

Country Name	<b>Project for the Comprehensive Transport and Trade System Development Master Plan</b>
United Republic of Tanzania	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	Tanzania has the port of Dar es Salaam, the gateway to East Africa, and in addition, it has international corridors that greatly influence the transport and trade of Tanzania and the neighboring countries. In particular, the four major development corridors identified in the “10-year Transport Sector Investment Programme” (2007), namely, the Dar es Salaam, Central, Tanga and Mtwara Development Corridors, have a large influence on the livelihood and economic activities of these countries. However, there were many obstacles for the smooth and seamless transport and trade, such as unpaved roads, inefficiency of and low reliability on the railway transportation, limited handling capacity of ports and inefficient connections and procedures between transport modes.										
Objectives of the Project	By preparing the transport origin to destination (OD) data and Master Plan for nationwide transport and trade system, the project aimed at developing future visions of development corridors for 2030 and freight transport strategies thereby developing capacity of the related organization on project planning and management, and ultimately contributing to facilitation of interregional transport and trade through efficient intermodal transport of multiple transport modes.										
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Expected Goals through the proposed plan<sup>1</sup>: Interregional transport and trade are facilitated through the efficient intermodal transport of the multiple transport modes.</li> <li>Expected utilization of the proposed plan: (1) Future visions of development corridors for 2030 and their freight transport strategies are concretely developed as the master plan; and (2) Capacity of the related organizations on program/project planning and implementation related to the transport plan is improved.</li> </ol>										
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site: Tanzania mainland</li> <li>Main activities: The study team (1) conducted survey and analysis of the current status of the transport sector; (2) conducted the network analysis and demand forecast; (3) complemented the strategy for nationwide transport and trade system, (4) Prepared the Master Plan for nationwide transport and trade system; (5) implemented the pre-feasibility study; and (6) conducted technology transfer.</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Tanzanian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Mission members: 20 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: Personnel of MOWTC.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Training in Japan: 5 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facility: Office space, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Operation cost: hiring 1 Tanzanian professional and 3 assistants, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side	1) Mission members: 20 persons	1) Staff allocated: Personnel of MOWTC.	2) Training in Japan: 5 persons	2) Land and facility: Office space, etc.	3) Operation cost: hiring 1 Tanzanian professional and 3 assistants, etc.	
Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side										
1) Mission members: 20 persons	1) Staff allocated: Personnel of MOWTC.										
2) Training in Japan: 5 persons	2) Land and facility: Office space, etc.										
3) Operation cost: hiring 1 Tanzanian professional and 3 assistants, etc.											
Project Period	August 2011 to February 2013	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 350 million yen, (actual) 462 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Transport (Ministry of Works, Transport and Communications (MOWTC) from 2015)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	PADECO Co., Ltd., Nippon Koei Co. Ltd, International Development Center of Japan Incorporated										

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

<Special perspectives considered at the ex-post evaluation>

- As “expected utilization of the proposed plan,” one of the two objectives set forth at the ex-ante evaluation was “Future visions of development corridors for 2030 and their freight transport strategies are concretely developed as the master plan.” However, since the master plan was one of the project outputs, it is not appropriate as an indicator of the utilization status of the proposed plan. Therefore, this was used as an indicator for the outputs to achieve the project goal.

<Evaluation constraint>

- As “expected utilization of the proposed plan,” one of the indicators was set forth as “facilitation of the interregional transport and trade through the efficient intermodal transport of the multiple transport modes.” For understanding of this indicator, it was intended to use the following data: time of transport and trade, cost of transport and trade, traffic volume, cargo volume, and freight income, though most of which were not available.

**I Relevance**

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Tanzania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with Tanzanian development policies, as transport was positioned as a priority sector in the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (2010-2014).

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Tanzania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

Though major development corridors had been improved, the proportion of roads which were paved was still low and obstacles remained for smooth and seamless transport and trade still at the project completion, including inefficient rail transport and its low reliability, limited capacity of ports, connection and procedure between transport modes.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

In the Country Assistance Plan for Tanzania (2008), under the pillar of growth and reduction of income poverty, infrastructure was one of the priority areas.

<sup>1</sup> The degree of achievement of expected goals is not to be assessed in principle at the time of ex-post evaluation, since it is defined as the medium-to-long-term goals which will be attained as a result of crystallizing the proposed plan (“output” of the project).

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Objectives at the Time of Project Completion>

The Transport and Trade Master Plan (Master Plan) was developed with the pre-feasibility studies. The Tanzanian Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) was conducted on the Master Plan and approved by the State Minister in Charge of Environment in February 2014. The Master Plan developed by the project includes strategies for freight transport development, port sector development, road sector development, and railway sector development. It also includes institutional development strategies and proposes projects for 2030. MOWTC answered at the ex-post evaluation that they are satisfied with the Master Plan because it was a comprehensive plan which included transport demand forecast and suggested projects for implementation and it was useful for planning.

<Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the Time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The developed Master Plan has been utilized. For the subsectors of air, inland port, sea port, road and railway, a total of 41 infrastructure projects were proposed. Among the 18 proposed projects for the time frame 2013-2017, 4 were completed<sup>2</sup>, 9 projects are under implementation and 5 projects are planned. Also, 23 proposed projects for the time frame 2018-2022 and 2023-2030, 5 projects are under implementation. Through planning and implementation of the proposed projects, MOTWC and other agencies have improved their capacity for program/project planning and implementation, according to MOWTC.

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the Time of Ex-post Evaluation>

It is too early to judge the achievement status of the Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan. The following analysis was made for reference. The developed Master Plan proposes strategies and projects until 2030, and 18 out of 41 proposed projects were completed or are under implementation. As of June 2017, no data were available for time of transport and trade, cost of transport and trade, traffic volume, cargo volume, and freight income, though, with regard to the time of transport and trade, with the bus rapid transit system introduced in some projects, the time to and from the central business district has been reduced in the opinion of MOWTC. With regard to promotion of the modal shift between ships and trains, some of the projects such as Dar es Salaam port improvement project and standard gauge rail construction have started recently. MOWTC presumes that the modal shift would be promoted when the government completes those projects.

<Other Impact at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No particular impact has been confirmed at the ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, through the project, the Master Plan for transport and trade system development was developed, which includes future visions of development corridors for 2030 and their freight transport strategies, and some projects proposed by the Master Plan have been implemented. Furthermore, capacity of the related organizations on project management has been improved. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Status of Achievement of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan and Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan) 1. Future visions of development corridors for 2030 and their freight transport strategies are concretely developed as the master plan 2. Capacity of the related organizations on program/project planning and implementation related to the transport plan is improved	1. Utilization status of the prepared Master Plan	Status of achievement: Achieved. (Ex-post Evaluation) - 18 proposed projects for the time frame 2013-2017, 4 were completed, 9 projects are under implementation and 5 projects were planned. Also 23 proposed projects for the time frame 2018-2022 and 2023-2030, 5 projects are under implementation. - The Master Plan has been used by MOWTC and implementing agencies as a reference material for project planning and implementation, and MOWTC judges their capacity on project planning and implementation related to the transport plan has been improved. <Supplementary information> - The Master Plan developed by the project includes strategies for freight transport development, port sector development, road sector development, and railway sector development. It also includes institutional development strategies and proposes projects for 2030.
(Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan) (Not to be evaluation) 1. Interregional transport and trade are facilitated through the efficient intermodal transport of the multiple transport modes	1. Facilitation of the interregional transport and trade through the efficient intermodal transport of the multiple transport modes 2. Promotion of the modal shift	Status of achievement: Not verified. (Ex-post Evaluation) - No exact data were available for time of transport and trade, cost of transport and trade, traffic volume, cargo volume, and freight income, since they have not been measured yet. Status of achievement: - Not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) - The government has started port improvement and construction of the standard gauge rail, and the modal shift between ships and trains will be promoted after completion of those projects.

(Source) MOWTC.

3 Efficiency

Both of the project cost and period exceeded the plan because it took more time and cost for the approval process of SEA than expected (ratios against the plan: 131% and 112%, respectively). Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

<sup>2</sup> Completed projects are “JNIA Cargo Terminal Development” (Tanzania Airport Authority), “Refurbishment of Container Terminal for Kigoma Port” of Tanzania Port Authority (TPA), “Community Service Project: Six Cluster Ports on Tanganyika and Kiwira on Nyasa” (TPA) and “Kasanga Port Development Phase I” (TPA), as of July 2017.

#### 4 Sustainability

##### <Policy Aspect>

Development of transport and trade has been prioritized in the National Transport Policy. According to MOWTC, some proposed projects by the Master Plan was adopted by the Five-Year Development Plan (FYDP II).

##### <Institutional Aspect>

The Department of Policy and Planning of MOWTC is responsible for monitoring the implementation status of the pilot projects proposed in the Master Plan. The number of the personnel for this responsibility is 5 and it is sufficient for coordinating implementing agencies, according to the Department of Policy and Planning. For monitoring, performance agreements are annually exchanged with these agencies. The responsible section or personnel for revision of the Master Plan has not been decided, because there has not been such necessity. For implementation of the proposed projects in the Master Plan in the subsectors of air, inland port/sea port, road and rail, the responsible are Tanzania Airport Authority (TAA), Tanzania Ports Authority (TPA), Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS), and Reli Assets Holding Company (RAHCO), respectively. In all agencies, the personnel in charge is the directorate of the responsible section and the number is sufficient, according to MOT.

##### <Technical Aspect>

MOWTC judges that the technical level of all the implementing agencies (TAA, TPA, TANROADS and RAHCO) is sufficient for implementation of the proposed projects in the Master Plan, based on the monitoring of their performance. If they have necessity for upgrading the technical level, new personnel will be recruited. Also, MOWTC has acquired sufficient techniques for project monitoring, as they have conducted it without difficulties.

##### <Financial Aspect>

Projects proposed by the Master Plan have been implemented annually using the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework. The budget sources include allocation from the central government and supports from the World Bank, African Development Bank, Kuwait Foundation, etc. As of 2016, 1,526 million USD were disbursed for 14 projects which have been implemented and of which the financial data were confirmed. However, some proposed projects have not secured financing from the government yet, because of the limited financial resources for competing demands between transport and social developmental issues.

##### <Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the financial aspects of MOWTC and other implementing agencies. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

In the project, the Master Plan for transport and trade system development which satisfy MOTWC was developed. Several projects proposed in the Master Plan have been implemented, and capacity of MOWTC and other implementing agencies has been improved. Since only 4 were completed and 14 are ongoing among the 41 proposed projects, it is too early to strictly verify the results of utilization of the Master Plan as a whole at the ex-post evaluation. Regarding the sustainability, though there have not been problems of MOWTC and implementing agencies regarding the organizational structure and technical levels for planning and implementing the proposed projects, there have been budget constraints for some projects. As for the project efficiency, both of the project cost and period exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- For verification of effects of utilization of the Master Plan developed by the project, it is recommended to MOWTC to set indicators such as transport time, transport cost, traffic/cargo volume and freight income and measure the effects when all related projects are completed. It would be effective to convince the financing authority to secure budgets by showing the performance.



Opening Ceremony of Construction of Mwl. Nyerere-N. Mandela Flyover. An intervention to ease congestion along Dar port access road for smooth cargo movement to hinterland and land locked countries.

