as “Hospitalization period at NRH is shortened” in PDM. However, as pointed out by the Terminal Evaluation, it is not an appropriate indicator for verification of achievement of the Project Purpose, because it can be affected by external factors such as patient’s request to stay longer for receiving quality rehabilitation service at NRH and family conditions to receive the patient. In the ex-post evaluation, this indicator was not applied to verify the achievement and continuation level of the Project Purpose.

[Evaluation constraints]

- Three hospitals were targeted in the Overall Goal in PDM. Due to the time and resource constraints, Yangon General Hospital (YGH) and Mandalay General Hospital (MGH) were visited for the site survey of this ex-post evaluation, as there were more participants in the trainings during the project period than Nay Pyi Taw General Hospital (NGH). The survey was conducted with North Okkalapa General Hospital (NOGH), though it was not targeted in PDM, as recommended by the Terminal Evaluation team.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Myanmar at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>  
Disability was one of the priority issues in the “National Health Plan (2006-2011),” and in the “National Plan of Action for Persons with Disabilities 2010-2012” which was still effective at the project completion, one of the objectives was to increase mobility, accessibility and opportunities for persons with disabilities. Thus, the project was consistent with the development policy of Myanmar.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Myanmar at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

Though the Government of Myanmar had provided social and health services for PWDs, these provided services were not sufficient in terms of quantity and quality. Rehabilitation personnel (physicians, nurses, physiotherapists (PTs), etc.) were not sufficient in terms of quantity and quality, either. In such circumstances, there were great needs for capacity development of NRH who plays a principal role for capacity building of the rehabilitation personnel at both the ex-ante evaluation and project completion, and thus the project was relevant with these needs.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

As the Japan’s ODA policy for Myanmar, new economic cooperation projects had been suspended since 2003 considering the political situation in Myanmar, but there were exceptions of projects with urgency and humanitarian purposes and aiming at capacity
building for democratization and economic structural reform to be implemented after careful consideration of project components. This project was consistent with humanitarian purpose of exceptional project to be implemented by the Japan’ ODA¹.

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the project completion. During the project period, four satisfaction surveys were conducted regarding NRH’s medical and rehabilitation services, rehabilitation equipment and referral services after discharge, and in all of the surveys the average scores were 4.6 to 4.8 exceeding 4 in five-grade evaluation (Indicator 1). Also, the other survey showed that physical and mental conditions of the discharged patients of spinal cord injury (SCI) were improved (Indicator 2). SCI was one of the topics which the project focused on.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have mostly continued. NRH’s major functions strengthened by the project such as the patient report system, case conference, risk management and barrier-free facilities have been sustained. After the project completion, the patients’ satisfaction survey was conducted every year in which the average scores always exceeded 4. The survey to assess physical and mental conditions of the discharged patients has not been conducted through home visits for follow-up by PTs and Medical Social Workers due to the staff and fund shortage and low accessibility to patients’ residence. However, NRH considers they have been improved because they provide quality rehabilitation services and wheelchairs and training opportunities when they are needed.

For diffusion of the project experience, trainers who had been trained in the project annually conducted specialized trainings from 2013 to 2015². In each training, rehabilitation personnel of NRH, MGH, YGH and other hospitals participated (25 participants in 2013, 28 in 2014 and 25 in 2015) in order to learn rehabilitation for SCI, cerebral palsy (CP) and stroke. Since 2016, with support of the International University of Health and Welfare (IUHW) of Japan, NRH has been conducting 5-day trainings for PTs in the country on physiotherapy, speech therapy and occupational therapy. 20 staffs of NRH and other hospitals participated in the training in 2016. Besides these trainings, NRH has shared the project experience with other hospitals through monthly meetings of the Myanmar Society of Rehabilitation Medicine (MSRM) and annual rehabilitation symposium and conference.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

It is judged that the Overall Goal has been mostly achieved. MGH, YGH and NOGH had been expected to conduct surveys on patients’ satisfaction, and after the project completion, and questionnaire sheets had been prepared for patients’ satisfaction by the project. However, any survey has not been conducted at either of these hospitals (Indicator 1), because they had not been informed of the survey and no instruction had been given to them by MoHS. On the other hand, the interviewed personnel of these hospitals answered that rehabilitation patients must have been satisfied with their services because their rehabilitation personnel got better knowledge and skills than before the project, provided team rehabilitation, and so on. Regarding the number of rehabilitation patients, the number of the outpatients has been increasing at all of MGH, NOGH and YGH and the number of the inpatients has been mostly stable (Indicator 2). In particular, the number of SCI patients has almost tripled at YGH, due to their quality acute rehabilitation services and sophisticated medication such as magnetic resonance imaging (MRI), according to YGH. Also, YGH answered that their personnel gained better rehabilitation knowledge and skills from the trainings in Japan during the project period and specialized trainings after the project completion.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Medical Superintendent (MS) who joined NRH after the project completion and learned the project experience from his colleagues has given lectures in the master course on rehabilitation medicine and physiotherapy, and their learning has been shared with the students who will be in the rehabilitation sector in the future. No negative impact has been confirmed in the natural environment and social aspects.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the Project Purpose was achieved and the effects have mostly continued. It is judged the Overall Goal has been mostly achieved. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aim</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Status of achievement: Achieved. (Terminal Evaluation)</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The system for providing rehabilitation services in NRH is strengthened</td>
<td>1. Satisfaction of patients to rehabilitation services at NRH exceeds 4 in five-grade evaluation.</td>
<td>In all of the satisfaction surveys with rehabilitation patients at NRH, the average exceeded 4.</td>
<td>[Dec. 2010 to Apr. 2011:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Average: 4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Note: The survey was conducted on 16 topics of 1) medical and rehabilitation services, 2) equipment and 3) referral services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Ex-post Evaluation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Average: 4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Note: The survey was conducted on the same topics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Health and mental condition of discharged patients are improved.</td>
<td>Status of achievement: Achieved. (Terminal Evaluation)</td>
<td>During the period from Sep. 2011 to Dec. 2012, 50 inpatients were assessed on their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² There was an agreement between the project and NRH to continued specialized trainings for three years.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. Hospitalization period at NRH is shortened.</th>
<th>Status of achievement: Not to be verified for evaluation.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;Reference information&gt; (Terminal Evaluation)</td>
<td>Days of hospitalization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days of hospitalization (Ex-post Evaluation)</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days of hospitalization</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days of hospitalization</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Overall Goal) Quality of rehabilitation services in Myanmar is improved.

1. Satisfaction of patients to rehabilitation services at Mandalay General Hospital (MGH), (Nay Pyi Taw General Hospital) NGH, and Yangon General Hospital (YGH) is increased. Status of achievement: Partially achieved. Satisfaction surveys have not been conducted at MGH, YGH and NOGH, though their personnel consider that patients’ satisfaction have been improved.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. Number of patients treated for the rehabilitation service at MGH, NGH, and YGH is increased.</th>
<th>Status of achievement: Achieved. (Ex-post Evaluation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YGH (Inpatients)</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YGH (Outpatients)</td>
<td>13,770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGH (Outpatients, first visit)</td>
<td>13,329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGH (Outpatients, return visit)</td>
<td>3,157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOGH (Outpatients)</td>
<td>2,109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOGH (Inpatients)</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The numbers of the outpatients at MGH, NOGH are those of walk-in patients for physical medicine treatment and those referred from other hospitals.

Source: Terminal Evaluation Report, interview with MoHS, NRH, YGH, MGH, NOGH.

3 Efficiency

Outputs were produced as planned, and both the project cost and period were within the plan. Therefore, the project efficiency is high.

4 Sustainability

Policy Aspect

In the “National Comprehensive Development Plan” (2011-2030), one of the strategic thrusts to achieve goals is promotion of human development and poverty reduction,” which includes improvement of public services and inclusive access to quality services for the vulnerable. The “Myanmar National Strategy for Development of Persons with Disabilities” (2016-2025) prioritizes rehabilitation and capacity building among others.

Institutional Aspect

At NRH, there are 121 appointed personnel including 4 rehabilitation physicians, 1 health administration & health management specialist, 22 PTs, 19 nurses, 14 nurse aids and 8 Prosthetics and Orthotics (P&Os). Though the appointed posts are fewer than 201 sanctioned posts, NRH has sustained major functions strengthened by the project as explained above, except follow up home visits, the library management and task group for speech therapy. NRH has been upgraded to a 100-bedded hospital since January 2016. For capacity building of the rehabilitation personnel, NRH as well as other related hospitals discusses with MSRM and Myanmar Medical Association (MMA) every month. The information how NRH evaluates trainings for the next training could not be confirmed at the ex-post evaluation. At NRH, there are 5 trainers on SCI, CP and stroke who work as trainers when needed, and the number is sufficient, according to NRH.

With regard the rehabilitation personnel in the whole country, the number of PTs has been increasing. There are currently 360 PTs, as there are more 156 PTs assigned after the project completion. However, there are still few other professions such as P&Os, occupational therapists and rehabilitation nurses. According to MoHS, these numbers are not sufficient to provide quality rehabilitation services in 113 hospitals where such services are provided.

Technical Aspect

According to NRH, YGH and MGH and NOGH, the rehabilitation personnel have sufficient knowledge and skills. They judge so based on their experience gained from the project and increasing the number of patients. Furthermore, they continuously have training opportunities of ongoing projects for capacity building for rehabilitation personnel, with support from international and national organizations including IUHW, Exceed Worldwide, and Nippon Foundation. Booklets and pamphlets developed by the project have been utilized at NRH, YGH, MGH and NOGH. These materials are used also as reference by the master course students in rehabilitation medicine and physiotherapy at NRH internship. For trainings of the rehabilitation personnel, those who were trained in TOT during the
The gravicorder is an equipment for evaluation of the equilibrium function of rehabilitation patients.