

Country Name	Participatory Forest Management Project in Belete-Gera Regional Forest		
Federal Republic of Ethiopia	Priority Area Phase 2		

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Ethiopia, the forest area used to account for approximately 35% of the land area (equivalent to approximately 42 million ha), but due to inappropriate land use, excessive deforestation, population growth, and so forth, it decreased to about 4.5 million ha (2000). Although the Government of Ethiopia made efforts for forest preservation including selection of national forest priority areas, the effects were limited. Upon request from the Government of Ethiopia, JICA implemented “the Forest Resources Management Study in the southwestern part of Ethiopia (1996-1998)” in which the survey on the forest and sub-villages in the Belete-Gera Regional Forest Priority Area (RFPA) was conducted. The survey revealed that the natural forests were diminishing every year due to expansion of residential areas and agricultural land and that there were emergent needs for effective utilization and conservation of forest ecosystems. Based on this survey result, a technical cooperation project for development and participatory forest management was implemented in two districts in Belete-Gera RFPA (Participatory Forest Management Project in Belete-Gera RFPA, 2003-2006). The project was requested for further capacity development of the implementing agencies and sub-villages and expansion of sustainable forest management along with livelihood improvement including wild coffee business to other districts.</p>																				
Objectives of the Project	<p>By organizing forest management associations (WaBuBs), establishing coffee business partnership and conducting field schools for farmers, the project aimed at developing participatory forest management in selected areas, thereby contributing to implementation of the participatory forest management in sustainable manner in Belete-Gera RFPA.</p> <p>* WaBuB PFM approach is composed of the forest management (organization of WaBuB and preparation and implementation of WaBuB Forest Management Plan (FMP)) and livelihood support components (WaBuB Field School (WFS) and Forest Coffee Certification Programme (FCCP)). Each WaBuB signs the Provisional Forest Management Agreement (P-FMA) after demarcating the forest boundaries, prepares FMP based on the joint monitoring with Jimma Branch Office (JBO) of the Oromia Forest and Wildlife Enterprise (OFWE), and signs the Forest Management Agreement (FMA).</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Overall Goal: Participatory forest management is carried out in a sustainable manner by the local people in Belete-Gera Regional Forest Priority Area (RFPA). 2. Project Purpose: WaBuB Participatory Forest Management (WaBuB PFM)* is developed in selected areas in Belete-Gera RFPA. 																				
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project site: 124 sub-villages in Belete-Gera RFPA 2. Main activities: Establishing and supporting WaBuBs for implementing Forest Management Plan, supporting WaBuBs for participating in the coffee certification program, conducting the field school for increasing the agricultural productivity and improving farmers' livelihood, etc. 3. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Japanese Side</td> <td colspan="2">Ethiopian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts from Japan: 11 persons</td> <td colspan="2">1) Staff allocated: 10 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Experts from the third country: 4 persons</td> <td colspan="2">2) Land and facilities: Office space in Jimma and Gera, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Training in Japan and third country: 38 persons</td> <td colspan="2">3) Operation cost for hiring assistant officers, expenses for joint monitoring, coffee certification program, water and electricity, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Equipment: vehicle, PCs, GPS equipment, etc.</td> <td colspan="2"></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5) Operation cost.</td> <td colspan="2"></td> </tr> </table>			Japanese Side	Ethiopian Side		1) Experts from Japan: 11 persons	1) Staff allocated: 10 persons		2) Experts from the third country: 4 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space in Jimma and Gera, etc.		3) Training in Japan and third country: 38 persons	3) Operation cost for hiring assistant officers, expenses for joint monitoring, coffee certification program, water and electricity, etc.		4) Equipment: vehicle, PCs, GPS equipment, etc.			5) Operation cost.		
Japanese Side	Ethiopian Side																				
1) Experts from Japan: 11 persons	1) Staff allocated: 10 persons																				
2) Experts from the third country: 4 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space in Jimma and Gera, etc.																				
3) Training in Japan and third country: 38 persons	3) Operation cost for hiring assistant officers, expenses for joint monitoring, coffee certification program, water and electricity, etc.																				
4) Equipment: vehicle, PCs, GPS equipment, etc.																					
5) Operation cost.																					
Project Period	October 2006 to March 2012 (Extension period: October 2010 to March 2012)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 370 million yen, (actual) 503 million yen																		
Implementing Agency	<p>Oromia Forest and Wildlife Enterprise (OFWE), Jimma Branch Office (JBO)</p> <p>*OFWE was separated from the Rural Land Administration Sector of Agriculture and Rural Development Bureau in 2009, due to the structural change in the Oromia Regional Government.</p>																				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	None.																				

II. Result of the Evaluation

[Special perspectives of evaluation considered at the ex-post evaluation]

- Among the indicators of the Project Purpose and Overall Goal set in PDM, some were not appropriate to verify the achievement level. For example, the Overall Goal was described as “practice of PFM” but its indicators included those which verify the result of practiced PFM. At the ex-post evaluation, the indicators which were set in PDM were verified, and some supplementary information was used for explaining the logic for attaining the project effects.

- Indicator 3 of the Overall Goal was set as “At least 70% of WaBuB members observe that deforestation in their designated area has stopped.” To verify deforestation more objectively, the data on the forest was used.

- There were 125 target sub-villages in the project. Slightly before the project completion, two sub-villages were merged into one sub-village, and therefore the number of the target sub-villages was considered as 124 at the ex-post evaluation.

- During the project period, a total of 7,977 households graduated from WFS, and 1,856 households participated in FCCP. Among them, 327 and 205 households, respectively, were surveyed at the ex-post evaluation.

- Among the target WaBuBs, those where forest coffee is grown have been supported by the successor project implemented by OFWE and JICA (Project for Supporting Sustainable Forest Management through REDD+ and Certified Forest Coffee Production & Promotion, 2014-2020). This ongoing project aims at increasing farmers' income through FCCP linked with appropriate forest management. It was difficult to verify the project effects and sustainability by strictly separating this ongoing intervention in these WaBuBs' activities with regard to coffee production.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Ethiopia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

Necessity of forest management in Ethiopia is described in the proclamation of forest conservation, development and utilization (No.94/1994) of the Federal Government of Ethiopia and in the forest proclamation (No.72/2003) of the Oromia Regional Government. These policies have been effective until the time of the ex-post evaluation, and therefore the project was consistent with development policies of Ethiopia.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Ethiopia at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion >

Most high forest areas in Oromia Region are located within regional forest priority areas. In particular, highland areas above the elevation of 1,500m were assumed to be densely covered with closed high forest. However, owing to the explosive population growth and resulting human encroachment into forests, these forests were drastically diminishing. Oromia Region represents approximately 70% of the forest resources of the country, however, its closed high forests were annually diminishing 50,000 to 100,000 ha due to agricultural expansion, fuel wood collection, illegal settlers, urbanization, forest fires, and poor logging practice. There were great needs for forest management both at the time of the ex-ante evaluation and project completion.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

In the discussion for preparation of "the Country Assistance Program for Ethiopia" which was developed in 2006, top priority areas for assistance were agriculture and water. It was planned that the long- and mid-term assistance would be provided for farmers in poverty¹.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved. By the project completion, all of the 124 target WaBuBs signed P-FMA and FMA (Indicator 1). A total of 321 WFS were organized and 7,977 farmers (4,297 male and 3,680 female) graduated from WFS. More than 80% of the graduates improved agriculture practices such as weeding and home garden, and more than 70% improved agricultural management methods such as regular farm visit, proper spacing and use of manure/compost (Indicator 2). All of WaBuBs where wild coffee was grown participated in FCCP and no case of violating certification criteria was reported (Indicator 3). They got premium rates (15-25%) when selling coffee.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have mostly continued. All of the 124 target WaBuBs have sustained FMA. All of the 124 surveyed households which graduated from WFS have still applied the learnings such as weeding and home garden. They have also continued acquired agricultural management methods such as regular farm visits, proper spacing and use of manure/compost. Activities related to FCCP have been continued by the surveyed households who participate in FCCP (205 households) with support from the ongoing project supported by JICA. However, less than half of them have gained more than 15% of benefits for selling coffee. It is because they cannot sell coffee to JBO if the quality is not good even though they follow FCCP criteria.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

It can be judged that the Overall Goal has been partially achieved from the following reasons. First, PFM has not been practiced at WaBuB level but individual level. Since the project completion, no WaBuB has conducted joint monitoring with OFWE or PFM activities such as planting and replanting based on the action plan of FMP due to the lack of OFWE's coordination. However, individual households recognized PFM and respected the forest boundary, according to the WaBuB members (327 households) interviewed for the ex-post evaluation. They understand that logging in forest area is prohibited and if they find it they report to the local government.

On the other hand, though PFM application has been partial, forest dependent households in the Belete-Gera RFPA increased their incomes more than planned by selling coffee and other agricultural products. Households which participate in FCCP increased their incomes by 72% on average through FCCP and also from selling vegetables and fruits (2,415 Ethiopian Birr (ETB) to 4,165 ETB). Although the data for the Indicator 1 was not available, the average income for all the 92 households surveyed considerably increased. Therefore, it is reasonably assumed that the average income for individual households may have increased by the more than target value of 20%. Households which graduated from WFS increased incomes by 43% on average (Indicator 1). Furthermore, it can be said that WaBuB forest management has improved the members' livelihood, as 85% of the surveyed households who participate in FCCP and 57% of those which do not participate in FCCP answered that their livelihood vulnerability has reduced due to benefits obtained from forest coffee and other agricultural products (Indicator 2). Regarding the forest area, WaBuB members themselves realize that "deforestation has decreased due to forest protection and the forest area has increased," and recognize the effectiveness of PFM. However, as far as the data show, the forest area has not increased, but the deforestation rate has decreased since the project started (Indicator 3).

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

There are several positive impacts as follow. First, WaBuB members became conscious about PFM and came to properly dispose non-degradable solid waste including plastics. Second, the habitat range and the number of the wildlife animals such as monkey and porcupine have increased according to the interviewed WaBuB members. Thirdly, men and female have equally participated in the PFM activities and they consider forest ownership and resource sharing are not influenced by gender. No negative impact has been reported on the natural environment.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the Project Purpose was achieved, and the effects have mostly continued. The achievement level of the Overall

¹ Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2007). "ODA Databook 2006."

Goal has been partial. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of the Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																								
<p>(Project Purpose) WaBuB Participatory Forest Management (WaBuB PFM)* is developed in selected areas in Belete-Gera RFPA.</p>	<p>Indicators: 1. At least 60 % of WaBuBs signed Provisional Forest Management Agreement (P-FMA) to implement PFM through the WaBuB PFM approach.</p>	<p>Status of achievement: <u>Achieved (Continued).</u> (Project Completion) - All of the 124 targeted WaBuBs (100%) were established through P-FMA, and signed FMA to implement PFM. (Ex-post Evaluation) - All of the 124 targeted WaBuBs have sustained FMA.</p>																								
	<p>2. At least 80% of households graduating from WaBuB Field School (WFS) improved land use and agriculture practices as a result of the WFSs.</p>	<p>Status of achievement: <u>Achieved (Continued).</u> (Project Completion) - More than 80% of the graduates adopted and improved land use and agriculture practices. More than 70% adopted and improved agricultural management methods. (Ex-post Evaluation) - All of the 327 surveyed households which graduated from WFS (117 in Belete and 210 in Gera) have applied learnings from WFS.</p>																								
	<p>3. At least 90% of households participating in the Forest Coffee Certificate Programme (FCCP) respect the certification criteria</p>	<p>Status of achievement: <u>Achieved (Continued).</u> (Project Completion) - No violation was reported. (Ex-post Evaluation) - All of the 205 surveyed households who participate in FCCP have respected the certification criteria.</p>																								
	<p>4. At least 80% of households participating in FCCP realize an increased producer price of at least 15% resulting from FCCP.</p>	<p>Status of achievement: <u>Achieved (Partially continued).</u> (Project Completion) - All WaBuBs which participated in FCCP experienced in premium rates (15-25%) when selling their products. (Ex-post Evaluation) - Among the 205 surveyed households which participated in FCCP (70 in Belete and 135 in Gera), 90 households (44%) answered that they have gained more than 15% of benefits of the increased price from FCCP.</p>																								
<p>(Overall goal) Participatory forest management is carried out in a sustainable manner by the local people in Belete-Gera Regional Forest Priority Area (RFPA).</p>	<p>1. At least 50% of forest dependent households in the Belete-Gera RFPA have increased their real incomes by at least 20% through legally secured access to forests, intensified and diversified farm land use, and improved marketing.</p>	<p>Status of achievement: <u>Achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - The average annual income of the 92 surveyed households which participate in FCCP increased from 2,415 ETB before joining WaBuBs to 4,165 ETB, through cultivation of forest coffee and intensive agricultural products (increase by 72%). The proportion of the households which increased their real incomes by more than 20% could not be confirmed. However, since the average income of all the 92 households increased by 72%, it can be presumed that the set target has been achieved. - The average annual income of the 32 surveyed households who did not participate in FCCP has increased from 2,144 ETB to 3,450 ETB, through cultivation of vegetables and fruits (increase by 61%). - The average annual income of the 124 surveyed households which graduated from WFS has increased from 2,345 ETB before joining WaBuBs to 3,355 ETB, through cultivation of fruits and vegetables and apiculture (increase by 43%). *Note: The average incomes are gross incomes before deducting the expenses.</p>																								
	<p>2. At least 50% of project beneficiaries state that their livelihood vulnerability has reduced as a result of the WaBuB Participatory Forest Management (PFM) approach</p>	<p>Status of achievement: <u>Achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - 85% of the 205 surveyed households which participated in FCCP answered that their livelihood vulnerability has reduced as a result of participatory forest management. - 57% of the 122 surveyed households which did not participate in FCCP answered that their livelihood vulnerability has reduced as a result of participatory forest management.</p>																								
	<p>3. At least 70% of WaBuB communities (members) observe that deforestation in their designated area has stopped</p>	<p>Status of achievement: <u>Not achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) <Supplementary information></p> <table border="1" data-bbox="660 1765 1524 1921"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>1995</th> <th>2000</th> <th>2010</th> <th>2015</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Forest area in Belete-Gera (ha)</td> <td>115,537</td> <td>108,823</td> <td>101,860</td> <td>99,508</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Increase rate</td> <td>NA</td> <td>-5.8%</td> <td>-6.4%</td> <td>-2.3%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Forest coffee area (ha)</td> <td>69,593</td> <td>64,688</td> <td>63,245</td> <td>62,041</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Increase rate</td> <td>NA</td> <td>-7.0%</td> <td>-2.2%</td> <td>-1.9%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		1995	2000	2010	2015	Forest area in Belete-Gera (ha)	115,537	108,823	101,860	99,508	Increase rate	NA	-5.8%	-6.4%	-2.3%	Forest coffee area (ha)	69,593	64,688	63,245	62,041	Increase rate	NA	-7.0%	-2.2%
	1995	2000	2010	2015																						
Forest area in Belete-Gera (ha)	115,537	108,823	101,860	99,508																						
Increase rate	NA	-5.8%	-6.4%	-2.3%																						
Forest coffee area (ha)	69,593	64,688	63,245	62,041																						
Increase rate	NA	-7.0%	-2.2%	-1.9%																						
	<p><Supplementary information> - Among 124 WaBuBs, no WaBuBs have conducted joint annual monitoring with OFWE, revised the forest management action plan or practiced PFM activities as WaBuB. On the other hand, individual households have recognized PFM and respected the border of forest and homestead area - 117 WaBuBs (94%) have obeyed rules of land-use mapping. Agricultural land use within the mapping has been decreased.</p>																									

Source: Project Completion Report and other internal documents, interview with WaBuB members.

3 Efficiency

Outputs were produced as planned, but both the project cost and period exceeded the plan in order to ensure PFM application in all the targeted sub-villages (ratio against the plan, 136% and, 138%, respectively). Therefore, the project efficiency is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

Promotion of forest management for mitigating deforestation is prioritized in the government policy. As the government's commitment to building Climate Resilient Green Economy is described in the Second Growth and Transformation Plan (GTP-II) (2014-2019), forest management is a priority issue towards adaptation to climate change and mitigation of greenhouse gases emissions.

<Institutional Aspect>

JBO is responsible for supervising forest management in Belete-Gera. Only one person is assigned as PFM Expert. At the Unit Offices of Belete and Gera, six and five Forest Experts are assigned, respectively, but not specifically dedicated to PFM. Though these staff numbers have been increasing, it is not sufficient to support PFM activities in 44 villages. For example, joint monitoring with WaBuBs has not been conducted, because no sufficient personnel and budget are not assigned as OFWE doesn't consider PFM as top priority because it does not make profits. The District Agriculture and Rural Development Offices (ARDO) take responsibility for agricultural extension. 28 and 76 Development Agents (DA) are working as extension officers in Gera and Shabe Districts, respectively. The number is sufficient, but ARDOs do not collaborate with OFWE as before due to lack of coordination. DAs' intervention related to PFM has been reduced. Since the project completion, operation of WFS has been handed over to ARDOs. However, WFS have not been conducted, due to lack of coordination between ARDOs and OFWE. They used to get together five times per year, but since the project completion they have had only one meeting per year. Meetings of WaBuBs' representatives for information sharing on PFM have also been reduced. They meet each other only when they have serious problems such as illegal logging or land use. During the project period, six coffee cooperatives were organized and during the follow up period one cooperative was newly established. Under the ongoing JICA project, these seven cooperatives have been continuously supported.

<Technical Aspect>

JBO staff including PFM Expert and Coffee Expert themselves consider its technical staff acquired sufficient knowledge on PFM except GIS mapping and FCCP from the project activities, but, as mentioned, there are few opportunities to exercise their knowledge to support WaBuBs. The DAs of ARDO and the Farmer Facilitators selected from the WFS graduates have sufficient knowledge as trainers of WFS, according to WaBuB members, and they still keep facilitator's manuals on seedling fields, seedling management, agroforestry, planting management. However, they have no chance to utilize acquired knowledge and materials as no WFS has been organized. Regarding the technical level of WaBuB members, as most of the WaBuB leaders (121 of the 124 interviewed) answered that they have sufficient skills on PFM and cultivation of coffee and vegetables such as use of organic fertilizers. They still use the guidelines of WaBuB PFM as reference and sometimes share their experience in quality assurance of forest coffee.

<Financial Aspect>

The budget of OFWE comes from the Oromia Regional Government. Though the budgets of OFWE and allocation to JBO have increased since the project completion, less than 1% has been assigned to PFM related activities, and it is not sufficient. PFM is not top priority for OFWE, because it does not make profits. As OFWE is an independent organization, it prioritizes commercial programs of plantation trees. Regarding FCCP, OFWE has borne expenses for the license acquisition.

Table: Executed budgets of OFWE and JBO (thousand ETB)

	2013	2014	2015	2016
OFWE	23,206	17,839	23,162	37,243
JBO	9,099	8,234	10,204	14,267

Source: OFWE.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Project Purpose was achieved but the effects have mostly continued. The Overall Goal has been partially achieved. In other words, in all the targeted sub-villages, WaBuBs were organized to sign FMA and conducted livelihood improvement activities in accordance with PFM. Since the project completion, FMA itself has been sustained in all the WaBuBs, WaBuB members on average have increased incomes from forest resources, but there have been issues such as no joint monitoring with OFWE and no implementation of PFM activities based on the action plan. Regarding the sustainability, OFWE has not conducted PFM-related activities such as joint monitoring with WaBuBs and coordination with ARDO, due to the budget and personnel shortage. No farmer schools have been organized. WaBuBs which produce forest coffee have been supported by the successor project. So as to the efficiency, both the project cost and period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- No WaBuBs have implemented PFM activities based on the forest management action plan, and their joint monitoring with OFWE has not been conducted. It is recommended that OFWE should revise WaBuB approach so that it can be applied with available human and financial resources of OFWE and restart supporting WaBuB PFM activities even in a limited number of the WaBuBs (both forest coffee area and highland area) to understand the current situation of coffee production linked with PFM.
- It is recommended to OFWE that it should also consider WaBuB approach with renewable membership so that many members could sustain their gained knowledge and skills for PFM.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- During the project period, the project made much effort in directly supporting target sub-villages, rather than involving OFWE in the project activities. As a result, WaBuBs were organized and FMA was signed in all of the target sub-villages. It can be said that the project approach which balanced PFM with livelihood improvement was effective, as WaBuB members have increased incomes from forest

resources and sustained forest protection activities. However, due to lack of OFWE's involvement, PFM activities as WaBuB have not continued. For sustainability of the project effects, the project team should have carefully examined the implementing agency's budget and personnel capacity. If the capacity is not considered sufficient, the project should prioritize capacity development of the implementing agency rather than achievement of the objectives at the beneficiaries' level. Furthermore, by trial and error, the project should revise a possible approach which the implementing agency could manage by itself after the project completion. Or, the project should involve other agencies which work for forest management besides the implementing agency so that PFM would be sustained.



WaBuB members who are taking training by ongoing JICA project



WaBuB members who are taking training by ongoing JICA project