

Country Name	<b>Project for Tirana Thematic Urban Planning</b>
Republic of Albania	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	Along with democratization which started in 1991, urbanization had progressed in the capital city, Tirana, which had accommodated a rapid increase in migrants from rural and mountainous areas. In 2008, the population of Tirana reached 640,000, from 250,000 in 1989, or an increase of almost 270% in just nine years. Such an acute urbanization resulted in serious urban problems such as shortages in infrastructure. Many rural migrants illegally settled in the surrounding areas of the urban center or in protected green areas where no sufficient water and power supply systems are provided, and where solid waste was managed poorly, resulting in significant degradation of the urban environment. Urbanization was still in progress, and it was predicted that the city's population would reach one million by 2025. It was thus urgent for urban developments in the transportation, water/sewerage, and solid waste management sectors, in particular, to keep up with the burgeoning urban population.										
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Expected Goals to be achieved by Utilization of Proposed Plan: Infrastructure in Tirana is developed effectively and efficiently.</li> <li>Expected Utilization of Proposed Plan by the project: The thematic urban infrastructure plans ("Master Plan") developed by the project are adopted as Tirana's urban infrastructure development plans and Municipality of Tirana (MOT) implements action plans.</li> <li>Project Purpose: The thematic urban infrastructure plans (Master Plan) in Tirana are developed.</li> </ol>										
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site: Tirana Metropolitan Area</li> <li>Activities: (1) The study team reviews the current situation of urban development in Tirana, (2) The study team develops thematic urban plans for short-term (5 years) and medium term (10 years) for Road and urban transportation, Solid Waste Management, Water Supply System Development, and Sewage and Drainage system Development, (3) The study team selects priority projects (for short-term), (4) The study team formulates implementation plans for the priority projects, and (5) The study team formulates action plans for Tirana thematic urban planning</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Albanian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Members of mission: 12 persons</td> <td>1. Staff allocated: Participation in steering committee</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>2. Land and facility: Project office</td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>					Japanese Side	Albanian Side	1) Members of mission: 12 persons	1. Staff allocated: Participation in steering committee		2. Land and facility: Project office
Japanese Side	Albanian Side										
1) Members of mission: 12 persons	1. Staff allocated: Participation in steering committee										
	2. Land and facility: Project office										
Ex-Ante Evaluation	2010	Project Period	June 2011 - January 2013	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 210 million yen (actual) 203 million yen						
Executing Agency	Municipality of Tirana (MOT)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Value Planning International Inc., NJS Consultants Co., Ltd.										

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

1 Relevance
<p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of Albania at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion&gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with development policy of Albania both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, National Strategy for Development and Integration (NSDI) (2007-2013) aimed at achieving 6% economic growth and reduction of poverty ratio to less than 10%. The project was in line with NSDI as it contributes to economic growth and poverty reduction through effective infrastructure development in the capital of the country. At the time of project completion, NSDI II, which presents national vision for the social and economic development of Albania over the period 2015 to 2020, emphasizes "An efficient and integrated transport system that promotes the economic development and improves the life quality of the citizens", "Expansion and improvement of the quality of services of water supply and sewerage", "Increase of the effectiveness and efficiency of the water services in urban and rural areas", "Securing inclusive and strategic management for the Integrated Solid Waste Management", "Improvement of the general performance of the solid waste management until 2020" and "Improvement of the reporting system related to waste management".</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Needs of Albania at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion &gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with the needs for infrastructure development in Albania both at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, there were urgent needs for urban development in the capital city to keep up with the burgeoning urban population. At the time of project completion, demand for infrastructure development was high because of the population growth in association with expected territorial expansion of Tirana city<sup>1</sup>.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation&gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy. Infrastructure development is one of the priority areas under the Country Rolling Plan to Albania 2009.</p> <p>&lt;Evaluation Result&gt;</p> <p>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.</p>

<sup>1</sup> At the time of project development, Municipality of Tirana was smaller territory and Tirana Metropolitan Area included also territories, that in that time did not belong to Municipality. After territorial reform in 2015, the Tirana Municipality of today, includes all the Tirana Metropolitan Area.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

### <Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The project purpose was mostly achieved by the time of project completion because the draft Master Plan was developed and submitted to the Government of Albania by the end of the project period.

According to MOT, the planning and coordinating capacity of the Tirana municipal government personnel was enhanced by the technical transfer, especially in Transport and Mobility Department and Waste Management Department. Enhancement of planning and coordinating capacity for water supply and sewerage was limited mostly because Tirana Water Supply and Sewerage Company (UKT) was not included in the target of the technical transfer, although these sectors were covered by UKT, the local utility which was at the time a separate management entity from the Municipality (UKT was managed under the central government until 2012. Although decision to transfer UKT from the central government to the Municipality was made in 2010, MOT was reluctant to take over UKT's dividend due to the huge utility debt and non-clear status of UKT. It took 2 years before MOT became the main shareholder in 2012). Consequently, the technical transfer during the project period was not achieved at the expected level.

### <Status of the Expected Utilization of Proposed Plan by the project at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Master Plan is well utilized by MOT. MOT confirmed that the Master Plan has met their needs. The Master Plan is in consistency with policy and vision of MOT and this master plan development project is recognized as a base project to develop the Tirana city. General Regulatory Plan of Tirana Municipality was approved on December 26, 2016. The Master Plan which is in line with the new Regulatory Plan was adopted as Tirana's urban infrastructure development plan accordingly (delay was caused due to the change of the local government).

The biggest progress is observed in the road and urban transport sector where the following action plans under the Master Plan are under implementation: (1) Inner/Middle Ring Missing Links Development, (2) Dedicated Bus Lanes Development, (3) Removal of On-street Parking and Supply of Parking Facilities along with establishment of Parking Fee, and (4) The Outer Ring Road (North Section) is at the planning stage.

Most of the priority projects suggested in the master plan for solid waste management sector are still the priority of MOT and used as a base of the activities in waste management sector and are in preparation stage, The Illegal Dump Site Clean-up Project has been already in implementation in the peripheral area especially along the river banks of the Tirana River and upstream and downstream of the Lana River.

As for the water supply and sewerage and drainage system development, the Master Plan developed by the project is relevant with long-term vision and mission of UKT. They comply fully with the UKT objectives for continuing the service in the future for the Tirana region<sup>2</sup>. UKT has fulfilled to some extent the plans provided by the project such as reduction of non-revenue water as well as plan to introduce pipe mapping system, while the other action plans are the goal for the following years.

### <Status of Achievement for Expected Goals by utilization of the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

As the plans are still under planning except for a few that have been initiated, the expected goals set as 'Infrastructure in Tirana is developed effectively and efficiently' are yet to be achieved. However, the expected goals were not assessed as they are expected to be achieved in a medium- or long-term.

### <Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project, and no negative impacts on natural environment were observed.

### <Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the Master Plan for Tirana was developed so the project purpose was mostly achieved. The Master Plan was then authorized in 2016 and is judged to be utilized as the action plans are in progress at the time of ex-post evaluation to implement the Master Plan. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

## 3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 97%), the project period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 118%). Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

## 4 Sustainability

### <Policy Aspect>

There is established support from government's policy/system as referred in the Governmental Program 2013-2017 and NSDI II at the time of ex-post evaluation so that the effects achieved by the project continue after the project completion. Under the Government Program, the central government encourages the local governments to take over the leadership of land development by protecting natural, historical and agricultural areas and help them to forge public-private partnership to fund infrastructure and services and manage a proper distribution of the right to development.

### <Institutional Aspect>

The institutional set-up (Cross-functional Task Forces and others) proposed by the project is not adopted since MOT has just obtained approval of the Master Plan developed by the project to become part of Tirana's urban infrastructure development plan (December, 2016). As for the meetings with stakeholders, MOT has a practice to obtain advice from line ministries for major project and issues, and to make public consultations for projects that affect important industries for the city or considerable part of population.

Roles and responsibility of each directorate and demarcation among directorates in MOT is clear. The number of staff is not sufficient to implement the action plans established by the Master Plan due to the budget constraint.

### <Technical Aspect>

According to the Transport and Mobility Department's opinion, its staff have enough capacity to undertake its duties to plan and implement the priority projects. Part of ex-staff members of the JICA study team of this project is working at leadership positions in the department, which assures its sufficient capacities to undertake its duties and responsibilities for planning and implementing priority projects. The opinion of the Solid Waste Management Department and UKT is that they need more capacity enhancement to undertake its duties to plan and implement the priority projects.

<sup>2</sup> Tirana Region is consisted of 4 Municipalities including Tirana.

#### <Financial Aspect>

MOT has partially secured the budget to implement the action plans. The biggest improvement is in urban road and transport sector where most of the projects have been financed from the MOT's budget. The other action plans in solid waste management sector and water supply and sewerage and drainage system have a budget issue to implement the action plans but they are finding the financial support from other available sources and donors including support from Verona municipality under MOU, and loan from Government of Italy. In addition, MOT's budget has been increasing, which is a positive tendency for the future priority project implementation. The Municipal Council approved in March 2016 the new scheme of local taxes and fees and their way of collection, which is expected to give a considerable improvement on the budget of Municipality, which can then enable MOT to finance some of priority projects.

UKT, a self-sustaining company, realizes revenue to cover the operation and maintenance cost. The need for investment is enormous, so UKT receives contribution from State Budget and other development partners.

#### <Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project purpose was mostly achieved as the Master Plan was developed, and it was submitted to the Albania government when the project was completed. The Master Plan is well utilized as the Master Plan was adopted as Tirana's urban infrastructure development plan in 2016 and its action plans are in progress for its implementation. As for sustainability, there are some challenges in institutional, technical and financial aspects. For efficiency, the project period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations to Executing Agency:

1. Municipality of Tirana is advised to follow the recommendation by the project to establish the Cross-functional Task Forces as well as Technical Advisory Groups and Steering Committee that should be in charge for the preparation of the implementation plan of the projects proposed in the Master Plan.
2. Municipality of Tirana is advised to constantly pursue/offer the training opportunities for its staff in the respective departments for their capacity enhancement.

#### Lessons learned for JICA:

1. It took long for the Master Plan to be adopted as Tirana's urban infrastructure development plan due to change of local government. JICA could have obtained a commitment by the executing agency to adopt the Master Plan as a Tirana's urban infrastructure development plan by signing the agreement document with JICA. Signing of the agreement before the completion of master plan development project is expected to facilitate the approval process faster and prevent delay in planning and implementation of action plans.
2. Coordination among UKT and MOT was lacking during the implementation phase of the project, which was caused by unsolved management issues of UKT. MOT was reluctant to show ownership of the activities designed for UKT for 2 years (from 2010 to 2012), which overlaps with the project implementation, and the vision for the utility management was not in line with the plans and visions of the MOT during that period. JICA could have carefully considered complicated circumstances and issues that occurred in the management of UKT in the planning and implementation stage and could have proposed countermeasure to foster the coordination among UKT and MOT.



Dedicated Bus and Bicycle Lanes at the Dritan Hoxha Street



Newly Constructed Parking Facility in Tirana