

Country Name	Project for Institutional Capacity Development of the Civil Service Training Centre in Ghana
Republic of Ghana	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The Civil Service Training Centre (CSTC) had provided training for middle and lower level civil servants in Ghana under the Office of the Head of the Civil Service (OHCS). Since the trainees targeted by CSTC played core roles in the formulation and implementation of policies in government, their capacity building was crucial to improve quality and productivity of the service delivery. However, practical training of leadership, work ethics as well as quality and productivity improvement had not been carried out due to the lack of capacity of OHCS/CSTC. In response to those needs and the request from OHCS, JICA implemented the technical cooperation project named the “Capacity Development of Government Administration (“the 1st Phase Project”) from 2007 until 2010. Though the basic training management capacity was enhanced, in accordance with the increasing demand for the training, further capacity development was needed, specifically, in terms of the capacity of trainers in delivering lectures and capacity in developing training curriculum and materials. Also, through the 1st Phase Project, OHCS/CSTC realized the need to deliver its training services to English-speaking countries in West African sub-region.</p>																										
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through (1) developing capacity of OHCS/CSTC personnel to conduct training needs assessment (TNA) and developing training curricula and materials for Ghana and the sub-region¹, (2) Strengthening training delivery capacity of the CSTC trainers for Ghana and the sub-region, (3) developing capacity of CSTC to plan and deliver regular training for participants from Ghana and the sub-region, and (4) establishment and implementation of a monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system to ensure quality training at CSTC, the project aimed at strengthening institutional capacity of CSTC, and thereby contributing to CSTC’s provision of training and advices to civil servants and institutions in Ghana and the sub-region and replicating EL/QPI training in Sierra Leone and Liberia.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Civil servants and Institutions in Ghana and the sub-region benefit from the services of CSTC as the 'Centre of Excellence* in civil service training Project Purpose: Institutional capacity of CSTC strengthened towards its functioning as the 'Centre of Excellence' in civil service training in Ghana and the sub-region. <p>* 'Centre of Excellence' in this document refers to a civil service training institution with state of the art facilities, techniques, methodologies and approaches for equipping civil servants in Ghana and the sub-region with knowledge and skills in cutting-edge courses towards quality service delivery.</p>																										
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: CSTC in Accra Main activities: (1) Development of training materials and training curriculum, (2) Implementation of training of trainers (TOT), (3) Implementation of newly developed training courses, (4) Strengthening of M&E system Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0"> <tr> <td colspan="2">Japanese Side</td> <td colspan="2">Ghanaian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 4 persons</td> <td></td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 33 persons</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 16 persons</td> <td></td> <td>2) Land and Facilities: Provision of Project offices and part of training expenses</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Third Country Training (Singapore):</td> <td></td> <td>3) Local Expense (Japanese Counter-value Fund):</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Equipment: generator, vehicle, office equipment others</td> <td></td> <td>Construction of the new training building</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5) Local Expenses: local experts and training expenses</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </table>			Japanese Side		Ghanaian Side		1) Experts: 4 persons		1) Staff allocated: 33 persons		2) Trainees received: 16 persons		2) Land and Facilities: Provision of Project offices and part of training expenses		3) Third Country Training (Singapore):		3) Local Expense (Japanese Counter-value Fund):		4) Equipment: generator, vehicle, office equipment others		Construction of the new training building		5) Local Expenses: local experts and training expenses			
Japanese Side		Ghanaian Side																									
1) Experts: 4 persons		1) Staff allocated: 33 persons																									
2) Trainees received: 16 persons		2) Land and Facilities: Provision of Project offices and part of training expenses																									
3) Third Country Training (Singapore):		3) Local Expense (Japanese Counter-value Fund):																									
4) Equipment: generator, vehicle, office equipment others		Construction of the new training building																									
5) Local Expenses: local experts and training expenses																											
Project Period	March 1, 2011-February 28, 2014	Project Cost	(ex-ante) Approximately 300million yen, (actual) 309 million yen																								
Implementing Agency	Office of the Head of the Civil Service (OHCS), Civil Service Training Centre (CSTC)																										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	PADECO Co., Ltd.																										

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

- Achievement of the Overall Goal is somewhat constrained by the Ebola epidemic that hit the sub-region since Sierra Leonean and Liberian Government could not direct financial resources to these activities and funding organizations such as Development Partners were not ready to undertake any activities for fear of being infected by the Ebola.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Ghana at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with Ghana’s development policy. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, there was no policy related to governance for the time being after the end of the “Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy II (2006–2009)”. However, the policy named “the Training and Development Policy of the Ghana Civil Service and Guidelines for Implementation”, which emphasized importance of training for civil services, was proposed in 2008 and being implemented. As to sub-regional cooperation, the project was consistent with Conference of African Ministers on Public/Civil Service (CAMPS) at which Ghana was expected to play a key role. At the time of project

¹ The sub-region in the project related documents including Project Design Matrix means Sierra Leone and Liberia.

completion, the “OHCS Medium Term Development Plan of 2013-2017” intended to create highly capacitated Civil Servants to deliver effective and efficient service. At the same time, “CSTC’s Strategic Plan 2013-2017” included building of staff capacity to deliver training in Ghana and the sub-region.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Ghana at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with Ghana’s development needs for capacity development of civil servants. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, although the technical cooperation project for capacity development of OHCS was implemented from 2007-2010, in order to become COE in civil service training in the sub-region, CSTC further needed to strengthen its institutional capacity. At the project completion, Scheme of Service Training which makes up 40 hours per annum of training mandatory for promotion had come to effect since January 2013. Therefore, CSTC needed to expand its capacity for delivering more training courses to respond to the national demand.

In Sierra Leone, the capacity building in the context of governance and public sector reform was set as the area of priority in its national development plan, “the Agenda for Prosperity (2013-2018)”. Civil Service College (CSC) targeting the middle level civil servants had been re-established. CSC was in need of developing the capacity of trainers. In Liberia, the capacity building and training were also set as the essential areas under its national development agenda, “the Agenda for Transformation for 2012-2017”. In the Agenda, weak human and institutional capacity in the civil service was identified as one of the challenges.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan’s ODA Policy to Ghana at the time of ex-ante evaluation. The “Country Assistance Program to Ghana 2006” prioritized capacity development of public service and institutional improvement.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion as all indicators set to measure the level of achievement of the Project Purpose such as “CSTC increases its training resources, in terms of number of trainers and facilities by at least 50%” (indicator 1), “Trainers' average performance scoring by the end of each course” (indicator 2), “A training cycle management plan for training delivery for Ghanaian and sub-regional participants established” (indicator 3), and “Host institutions of the participants indicate interest in further collaboration with CSTC in capacity development” (indicator 4) were attained.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

After the project was completed, the effects of the project have mostly continued. The number of trainers has expanded even after the project completion. CTSC has not continued the International Ethical Leadership/Quality and Productivity Improvement (EL/QPI) courses after the project completion due to the financial challenges on the part of international participants as well as the Ebola epidemic that hit the countries. However, CTSC has continued ADDIE² process as well as Minimum Steps Approach which were introduced by the project when CTSC develops contents for training. For example, CSTC applied the ADDIE process in developing content for training of “Local Government Service Staff” across the country. It also applied the Minimum Step Approach for courses titled “the Evidence Informed Policy Making and Public Private Partnership Training”.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

After the project was completed, more civil servants in Ghana benefitted from the services of CSTC as the number of participants in CTSC have witnessed an increase. Beneficiary institutions include the Local Government Service, the Energy Commission, the Ghana Ports and Harbours Authority and Ghana Health Service amongst other numerous institutions. However, other sub-regional institutions and civil servants from Sierra Leone and Liberia have not benefitted much from the training offered by CSTC mainly due to budget constraints. The Human Resource Management Office (HRMO) in Sierra Leone and the Civil Service Agency (CSA) in Liberia are unable to support training and as such have had to solicit funding from other Development Partners (DPs) most of whom were not ready to support due to the Ebola crisis that hit the countries. Ex-participants from Sierra Leone and Liberia however implemented training activities either as groups or as individuals for their respective offices and HRMO and CSA supervised the sessions respectively.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

According to CSTC, a good number of women who came for the training were promoted on their return. CSTC took a management decision at the earlier stages that efforts should be made to include considerable number of women for the programme. It came out that these women showed great interest in resolving challenges in the public service delivery and they were eager to use their learning to influence change in their respective institutions. Therefore, they succeeded in implementing their action plans developed during the training.

No land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project, and no negative impacts on the natural environment were observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the project achieved the Project Purpose at the time of project completion, the effects of the project have mostly continued, and the Overall Goal was mostly achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Institutional capacity of CSTC strengthened towards its functioning as the 'Centre of Excellence' in civil service training in Ghana and the sub-region.	Indicator 1: CSTC increases its training resources, in terms of number of trainers and facilities (eg. Lecture rooms) by at least 50%.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (continued) (Project Completion) -The number of permanent trainers at CSTC increased from 4 to 11, and the number of adjunct trainers from 22 to 29. Therefore, the total number of trainers has increased from 26 to 40. (Increase by 54%) -The number of classrooms increased from 3 to 12 when the new building started in use in June 2013. (increase by 300%)

² ADDIE stands for Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation and Evaluation.

	<p>Indicator 2: Trainers' average performance (EL/QPI and TOT courses for Sierra Leone/Liberia as well as newly developed courses referred in Activity 1.5 and 1.6) scoring by the end of each course evaluation by participants averaged at least 60%.</p> <p>Indicator 3: A training cycle management plan for training delivery for Ghanaian and sub-regional participants established.</p> <p>Indicator 4: Host institutions of the participants indicate interest in further collaboration with CSTC in capacity development.</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) The number of staff at CSTC</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="772 114 1513 248"> <tr> <th>Position</th> <th>Number of staff</th> </tr> <tr> <td>Permanent trainers (including principal)</td> <td>14</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Adjunct trainers</td> <td>37</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Others (Administrative staff)</td> <td>34</td> </tr> </table> <p>Status of the Achievement: achieved (not continued) (Project Completion) Satisfaction rates on trainers' performance received at the end of course evaluation are as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="772 376 1398 667"> <tr> <td>1st international EL/QPI course</td> <td>95%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2nd international EL/QPI course</td> <td>100%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3rd international EL/QPI course</td> <td>100%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4th international EL/QPI course</td> <td>100%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1st international TOT course</td> <td>75%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2nd international TOT course</td> <td>88%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3rd international TOT course</td> <td>100%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1st Customer Care course</td> <td>94%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2nd Customer Care course</td> <td>100%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1st Monitoring and Evaluation course</td> <td>81%</td> </tr> </table> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) There were no international EL/QPI courses organised after the end of the project partly because of funding challenges on the part of participants and partly because the Ebola epidemic. Therefore, there is no data on the satisfaction rate.</p> <p>Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued) (Project Completion) -TNA guideline, Training Administration Manual and M&E guideline were compiled. -International and domestic training courses were conducted following the ADDIE cycle. -In the third project year, the project team made the effort to establish a simplified standard ADDIE cycle for CSTC as a "Minimum Steps Approach." The "Minimum Steps Approach" summarized work instructions and check points focusing on must know contents for acquiring targeted skills.</p> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) CSTC has continued ADDIE and the Minimum Steps Approach to develop contents to Ghanaian trainees.</p> <p>Status of the Achievement: achieved (Project Completion) - Both Human Resource Management Office (HRMO) in Sierra Leone and Civil Service Agency (CSA) in Liberia expressed their interests. However, it was not materialized due to financial constraint. -Domestic Customer Care Course was requested an additional batch from the host organization in the 1st Batch and the schedule was under negotiation.</p> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) See Indicator 1 of the Overall Goal below.</p>	Position	Number of staff	Permanent trainers (including principal)	14	Adjunct trainers	37	Others (Administrative staff)	34	1 st international EL/QPI course	95%	2 nd international EL/QPI course	100%	3 rd international EL/QPI course	100%	4 th international EL/QPI course	100%	1 st international TOT course	75%	2 nd international TOT course	88%	3 rd international TOT course	100%	1 st Customer Care course	94%	2 nd Customer Care course	100%	1 st Monitoring and Evaluation course	81%					
Position	Number of staff																																		
Permanent trainers (including principal)	14																																		
Adjunct trainers	37																																		
Others (Administrative staff)	34																																		
1 st international EL/QPI course	95%																																		
2 nd international EL/QPI course	100%																																		
3 rd international EL/QPI course	100%																																		
4 th international EL/QPI course	100%																																		
1 st international TOT course	75%																																		
2 nd international TOT course	88%																																		
3 rd international TOT course	100%																																		
1 st Customer Care course	94%																																		
2 nd Customer Care course	100%																																		
1 st Monitoring and Evaluation course	81%																																		
<p>(Overall Goal) Civil servants and Institutions in Ghana and the sub-region benefit from the services of CSTC as the 'Centre of Excellence in civil service training</p>	<p>Indicator 1: CSTC provides training and/or advice to the national and sub-regional counterpart institutions at their request.</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved (1) Number of training courses provided to staff of national counterpart institutions and trainees</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="788 1644 1525 1912"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2"></th> <th colspan="3">No. of participants</th> <th rowspan="2">No. of Training</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Civil Servant</th> <th>Others</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>2012</td> <td>1,419</td> <td>21</td> <td>1,440</td> <td>48</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2013 (as of the end of September)</td> <td>289</td> <td>833</td> <td>1,112</td> <td>32</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2014</td> <td>2,063</td> <td>57</td> <td>2,120</td> <td>32</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2015</td> <td>2,744</td> <td>645</td> <td>3,389</td> <td>28</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2016</td> <td>3,601</td> <td>299</td> <td>3,900</td> <td>28</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>(2) Training for the sub-regional counterpart institutions The training courses were not conducted due to the Ebola crisis that hit the countries.</p> <p>(3) Advice to the national and sub-regional counterpart institutions - In Ghana, CSTC offered partial consultancy to the Local Government Service in the development of their HR manual in 2014. In 2015, CSTC offered consultancy service by conducting a survey on training requirement for HR manual using the minimum step approach. In 2016 the CSTC offered consultancy service through a customized training for the Local Government</p>		No. of participants			No. of Training	Civil Servant	Others	Total	2012	1,419	21	1,440	48	2013 (as of the end of September)	289	833	1,112	32	2014	2,063	57	2,120	32	2015	2,744	645	3,389	28	2016	3,601	299	3,900	28
	No. of participants			No. of Training																															
	Civil Servant	Others	Total																																
2012	1,419	21	1,440	48																															
2013 (as of the end of September)	289	833	1,112	32																															
2014	2,063	57	2,120	32																															
2015	2,744	645	3,389	28																															
2016	3,601	299	3,900	28																															

Service and carried out training needs assessment for the Ministry of Power and Petroleum.
 - CSTC was assisting Liberia to develop an abridged form of EL/QPI for training “Civil Service Staff at the Counties”. Unfortunately, this could not come on because of the Ebola crisis. However, some of the Ex-participants were assisted to develop training for their colleagues at the office for example the case of Ministry of Post.
 - In the case of Sierra Leone, CSTC started some discussions with the Sierra Leone Civil Service Training College for the latter to develop training courses. A delegation from the College visited CSTC in Ghana and agreements were reached to start the collaboration. Same as Liberia, the Ebola truncated to continuation of the plan.

Indicator 2: Sierra Leone and Liberia replicate EL/QPI training in their respective countries.

(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved

The number of EL/QPI training

	Sierra Leone		Liberia	
	No. of training	No. of staff trained	No. of training	No. of staff trained
2014	2	56	9	113
2015	5	104	6	87
2016	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

Source : JICA internal documents, questionnaire and interviews with CSTC, HRMO and CSA (through CSTC).

3 Efficiency

Although the project period was as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 103%). Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

There are established supports from the government’s policy direction with appropriate policy documents such as “the Ghana Public Service Human Resource Policy, (2014)” which emphasizes importance of human resource development and career management of civil servants. There is also governments’ directive on Scheme of Service Training to be incorporated into the promotional interviews of civil servants, an indication of CSTC’s invaluable contribution to the capacity building of Ghana’s civil servants and strategic position for human resource development in Ghana.

<Institutional Aspect>

Training section of CSTC is responsible for training, and each of the Administration, the Accounts, and the Audit supports the Training section. Thus, an appropriate organizational structure capable of sustaining the gains of the project is in place. The future prospects of the institution are positive with a process initiated for the development of three additional units, namely “the Curriculum and Research Unit”, “the Material Development Unit”, and “the Publicity and Communication Unit” to strengthen the training centre. As mentioned above (the indicator 1 of the project purpose), CSTC also has the adequate number of staff to deliver on its mandate.

<Technical Aspect>

To a large extent, CSTC has the required technical levels to sustain project effects in terms of basic skills, utilization and update of technical guidelines and EL/QPI training manuals. However, CSTC lack technical expertise in the development of content for specialised courses such as Public Service Delivery Improvement (PSDI) and the development of presentation materials for trainees. Considering the new direction of CSTC coupled with the over reliance on consultants even after the capacity development of staff under the project, additional capacity building for staff is required to enable them become subject matter experts in content development in order to reduce the over dependence on consultants.

<Financial Aspect>

The financial condition is not firmly secured. CSTC’s budget from the Government of Ghana³ has seen gradual reduction in the amount of money approved for its activities though its financial request has seen increased in the last three years. The Government of Ghana over the past few years have made financial cuts to public institutions including CSTC due to slowed economic growth. In order to improve better economic management, the government has taken steps that will see further cuts to institutions that have the potential of self-sustenance, as a result CSTC is likely to experience further budget cuts. Apart from JICA support, there are no other DPs’ supports as at yet. However, there is potential at CSTC for sustainability. CSTC continues to witness increase in participation in its Scheme of Service training courses with the directive from Government of Ghana for Scheme of Service training as a pre-requisite for promotion. Some of these public institutions have budget allocation for such trainings though not adequate. However, as mentioned above, HRMO and CSA do not have the required budget to embark on the training by themselves.

Budget of CSTC

(Unit: GHC)

	2014	2015	2016
Applied budget	1,047,646.00	1,395,764.00	1,567,134.00
Approved budget	798,860.00	727,245.86	674,221.00

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, though slight problems have been observed in terms of the technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency, such as lack of technical expertise and insufficient budget, there are opportunities to sustain the gains of the project. Therefore, the sustainability of the effects through the project is fair.

³ The budget includes tuition fee for participants. Participants only pay for meals, snacks and cost of utilities.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved its Project Purpose at the project completion, as indicators such as “increase in training resources”, “trainer’s performance”, “establishment of the training cycle management plan”, and “interests from host institutions of the participants” were achieved. The project effects have mostly continued after the project completion, and the Overall Goal was mostly achieved as the training cycle management plan introduced by the project have continued, and the number of participants in CSTC training increased. As for the sustainability, slight problems have been observed in terms of the technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency, such as lack of technical expertise and insufficient budget. However, no problem was observed in terms of the policy and institutional aspect. As for the efficiency, the project cost slightly exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- CSTC lack technical expertise in the development of content for specialised courses such as Public Service Delivery Improvement (PSDI) and the development of presentation materials for trainees. This had led to the over reliance on consultants, putting pressure on scarce resources of the institution. OHCS will need to identify champions such as Development Partners and dedicated staff within CSTC and invest in developing core technical and specialised expertise needed by CSTC.
- The Heads of HRMO and CSA need to re-engage Development Partners in funding discussion in order to get adequate support to fund its training activities for civil servants in Liberia and Sierra Leone since Ebola is now over.



Lead trainer delivery training on Public Service Improvement(PSDI)



Participants listening attentively to a presentation by the lead trainer