

Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

conducted by Niger Office: August, 2018

| | |
|-------------------|--|
| Country Name | Support to the Improvement of School Management through Community Participation (“School for All”) Phase II (Appui à L’Amelioration de la Gestion des Etablissements Scolaires à travers la Participation Communautaire (Ecole Pour Tous) Phase II) |
| Republic of Niger | |

I. Project Outline

| | | | | | |
|---|--|--------------|---|---|--|
| Background | <p>Niger aimed at improvement of the gross enrollment rate of primary education from 41.7% in 2002 to 94% in 2012 under “the 10-year Educational Development Plan (Plan Décennal de Développement de l’Education: PDDE)” (2003-2012). The one of the pillars of PDDE was a decentralization policy which main framework was transfer of school management to the School Management Committee (Comité de Gestion des Etablissements Scolaires: COGES), which is composed of the school principal, a representative of teachers, a representative of parents and a representative of mothers. The policy places local people and communities as key actors in school management and delegates them responsibilities of school management including planning, operation, management of teachers as well as awareness rising of parents. However, at the beginning, COGES was not functioning due to the lack of implementation plan for embodying the policy. Under such situation, since 2004, JICA implemented “the Project on Support to the Improvement of School Management through Community Participation (“School for All”) Phase I” (hereafter referred to as Phase I) in the country, in particular in Tahoua region. Although the school management model to promote the community participation was established by the Phase I, there were remaining issues, such as capacity enhancement of education officers at local level and establishment of more efficient monitoring system to be implemented by the Ministry of National Education sustainably, in order to disseminate the model nationwide. On the other hand, among the school improvement activities conducted by community residents simultaneously in the Phase I, some cases of the school improvement activities towards attaining the educational development goals by the Ministry of National Education were observed and their effects were verified. Therefore, in the Phase II, it was expected to compile good practices of educational development by community participation using functional COGES and to establish a model of education improvement activities by community.</p> | | | | |
| Objectives of the Project | <p>Through trainings on COGES for officers at national level and local level as well as school officials, establishment of monitoring system on COGESs organized, implementation of monitoring, holding of workshops for experience sharing on the monitoring, and sharing experiences for establishing a model of education improvement activities by COGES in the pilot areas (Tahoua region and Zinder region), the project aimed at reinforcing capacity of government officers, school directors, teachers and local people for dissemination of functional COGES nationwide, thereby contributing to improvement of quality and access to basic education by the COGES model.</p> <p>*By the Ministry Order dated February 22, 2012, COGES was renamed as the Decentralized School Management Committee (Comité de Gestion Décentralisée des Etablissements Scolaires : CGDES), this ex-post evaluation uses CGDES for descriptions about situations since 2012.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: The quality of and the access to basic education are improved by school management through community participation. Project Purpose: Structure to establish and sustain COGES is reinforced to make COGES effective nationwide. | | | | |
| Activities of the Project | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: 8 regions in Niger (Niamey, Tillaberi, Dosso, Maradi, Agadez, Diffa, Tahoua, Zinder) Main Activities: 1) Trainings for COGES supervisors and officers on trainers’ training, COGES establishment and training planning, 2) Establishment of monitoring system on COGES and conducting monitoring, 3) Implementation of school improvement activities at pilot schools in the target regions and organizing of seminars for sharing experiences Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;"> <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 13 persons Trainees Received: 4 persons Equipment: vehicles, motorbikes, etc. Local cost: cost for training and manual development </td> <td style="width: 50%;"> <p>Niger Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Allocated: 12 persons Land and facility: project office in the Ministry of National Education Local cost: cost for trainings </td> </tr> </table> | | | <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 13 persons Trainees Received: 4 persons Equipment: vehicles, motorbikes, etc. Local cost: cost for training and manual development | <p>Niger Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Allocated: 12 persons Land and facility: project office in the Ministry of National Education Local cost: cost for trainings |
| <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 13 persons Trainees Received: 4 persons Equipment: vehicles, motorbikes, etc. Local cost: cost for training and manual development | <p>Niger Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Allocated: 12 persons Land and facility: project office in the Ministry of National Education Local cost: cost for trainings | | | | |
| Project Period | August 2007 – January 2012 (Extension: August 2010 – January 2012) | Project Cost | (ex-ante) 360 million yen, (actual) 553 million yen | | |
| Implementing Agency | Ministry of National Education (MEN) | | | | |
| Cooperation Agency in Japan | None | | | | |

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Niger at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with Niger's development policies of "PDDE" (2003-2012) prioritizing to improve the gross enrollment rate of primary education from 41.7% in 2002 to 94% in 2012 and the enrollment rate of preschool education to 5% by 2013 through decentralization to delegate responsibility of school management to COGES. The policy priorities were confirmed at the time of ex-ante evaluation and at the time of project completion.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Niger at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with the Niger development needs to establish sustainable and efficient monitoring system in MEN and capacity building of local educational officers for disseminating COGES nationwide, improvement of school management based on local needs, implementation of pre-school education through establishment and operation of kindergartens.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy for Niger¹ focusing on assistance to contribute to improvement of poverty status of the people in Niger through supports including "Basic Human Needs" along with the implementation process in the "Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper" (2002), and prioritizing education, health care, water supply and community development.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the project completion. As of February 2009, 97.1% of the total number of primary schools in Agadez, Diffa, Dosso, Maradi, Niamey, Tillaberi, Tahoua and Zinder regions (6,577 schools) established their COGES through democratic elections and submitted the minutes on the establishment (Indicator 1). In terms of school action plans, 93.2% (11,175 COGES) of the total number of COGES in 2009/10 submitted the plans to their respective communal federations of COGES (FCC), and 89% (11,795 COGES) of them in 2010/11 did (Indicator 2). For the annual reports, 82.8% (9,930 COGES) of all COGES in 2009/10 submitted the reports to their FCC, and 93.5% (12,426 COGES) of them in 2010/11 did (Indicator 3).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been continued since the project completion. As of 2015/16 after the project completion, in all the target regions, CGDES was established through democratic elections in each primary school in all the target regions except Diffa region while the total number of primary schools has increased by increase in the number of newly constructed primary schools. It was confirmed by the fact that 23 CGDES surveyed by the ex-post evaluation were established through democratic elections and sustained. As of 2016/17, 89.8% (16,758 CGDES) of all the CGDES submitted their school action plans to their FCC. Also, the annual reports were submitted by 89.1% of the total CGDES in 2012/13 and 82.9% in 2016/17 to FCC. In addition, since the project completion, the monitoring system established by the project has been continuously functioning from the central level to the commune level. Furthermore, in Tahoua and Zinder regions, the community pre-schools have been continued by CDGES as a model case to meet the needs of pre-school education including increase in primary enrollment. In other regions, the community pre-schools have been sustained by CGDES. As the government has integrated the community pre-schools into public pre-schools, the number of the existing community pre-schools in the 2 pilot regions surveyed by the ex-post evaluation has been decreasing. On the other hand, the proportion of the community pre-schools in the total number of pre-schools in Niger has sustained at more than 20% since the project completion in despite of a decrease to 19.2% in 2016 because the number of public pre-school has not increased.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was mostly achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. The enrollment rate and the completion rate of 2015/16 in all regions in the country increased from the ones in the year of project completion. Also, all the regions except Diffa region have lower repetition rate in 2015/16 compared to the ones in 2013/14. It can be reasonably assumed that CGDES activities, including newly construction of thatch-roofed classrooms, monitoring of attendance of teachers and students, and introduction of remedial classes and night studies, have contributed to these improvements. However, while the dropout rate decreased in 4 out of the 8 regions, it increased on the 4 regions of Diffa, Dosso, Niamey and Tahoua because the students faced difficulties to continue their school attendance due to security deterioration, migration of local residents, and unsolved poverty issues.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts were observed at the time of ex-post evaluation. Since the representatives of mothers' association have been always affiliated with CGDES, women enable to participate in decision making on school management. Also, educational environment for girls have been established because of campaign activities for promoting girls' enrollment sponsored by CGDES. As a result, the gross entering rate for girls² increased from 62.3% in 2012 to 70.2% in 2016. Apart from this impact, the following other positive impacts were observed: establishment of steering committee for daily life areas including health, water and environment, establishment of CGDESs at a secondary school level and dissemination of the community pre-school in all the regions except Tahoua and Zinder. There was no negative impact observed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, through the project, the Project Purpose was achieved, the project effects have been continued, and the Overall Goal was mostly achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

| Aim | Indicators | Results |
|---|---|---|
| (Project Purpose) Structure to establish and | (Indicator 1) 80% of the COGES have been established | Status of the Achievement: Achieved (continued) (Project Completion) |

¹ This is based on the statement in Ministry of Foreign Affairs "Japan's ODA Data (2007)"

² Gross entering rate: the proportion of the number of children entering in primary school out of the total number of children of official age for entering primary school (6-7 years of age)

| sustain COGES is reinforced to make COGES effective nationwide. | through democratic elections. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> February of 2009: 97.1% of the total number of primary schools in Agadez, Diffa, Dosso, Maradi, Niamey Tillaberi, Tahoua and Zinder regions, established their COGES through democratic elections and submitted the minutes on the establishment. (Ex-post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The 23 CGDES, which were surveyed by the ex-post evaluation, were sustained. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--------|------|------|------|------|-------|-------|------|------|------|------|-------|-------|------|------|------|------|--------|--------|------|------|------|------|--------|--------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-----------|-----------|------|------|------|------|--------|--------|------|------|------|------|--------|--------|------|------|------|------|------|
| | (Indicator 2) 90% of the COGES have submitted school action plans to their respective communal federations of COGES | Status of the Achievement: Achieved (continued) (Project Completion) The proportion of COGESs, which submitted their school actions plans to their FCC, was as follow: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2009/10: 93.2% of COGESs submitted. 2010/11: 89% of COGESs submitted. (Ex-post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2016/17: 89.8% of CGDESs submitted their school action plans to their respective communal federations of CGDES. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | (Indicator 3) 80% of the COGES have submitted annual reports to their respective communal federations of COGES | Status of the Achievement: Achieved (continued) (Project Completion) The proportion of COGES which submitted the annual reports to the FCC was as follow: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2009/10: 82.8% submitted. 2010/11: 93.5% submitted (Ex-post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2016/17: 82.9% of the CGDESs submitted annual reports to their respective communal federations of CGDES. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| (Overall Goal) The quality of and the access to basic education are improved by school management through community participation. | (Indicator 1) Changes in enrollment rate ³ | (Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In all the regions, the enrollment rate was higher in 2015/16 than in the project completion year 2011/12. <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Region \ Year</th> <th>2011/12</th> <th>2012/13</th> <th>2013/14</th> <th>2014/15</th> <th>2015/16</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Agadez</td> <td>81.1</td> <td>83.6</td> <td>77.9</td> <td>88.5</td> <td>99.2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Diffa</td> <td>46.2</td> <td>50.6</td> <td>49.3</td> <td>48.5</td> <td>62.3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Disso</td> <td>80</td> <td>83.2</td> <td>84.1</td> <td>86.5</td> <td>85.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Maradi</td> <td>71.2</td> <td>74.7</td> <td>75.4</td> <td>78.5</td> <td>80</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Niamey</td> <td>122.5</td> <td>126.7</td> <td>132.9</td> <td>136.5</td> <td>139.4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tillaberi</td> <td>69.4</td> <td>72.8</td> <td>73.2</td> <td>75.2</td> <td>76.7</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tahoua</td> <td>62.2</td> <td>63.3</td> <td>63.8</td> <td>67.4</td> <td>68.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Zinder</td> <td>54.4</td> <td>55.5</td> <td>56.2</td> <td>56.3</td> <td>59.1</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | Region \ Year | 2011/12 | 2012/13 | 2013/14 | 2014/15 | 2015/16 | Agadez | 81.1 | 83.6 | 77.9 | 88.5 | 99.2 | Diffa | 46.2 | 50.6 | 49.3 | 48.5 | 62.3 | Disso | 80 | 83.2 | 84.1 | 86.5 | 85.1 | Maradi | 71.2 | 74.7 | 75.4 | 78.5 | 80 | Niamey | 122.5 | 126.7 | 132.9 | 136.5 | 139.4 | Tillaberi | 69.4 | 72.8 | 73.2 | 75.2 | 76.7 | Tahoua | 62.2 | 63.3 | 63.8 | 67.4 | 68.1 | Zinder | 54.4 | 55.5 | 56.2 | 56.3 | 59.1 |
| | Region \ Year | 2011/12 | 2012/13 | 2013/14 | 2014/15 | 2015/16 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Agadez | 81.1 | 83.6 | 77.9 | 88.5 | 99.2 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Diffa | 46.2 | 50.6 | 49.3 | 48.5 | 62.3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Disso | 80 | 83.2 | 84.1 | 86.5 | 85.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Maradi | 71.2 | 74.7 | 75.4 | 78.5 | 80 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Niamey | 122.5 | 126.7 | 132.9 | 136.5 | 139.4 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tillaberi | 69.4 | 72.8 | 73.2 | 75.2 | 76.7 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tahoua | 62.2 | 63.3 | 63.8 | 67.4 | 68.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Zinder | 54.4 | 55.5 | 56.2 | 56.3 | 59.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| (Indicator 2) Changes in completion rate ⁴ | (Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In all the regions, the completion rate regions was higher in 2015/16 than in the project completion year (2011/12). <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Region \ Year</th> <th>2011/12</th> <th>2012/13</th> <th>2013/14</th> <th>2014/15</th> <th>2015/16</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Agadez</td> <td>52.2</td> <td>62.1</td> <td>58.2</td> <td>68.1</td> <td>91.3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Diffa</td> <td>29.9</td> <td>37.4</td> <td>40.2</td> <td>47.6</td> <td>57.6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Disso</td> <td>66.5</td> <td>61.2</td> <td>73.9</td> <td>89.9</td> <td>92.3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Maradi</td> <td>54.3</td> <td>54.5</td> <td>71.4</td> <td>88.5</td> <td>97</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Niamey</td> <td>94.4</td> <td>93.6</td> <td>97.9</td> <td>110.3</td> <td>115.6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tillaberi</td> <td>43.2</td> <td>43.7</td> <td>52.3</td> <td>68.3</td> <td>71.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tahoua</td> <td>40.1</td> <td>50.7</td> <td>66.6</td> <td>70.4</td> <td>73.2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Zinder</td> <td>37.1</td> <td>38</td> <td>45.5</td> <td>52.9</td> <td>54.3</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | Region \ Year | 2011/12 | 2012/13 | 2013/14 | 2014/15 | 2015/16 | Agadez | 52.2 | 62.1 | 58.2 | 68.1 | 91.3 | Diffa | 29.9 | 37.4 | 40.2 | 47.6 | 57.6 | Disso | 66.5 | 61.2 | 73.9 | 89.9 | 92.3 | Maradi | 54.3 | 54.5 | 71.4 | 88.5 | 97 | Niamey | 94.4 | 93.6 | 97.9 | 110.3 | 115.6 | Tillaberi | 43.2 | 43.7 | 52.3 | 68.3 | 71.1 | Tahoua | 40.1 | 50.7 | 66.6 | 70.4 | 73.2 | Zinder | 37.1 | 38 | 45.5 | 52.9 | 54.3 | |
| Region \ Year | 2011/12 | 2012/13 | 2013/14 | 2014/15 | 2015/16 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Agadez | 52.2 | 62.1 | 58.2 | 68.1 | 91.3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Diffa | 29.9 | 37.4 | 40.2 | 47.6 | 57.6 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Disso | 66.5 | 61.2 | 73.9 | 89.9 | 92.3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Maradi | 54.3 | 54.5 | 71.4 | 88.5 | 97 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Niamey | 94.4 | 93.6 | 97.9 | 110.3 | 115.6 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tillaberi | 43.2 | 43.7 | 52.3 | 68.3 | 71.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tahoua | 40.1 | 50.7 | 66.6 | 70.4 | 73.2 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Zinder | 37.1 | 38 | 45.5 | 52.9 | 54.3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| (Indicator 3) Changes in repetition rate ⁵ | (Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In 7 regions except Diffa region, the repetition rate was lower in 2015/16 than in 2013/14. <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Region \ Year</th> <th>2011/12</th> <th>2012/13</th> <th>2013/14</th> <th>2014/15</th> <th>2015/16</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Agadez</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>7.8</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Diffa</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>1.9</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>2.2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Disso</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>2.9</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>2.2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Maradi</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>3.9</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>2.3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Niamey</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>7.5</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>3.9</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tillaberi</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>3.1</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>2.7</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tahoua</td> <td>3.53</td> <td>2.33</td> <td>3.2</td> <td>2.35</td> <td>2.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Zinder</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>4.9</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>3.3</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: The repetition rates are not available in educational statistical yearbook but are available in booklets of “Focus of Primary Education and Literacy Education” which has been published on ad hoc basis. Therefore, the data are available for the limited school years. For Tahoua, the data were provided by</p> | Region \ Year | 2011/12 | 2012/13 | 2013/14 | 2014/15 | 2015/16 | Agadez | N/A | N/A | 7.8 | N/A | 4 | Diffa | N/A | N/A | 1.9 | N/A | 2.2 | Disso | N/A | N/A | 2.9 | N/A | 2.2 | Maradi | N/A | N/A | 3.9 | N/A | 2.3 | Niamey | N/A | N/A | 7.5 | N/A | 3.9 | Tillaberi | N/A | N/A | 3.1 | N/A | 2.7 | Tahoua | 3.53 | 2.33 | 3.2 | 2.35 | 2.1 | Zinder | N/A | N/A | 4.9 | N/A | 3.3 | |
| Region \ Year | 2011/12 | 2012/13 | 2013/14 | 2014/15 | 2015/16 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Agadez | N/A | N/A | 7.8 | N/A | 4 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Diffa | N/A | N/A | 1.9 | N/A | 2.2 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Disso | N/A | N/A | 2.9 | N/A | 2.2 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Maradi | N/A | N/A | 3.9 | N/A | 2.3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Niamey | N/A | N/A | 7.5 | N/A | 3.9 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tillaberi | N/A | N/A | 3.1 | N/A | 2.7 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tahoua | 3.53 | 2.33 | 3.2 | 2.35 | 2.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Zinder | N/A | N/A | 4.9 | N/A | 3.3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

³ Gross enrollment rate (the proportion of the number of children enrolled in primary school out of the total number of children of official primary school age). The rate can be more than 100% because of the children over official primary school age enrolled in primary school.

⁴ The proportion of the number of children completing primary school out of the total number of children to be expected to complete primary school in the relevant school year (who will graduate from primary school after six years since entering). The rate can be more than 100% because of the children enrolled in primary school for more than 6 years for reasons such as repetition.

⁵ The proportion of the number of children repeating the same grade out of the total number of children to advance the next grade in the relevant school years.

| (Indicator 4) Changes in dropout rate ⁶ | <p>the provincial office.</p> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The dropout rate in the 4 regions out of all 8 regions was lower in 2015/16 than that of 2013/14. <table border="1" data-bbox="774 159 1173 414"> <thead> <tr> <th>Region \ Year</th> <th>2013/14</th> <th>2015/16</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Agadez</td> <td>18.3</td> <td>8</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Diffa</td> <td>17.6</td> <td>19.8</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Disso</td> <td>11.1</td> <td>13.9</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Maradi</td> <td>13.5</td> <td>11.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Niamey</td> <td>4.1</td> <td>5.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tillaberi</td> <td>13.4</td> <td>13.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tahoua</td> <td>13.8</td> <td>15.4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Zinder</td> <td>16.4</td> <td>9.6</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: The dropout rates are not available in educational statistical yearbook but are available in booklets of “Focus of Primary Education and Literacy Education” which has been published on ad hoc basis. Therefore, the data are available for the limited school years.</p> | Region \ Year | 2013/14 | 2015/16 | Agadez | 18.3 | 8 | Diffa | 17.6 | 19.8 | Disso | 11.1 | 13.9 | Maradi | 13.5 | 11.1 | Niamey | 4.1 | 5.1 | Tillaberi | 13.4 | 13.1 | Tahoua | 13.8 | 15.4 | Zinder | 16.4 | 9.6 |
|---|--|---------------|---------|---------|--------|------|---|-------|------|------|-------|------|------|--------|------|------|--------|-----|-----|-----------|------|------|--------|------|------|--------|------|-----|
| Region \ Year | 2013/14 | 2015/16 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Agadez | 18.3 | 8 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Diffa | 17.6 | 19.8 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Disso | 11.1 | 13.9 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Maradi | 13.5 | 11.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Niamey | 4.1 | 5.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tillaberi | 13.4 | 13.1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tahoua | 13.8 | 15.4 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Zinder | 16.4 | 9.6 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Internal documents of JICA, Report of National Workshop for Monitoring FCC and CGDES (2013-2017), Questionnaire and Interview with the stakeholders, Statistical Yearbook for Basic Education (2010-2016), Focus of Primary Education and Literacy Education (2012, 2014, 2016)

3 Efficiency

The project cost and period considerably exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 154% and 150%, respectively). That was because the completion of nationwide dissemination of FCC model had been the final year of the original project period but the additional activities and activities for trial of new framework for activity plan had been needed to functionalize FCC and to ensure a sustainable monitoring system. In addition, it was necessary to change some sites for the project activities where the Japanese experts had been able to travel due to the travel limits in a part of the project sites in accordance with the risk level in the overseas travel information issued by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs due to the deteriorated security status by more terrorist activities by the Islamic extremist groups since February, 2010. Furthermore, the Nigerien side appreciated the results of this project and unofficially requested to continue the support by JICA. Although the establishment of new democratic administration was under preparation as a result of the presidential election in March, 2011. Therefore, since the transition to civilian control and approval of the new administration were not completed and that was not a situation where the Nigerien side as the government of Niger can make an official request of a new project to the government of Japan. As a result, it was necessary to continue the support by the re-extension of the project period. However, there was no change in the outputs of the project from the original plan. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is low.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

In the “Education and Training Sector Programme (Programme Sectoriel de l’Education et de la Formation: PSEF)” (2014-2024), CGDES is approved as an official organization to be supported by MEN. Also, since MEN assigned CGDES supervisors to regions and departments to monitoring operation of CGDESs and stipulated the Ministry Order on establishment of monitoring for CGDES and FCC (Supplement No. 000031/MEP/A/PLN/EC/SG/DL on January 29, 2016) and the Ministry Order on structure and methodologies of monitoring (No. 00003/MEP/EC/SG/DL on January 29, 2016), the organizational activities by CGDESs have been ensured by the central government and the monitoring by the central government have been required. By these policies and legislations, the dissemination and sustainability of the model of school management by CGDES introduced by the project have been endorsed.

<Institutional Aspect>

There have not been any major changes in the institutional structure for the nationwide dissemination of CGDES. Even at the time of ex-post evaluation, the relevant organizations involving the project at the time of project completion has been functional with the same roles and responsibilities during the project implementation.

[MEN]

The unit of MEN for CGDES has been responsible for budgeting operation of the monitoring system, coordination among the related organizations for activities at a regional level, implementation of nationwide workshops for monitoring the activities by CGDES and FCC, and preparation of data for annual reports of MEN. For monitoring of CGDES and FCC, 1 staff member has been deployed to the Survey Planning Division and 12 staff members have been deployed to the CGDES Promotion Office. The number of staff members for the monitoring activities have been considered as sufficient since the necessary activities have been sustained.

[Regional Directorate of National Education]

The responsibilities for the Regional Directorates of National Education have been guidance and evaluation of monitoring activities conducted by the department CGDES supervisors, summary of activities by CGDES and FCC at the department level, preparation and submission of regular and annual reports, awareness activities aiming at management of fund to be allocated, participation into the national workshops organized by MEN. One regional supervisor has been assigned to each region, namely eight regional supervisors in total have been deployed nationwide. As they have been continuously engaged in the activities without problem, including monitoring, guidance and activity evaluation for the departmental school inspectors as well as implementation of the GDGES supervisor meeting in each province three times a year, the number of supervisor has been sufficient for conducting these activities.

[Departmental Office of School Inspector]

Departmental Office of School Inspector has taken responsibilities for monitoring, advising and supervision for activities and meetings of CGDES and FCC, cooperation and supports for FCC’s activity plans, preparation of regular and annual reports, and so on. One departmental CGDES officer has been deployed for each department and 75 CGDES departmental officers in total have been assigned nationwide. As they have continued activities of guidance and monitoring for CGDES, the number of CGDES departmental officers is sufficient.

[FCC]

⁶ The proportion of the number of children dropping out of primary school out of the total number of children enrolled in primary school.

FCC has been responsible for advising and supervision for CGDES's activities, monitoring of activities and general assemblies implemented by CGDES, cooperation and supports for FCC's activity plans, preparation of regular and annual reports, sharing of related information on CGDES with the related organizations. Each CGDES has 5 staff members and their activities for supporting CGDES have been sustained. Thus, the number of the staff members are sufficient for their activities.

[Commune]

Commune is an administrative division under department, and there are 266 communes across the country. Commune has taken responsibilities to cooperate FCC's activity plans and activities, financial supports to CGDES, participation in the general assembly of FCC. 1 staff is deployed to each commune, and the number of the staff is adequate.

[Primary school/CGDES]

Primary school and CGDES have implemented annual school activity plans and monitored the attendances of students and teachers.

<Technical Aspect>

The 12 manuals and guidelines of CGDES developed by the project have been utilized at the time of ex-post evaluation. Also, all the staffs of the related organizations mentioned above have sustained the necessary knowledge and skills for establishment, action plans, operation and monitoring of CGDES through the manuals and trainings.

<Financial Aspect>

The budget for the Unit of CGDES Promotion in MEN has fluctuated year by year since the project completion. The budget amounted 270 million FCFA in 2012/13 and increased to 507 million FCFA in 2015/16, but it was declined to 189 million FCFA in 2016/17 and 151 million FCFA in 2017/18. It was because the total budget of MEN had been decreased while the budget for security had been prioritized in the national budget allocation due to the current security situation. The budget for CGDES's operation and maintenance as well as monitoring has been secured due to the Minister Order as mentioned above. However, the budget execution has been persistently delayed because of the delays of approval for expenditure from the Ministry of Finance to MEN and the time consuming process for internal approval on the budget execution within MEN. Therefore, there have been cases where some activities have not been implemented timely and there is a slight concern about sustainable CGDES activities. The budget sources of the CGDES's activities have been membership fees and the budget from commune in addition to the government budget. Also, the activities related to CGDES have been financially supported by international organizations and non-governmental organizations in supporting decentralized school management. In addition, the counterpart fund for reinforcement of CGDES's function has been utilized for monitoring of their activities, trainings at regional and department levels, and implementation of monthly meetings, which has contributed to the nationwide dissemination of CGDES. For the recent years, the fund was spent on the purchase of 83 motorbikes for the monitoring and supervising activities by the CGDES supervisors.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose for establishment of functional CGDES at primary school nationwide and structural reinforcement to sustain CGDES and the Overall Goal for improvement of the enrollment rate of primary education through school management by CGDES. As for sustainability, there has remained a challenge that some of the related activities to CGDES have not been implemented in appropriate ways because of the constant delays of the budgetary execution. As for efficiency, the project cost and period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- MEN is required to develop human resources, to strengthen organizational cooperation, to secure budget continuously including financial supports from donors, and to timely allocate the budget execution in order to sustain the outputs produced by the Phase II and to contribute to improvement of quality and access to the basic education.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- Through the project, the Ministry of National Education issued the Ministry Order to ensure budget for secured implementation of monitoring activities by the CGDES supervisors at provincial and school inspectors at department level. In the background, there is a fact that the project has been implemented with the units of the Ministry of National Education under the Secretary General as a counterpart and with sufficient understanding on the project concept among the stakeholders as well as the clear chain of command. The clear-cut institutional framework has made the monitoring system functioning and contributed to ensuring continuation of the project effects as well as their sustainability. In case where JICA considers a similar type of project in other Francophone African countries, it is important to incorporate project components to promote dissemination of the model activities at policy level, to establish monitoring system for the activities, and to endorse budget for them. Also, in order to facilitate those efforts at policy level, it is essential to involve stakeholders, in particular, the key decision makers, and to make them understanding on the project from the stage of project formation.
- The project focused on transparency for the selection of CGDES members by introducing the democratic local elections which have enabled women to participate into decision making on school management. Therefore, it can be considered that the significant contribution of the project is the establishment of mutual trust with the local people and the promotion of establishment of CGDES and the model of school management by CGDES through facilitation of participation of the communities which is the key for democratic community activities based on women's needs and viewpoints, such as the community based pre-school. For the technical cooperation project focusing the activities based on community participation, it is essential how to establish mutual trust between the local communities and the related organization. Also, it is necessary to consider project design and actions to be taken during the project implementation.



Interviews with the CGDES members



Classroom constructed by CGDES