

Country Name	Project on Forestry Human Resource Development in Western Region of China
People's Republic of China	

I. Project Outline

Background	Western region of China ¹ was the headwater area of the major rivers in the country such as Chang Jiang and the Yellow River, and thus environmental protection of the region was highly important. Nevertheless, it had scarce forests, and was most seriously suffered from runoff of soil and water and desertification. Since most of the forests in China were either collective forests managed by local groups or national forest farms, the Chinese government promoted the Reform of collective forest right system and the Reform and development on national forest farm. However, progress of both Reforms in the western region was slow compared to other regions due to severe natural environment and shortage of human resources. In particular, human resource development of the personnel at county and/or lower administration levels, responsible for practical works in both Reforms, was insufficient as the training opportunities were very limited. Therefore, it was the urgent need to develop capacity of forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels to implement both Reforms effectively and promote appropriate forest conservation.												
Objectives of the Project	<p>The project aimed at developing a training system² for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels in the western region of China to promote the Reform of collective forest right system and the Reform and development on national forest farm through activities in the pilot provinces and autonomous regions (ARs) (i.e. strengthening of cooperation among related departments and organizations of forest bureaus for training on both Reforms, and development of the training systems through implementation of training) and enhancement of information sharing and exchange on policies, good practices, references and the training system relevant to both Reforms in various manners, thereby having the training system on both Reforms disseminated in the western region.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Reform of collective forest right system and Reform and development on national forest farm are promoted in the western region of China through dissemination of the training system on both Reforms, which targets forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels. Project Purpose: Training system for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels is developed through activities at pilot provinces and ARs to promote Reform of collective forest right system and Reform and development on national forest farm, which can be applied to the western region of China. 												
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: Western region of China Main Activities: 1) understanding of training situation of both Reforms, creation of common understanding with the forestry bureaus about the roles of the related departments and organizations, coordination of training by the related departments and organizations in the pilot provinces/ARs; 2) understanding of the current status of both Reforms and training needs, development and implementation of training courses, support for implementation of extension training by the training participants to disseminate their learning to their colleagues, improvement of the training based on the results of training evaluation by the training participants and monitoring of the training effect in the pilot provinces/ARs; 3) organization of training and seminars for senior officers in the authorities concerned with both Reforms in the western regions, information sharing via newsletter, internet, etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side (at the time of project completion)</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Chinese Side (at the time of terminal evaluation)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: (long-term) 5 persons, (short-term) 9 persons</td> <td>1) Staff Allocated: 58 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees Received: 25 persons</td> <td>2) Land and Facilities: office for experts</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: vehicles, equipment for training, etc.</td> <td>3) Local Cost: cost for project management, cost for training</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Local Cost: cost for training, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side (at the time of project completion)	Chinese Side (at the time of terminal evaluation)	1) Experts: (long-term) 5 persons, (short-term) 9 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 58 persons	2) Trainees Received: 25 persons	2) Land and Facilities: office for experts	3) Equipment: vehicles, equipment for training, etc.	3) Local Cost: cost for project management, cost for training	4) Local Cost: cost for training, etc.	
Japanese Side (at the time of project completion)	Chinese Side (at the time of terminal evaluation)												
1) Experts: (long-term) 5 persons, (short-term) 9 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 58 persons												
2) Trainees Received: 25 persons	2) Land and Facilities: office for experts												
3) Equipment: vehicles, equipment for training, etc.	3) Local Cost: cost for project management, cost for training												
4) Local Cost: cost for training, etc.													
Project Period	March 2010-February 2014	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 470 million yen, (actual) 277 million yen										
Implementing Agency	State Academy of Forestry Administration (STAFSA), State Forestry Administration (SFA) Provincial/Autonomous Region Bureau of Forestry and Forestry Academy of each pilot province/autonomous region (Sichuan Province, Shaanxi Province, Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region, and Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region) ³												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Forestry Agency												

¹ 12 provinces/autonomous regions (hereinafter referred to as "ARs")/direct-controlled municipality (hereinafter referred to as "municipality"): Sichuan Province, Shaanxi Province, Guangxi Zhuang AR (hereinafter referred to as "Guangxi AR"), Ningxia Hui AR (hereinafter referred to as "Ningxia AR"), Inner Mongolia AR, Xinjiang Uighur AR (hereinafter referred to as "Xinjiang AR"), Gansu Province, Qinghai Province, Tibet AR, Yunnan Province, Guizhou Province, and Chongqing City.

² "Training system" in the project refers to training style, training curriculum, training method, training material, training evaluation method, etc.

³ They were selected as the pilot provinces/ARs because they had climatic conditions representing the northwest and southwest part of China and the progress of both Reforms was different. It was considered that the training systems to be developed there were likely to be useful for other provinces/ARs in the western region.

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

-The Overall Goal consists of two levels of objectives i.e., the means (“The training system on Reform of collective forest right system and Reform and development on national forest farm, which targets forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels, is disseminated”) and the effects (“Both reforms are promoted in the western region of China”). In addition, indicators to measure the achievement of the latter are not specified in the Project Design Matrix (PDM). In view of the above, in the ex-post evaluation, the former shall be regarded as the “Overall Goal” and the latter shall be treated as the “Super Goal”.

-Although the target date for achieving the Overall Goal is not specified in the PDM, there is a statement in the terminal evaluation report that “it is confirmed that the Overall Goal will be achieved by February 2017, three years after completion of the project”. Therefore, in the ex-post evaluation, February 2017 shall be regarded as the target date.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of China at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the project was consistent with China’s development policy of enhancement of conservation of natural environment, including forests, as set forth in the “11th Five Year Plan for National Economic and Social Development of the People’s Republic of China” (2006-2010). At the time of project completion, it was consistent with the development policy of promotion of protection and rehabilitation of ecosystem as set forth in the “12th Five Year Plan” (2011-2015).

<Consistency with the Development Needs of China at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, as mentioned in “Background” above, it was the urgent need to develop capacity of forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels to effectively implement both Reforms. At the time of project completion, the need for human resource development for both Reforms increased further because full-scale implementation of the Reform of collective forest right system had been started nationwide and official permissions for enforcement of the Reform on development on national forest farm had been granted in some provinces.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with one of the priority areas of the Economic Cooperation Plan for China (2001), “cooperation for dealing with global problems such as environmental problems”.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the project completion. STAFA compiled the training systems for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels to promote both Reforms, which were developed in the pilot provinces/ARs, into a training system collection that could be applied to the western region (Indicator 1).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The achievement status of the Project Purpose is continued. Application of the training system developed through the project has been promoted by SFA and STAFA in the western region. SFA has secured a special budget for dissemination of the outcomes of this project, and, utilizing this budget, STAFA has carried out various dissemination activities such as introduction and promotion of utilization of the training system through implementation of model training in other provinces/ARs and the summary meetings of the project outcome dissemination, dispatch of its staff to give guidance about the training system, and provision of financial support to the forestry academies in the western region, including the pilot provinces/ARs.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. By the target date (i.e. February 2017), model training applying the training system developed through the project was implemented in 6 provinces/ARs/municipality in the western region other than the pilot provinces/ARs (Indicator 1; the target was “in at least 2 provinces”), and 4,387 people participated in the training in the western region, including the pilot provinces/ARs (Indicator 2; the target was “at least 600 people”). According to STAFA, the reasons that the achievement greatly exceeded the target include strong demand for human resource development for both Reforms and high motivation of the field staff for learning besides the above-stated project outcome dissemination promoted by SFA and STAFA.

< Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

There are no negative impacts on natural and social environment caused by the project. Other positive impacts of the project include implementation of extension training by the training participants. At the time of training on both Reforms, the training participants were requested to implement the extension training to their colleagues. As a result, according to STAFA, 98% of the training participants in the pilot provinces/ARs have conducted the extension training. STAFA also confirmed through the exchange at a social networking service group that the training participants in other provinces/ARs have conducted the extension training although there is no aggregated data. It can be said that the extension training has been a promoting factor for smooth implementation of both Reforms, which is the Super Goal.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, through the project, the Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion and the project effect is continued at the time of ex-post evaluation. The Overall Goal is achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																																																																						
<p>(Project Purpose) Training system for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels is developed through the activities at pilot provinces and autonomous regions to promote Reform of collective forest right system and Reform and development on national forest farm, which can be applied to the western region of China.</p>	<p>(Indicator 1) Training systems in the pilot provinces/ARs are compiled into a training system collection by STAFA taking into consideration natural, social and economic conditions and the progress of both Reforms.</p>	<p>Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued) (Project Completion) -STAFA compiled the training systems developed in the pilot provinces/ARs into a training system collection, which was printed and bound. (Ex-post Evaluation) -SFA and STAFA have been promoting application of the training system in the western region.</p>																																																																						
<p>(Overall Goal) The training system on Reform of collective forest right system and Reform and development on national forest farm, which targets forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels, is disseminated. *See <Special Perspectives in the Ex-Post Evaluation></p>	<p>(Indicator 1) The training system developed through the project is applied in at least 2 provinces in the western region other than the pilot provinces/ARs. (Indicator 2) At least 600 people participate in the training on Reform of collective forest right system and Reform and development on national forest farm in the western region.</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved - By the target date (i.e. February 2017), training for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels, applying the training system developed through the project, had been conducted in 6 provinces other than the pilot ones. - From March to September 2017, training for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels, applying the training system developed through the project, was conducted in one more province.</p> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved <Number of participants in the training at county and/or lower administration levels in the pilot provinces/ARs> (March 2014-February 2017)</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th style="text-align: center;">Province/AR</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Reform of collective forest right system</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Reform and development on national forest farm</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">1</td> <td>Sichuan Province</td> <td style="text-align: center;">358</td> <td style="text-align: center;">276</td> <td style="text-align: center;">634</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">2</td> <td>Shaanxi Province</td> <td style="text-align: center;">906</td> <td style="text-align: center;">990</td> <td style="text-align: center;">1,896</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">3</td> <td>Guangxi AR</td> <td style="text-align: center;">311</td> <td style="text-align: center;">340</td> <td style="text-align: center;">651</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">4</td> <td>Ningxia AR</td> <td style="text-align: center;">254</td> <td style="text-align: center;">271</td> <td style="text-align: center;">525</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="4" style="text-align: center;">Total</td> <td style="text-align: center;">3,706</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><Number of participants in the training at county and/or lower administration levels outside the pilot provinces/ARs> (March 2014-February 2017)</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th style="text-align: center;">Province/AR</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Reform of collective forest right system</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Reform and development on national forest farm</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">1</td> <td>Chongqing City</td> <td style="text-align: center;">131</td> <td style="text-align: center;">0</td> <td style="text-align: center;">131</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">2</td> <td>Gansu Province</td> <td style="text-align: center;">100</td> <td style="text-align: center;">151</td> <td style="text-align: center;">251</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">3</td> <td>Xinjiang AR</td> <td style="text-align: center;">0</td> <td style="text-align: center;">40</td> <td style="text-align: center;">40</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">4</td> <td>Guizhou Province</td> <td style="text-align: center;">100</td> <td style="text-align: center;">0</td> <td style="text-align: center;">100</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">5</td> <td>Qinghai Province</td> <td style="text-align: center;">0</td> <td style="text-align: center;">66</td> <td style="text-align: center;">66</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">6</td> <td>Yunnan Province</td> <td style="text-align: center;">93</td> <td style="text-align: center;">0</td> <td style="text-align: center;">93</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="4" style="text-align: center;">Total</td> <td style="text-align: center;">661</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>-From March to September 2017, 66 people in Chongqing City and 69 people in Inner Mongolia AR participated in the training on the Reform and development on national forest farm, targeting at county and/or lower administration levels.</p>		Province/AR	Reform of collective forest right system	Reform and development on national forest farm	Total	1	Sichuan Province	358	276	634	2	Shaanxi Province	906	990	1,896	3	Guangxi AR	311	340	651	4	Ningxia AR	254	271	525	Total				3,706		Province/AR	Reform of collective forest right system	Reform and development on national forest farm	Total	1	Chongqing City	131	0	131	2	Gansu Province	100	151	251	3	Xinjiang AR	0	40	40	4	Guizhou Province	100	0	100	5	Qinghai Province	0	66	66	6	Yunnan Province	93	0	93	Total				661
	Province/AR	Reform of collective forest right system	Reform and development on national forest farm	Total																																																																				
1	Sichuan Province	358	276	634																																																																				
2	Shaanxi Province	906	990	1,896																																																																				
3	Guangxi AR	311	340	651																																																																				
4	Ningxia AR	254	271	525																																																																				
Total				3,706																																																																				
	Province/AR	Reform of collective forest right system	Reform and development on national forest farm	Total																																																																				
1	Chongqing City	131	0	131																																																																				
2	Gansu Province	100	151	251																																																																				
3	Xinjiang AR	0	40	40																																																																				
4	Guizhou Province	100	0	100																																																																				
5	Qinghai Province	0	66	66																																																																				
6	Yunnan Province	93	0	93																																																																				
Total				661																																																																				

Source: Project Completion Report, questionnaire survey and interview to STAFA

3 Efficiency

The project cost and period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 53% and 100%). Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

Both Reforms contribute to enhancement of ecosystem conservation and acceleration of improvement of ecological environment, which are regarded as important issues in the "13th Five Year Plan of the National People's Republic of China's Social Economy and Social Development" (2016-2020). Furthermore, policy support for both Reforms has been enhanced through the "Reform Plan for the National Forest Farm" and "Guidance Opinion on Reform of the National Forest Ward" promulgated by the Communist Party of China and the State Council in 2015, and the "Opinion of the State Council on Improvement of the Collective Forest Rights System" promulgated by the State Council in 2016.

<Institutional Aspect>

The organizational system and roles of the Implementing Agencies regarding the training on both Reforms have not been changed. STAFA continues to support dissemination of the training system developed through the project in the western region. In the pilot provinces/ARs, under the coordination of the provincial/ARs' forestry bureaus, the forestry academies plan and implement the training on

both Reforms using the training system developed through the project. In general, the number of staff of the relevant departments of the Implementing Agencies is up to or larger than the quota, and, at STAFA, 3 staff members are allocated for dissemination of the project outcomes on full-time basis. The number of staff of the forestry academies in Sichuan and Shaanxi Provinces is less than the quota, but lecturers have been secured in collaboration with the local universities and research institutes. As the training which applied the system developed through the project has been carried out steadily in the western region, including the pilot provinces/ARs, since the completion of the project, it is considered that, in each Implementing Agency, necessary personnel have been secured to continuously fulfill the respective organizational role stated above.

<The number of staff of the departments relevant to the training on Reform of collective forest right system and Reform and development on national forest farm in the Implementing Agencies>

	STAFA	Sichuan Province		Shaanxi Province		Guangxi AR		Ningxia AR	
		Forestry bureau	Forestry academy	Forestry bureau	Forestry academy	Forestry bureau	Forestry academy	Forestry bureau	Forestry academy
Staff number	35	13	4	35	6	4	5	7	4

Source: Questionnaire survey and interview to STAFA

<Technical Aspect>

Almost all the counterpart personnel at the Implementing Agencies remain in their respective organizations and continue to engage in the work related to the training on both Reforms by using the knowledge accumulated through the project and the project deliverables. According to the Implementing Agencies, the staff of STAFA have sufficient knowledge to disseminate the training applying the training system developed through the project, and the staff of the forestry academies in the pilot provinces/ARs maintain basic knowledge concerning the planning and implementation of the training that applied the training system. In addition, external lecturers are invited through cooperation with the local universities and research institutes so that the technical level necessary for the training on both Reforms is secured. As for the equipment provided to the pilot provinces/ARs, the staff in charge of management have been allocated, maintenance has been appropriately done, and the equipment has been continuously utilized in the training on both Reform according to the report of the Implementing Agencies, which was observed during the field visit to a pilot province.

<Financial Aspect>

In the fiscal year (FY) 2016, 1.7 million yuan was allocated to STAFA as the budget for the training on both Reforms. The budget for the forestry academies in the pilot provinces/ARs was 0.38 million yuan in Sichuan Province, 0.32 million yuan in Guangxi AR, and 0.12 million yuan in Ningxia AR⁴. For the three years from FY 2014, the budget for STAFA was stable, the budget for Ningxia AR gradually increased, and the budget for Sichuan and Guangxi AR varied from year to year, but the expenditure of each organization was within the budget. During the said period, the training on both Reforms, including Shaanxi Province where budget information could not be obtained, was steadily carried out; therefore, the necessary budget is considered to have been secured by each Implementing Agency. Regarding the future prospects, the project effects are likely to continue for the following reasons: application of the training system developed through the project has been mostly completed in the western region; the training budget for the forestry academies in the pilot provinces/ARs are likely to be secured from the past record; and, even if the budget is limited, it can be complemented by the extension training conducted by the training participants.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, no problem has been observed in terms of the policy/institutional/technical/financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is high.

5 Summary of Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose (i.e. development of the training system for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels to promote the Reform of collective forest right system and the Reform of national forest farm, which is applicable to the western region). The effect of the project is continued and the Overall Goal (i.e. dissemination of the training system for forestry sector personnel at county and/or lower administration levels to promote the Reform of collective forest right system and the Reform of national forest farm in the western region) has been achieved. Regarding the sustainability, the policy, institutional, technical, and financial aspects to maintain the project effects have been secured. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendation to the executing agency:

-It is recommended that STAFA of SFA make maximum effort to continuously secure the budget for the project outcome dissemination at the earliest possible time. If it is difficult to secure a special budget, it is desirable to sustain the project effects within the limited budget by devising ways and means of dissemination, such as posting the teaching materials used in the trainings and records of questions and answer sessions on the website to allow a wide range of forestry sector personnel to access them.

Lessons learned for JICA:

-As in the case of the project, incorporating support for implementation of the extension training by the training participants in the project activities, requesting the participants to conduct the extension training at the time of training, and monitoring the training implementation status as an outcome indicator, could bring about a high impact and increase the possibility to secure the sustainability of the project effect even if the budget of the provinces/ARs is limited.

⁴ According to STAFA, the forestry academies in some pilot provinces/ARs have applied/secured the training funds from the budget of the relevant projects in China in addition to the provincial budget to have as many forestry sector personnel as possible trained. The funds from the additional budget, however, are not reflected in the budget amount since the detailed information could not be confirmed.



Opening ceremony of training for senior forestry officers in Inner Mongolia AR