

Country Name	The Project for the Establishment of New Schools in the West Bank
Palestinian Authority	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The Palestinian Authority regarded the education sector as a priority area in order to develop the human resources for its future independence. In the West Bank, the target area of the project, the annual average rate of increase in basic and secondary education enrolment between 2002/3 -2006/7 was as high as 2.6%. Moreover, the annual average rate of increase in enrolment at secondary level alone during the same period was as high as 8.7%. In order to accommodate the increasing number of students, many schools in the West Bank were forced to adopt a double-shift system at school or even under a single-shift system they have to use buildings for rent not designed for educational purposes and which had often been dilapidated. Many of those rented school buildings did not have classrooms of adequate size, nor have specific rooms to meet the purpose of subjects, such as computer labs or science laboratories. And the time allocated for the lecture under the double-shift system was limited or much shorter than that of single-shift system. Lectures given under the double-shift system had not always been in accordance with the curriculum. These inadequate learning environments had constituted a limiting factor to improve the educational quality.</p>			
Objectives of the Project	<p>To provide a better learning environment for students of schools in the West Bank by constructing primary and secondary school facilities with provision of school furniture and educational equipment, thereby contributing to the improvement in the quality of education in the West Bank.</p>			
Contents of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project Site: Seven sites located in three Governorates of Nablus, Tubas and Jericho of the West Bank 2. Japanese side : Provision of grant necessary for the following items: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Reclaim the land and construct the exterior facilities, (2) Construct classrooms, special classrooms such as science labs, administrative unit including headmaster room, toilets, etc. (3) Procure school furniture and educational equipment. (It was once planned for five schools. Later, construction of another two schools was decided with remaining available funds.) 3. Palestinian side: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Secure the land for construction, (2) Dismantle existing buildings and obstacles 			
Project Period	E/N Date	February 26, 2009	Completion Date	July 18, 2012
	G/A Date	February 26, 2009		
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit / G/A Grant Limit: 900 million yen Actual Grant Amount : 900 million yen			
Executing Agency	The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE), the Palestinian Authority			
Contracted Agencies	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Main Consultant: Mohri Architect & Associates, Inc. (2) Agent: Japan International Cooperation System (3) Local Contractors: Al-Aseel Co., Brothers Engineers Contracting Company, Al-Aseel Co., Rida Ahmad Khamees Eswad Company, Al-Nakheel Company, and Al-Emad Co. 			

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

- Since the targeted schools were widely spread, the evaluator could visit the limited number of schools for detailed data collection and site observation within the given timeframe.

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

[Target Year for Evaluation] Due to that the two schools were additionally constructed with the remaining funds, the project period was extended to the year 2012. Therefore, the target year is defined as 2012 according to the definition of target year stated as “after the project completion” in the ex-ante evaluation sheet.

[Indicators for Outcome] With the remaining funds, two schools were additionally constructed and furniture and equipment were procured as well. This change in baseline resulted in the increase of number of schools subject to assessment for Outcome indicators.

[Supplemental information for Outcome] In order to examine how the school capacity as a whole has changed, “the number of students for each school by year” is used as supplemental information (1). In order to examine the continuation effect by the project, “the number of ordinary classrooms and special classrooms used continuously from the project completion accordingly as originally intended” is used as supplemental information (2).

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Palestinian Authority at the Time of Ex-Ante and Ex-Post Evaluation>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, this project was consistent with development plans such as “Palestine Reform & Development Plan (2008-2010)”, “Five Year Education Plan” (2007-2011) which specifically focused on the equal educational opportunities for all Palestinians by reducing the rented classes, rehabilitating the old schools and reducing the number of schools under double shift system and the improvement in the quality of education (the appropriate number of students per classroom, classes per teacher, square measure of classroom, etc.) At the time of ex-post evaluation, “Education Development Strategic Plan” (2017-2022), which integrates all related policies and development plans for education, emphasizes the improvement of learning environment by access to education for all students.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Palestinian Authority at the Time of Ex-Ante and Ex-Post Evaluation>

This project has been consistent with Palestinian development needs of education in the West Bank at the time of ex-ante evaluation as described in “Background” above. At the time of ex-post evaluation, there are still continuing needs for schools constructed and equipment provided by the project due to the continuous increase of student numbers (About 7% increase in 2016/17 compared with before the project in 2008/9).

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

One of the priority areas of the Japan’s ODA Policy toward Palestinian Authority, (Economic Cooperation Policy Consultation, 2005) was the assistance toward human right. This policy had been further enhanced with the strong commitment for the initiative of the “Corridor for Peace and Prosperity” presented at the Third Ministerial-Level Meeting of the Four-Party Consultative Unit in July 2008.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Effectiveness>

The project objective of providing a better learning environment for students by constructing primary and secondary school facilities with provision of school furniture and educational equipment has been achieved. For quantitative effects, all of five schools which were under double shift or were expected to be under double shift have now been used under single shift as planned (Indicator 1). Also, all of four schools which used buildings for rent before the project have used no rental building after the project completion in 2012 (Indicator 2). Furthermore, the number of students for all seven schools has gradually been increasing year by year after the project. Before the project in 2009, the aggregated number of students of all seven schools was 1,713 and this number increased to 1,958 after the project in 2012 showing 14% increase. And at the time of ex-post evaluation in 2017, the number has increased to 2,066 showing 21% increase. (Supplemental Information 1). It was confirmed that most of ordinary classrooms and special classrooms constructed by the project have been used accordingly as originally intended, with some exception that some classrooms have been divided into two in order to accommodate the increment of students or in order to cope with the special needs for those students with learning difficulties, etc. (Supplemental Information 2). As for qualitative effects, according to the interview with schoolmasters, their schools have secured the adequate classroom sizes and special classrooms such as laboratories, thus the curriculum has been taught according to the plan under the single shift system and it was also observed the active participation of the students to the science classes by using the laboratories and much deeper exchanges with community persons in taking care of the garden in the schools.

<Impact>

As shown by the tables below, it is obvious that there was a positive impact of the improvement of learning environment on the quality of education. Average attendance rates of targeted schools for both boys and girls gradually increased and it reached to 97% and 98% respectively at the time of ex-post evaluation. Average dropout rates of targeted schools for both boys and girls have shown the remarkable progress. They were 10.5% for boys and 3% for girls before the project, but at the time of ex-post evaluation, they dropped down to 2% and 1% respectively. Interviews with teachers have revealed that teachers are more focusing on each individual student because of less students in each classroom. It was also reported that social workers rooms created by the project has contributed to decreasing the dropouts in all schools; since they have served as the space for social worker to communicate with the families of dropped-out students for counseling, and science laboratories created by the project have motivated students for better understanding and practice of science. As to impacts on gender, an interview with the principal of one of girl’s school in a rural area, where females’ enrollment to the higher education is not so much high comparing with that of males, revealed that the relatively large number of graduated students attend universities and colleges and it reached 99% in some years. Some of them have become instructors in some universities. The establishment of the school in the area have promoted females as part of the community decision making in the village. No negative impacts were found on environment.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effect of the project has been observed mostly as planned. Therefore, the effectiveness /impact of the project is high.

Quantitative Effects:

Indicators	Baseline 2009 Baseline Year	Target 2012 0 Year after Completion	Actual 2012 Completion Year	Actual 2017 5 Years after Completion
Indicator 1: Number of schools under the double-shift system	5	0	0	0
Indicator 2: Number of schools which use buildings for rent that are not designed for educational purpose	4	0	0	0

<Source> Outline Design Study Report, JICA document, Interviews and site visits to targeted schools.

Supplemental Information 1: The aggregate number of students for targeted schools (Actual)

Supplemental Information	Baseline 2009 Baseline Year	Target 2012 Completion Year	Actual 2013 1 Year after Completion	Actual 2014 2 Years after Completion	Actual 2015 3 Years after Completion	Actual 2016 4 Years after Completion	Actual 2017 5 Years after Completion
Total aggregate number of boy students for targeted schools	1,109	1,166	1,194	1,368	1,366	1,320	1,381
Total aggregate number of girl students for targeted schools	604	792	800	806	645	673	685
Grand Total	1,713	1,958	1,994	2,174	2,011	1,993	2,066
% increase from the baseline year		14%					21%

<Source> MEHE Data

Expected Impact: Average attendance rates and dropout rates of targeted schools (Actual)

Indicators		Baseline 2009 Baseline Year	Target 2012 Completion Year	Actual 2013 1 Year after Completion	Actual 2014 2 Years after Completion	Actual 2015 3 Years after Completion	Actual 2016 4 Years after Completion	Actual 2017 5 Years after Completion
Average attendance rates ⁽¹⁾ of targeted schools	Boys	88%	93%	95%	95%	96%	97%	97%
	Girls	95%	96%	97%	97%	98%	98%	98%
Average dropout rates ⁽²⁾ of targeted schools	Boys	10.5%	6%	4%	3%	2.5%	2%	2%
	Girls	3%	2%	1.5%	1.5%	1.5%	1%	1%

<Source>School data and MEHE data

<Note>

(1)Average attendance rates: Total number of students in the given age group for a given level of education attending that level at any time during the reference academic year

(2)Average dropout rates: Proportion of students from a cohort enrolled in a given grade at a given school year who are no longer enrolled in the following school year.

3 Efficiency

The outputs of the project were produced more than planned due to that two schools were additionally constructed with the remaining funds, which was determined after the bidding of five schools. And it required longer than planned work period for construction because large scale of land reclamation work was needed to build one of additionally planned schools. As a result, while the project cost was within the plan, the project period largely exceeded the plan (ratio against plan: 100%, 175%) (The increase in the inputs surpassed the increase in the outputs). Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Institutional Aspect>

The Construction Department of MEHE is responsible for construction of school facilities and the Equipment Department is responsible for procurement of school furniture and educational equipment and they work under the instructions and Ministerial Decisions. And maintenance and procurement of essential equipment is conducted periodically by the Building's Department of MEHE and the Region Directorate's engineers. The mechanism of self-managed schools was adapted national-wide and each school maintains the school management policy which stipulates on the budget, maintenance and renovations of building facilities. According to the interviews with teachers, sufficient number of teachers and maintenance staff has been allocated to each targeted-school (Its number varies from 10 to 30 for teachers and 1 to 3 for maintenance staff for each school depending on the school size). However, there is a limited number of engineers for all targeted schools in the Regional Directorate of MEHE. In principle, one engineer is allocated to each directorate who is expected to visit each school for the periodical checkup several times per year. But there are only 14 engineers who should cover the checkup for the total number of 1,750 schools in the 14 directorates all told. The interview with a school principle notified the delay of repair work for Marj Al Ghazal School due to the shortage of those engineers. Especially in the case of Marj Al Ghazal School, due to the insufficient number of engineers, the needs of repair work from the schools was not reported at the right timing to the MEHE, even the periodical visit to the school was conducted properly. Therefore, regional Directorate of MEHE should have sufficient number of engineers to fulfill the periodical site visits to each school and at the same time to cope with other related works, such as to make reports at the appropriate timing to MEHE by allocating budget.

<Technical Aspect>

Sufficient number of teachers and maintenance staff are allocated for each target schools and it enables for them to manage well in daily maintenance and minor repair which do not require the specific technical skills. In this regards, the technical skills of teachers and maintenance staff (Janitors) are sufficient to sustain the benefit of the project. According to the interview with MEHE, there is a general need for capacity building on maintenance in order to keep up with their maintenance skills. Currently, no trainings are available for teachers and maintenance staff at school due to no budget allocation. Such training is available only for some engineers in the Directorate of MEHE.

<Financial Aspect>

No major problems have been identified in the financial aspect in terms of daily maintenance and repair of school facilities as they are covered by the school budget which consists of student's contribution and some revenues earned by themselves, such as by leasing the Cafeteria, etc. They are called "Financially Self-managed Schools", of which a school administration controls its own budget with monitoring by and reporting to the MEHE. According to the Income and Expenditure for seven-targeted schools in 2017, approximately 26% of revenue has been allocated to the building /utilities maintenance. Meanwhile, it was also observed in several schools when relatively large repair or rehabilitation is needed, the school has not received the timely response from Region Directorate of MEHE due to the shortage of engineers. And it is often difficult for them to hire new engineers due to the insufficient budget.

Income and Expenditure of seven targeted schools (September 2016 to August 2017)

Unit of CCY (NIS: New Israeli Shekel)

School Name	Income Total	Expenditure					Total	Net Balance
		IT maintenance	Building/utilities maintenance	Stationary	Others			
Beita Boys School	40,000	9,000	10,000	8,000	13,000	40,000	-	
Wadi Fara Girls School	25,800	5,200	4,700	5,000	10,000	24,900	900	
Beit Dajan Boys School	15,000	3,500	4,000	3,000	4,550	15,050	△50	
Jericho Boys School	45,000	7,000	12,000	9,000	17,000	45,000	-	
Al Fara'a Boys School	17,000	1,000	4,200	2,500	4,750	12,450	4,550	

Marj Al Ghazal Girls' School	12,300	2,000	6,000	1,000	3,000	12,000	300
Marj Al Ghazal Co-ed School	1,620	450	-	200	950	1,600	20
Total amount	156,720	28,150	40,900	28,700	53,250	151,000	5,720
Average %	100%	18%	26%	18%	34%	96%	4%

<Source> Targeted seven schools <Note> No budget data to show the periodical change was available.

<Current Status of Operation and Maintenance>

Building facilities of all targeted-schools have been maintained well. According to Buildings Department, and Regional Directorate of MEHE, the engineers of the Department are supposed to pay a periodical visit to each school six to eight times per year for checkup of building status, but may not be able to fulfill planned visits for all seven schools because of its limited numbers. IT technicians of Regional Directorates of MEHE visits schools on demand for IT checkups and maintenance. All targeted schools have maintenance contract for printing machines and some high-tech equipment. Spare parts for furniture are obtained from Regional Directorate of MEHE and spare parts for educational equipment are obtained either from the MEHE, or purchased with school budget.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional and financial aspects of the executing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effect is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project has achieved its objectives, "to provide a better learning environment for students" as it was observed that the double-shift operation was abolished and all targeted schools have now used buildings designed for educational purpose. Furthermore, the number of students of targeted schools has steadily increased. Positive impacts were observed in improvement in students' attendance and dropout rates. As for sustainability, there is a slight problem in institutional and financial aspects. Regarding efficiency, project period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to Executing Agency:

To: Building Department of MEHE and Regional Directorate of MEHE in Jericho

MEHE should have engineers to conduct periodical site visit to schools and to make report at the appropriate timing to MEHE by allocating budget for hiring the engineers. Due to shortage of the number of engineer in the Directorate of MEHE, requests submitted by schools for repair have not been effectively handled, thus some school facilities in need for repair have left unfixed.

Lessons Learned

In order to ensure the sustainability of the school facility, it is necessary to confirm whether there is the system of both daily checkup and the periodical monitoring for large repair or rehabilitation such as repairing the wall or part of school infrastructure. Although no major problems have been identified in terms of daily maintenance and repair of school facilities, the poor function of periodical monitoring for large repair or rehabilitation by engineers have resulted in the insufficient repair work for school facilities.

Lessons Learned in terms of social workers room

The dropout rate has improved year by year in the targeted schools. It is likely that the improvement of learning environment and security situations in the school as well as political stability might have served as contributing factors. Furthermore, it was also identified in some targeted schools that the establishment of the social workers room might have contributed to reduce the drop-out rates as it has made possible for social workers to pay periodic visit and provide necessary consultation and follow up for the students. MEHE should recognize this and encourage the effective usage of the social worker's room further in the future.



General view of Beita Boys School in Nablus



Pupils at the classroom of Wadi Fara'a Girls School in Tubas