

## Summary of Terminal Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project	
Country : Tunisia	Project title : The Project for Co-Management of Coastal Fisheries in the Gulf of Gabes
Issue/Sector : Fishery	Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation
Division in charge : Rural Development Department	Total cost : about 440,000,000 Yen
Period of Cooperation	Cooperation period: October 2012 – October 2016
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : General Directorate of Fisheries and Aquaculture (DGPA), Ministry of Agriculture, Hydraulic Resources and Fishery Supporting Organization in Japan : OAFIC Co., Ltd
<p>1. Background of the Project</p> <p>Coastal waters of southern Tunisia, especially in the Gulf of Gabes, are known not only as good fishing grounds but also as important nursery grounds of fishery resources. However, overfishing and destruction of seagrass bed have been caused by illegal fishing, and consequently catch of fish has dramatically decreased in the region recently. Livelihoods of some 33,000 fishers and those who engage in related industries are threatened by the rapid decrease of capture production particularly in the Gulf of Gabes.</p> <p>In order to address these problems, the Tunisian government and JICA jointly implemented "The Project for Sustainable Management of Coastal Fisheries Resources in the Republic of Tunisia" from 2005 to 2010 to promote participatory management of fishing grounds for the sustainable use of fishery resources so that the fishers' livelihoods are sustained and stabilized.</p> <p>Based on the results of the project, coastal communities voluntarily continue their efforts to manage fishery resources by applying management measures developed by the project including installation of artificial reefs.</p> <p>However, local authorities concerned have experienced some difficulties to improve the effectiveness of fishery resource management and extend it to wider areas. Further efforts are still needed to put effective fisheries management in place in the entire area of the Gulf of Gabes. Therefore, the Tunisian government requested the assistance for sustainable fishery resource management in the Gulf of Gabes to Japan and the Project activities started in October, 2012 for four year's project duration.</p> <p>2. Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">The practice of co-management of coastal fishery resources is extended throughout the Gulf of Gabes.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">Co-management of coastal fishery resources is practiced in the target areas of the Gulf of Gabes</p> <p>(3) Outputs</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">Capacity of stakeholders to implement fisheries co-management is enhanced.</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">Coastal fishery resource management plan (CFRMP) is formulated based on the information on fishery resources/eco-system, fishing operation and socio-economic aspects of the coastal communities.</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">The viability of CFRMP is verified in the Target Areas</p> <p>(4) Inputs (as of the Terminal Evaluation)</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">Japanese side :</p>	

- 1) Experts 84.5MM
- 2) Persons who participated in trainings in Japan: 24 persons (including the group training participants)
- 3) Persons who participated in trainings in Senegal: 15 persons
- 4) Equipment
  - Underwater camera, GIS software, Automobiles, etc.
  - Tunisian Side :
- 1) Counterparts:
- 2) Facility/Equipment:
  - The Project office for the Japanese experts at INSTM Gabes, 150 artificial reefs to Target area
- 3) Local cost for daily local activities:
  - Cost of transportation for the counterparts and logistics arrangements

## II. Evaluation Team

	Name	Title	Position and Organization
Members of Evaluation Team	Mr. Osamu Tanaka	Leader	Advisor, Team 2, Agricultural and Rural Development Group 1, Rural Development Department, JICA
	Mr. Kentaro Katano	Cooperation Planning	Team 2, Agricultural and Rural Development Group 1, Rural Development Department, JICA
	Mr. Jun Totsukawa	Evaluation Analysis	Director, Sano Planning Co., Ltd
Period of Evaluation	5/April/2016-29/April/2016		Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

## III. Results of Evaluation

### 3-1 Accomplishment of the Project

#### 3-1-1 Achievement of the Outputs

Output 1 : Capacity development of counterparts on co-management of coastal fisheries

Output 1 is almost achieved as of the Terminal Evaluation.

The counterparts have participated in the Project activities from the initial stage such as selection of the pilot sites on the basis of the baseline survey until the implementation and the monitoring stage of CFRMP. The necessary steps for CFRMP development were reconfirmed in the elaboration process of "Implementation guideline" as well.

In spite of these positive achievements, official coordination meeting bodies for coastal fishery resource management have not been created yet.

#### Output 2: Formulation of CFRMP

Output 2 is achieved as of the Terminal Evaluation.

CFRMP for each site was formulated through effective use of GIS, registered fishing boats/owners database, and other various studies results including socio-economic aspects.

#### Output 3: Verification of the viability of CFRMP

Output 3 is almost achieved as of the Terminal Evaluation.

After implementation of CFRMP for a certain period, fishery communities confirmed its effectiveness and already experienced their revision works on the basis of internal evaluation of CFRMP. Monitoring of

the compliance status of CFRMP is also evaluated it well functioning.

Only the official status of the extension strategies is remained to be settled by the end of the Project.

### 3-1-2 Achievement of the Project Purpose

The Project purpose is likely to be achieved during the Project period.

Through dozens of meetings/workshops by participatory approach philosophy, the Project almost satisfactorily elaborated CFRMP at all the seven sites and completed one turn of its PDCA cycle at the four pilot sites. It is also confirmed that the ratio of CFRMP participating boats/boat owners exceeded 50% at each site, whose high ratio can endorse the plan's effectiveness.

Overall, it is evaluated that co-management of coastal fishery resources is well practiced.

### 3-2 Summary of Evaluation

\* Five categories are evaluated by five ranks: high, relatively high, moderate, relatively lower, and low.

#### 3-2-1 Relevance: High

The Strategic goals of the Ministry of Agriculture, Hydraulic Resources and Fishery 2015 set a vision for the development of the fishery sector which is to declare "rational exploitation of fisheries". In this framework, installation of artificial reefs, and coastal fisheries with the concept of participatory approach are particularly paid attention. The Project's contents meet with such policies' direction and technical needs of the counterpart organizations. In this line, the relevance of the Project is evaluated high.

#### 3-2-2 Effectiveness: Relatively high

The Project purpose, which is to "practice co-management of coastal fishery resources", has been progressing almost steadily until the Terminal Evaluation. Although some delays in completion of CFRMP are observed due to difficult time on several petition issues between the government and fishery communities, all the seven sites have already reached signs of CFRMP and started their operation as of the Terminal Evaluation.

On the other hand, the setup of the coordination body on CFRMP at the central/regional levels is still remained as the next tackling issue.

#### 3-2-3 Efficiency: Relatively high

Manpower and material inputs are evaluated appropriate, and they have been contributing to achievement of the Project's outputs and purpose. The trainings in Japan and Senegal were also effective events for the counterparts' capacity development. However, the schedule of the Project activities were sometimes paused and/or changed because unexpected events such as demos, strong negotiations/petitions with government by fisheries communities made it difficult to conduct meetings and/or workshops at the target sites.

#### 3-2-4 Impact: Relatively high

Many fishers confirmed the increase in their income, the catch of fish and the number of fish species at the CFRMP sites, comparing with before the Project implementation. They believe that these have been realized by installation of the artificial reefs and other management measures in the CFRMP framework. As to the Overall goal, it is evaluated possible to be achieved, though, the timing of its achievement may be after the target period.

Overall, the Impact is evaluated relatively high in this line.

#### 3-2-5 Sustainability: Moderate

##### (1) Policy aspect

The Tunisian national policy, the Economic and Social Program 2012-2016, and the sectoral strategic

policy such as the strategic goals of the Ministry of Agriculture, Hydraulic Resources and Fishery place the importance on sustainable management of fishery resources by citizen participation concept. It can be judged that the government would keep the basic direction of the policy.

(2) Legal/regulation aspect

Effectuation of CFRMP, the Implementation guidelines and extension strategies is one of the challenging factors to promote CFRMP extension. As long as CFRMP does not have enforcement power of the rules to external fishers from the corresponding communities and/or official authorization, it may make fishers to lessen interests in developing and retaining CFRMP.

(3) Organizational and technical aspect

In order to continue proper monitoring of existing CFRMPs and to extend CFRMP development, collaborative works by all the stakeholders are required in the same manner as practiced in the Project. The counterparts have accumulated necessary experiences regarding CFRMP formulation. Judging from the actual performances of the counterparts at these phases, technical sustainability is confirmed.

From the viewpoint of organizational aspect, the issue of available manpower is raised as one of challenging issues in particular of technical extension for fishers. The venues for technical instructions are not at the field but at CFPP basically because of the limited number of extension officers and their transportation availability.

(4) Financial aspect

The largest portion of the necessary budget for CFRMP is installation of artificial reefs. In this connection, the Tunisian government has already started the National Program for Artificial Reef 2016-2020, which targets the Gulf of Gabes. The program secured 2 million DT for 2016, and is preparing the budget application as 3 million DT for the next year, 2017. This budget arrangement effort would strongly endorse the sustainability of the CFRMP extension actions. Although the launch of the National Program for Artificial Reef 2016-2020 is highly evaluated, the current budget scale is still insufficient to cover all the necessary locations at the Gulf of Gabes.

### 3-3 Contribution factors

(1) Participatory approach philosophy to fishing communities

The Project introduced the participatory approach philosophy in the development process of CFRMP. Owing to this elaborate decision process by the participatory approach, all the CFRMPs have been supported by the majority of fishers in their communities, and followed without creating rule-breakers until the Terminal Evaluation.

(2) Public relation activities

The Project actively and effectively utilized various public relation tools. The public relations contributed to welcoming more participants in CFRMP; to produce impacts such as technical transmission to another community out of the target area by social media; then, to plant self-consciousness and/or responsibility mind in fishing communities on their CFRMP.

(3) Inputs by Tunisian side

The Tunisian side provided 150 sets of the artificial reefs to the Project's target areas, Skhira, Ghanouch and Zarzis, which promoted to formulate CFRMP at these sites.

(4) Training in relation to co-management in Japan

The Project utilized two types of training in Japan on the co-management of costal fishery resources. The

variety of training contents contributed to deepening the counterparts' knowledge of co-management of coastal fisheries.

### 3-4 Inhibition factors

#### (1) Transition period of local communities

Within the transition period of local people's mindset after the Tunisian revolution, the Project has sometimes faced difficulties to access the communities. There were local people's frequent and strong petitions to the government. The situation sometimes accelerated up to a certain scale of demo and/or rejection of further communication with government officials. The schedule of the Project activities was influenced by these events.

#### (2) Suspension of Japanese experts' dispatch

Due to the security concerns in relation with national elections, the Japanese experts' dispatch was paused in the third year of the Project period. It affected the following time line of CFRMP establishment.

### 3-5 Conclusion

The Project purpose and outputs are likely to be achieved by the end of the cooperation period. The remarkable achievements are particularly following; 1) CFRMP has been created; 2) Relevant techniques for co-management of coastal fishery resources in line with the CFRMP have been introduced in practice in pilot sites; and 3) Capacity of the stakeholders has been improved.

However, in order for sustainability, there are remaining tasks to be undertaken toward the end of the cooperation period, which especially include ensuring coordination mechanisms and effectiveness of the CFRMP, the implementation guidelines and the extension strategies at the central and regional levels. These will further help the rest of the Gulf of Gabes and the other parts of the entire coastline adopt the co-management of coastal fishery resources.

### 3-6 Recommendations

#### 3-6-1 Until the end of cooperation period

##### (1) Effectuation of CFRMP, Implementation guidelines and Extension strategies

The CFRMP, Implementation guidelines and Extension strategies have been approved by the JCC. Taking into account necessity of coherency with the existing laws and regulations in Tunisia, it is recommended that the Tunisian government consider possible ways to put them into effect within the Tunisian legal framework.

##### (2) Ensuring coordination functions for coastal fishery resource management

For the promotion of co-management of fisheries resources, it is important to ensure the function of mechanisms on coastal fishery resource management both at the central and regional levels. It does not mean establishing new bodies for coordination but it should suffice if the government makes it clear that any of the existing councils, committees or other entities takes the responsibility for the coordination.

##### (3) Effective public relations

For dissemination of the idea of the co-management of coastal fishery resources, the Team recommends that the Regional Committee of Agricultural Development, CRDA, and the Professional Fishers Training Center, CFPP, continue taking the initiative to do these public relations activities.

##### (4) Ensuring self-reliance and sustainability

As the cooperation period is to be expired in five months, special considerations for financial, operational

and mental self-reliance should be paid for the sake of sustainable co-management of coastal fishery resources.

### 3-6-2 After the end of cooperation period

#### (1) Sense of participatory approach to be depended even further

The participatory approach is the basis of co-management of coastal fishery resource management. Upon planning any activities for CFRMP, both of all the levels of the government and communities should share common goals and responsibility for achieving the goals. For that, they need to keep and strengthen further co-working, close communication and mutual respect.

#### (2) Ensuring continued execution of CFRMP

While the Team emphasizes the need for ensuring the central and regional coordination functions, it recommends that CRDA be playing a core role to implement the CFRMP. This is necessary to ensure continuation of actual activities to maintain and extend activities on CFRMP and therefore CRDA should be clearly mandated to take the leading role.

#### (3) Exchange between communities to spread good practices

Sharing good practices among fisheries communities is considered effective to promote expansion of CFRMP. In this regard, CRDA and CFPP are expected to facilitate the exchange.

#### (4) Sufficient human resources to be allocated

The shortage of manpower at the regional and local is serious, especially at the CFPPs. Gradual but steady personnel reinforcement of the CFPPs is necessary.

#### (5) Countermeasures against illegal fishing to be strengthened

Illegal fishing is the most serious problem and countermeasures against them are accordingly a pressing need of the coastal fishers in the Gulf of Gabes. Effective governmental countermeasures against illegal fishing are a prerequisite to co-management and therefore that particularly implementation of the National Program for Artificial Reef 2016-2020 is absolutely essential for further expansion of CFRMP.

#### (6) Supporting all forms of professional organizations in strengthening the technical and financial capacities

In order to smoothly promote co-management activities of fishers through professional organizations, their financial basis should be strengthened. For that, in the mid/long-term, it is desirable that the government considers reinforcing technical capacities of professional organizations and reviews the legal framework to allow them to do wider profitable activities.