

Country Name	Urban Planning Formulation and Management Capacity Development
Socialist Republic of Viet Nam	

I. Project Outline

Background	The major cities in Viet Nam had been rapidly urbanizing and rapid population increase by immigration from rural areas caused overt urban issues. In order to attend to the issues generated by urbanization, JICA had provided technical assistance to Viet Nam through a series of urban planning projects. Vietnamese side had much interest in the process and outputs of these studies, and recognized the necessity of introduction of scientific tools and methodologies for urban planning formulation based on the actual data. Thus, Ministry of Construction (MOC) requested Japan a technical cooperation project to strengthen the capacity of officers of local government in charge of urban planning by developing practical manuals and establishing training courses for them. Vietnam Institute for Architecture, Urban and Rural Planning (VIAP) was nominated as the counterpart of the project.						
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: With the support of the Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center, local government officers of major medium-sized cities acquire knowledge on new urban planning formulation methodology. Project Purpose: The Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center under VIAP is capable to conduct training courses for urban planning method. 						
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Hanoi Activities: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The project develops urban planning formulation manuals, (2) The project formulates urban master plans for a selected city as a case study to be used to give feedback to manual development, (3) The project develops trainers, (4) The project establishes training courses, (5) The project develops new urban plan management tools, and (6) The project establishes the Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center (VUPTC) Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;"> <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Long-term expert: 1 person Short-term expert: 105.2MM Training in Japan: 33 persons, The Third country training: 1 person Equipment: US\$163,917 (office and training equipment) Local cost: 65 million yen </td> <td style="width: 50%;"> <p>Vietnamese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 58 persons Land and facility: Office Local cost: unknown Others: Preparation of the training room </td> </tr> </table> 					<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Long-term expert: 1 person Short-term expert: 105.2MM Training in Japan: 33 persons, The Third country training: 1 person Equipment: US\$163,917 (office and training equipment) Local cost: 65 million yen 	<p>Vietnamese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 58 persons Land and facility: Office Local cost: unknown Others: Preparation of the training room
<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Long-term expert: 1 person Short-term expert: 105.2MM Training in Japan: 33 persons, The Third country training: 1 person Equipment: US\$163,917 (office and training equipment) Local cost: 65 million yen 	<p>Vietnamese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 58 persons Land and facility: Office Local cost: unknown Others: Preparation of the training room 						
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2008	Project Period	March 2009 to May 2012	Project Cost (Actual)	520 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Construction (MOC), Vietnam Institute for Architecture, Urban and Rural Planning (VIAP, Currently, Vietnam Institute of Urban and Rural Planning, VIUP)						
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism, ALMEC CORPORATION						

II. Result of the Evaluation

< Special perspectives considered in the ex-post evaluation >

Although the project planned to establish VUPTC, it was not established, and an existing institution within VIAP (VIUP after the project completion) has been functional to sustain the project effects in lieu of VUPTC. However, this change was not reflected in the PDM. In this context, Effectiveness/Impact is judged by incorporating the degree of achievement of PDM. For sustainability, institutional aspect is judged from a perspective of VIUP's institutional setup considering the fact that VIUP is functional and provides training for local government officials.

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Viet Nam at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with development policy of Viet Nam both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the 8th Socio Economic Development Plan (SEDP) (2006-2010) aimed at developing socio economic development level in all regions. Formulation and implementation of proper urban planning was deemed the foundation to achieve the objective. At the time of project completion, in the draft of the 9th SEDP (2011-2015), urban development, traffic network construction and infrastructure system development necessary for modern society were positioned to be one of the focus areas.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Viet Nam at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion ></p> <p>The project was consistent with the needs for urban development in Viet Nam both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, Viet Nam was developing urban planning system, and the modernization of the urban planning management tools so the capacity development met the demands of Viet Nam. At the time of project completion, trend of rapid urbanization and expansion of medium size local cities in Viet Nam remained the same or rather accelerated.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy as urban development was one of the priority areas of the Country Assistance Program to Viet Nam (2004).</p>

<Appropriateness of project design/approach>

Although the project planned to establish VUPTC, it was not established¹, and an existing institution within VIAP (VIUP after the project completion) has been functional in lieu of VUPTC and has sustained the project effects. However, the change of this direction should have been reflected in PDM.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The project purpose was partially achieved by the time of project completion. The project aimed at establishing and strengthening the capacity of the VUPTC in order to enhance the capacity of local government officials who are in charge of urban planning in various cities. However, MOC did not approve the establishment of VUPTC, partly because MOC was considering sorting out the demarcation of VIAP and other departments in charge of training under MOC. Instead, VIAP reorganized the existing Center for Training & International Cooperation to Urban Planning Training Center within VIAP to carry out the function of VUPTC envisaged in the project. At the time of project completion, VIAP did not develop an execution plan including budgetary plan in a detailed manner (Indicator 1). As for indicator 2, preparation training room was completed with necessary equipment installation. However, preparation of training materials and development of training course was on going, and it was deemed necessary for VIAP to make the contents of plan of training center clearer in early occasion.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

After the project was completed, MOC separated the department of architecture from VIAP and turned VIAP into VIUP. MOC thinks that the establishment of a new training center is not relevant for newly- restructured VIUP, both in terms of human resource, finance, and management, as the Urban Planning Training Center is functional. Moreover, the Urban Planning Training Center in particular and VIUP in general have a mission to provide training on urban planning and development for various kinds of trainees, including stakeholders from central, local governments, research institutes, regional officers, designers, consulting service companies.

After the project was completed, VIUP was able to continuously conduct training. The training courses have been conducted every year with the budget of MOC and VIUP itself as well as the financial contribution from participants. The frequency of those training courses is based on the actual demands from stakeholders in urban planning sector, such as local governments, consulting companies, research institutes. Many of the project's outputs have been utilized in formulating the above mentioned training courses. Training materials have been frequently updated, to formulate the most relevant material, properly reflecting the updated problems and suitable to trainees' demands. Further, VIUP has also applied outputs of the project when conducting researches and consulting services. Noticeable is the master plan for the cities of Bac Giang, Phu Ly and Thai Nguyen. All equipment and facilities supplied under the project have been fully used and maintained for training and workshop purposes as well as for the field trips and surveys by VIUP.

The project formulated the master plan for Hai Duong City for case study. After the project was completed, the master plan has been utilized in enhancement of capabilities for staff, experts in urban planning, and urban management of Hai Duong City itself. The methodology of master planning has been also applied to formulate the short term, medium term and long term plans of Hai Duong City in urban design, especially in urban management.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The overall goal was achieved. Together with training courses implemented during the project period, until May 2016, VIUP has conducted training courses and provided certificates to about 383 batches of trainees, exceeding the original plan of 150 batches of trainees (a trainee can participate in many training courses as long as they are eligible. Each time of participation is counted as one batch.). Approximately 70% of those 383 batches of trainees are from local governments, according to VIUP. Local provinces and cities assign proper staff, experts to participate in training courses.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project, and no negative impacts on natural environment were observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the project purpose was partially achieved at the time of project completion as training capacity was enhanced to some extent, though in the different institutional arrangement from the one originally envisaged. Overall goal was achieved as more than planned trainees were awarded certificate. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of project purpose and overall goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) The Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center under VIAP is capable to conduct training courses for urban planning method.	Indicator1: An implementation plan on training courses with necessary budget allocation	Status of the achievement: partially achieved (partially continued) (Project completion) VIAP reorganized the Center for Training & International Cooperation to Urban Planning Training Center within VIAP. VIAP still needed to develop an execution plan including budgetary plan in more detail. (Ex-post Evaluation) - The frequency of those training courses is based on the actual demands from stakeholders in urban planning - VIUP's Urban Planning Training Center is in charge of training. In this regard, Training Implementation Plan has been established and formulated by State budget.

¹ There are many factors which prevent VUPTC from being established. Especially, under MOC, there is a training school for construction which had operated for quite a long time. Therefore, the direction of MOC was changed to utilize the existing organization. In addition, there seems to have been a communication gap among Japanese side and Vietnamese side. Whereas Vietnamese side changed their direction to utilize the existing Urban Planning Training Center, Japanese side waited VUPTC to be established. That is why the PDM was not revised appropriately

	Indicator 2: Establishment of a training system with proper trainers, training rooms with necessary facilities/equipment, and materials for training courses	<p>Status of the achievement: partially achieved (partially continued) (Project completion) Preparation training room was completed with necessary equipment installation. Preparation of training materials and development of training course was on going. It was necessary for VIAP to make the contents of the plan on the training center clearer in an early stage. (Ex-post evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All equipment and facilities supplied under the project have been fully used and maintained for training and workshop purposes as well as for the field trips and surveys by VIUP. - Trainers who are equipped with new methods by the project apply their knowledge to their work. 																									
(Overall goal) With the support of the Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center, local government officers of major medium-sized cities acquire knowledge on new urban planning formulation methodology.	Indicator 1: More than 150 participants received certificate of training courses of Vietnam Urban Planning Training Center	<p>Status of the achievement: mostly achieved (Ex-post Evaluation) VIUP has conducted training courses and provided certificates to about 383 batches of trainees.</p> <p>Training courses conducted after the project completion</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="746 600 1535 1211"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2012 (Project completion)</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2015</th> <th>2016 (plan);</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Number of training course</td> <td>2</td> <td>4</td> <td>3</td> <td>Already implemented: 1 Plan to be implemented: 2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Number of trainees</td> <td>80</td> <td>150</td> <td>270</td> <td>Already implemented: 113 Plan to be implemented: 200</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Targeted trainees (management at middle level, technical level, senior engineer)</td> <td colspan="4">Trainees are local government officials, experts on urban planning, urban design, urban management from research institutes, universities, consulting companies from all over Viet Nam.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Content</td> <td colspan="4">Introduction of manuals of urban planning, the Project's outputs. The specific contents are introduced such as urban design, landscape design, green area design etc.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		2012 (Project completion)	2013	2015	2016 (plan);	Number of training course	2	4	3	Already implemented: 1 Plan to be implemented: 2	Number of trainees	80	150	270	Already implemented: 113 Plan to be implemented: 200	Targeted trainees (management at middle level, technical level, senior engineer)	Trainees are local government officials, experts on urban planning, urban design, urban management from research institutes, universities, consulting companies from all over Viet Nam.				Content	Introduction of manuals of urban planning, the Project's outputs. The specific contents are introduced such as urban design, landscape design, green area design etc.			
	2012 (Project completion)	2013	2015	2016 (plan);																							
Number of training course	2	4	3	Already implemented: 1 Plan to be implemented: 2																							
Number of trainees	80	150	270	Already implemented: 113 Plan to be implemented: 200																							
Targeted trainees (management at middle level, technical level, senior engineer)	Trainees are local government officials, experts on urban planning, urban design, urban management from research institutes, universities, consulting companies from all over Viet Nam.																										
Content	Introduction of manuals of urban planning, the Project's outputs. The specific contents are introduced such as urban design, landscape design, green area design etc.																										

Source : JICA internal documents, questionnaires and interviews with VIUP

3 Efficiency

Both project period and project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 106% and 130% respectively). There are several reasons for the delay and cost overrun including (i) Assignments of Vietnamese and Japanese experts were delayed as compared with the original schedule, and (ii) Administration procedure within the Vietnamese side and the Japanese side took much time.

Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

Project's outputs have been integrated into socio-economic strategic planning. This is in line with mission and solution under Resolution Socio-Economic Development 2016- 2020, which is "Continuously promoting restructure of socio- economic mechanism; linking renovation with development."

<Institutional Aspect>

The Decision No. 999/QD-BXD dated October 9, 2013 on the re-structure and the rename of VIAP to VIUP has regulated clearly the function, the management and the structure of VIUP. In line with State management on training by MOC, VIUP has the function to organize graduate training in urban planning, to do on-the-job training for local governments, research experts and experts at overall management, experts for consulting services in urban planning, urban design, and urban management. The number of staff of VIUP is 550 and the number of staff who are in charge of coordinating and organizing training courses assigned to Urban Planning Training Center is 7. VIUP has large organization structure, which include 3 main sections, i.e. Research Section, Independence Section, and Dependence Section. The Independence Section and Dependence Section have large number of experts and staff as they earn the income. Urban Planning Training Center (the Center) belongs to Research Section, which merely focus on research and general coordination. For each specific work, the Center will cooperate with related sections to implement the work. With such kind of structure, permanent number of 7 staff for the Center is allocated. Depending on each course's content, relevant lecturers (mainly from VIUP) are invited. VIUP has been equipped with adequate elements both hardware and software to properly deal with the task of training for urban planning for the whole Viet Nam.

<Technical Aspect>

VIUP has a large number of professional experts in a variety of majors. Those experts have got systematic training and acquired in- depth experience. Notice should be made of the educational background of the staff, such as Associate Ph.D: 1 person, Ph.D: 3 persons, Master: 76 persons, and University graduate: 392 persons. VIUP's lecturers are those with comprehensive and in-depth knowledge and practical experience for the whole process of urban planning. VIUP has sufficient capacity to manage the training as evidenced by the number of training courses which exceed the plan.

<Financial Aspect>

MOC provides budget for training for VIUP to organize seminars, workshops, and training courses. Although information on the detailed budget allocation was not obtained, it is confirmed that VIUP has been able to sustain organizing necessary training courses for local government officials, as shown in Effectiveness/Impact, in accordance with their annual plan with budget provided by MOC and with VIUP's self-mobilized financial resources. Upon additional requests from local government, VIUP can organize more training based on finance contribution from the local governments.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, no problems have been observed in terms of the policy, institutional, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is high.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project purpose was partially achieved at the time of project completion. The training function of VIUP was strengthened, though in a fashion differently from the project envisaged, as VUPTC was not established. Overall goal was mostly achieved as the capacity of local government officials on urban planning has been strengthened. As for sustainability, no problems have been observed in terms of the policy, institutional, technical and financial aspects. For efficiency, both project period and project cost exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Lessons learned for JICA:

- Project Target/ goal, output: Output 6 for establishing VUPTC has not been realized. That was caused by many uncontrollable factors as above mentioned. On a positive side, the non-existence of this center did not seriously cause harm to the project's success. In replace of this center, VIUP's existing training center has received capacity development and benefits of the project outputs instead and been working very actively, during and after the project's completion to provide necessary trainings for local government officers to meet the original needs. During the project's implementation, the project team has accommodated the situation flexibly and secured project impact in the case that VUPTC may not be established due to external reasons. Hence, it can be said that it was possible to deliver results by a flexible action without adhering to framework of implementation decided before the project had started. However, during the project implementation, especially at the time of mid-term and terminal evaluation, a deep and overall evaluation of whether or not the remaining activities and whether not yet completed targets can be implemented, should be done. If not, whether countermeasures should be provided and when and how such countermeasures to be taken should be contemplated.



Training room equipment