

Country Name	<b>Project for Strengthening of the Capacities for Rural Tourism Development in the Eastern Region of El Salvador</b>
Republic of El Salvador	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	In El Salvador, many of the developed tourism sites are concentrated in the Western Region. Although the Eastern Region <sup>1</sup> has rich tourism resources, basic tourism infrastructure had not been well developed for attracting both domestic and foreign investments. In order to boost the tourism industry in the Eastern Region, it was identified that strengthening of capacities of the related organizations such as the Ministry of Tourism (MITUR), the Salvadorian Corporation of Tourism (CORSATUR) and the Committee of Tourism Development (CDT) as well as the reinforcement of cooperation among the related organizations including the private sector was needed.														
Objectives of the Project	By strengthening the capacity development of MITUR, CORSATUR and CDTs/ADTs* through pilot project implementation and elaborating an Activity Model of CDTs/ADTs for the tourism development, the project aimed at developing a sustainable mechanism of the tourism development in the Eastern Region to benefit to the local communities, thereby contributing to development of community tourism based on local resources. *When a CDT satisfies certain organizational and financial requirements, it is approved as an independent entity and turns to be named a Tourism Development Association (ADT).														
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall Goal: Community tourism based on distinctive local resources is developed in the Eastern Region.</li> <li>Project Purpose: A sustainable mechanism of tourism development to benefit the local community in the Eastern Region is established through a public-private partnership.</li> </ol>														
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site: 13 municipalities in the Eastern Region (Santa Rosa de Lima, Bolívar, San José, Yucuaiquín, Pasaquina, Yayantique, San Alejo, La Unión, El Carmen, Chiriagua, Intipuca, Conchagua, and Meanguera del Golfo)</li> <li>Main activities: Analysis of the tourism development conditions, formulation of the tourism guidelines, implementation of the pilot tourism projects, training of the related organizations on tourism development and promotion, etc.</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Salvadoran Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 6 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 12 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Training in Japan: 5 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Office space, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Training in the third country: 78 persons</td> <td>3) Operation cost for the project activities.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Equipment: vehicle, PCs, office equipment, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5) Operation cost for pilot project implementation, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			Japanese Side	Salvadoran Side	1) Experts: 6 persons	1) Staff allocated: 12 persons	2) Training in Japan: 5 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space, etc.	3) Training in the third country: 78 persons	3) Operation cost for the project activities.	4) Equipment: vehicle, PCs, office equipment, etc.		5) Operation cost for pilot project implementation, etc.	
Japanese Side	Salvadoran Side														
1) Experts: 6 persons	1) Staff allocated: 12 persons														
2) Training in Japan: 5 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space, etc.														
3) Training in the third country: 78 persons	3) Operation cost for the project activities.														
4) Equipment: vehicle, PCs, office equipment, etc.															
5) Operation cost for pilot project implementation, etc.															
Project Period	July 2010 to July 2013	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 370 million yen, (actual) 371 million yen												
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Tourism (MITUR), Salvadoran Tourism Corporation (CORSATUR)														
Cooperation Agency in Japan	None.														

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

[Special perspectives considered at the ex-post evaluation]

- The framework of the Activity Model introduced by the project is explained as follows. CDT is established with support of CORSATUR for reactivation of local tourism development and functions as the core for encouraging tourism promotion activities. Through conducting such activities, capacity building of CDT is achieved, and the tourism development concept is formulated, tourism development projects are implemented, and activities of promotion and marketing of the developed tourism products are conducted. The knowledge obtained through these activities is fed back to the following tourism development activities.

<b>1 Relevance</b>
<p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of El Salvador at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion&gt;</p> <p>The tourist sector was regarded as one of the priority areas for the national development plan, the “Five-year Development Plan” (2010-2014 and 2014-2019), and various strategies for tourism development are described in the “National Policy of Tourism 2013”. Therefore, the project was consistent with development policies of El Salvador at both the time of the ex-ante evaluation and project completion.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Needs of El Salvador at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion&gt;</p> <p>Issues related to development of the tourism sector included capacity development of the related organizations such as MITUR, CORSATUR and CDTs. Both at the ex-ante evaluation and project completion, there were needs for capacity building of these organizations and also strengthening of their collaboration as an established mechanism for tourism development. Thus, the project was relevant with these needs.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation&gt;</p> <p>The Economic Policy Dialogues were conducted every year from 2004, in which one of the intersectoral development themes was the regional development with prioritization in the Eastern Region. And, one of the four priority areas was revitalizing the economy and job creation<sup>2</sup>. Thus, the project was consistent with Japan’s ODA policy for El Salvador at the time of the ex-ante evaluation.</p>

<sup>1</sup> The Eastern Region consists of four departments: Usulután, San Miguel, Morazán and La Unión.

<sup>2</sup> Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2011). “ODA Databook 2010”

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was mostly achieved by the project completion. Roles and positions of CDTs/ADTs for tourism development were clearly explained in the Activity Model developed by the project (Indicator 1); CDTs/ADTs are responsible for tourism infrastructure development and maintenance, tourism events, research on tourism, coordination with related organizations, and so on. The Activity Model was developed based on the implemented pilot projects and was approved by CORSATUR as the base for the national programs for tourism promotion (Indicator 2). Regarding the number of the employees in the tourism sector, there were no statistics or compiled data for the target municipalities (Indicator 3). Based on the 34 questionnaire responses received from the members of the target 13 CDTs/ADTs, it is presumed that the employment in the tourism sector has increased in their municipalities (29% answered “very much” and 50% “a little”).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have mostly continued. Roles and positions of CDTs/ADT are clearly stated in the “National Policy of Tourism 2013” which is still effective at the time of the ex-post evaluation. They have sustained functions for tourism promotion, and mainly worked for events related to the national tourism promotion campaign named “Pueblos Vivos” (Active Towns). Among the five pilot projects supported by the project, four of them have continued, which have involved new municipalities: the tourist map in Conchagua, mangrove tours in Intipucá, tourist signs in San Alejo, El Carmen, Chirilagua, La Unión, Conchagua, and island tour in Meanguera del Golfo, Zacatillo and Conchagua. The pilot project of the tourism and environmental education project has been suspended due to lack of municipality involvement, but the MEGATEC<sup>3</sup> of La Unión, which provided technical support to the project activities during the project, has a plan to implement it in other municipalities in the Eastern Region in near future. Regarding the number of the employees in the tourism sector, the data were available from six municipalities out of 11. The number has increased in four municipalities since the tourism promotion started based on the Activity Model. In the municipalities where the data were not available to compile, the interviewed personnel of the municipalities and CDTs/ADTs consider that the number has been on an increasing trend based on the increasing tourism business such as hotels and restaurants and participants in the festivals of “Pueblos Vivos.”

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

It is judged that the Overall Goal has been mostly achieved. Since the project completion, the Activity Model developed by the project has been incorporated in a part of the National Tourism Policy, and it has been diffused to other municipalities by CORSATUR via the Tourist Attention Centers (CATs) through trainings and workshops, and promotion of the La Unión Office of CAT which is the regional branch of CORSATUR. Based on this Model developed by the project, the number of the tourism products developed by local communities has almost tripled from 46 (2013) to 128 (2016) (Indicator 1). Various examples of the tourism products were confirmed, including handcrafts made of local materials, traditional dances and festivals, tours inside and outside the town, island tours, local gourmet products, and so on. Regarding the number of the employees in the tourism sector in the Eastern Region, the data were not available as there was no formal census (Indicator 2). However, it is assumed by the interviewed personnel of CORSATUR and MEGATEC that it has been increasing from the following factors: i) The number of the employees in the tourism sector in the whole country has been increasing (from 149,002 in 2013 to 189,897 in 2016)<sup>4</sup>; ii) New hotels have started the business; and iii) The number of the students has increased in tourism.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Following positive impacts have been confirmed. First, tourism promotion activities based on the Activity Model developed by the project have been launched in several non-target municipalities in the Eastern and other regions, including La Palma (Department of Chalatenango, Central Region) and Ruta de la Paz of (Department of Morazán, Eastern Region), and new tourism projects have been implemented such as the mangrove tour in La Pirraya (Department of Usulután, Eastern Region) and the fishing tours in Costa del Sol of (Department of La Paz, Central Region) and La Libertad of (Department of La Libertad, Central Region). Second, more women have been involved in tourism development activities and contributed to the local economies than before the project, such as promotion activities, handcrafts creation, restaurant and hotel staff. Forth, based on the project experience, MITUR has developed the guidelines named “Tourism Planning Guide: An Instrument for the Local Development in El Salvador” (2016) and “Sustainable Tourism: Articulator Axis of Economic, Social and Environmental Development in El Salvador” (2017). These have been distributed to the tourism related stakeholders including municipalities. No negative impact made by the project has been reported.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the Project Purpose was mostly achieved, and the project effects have mostly continued. The Overall Goal has been mostly achieved, and several positive impacts have been confirmed. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of the Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) A sustainable mechanism of tourism development to benefit the local community in the Eastern Region is established through a public-private partnership.	1. The role and position for CDTs/ADTs are stipulated.	Status of achievement: <u>Achieved (Continued)</u> . (Project Completion) - Roles and positions of CDTs/ADTs are explained in the Activity Model. (Ex-post Evaluation) - Roles and positions of CDTs/ADT are clearly stated in the “National Policy of Tourism 2014”, and are known to 8 out of the 11 interviewed personnel of CORSATUR and municipalities.
	2. The Model (JICA La	Status of achievement: <u>Achieved (Continued)</u> .

<sup>3</sup> MEGATEC articulates two levels of technical education: Middle Education and Higher Education. There are three MEGATEC campuses in the country, including MEGATEC La Unión.

<sup>4</sup> The census was not conducted at the regional level, but the national data was obtained from records of the registered employees in the national social security system.

	Unión Model) is approved by CORSATUR as a national standard.	(Project Completion) - The first version of the Activity Model was developed for diffusion to the four departments in the Eastern Region in May 2013. It was approved by CORSATUR by the project completion (July, 2013). (Ex-post Evaluation) - The Model has been used by CORSATUR, as a base for their programs including the annual tourism fair of “Pueblos Vivos”. It has been referred to by both target municipalities and non-target municipalities.										
	3. The number of employees in tourism sector in some areas of the pilot project area is increased.	Status of achievement: <u>Mostly achieved (Mostly continued)</u> . (Project Completion) - According to the 34 questionnaire responses received from the members of the target 13 CDTs/ADTs in February 2013, most of them think that the employment in the tourism sector has increased in their municipalities (29% answered “very much” and 50% “a little”). (Ex-post Evaluation) - Among the 11 surveyed municipalities, the data on the number of the employees in the tourism sector were available in the six municipalities, and the number has increased in the four municipalities. Out of the five municipalities where the data were not compiled, the interviewed officers and CDTs/ADTs of four municipalities consider that the number has been on an increasing trend.										
(Overall goal) Community tourism based on distinctive local resources is developed in the Eastern Region.	1. Tourism products developed by local community are increased in the Eastern Region.  2. The number of employees in tourism sector in the Eastern Region is increased.	Status of achievement: <u>Achieved</u> . (Ex-post Evaluation) - The number of the tourism products developed by local communities based on the Activity Model has increased. <table border="1" data-bbox="595 725 1417 790"> <tr> <td></td> <td>2013</td> <td>2014</td> <td>2015</td> <td>2016</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of the developed tourism products</td> <td>46</td> <td>60</td> <td>104</td> <td>128</td> </tr> </table> Status of achievement: <u>Mostly achieved</u> . (Ex-post Evaluation) - The data were not available for the Eastern Region. The interviewed CORSATUR and MEGATEC consider that the number of the employees in the tourism sector in the Eastern Region has been on an increasing trend from the facts: i) increase of the employees in the tourism sector in the whole country; ii) expansion of the tourism the business in the region; and iii) increase of the number of the students majoring in tourism.		2013	2014	2015	2016	No. of the developed tourism products	46	60	104	128
	2013	2014	2015	2016								
No. of the developed tourism products	46	60	104	128								

Source: Terminal Evaluation Report, Project Completion Report, interview with CORSATUR, CAT La Unión, MEGATC and 11 target municipalities.

### 3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and period were as planned (ratio against the plan: 100% and 100%). Therefore, the project efficiency is high.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

Tourism development and promotion in the Eastern Region are prioritized in the “Master Plan for Sustainable and Inclusive Development in the Eastern Region of El Salvador (2015-2025)”. As mentioned earlier, the Activity Model is considered as part of the “National Policy of Tourism 2013” and the base for the national tourism programs. Also, the “National Tourism Plan 2020” includes strategies which are relevant to the project components such as coordination with private enterprises and local administration, capacity building of the local stakeholders in tourism, and so on.

#### <Institutional Aspect>

The organizational structure for tourism development has remained almost the same as that during the project period; MITUR is responsible for policy planning and CORSATUR undertakes tourism promotion including support for municipalities. In 2017, MITUR conducted workshops for the purpose of related actors’ sharing experiences and improving tourism products and services. At the municipality level, CDTs/ADTs are in charge of tourism infrastructure development and maintenance, tourism events, research on the tourism, coordination with related organizations, and so on. Also, municipalities are supposed to be involved in these activities based on the plan of CDTs/ADTs. Depending on each tourism concept and available touristic resources some CDTs/ADTs form a groups named “circuits” (Eastern Coast Circuit of five municipalities, Carnival Circuit of 4 municipalities, etc.). Among the 11 municipalities surveyed by the ex-post evaluation, six are still active such as provision of the public space and equipment for the tourism events, allocation of budgets for local festivals, promotion of local hand crafts, etc. On the other hand, other five municipalities do not pay much attention in the tourism sector. According to the interviewed personnel of CORSATUR and CAT, the number of the personnel for tourism development is not sufficient, but more personnel assignment is not expected as the government has a policy not to increase the positions due to the budget constraints. As for CDTs/ADTs, the number of the members varies from 0 to 15. All of them answered that it is not sufficient to perform their duties, except one ADT (Intipucá).

#### <Technical Aspect>

The interviewed personnel of CORSATUR and CAT La Unión answered that they have sustained sufficient knowledge on tourism development and promotion. They judge so because they learned from the project activities and they also give trainings to CDTs/ADTs and other related actors such as local tourism business owners. The guidelines developed by the project were revised by CORSATUR with additional good practices manuals and still utilized. On the other hand, CDTs/ADTs members do not have sufficient knowledge on tourism promotion, according to the interviewed personnel of CORSATUR. They answered that, although they are given training opportunities on development of business by CORSATUR, the National Commission of Small and Medium-sized Enterprises (CONAMYPE) and Local Economy Development Association, they still lack promotion techniques and innovative thinking.

Table: Budget of CORSATUR (thousand USD)

	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017 (plan)
CORSATUR	\$13,039	\$12,589	\$13,697	\$14,424	\$15,864
CATs	\$347	\$213	\$256	\$339	\$410

Source: CORSATUR.

<Financial Aspect>

The budget of CORSATUR comes from the central government through MITUR and the revenue of the tax related to tourism services. The budget of CORSATUR has increased since the project completion, but they answered that it is not sufficient for assisting all CDTs/ADTs in the country. The budget of all CATs has been on an increasing trend, and it is not sufficient, either, according to CORSATUR. As for CDTs/ADTs, the data were available only from ADT Intipucá (annually 700 USD). Its member answered that it is not sufficient for maintenance of some equipment, as some events are not profitable. Members of other CDTs answered that the revenues from members' fee, donations and festival profits are not sufficient to fully conduct their tourism development activities.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, problems have been observed in terms of the institutional, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Project Purpose was mostly achieved and the effects have mostly continued. Concretely, through implementation of the pilot projects and capacity building of CDTs/ADTs, the Activity Model for tourism promotion in the Eastern Region was developed by the project, and the Model was approved by CORSATUR as the national standard. Since the project completion, CDTs/ADTs have sustained their functions, and most of the pilot projects have continued. It is judged as the Overall Goal has been mostly achieved, as more tourism products have been developed in the Eastern Region and the employment has been presumably enlarged. The project experience has been diffused to other municipalities, where new tourism promotion projects have been launched. Regarding the sustainability, the number of personnel engaged in tourism promotion is not sufficient, and some municipalities are not active in tourism promotion activities. However, the Activity Model is considered as part of the National Policy and the organizational structure for tourism development has remained the same since the project completion. The budget of CORSATUR has increased every year, though it is not sufficient for supporting the municipalities and CDTs/ADTs' activities.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for implementing agency:

- It is recommended for MITUR to encourage municipalities, which are not fully involved in tourism, to participate in the discussion to elaborate the next plan as planned, which will succeed the "National Policy of Tourism 2013" and "National Tourism Plan 2020", in order to make the plans more attractive and feasible for the municipalities and promote the use of the Activity Model and CDTs/ADTs in their tourism activities.
- It is recommended for CORSATUR to identify the resources, such as partnership with private sector, so that CDTs/ADTs can implement and promote their activities, utilizing the resources.
- It is recommended for MITUR and CORSATUR to include a session in their tourism related seminars and workshop where CDTs/ADTs can share their experience and techniques in development and promotion of products and activities so that the CDTs/ADTs can learn from each other and further improve their activities.
- It is recommended for MITUR and CORSATUR to share the project experience related to the Activity Model with other projects. For example, experiences in developing tourism products made of local/regional materials and tourism tours/fairs utilizing local/regional resources could be adopted in the project of CONAMYPE and JICA for promoting One Village One Product (OVOP) which aims at the local/regional branding for socio-economic development.

Lessons learned for JICA:

- The Activity Model developed by the project has been well promoted in the target and non-target municipalities and produced various positive impacts, such as increase in new projects and products and employment in the tourism sector. The Activity Model has continued successfully, because, firstly, it was developed as a practical model based on the experience from implementation of the pilot projects. Secondly, capacity building of CDTs/ADTs who are main actors in the Activity Model was conducted based on the detailed analysis of their capacity at the planning phase. Thirdly, the project succeeded in incorporating the Activity Model in the national policy, by involving various actors including CDTs/ADTs and other actors related to the project in the discussion for elaboration of the national policy. In projects in which a model is developed for future diffusion, it is important to (i) try to make a practical one through the trial-error during the project period, (ii) examine the capacities of the main users before the project and design the capacity building, and (iii) incorporate the model in the national policy by involving project related actors at different levels in discussion for elaboration of the national policy.



Promotional Stand for Mangrove Tour at Pueblos Vivos Fair 2017 for Intipucá, La Unión



Promotional material for "Eastern Coast Circuit"