Country Name	Project for Enhancing the Function of the National Water Resources Institute				
Federal Republic of Nig	ligeria				
I. Project Outline					
Background	The government of Nigeria was trying to supply safe water to all populations by 2011. However, the proportion of population with access to safe water had not sufficiently improved (49% in1990 and 48% in 2004) because of effects such as increase of the population. The Federal Ministry of Water Resources (FMWR) in Nigeria realized that capacity development was important factor for the Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Agency (RUWASSA) and the Ministry of Water Resources in each State, to improve the rural water supply situation. In addition, it was also important to reinforce the training implementation capacity of the National Water Resource Institute (NWRI) which conducted technical training for the relevant staff both at States and national level. NWRI had conducted training on the level of urban water supply and water supply in small town, but had not conducted training in rural water supply and sanitation. For that reasons, NWRI newly established the Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Centre for Capacity Development (RWSSC) and tried to reinforce the training implementation capacity specially to deal with the rural water supply. However, further capacity enhancement was needed.				
Objectives of the Project	 Through 1) identifying capacity gaps of NWRI/RWSSC and Rural Water Supply and Sanitation (RWSS) stakeholders at States, Local Government Areas (LGAs) and Community levels, 2) developing responsive and effective training system, 3) enhancing trainers' capacity in RWSS, 4) implementing and reviewing training, and 5) improving management of RWSSC, the project aimed at effective operation of the RWSSC for capacity development, and thereby contributing to the improvement of service delivery of RWSS in the country. 1. Overall Goal: Service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria through Capacity Development of stakeholders. 2. Project purpose: Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Centre for Capacity Development (RWSSC) is effectively operated. 				
Activities of the project	 Project site: Kaduna where RWSSC is located (and Abuja where the training courses were conducted after October 2012 due to the worsened security situation in Kaduna) Main activities: (1) Capacity assessment of NWRI/RWSSC and RWSS stakeholders, (2) Formulation of training program (development of curriculum, modules, materials, facilities etc.), (3) Implementing Training of Trainers (ToT), (4) Implementing and conducting Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) of training, and (5) Improving management of RWSSC Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side Equipment: Geophysical prospecting 2) Facilities and utilities: Project office, generator, equipment, training rig and related equipment, borehole camera, monitoring equipment, pumping test equipment, etc. 				
Project Period	March 2010 - November 2014 (Original period: March 2010-November 2013)Project Cost(ex-ante) Approximately 560 million yen, (actual) 430 million yen				
Implementing Agency Cooperation Agency in Japan	NWRI /RWSSC Yachiyo Engineering Co., Ltd.				

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was not verified as data is not obtained. The data is unavailable for two reasons. (1) The state RUWASSAs do not keep records of drilled boreholes. (2) The RWSSC records after 2014 does not specify the name of belonging organization where the participants that have attended the training courses came from.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Nigeria at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with the Nigeria's development policy. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, "the National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (NEEDS)", which was developed in 2004, designated the water supply as one of the prioritized sectors. "The National Water Supply and Sanitation Policy (2000)" and "the Rural Water and Sanitation Program (2004)" aimed at supplying safe water to all populations by 2011. At the time of project completion, one of the main goals of "Nigeria Vision 20:2020", which was published in 2009, was sustaining access to potable water and basic sanitation.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Nigeria the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Nigeria for water supply. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the management of training courses at NWRI was weak and the number and hours of training courses was limited. NWRI was not able to conduct the following activities regularly or in a well-coordinated manner: annual planning, revision of curriculum, promotion of the training courses, evaluation of the training, and follow-up of the participants. Besides, teaching materials and equipment were obsolete to response to new training courses. At the time of project completion, although the potential of water development in rural area in Nigeria was high, it was a

problem that private contractors had not been brought up sufficiently and they refused to have works which were in poor access area or in the area where it was difficult to excavate. Therefore, the role of RUWASSA was still important. RWSSC was expected to train RUWASSA officers through reinforcing the capacity of NWRI/RWSSC and therefore the need of capacity development was high. <Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA Policy to Nigeria at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Rural infrastructure development including water supply was one of the prioritized areas for ODA under the third policy dialogues between Nigeria and Japan in October 2007.¹

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

Judging from the achievement levels of the indicators set to measure the level of achievement by the project, the Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion. The indicators "The evaluation result by the trainee at the end of the project is increased compared with the ones at the beginning of the project." (Indicator 1) and "350 RWSS staff will attend RWSSC trainings in total by the end of the project" (Indicator 2) were achieved.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

After the project was completed, the effects of the project have somewhat continued as the training has been taking place and the average training evaluation results have maintained high level of satisfaction by participants. However, RWSSC faces some financial challenges. The number of training has been under constraint because of the lack of availability or delay execution of RWSSC annual budget allocated by federal government. One to two training courses for each theme were carried out annually after the project end, however, some courses such as "Ground water investigation", "Rehabilitation of boreholes and maintenance" and "Development of alternative water source" have not been carried out. The courses which are done annually are dependent on the amount of funds available for NWRI, the courses with the most impact on the target groups based on the needs assessments and its established effectiveness. In addition, lack of funding by state governments to RUWASSA for their travel expenses has made it difficult to increase the number of participants from the states and conduct all training courses concurrently. The equipment items supplied under the project have been operational and utilized for training such as "Borehole Construction Management and "Drilling Technology". As to the number of trainees, although the accumulated number of trainees was 710 as of September 2017 and not exceeded the target number (800) which was set at the time of the terminal evaluation², it is possible to achieve the target number by the end of 2017 if the budget was released as same level as the last year.

The Overall Goal was not verified as data is not obtained. The data is unavailable for two reasons. (1) The state RUWASSAs do not keep records of drilled boreholes. (2) The RWSSC records after 2014 does not specify the name of belonging organization where the participants that have attended the training courses came from.

Although there is no record of the out-of-service ratio of boreholes in the states which received the Grant Aid Projects³, there is a need to rehabilitate and maintain the boreholes in some villages according to some Evaluation Reports of JICA's Grant Aid Projects in rural water supply in Nigeria. The World Bank also reported that approximately 30% of boreholes in Nigeria are broken down two years after the installation⁴.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

As a result of the equipment supplied by the project being used for practical training courses, actual borehole rehabilitations are performed as part of the training courses in different communities. 12 boreholes have also been drilled so far, 4 in Abuja and 8 in Kaduna all under training courses. No land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project, and no negative impacts on the natural environment were observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the project achieved the Project Purpose at the time of project completion, the effects of the project have partially continued, however, the Overall Goal was not verified at the time of ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results				
(Project Purpose)	Indicator 1: The evaluation result by the	Status of the achievement: achieved (continued)				
Rural Water Supply and	trainee at the end of the Project is increased	(Project completion)				
Sanitation Centre for	compared with the ones at the beginning of	Result of training evaluation become higher than beginning of the project on				
Capacity Development	the Project.	four implemented courses.				
(RWSSC) is effectively		Average of training evaluation by the participants				
operated.		Training course 2011 2012 2013 2014			2014	
		1. Groundwater Investigation3.62-3.8		3.89	-	
		2. Borehole Construction and	4.4	4.08	4.25	4.44
		Management				
		3. Drilling Technology	-	-	4.49	4.67
		4. Drilling Machinery Maintenance	-	-	4.21	4.55
		Technique				
		(Ex-post Evaluation)				

¹Source: ODA Databook 2009

 $^{^{2}}$ At least 15 individuals per course are expected to take part in annually and therefore, the accumulated number would be more than 800 (15 individuals x 9 courses x 3 years in addition to the 405 individuals who already took part in.)

³The Project for Water Supply in Bauchi and Katsina States (2010), The Project for Improvement of Rural Water Supply (Grant aid project, 2012) ⁴Source: Nigeria Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene (WASH) Poverty Diagnostics: Preliminary Report (2016)

Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC	1				1.0				
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional materia 1 2				-			-		
Average of training evaluation by the participants Joint Joint <thj< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>-</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>ing is ea</td><td>isier to be</td></thj<>				-				ing is ea	isier to be
Overall Gouly 2013 2014 2015 2016 2015 2016 2015 2016 2017 2018 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018 2014 2015 2016 2016 2017 2016 2016 2017 2018 2014 2018									
Graudovater Investigation 3.89 - - - Brochold Construction and Management 4.25 4.44 89% 95% Drilling Technology 4.49 4.67 95% 94% Drilling Technology 0.9% F5% 94% 96%									2016
$ \begin{array}{ $									2016
Drilling Technology 4.49 4.67 95% 94% Drilling Machinery Maintenance 4.21 4.55 95% 90% Indicator 2: 350 RWSS staff will attend RWSSC trainings in total by the end of the Project. 100 101 2013 87% 85% 90% Indicator 2: 350 RWSS traff will attend RWSSC trainings in total by the end of the Project. 101 2012 2013 2014 total Indicator 2: 350 RWSS traff will attend RWSSC training in total by the end of the Project. 9 - 38 26 73 Indicator 3: 50 RWSS traff will attend RWSSC training in total by the end of the Project. 101 2012 2013 2014 total Indicator 2: 50 RWSS traff will attend RWSSC training in total by the end of the Project. 101 2012 2013 2014 total Indicator 3: 50 RWSS traff will attend RWSSC training by each year - 20 12 144 101 106 25 101 2014 101 2015 2016 2017 101 101 20 20 - 30 30 - </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>r</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>-</td>				r					-
Drilling Machinery Maintenance 4.21 4.55 93% 90% Indicator 2: 350 RWSS staff will tetted Other courses 93% 87% 85% 90% RWSSC trainings in total by the end of the Project. Project Completion) Number of participants of training by each year 1012 2013 2014 foat 1. Groundwater 9 -2 38 26 73 Investigation 9 -2 20 45 104 2. Borehole Construction 14 25 20 45 104 and Mangement - - 20 19 39 3. Drilling Echnology - - 20 19 39 5. Installation of hand 44 - - - 44 program 30 - - 30 - - 30 7. Development of - - 30 - - 30 8. Dubic health 30 - - <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>lanageme</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>				lanageme					
Technique Image									
Other courses99%87%85%90%Indicator 2: 350 RWS8 staff will attend RWSSC trainings in total by the end of the Project.Status of the Achievement: achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion)201220132014TotalNamber of participants of training by each year1201220132014Total1. Groundwater9-3826731. Groundwater9-2032522. Borchole Construction14252045104and Management3. Dulling technology2032524. Drilling Machinery2032525. Installation of land4444pump and operation and maintenance336. Rehabilitation of33307. Development of1602598122405Total1602520162017*1. Groundwater source201520162017*1. Groundwater Muster201520162017*1. Draul1602520302. Drauling Technology20520162017*1. Groundwater Muster2015201620162017*2. Drauling Technolo			<u> </u>	Maintenar	nce	4.21	4.55	95%	90%
Indicator 2: 350 RWS5 stalT will attend RWSSC trainings in total by the end of the Project. Status of the Achievement: achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion) Prining course 2011 2012 2014 Total Training course 2011 2012 2014 Total I. Groundwater 9 - 38 26 73 Investigation 14 25 20 45 104 3. Drilling Iechnology - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Machinery - 20 19 39 Maintenance Technique - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance - - - 30 7. Development of - - - 30 8. Public health 30 - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 106 Colontwater Investigation - - 20 20 - 106 Condwater Investigation - - -<			*			000/	0.70/	0.50/	0.00(
RWSSC trainings in total by the end of the Project. Project Completion) Number of participants of training by each year Training course 2011 2012 2013 2014 Total 1. Groundwater 9 - 38 26 73 1. Broundwater 9 - 20 32 52 2. Borchole Construction 14 25 20 45 104 and Management - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Technology - - 20 19 39 Maintenance - - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance - - - 33 7. Development of - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - 30 1. Groundwater Investigation 2015 2016 2017* 1. Groundwater Investigation 20 20 - 1. Groundwater Investigation 20 10 - 1. Groundwater Investigatio								85%	90%
Project. Number of participants of training by each year Training course 2011 2012 2013 2014 Total 1. Groundwater 9 - 38 26 73 Investigation 14 25 20 43 104 3. Drilling Technology - - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Machinery - - 20 42 52 5. Installation of hand 44 - - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance - - - 33 boreholes and maintenance 0 - - 30 7. Development of - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - 30 104 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) 160 25 26 0 30				ieved (pa	rtially	v conti	inued)		
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional trant Normality Modifization 201 2012 2013 2014 Total 1. Groundwater 9 - 38 26 73 Investigation 1 25 20 45 104 2. Borchole Construction 14 25 20 32 52 4. Drilling Technology - - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Machinery - - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Machinery - - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Machinery - - - 33 boreholes and maintenance - - - 30 0 - - - 30 0 100 25 98 122 405 10. Total 160 25 98 122 405 10. Total 160 25 60 30 4					_				
Image: Signal and Signa And Signa And Signal And Signal And Signal And Signal And Signa		Project.							
Overall Goal) Intestigation 1 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>201</td> <td>2 2</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					201	2 2			
2. Borchole Construction 14 25 20 45 104 and Management 3. Dirilling Technology - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Technology - - 20 19 39 Maintenance Technique - - 20 19 39 Maintenance Technique - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance 33 - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance 33 - - 33 6. Rehabilitation of 33 - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 Mohitization 160 25 98 122 405 (Tx-post Evaluation) 160 25 98 122 405 Total 160 25 98 122 405 (Tx-post Evaluation) 20 - - - - 10 100 25 56 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>9</td> <td>-</td> <td></td> <td>38</td> <td>26</td> <td>73</td>				9	-		38	26	73
and Management 0 1 0 1 0 1 1 3. Drilling Technology - 20 19 39 4. Drilling Machinery - 20 19 39 Maintenance Technique - 20 19 39 6. Rehabilitation of hand 44 - - 44 maintenance - - 33 - - 44 maintenance - - - 30 - - 30 7. Development of - - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 1060 25 98 122 405 - <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>-</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					-				
3. Drilling Technology - - 20 32 52 4. Drilling Technology - - 20 19 39 Maintenance Technique - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance - - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance - - - 33 6. Rehabilitation of 33 - - - - - 7. Development of alternative water source 30 - - - - 8. Public health 30 - - - - - - 10040 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) The number of participants of training by each year 1. Groundwater Investigation - - - - - - 2. Borcholoc Construction and Management 20 0 - - - - 1. Groundwater Investigation - - - - - - - - - </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>14</td> <td>25</td> <td>· </td> <td>20</td> <td>45</td> <td>104</td>				14	25	·	20	45	104
4. Drilling Machinery - - 20 19 39 Maintenance Technique 5. Installation of hand 44 - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance 6. Relabilitation of 33 - - 33 7. Development of - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 - - 30 9. Drilling Machinery Maintenance 15 55 25 - - - - - - - - - </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td> </td> <td>-+</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>						-+			
Maintenance Technique Image: Construction and technique 5. Installation of hand 44 - - 44 pump and operation and maintenance - - 33 6. Relabilitation of J 33 - - - 33 borecholes and maintenance - - - 30 7. Development of - - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - 30 Mobilization 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) Ten unber of participants of training by each year - - - - 30 Mobilization 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) -				-	-	-+			
5. Installation of hand pump and operation and maintenance 44 - - 44 6. Rehabilitation of boreholes and maintenance 33 - - 33 7. Development of alternative water source 30 - - 30 8. Public health 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - 30 10ai 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) The number of participants of training by each year - - - 10ai 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) The number of participants of training by each year - - - 10ai 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) - - - - - 10ai 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) - - - - - 10ai 160 20 15 - - 2. Borchole Construction and Manag			6	-	-		20	19	39
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rumal service delivery of RWSS 1 -						-+			
Imaintenance Imaintenance Imaintenance Imaintenance 6. Rehabilitation of 33 - - - 33 7. Development of - - - 30 8. Public health 30 - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 9. Community 30 - - - 30 Mobilization 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) The number of participants of training by each year 2016 2017* - - 2. Borehole Construction and Management 20 20 - - 2. Borehole Construction and Management 20 20 - - 2. Borehole Construction and Management 20 15 - and maintenance 15 55 25 Techningue - -				44	-		-	-	44
6. Rehabilitation of 33 - - - 33 borcholes and maintenance 7. Development of - <									
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural service delivery of RWSS Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural kacholders. Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural kacholders. Satural RWSSC in the specifie States which received the Grant Aid Project.									
7. Development of alternative water source -<				33	-		-	-	33
alternative water source 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30<									
8. Public health 30 - - 30 9. Community 30 - - 30 Mobilization 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) 160 25 98 122 405 Total 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) - - - - 1. Groundwater Investigation - - - - 2. Borehole Construction and Management 20 20 - 3. Drilling Technology 25 60 30 4. Drilling Machinery Maintenance 15 55 25 Technique 5 Installation of hand pump and operation 20 15 5. Installation of barcholes and - - - - 6. Rehabilitation of borcholes and - - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 -				-	-		-	-	-
9. Community 30 - - 30 Mobilization 160 25 98 122 405 (Ex-post Evaluation) The number of participants of training by each year 2015 2016 2017* 1. Groundwater Investigation - - - - - 2. Borehole Construction and Management 20 20 - 3. Drilling Technology 25 60 30 4. Drilling Machinery Maintenance 15 55 25 Technique - - - 5. Installation of band pump and operation and maintenance 0 15 - 6. Rehabilitation of boreholes and - - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - 7. Development of alternative water source - - - 8. Public health - - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - -									
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural keholders. Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural keholders. A of Expense to the spart of the specific States which received the Grant Akeholders. Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural keholders. Status of Achievement: not verified. Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural keholders. Xatus of Achievement: not verified. Status of Achievement: not verified. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWR/RWSSC Achievements, Questionnaire and interviews with NWR/RWSSC					-		-	-	
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria hrough Capacity Image: Ima			•	30	-		-	-	30
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural Service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria is improved in Nigeria Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural Service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural Service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria Subscience of the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project. Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural Service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural Service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria Status of Achievement: not verified. (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. States which received the Grant Aid Project.			Mobilization						
The number of participants of training by each year201520162017*1. Groundwater Investigation2. Borehole Construction and Management20203. Drilling Technology2560304. Drilling Machinery Maintenance155525Technique5. Installation of hand pump and operation2015-6. Rehabilitation of boreholes and7. Development of alternative water source8. Public health9. Community Mobilization201555557. Development of alternative water source9. Community Mobilization209. Community Mobilization209. Community Mobilization10015055-7. Total100150559. Community Mobilization209. Community Mobilization209. Community Mobilization10015055-9. Community Mobilization2010. Development ofnater supply facilities is increased10. Development ofnater supply facilities is increased10. Development ofnate supply facilities is increased10. Development ofna			Total	160	25	5	98	122	405
Overall Goal) Service delivery of RWSS s improved in Nigeria hrough Capacity Development of hrough Capacity Development of s is proved in Nigeria hrough CapacityIndicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in takeholders.Indicator 1: The rate of increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in takeholders.Indicator 1: The rate of increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in takeholders.Supple Science Science Science Science Science Science and interviews with NWRI/RWSSCSource : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSCSupple Science Sci									
I. Groundwater Investigation2. Borehole Construction and Management2020-3. Drilling Technology2560304. Drilling Machinery Maintenance155525Technique5155525Technique5156. Rehabilitation of hand pump and operation2015-7. Development of alternative water source8. Public health9. Community Mobilization207. Development of alternative water source8. Public health9. Community Mobilization2010015055**As of September 2017**Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the GrantStatus of Achievement: not verified. (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC-									
Qverall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in takeholders.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC20-2. Borehole Construction and Management2020-3. Drilling Technology2560304. Drilling Machinery Maintenance155525Technique2015-5. Installation of hand pump and operation and maintenance2015-6. Rehabilitation of boreholes and maintenance7. Development of alternative water source7. Development of alternative water source7. Development of alternative water source9. Community Mobilization207. Development of alternative water source9. Community Mobilization2010015055**-9. Community Mobilization200. Community Mobilization200. Compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in takeholders0. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC			2015 2016				2017*		
3. Drilling Technology2560304. Drilling Machinery Maintenance155525Technique5. Installation of hand pump and operation2015-and maintenance6. Rehabilitation of boreholes and maintenance7. Development of alternative water source8. Public health9. Community Mobilization20Total10015055*As of September 2017Status of Achievement: not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailableService delivery of RWSS s improved in Nigeria hrough Capacity Development of takeholders.Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.Status of Achievement: not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC							-	-	-
4. Drilling Machinery Maintenance 15 55 25 Technique 15 55 25 Technique 15 - - 3. Installation of hand pump and operation and maintenance 20 15 - 6. Rehabilitation of boreholes and maintenance - - - 7. Development of alternative water source - - - 8. Public health - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - 7. Development of alternative water source - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - 9. Community Mobilization 100 150 55 *As of September 2017 Status of Achievement: not verified Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Service delivery of RWSS si marce supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project. Sutus of Achievement: not verified. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC - -							20	20	-
4. Drilling Machinery Maintenance 15 55 25 Technique 15 5 25 Technique 15 - - 5. Installation of hand pump and operation and maintenance 20 15 - 6. Rehabilitation of boreholes and maintenance - - - 7. Development of alternative water source - - - 8. Public health - - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - 9. Community Mobilization 20 - - 9. Community Mobilization 100 150 55 *As of September 2017 Status of Achievement: not verified Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Service delivery of RWSS s improved in Nigeria hrough Capacity Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project. Status of Achievement: not verified. Data is unavailable. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC - - -							25	60	30
Overall Goal) Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural service delivery of RWSS is improved in Nigeria hrough Capacity Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project. Status of Achievement: not verified. Data is unavailable. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC Indicator under the rural service with NWRI/RWSSC							15	55	25
And maintenance									
And maintenance			5. Installation of hand pump	and opera	tion	Τ	20	15	-
maintenancen7. Development of alternative water source-7. Development of alternative water source-8. Public health-9. Community Mobilization2020-9. Community Mobilization2010015055*As of September 2017Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.Status of Achievement: not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC-									
7. Development of alternative water source8. Public health9. Community Mobilization209. Community Mobilization2010015055*As of September 2017Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in 			6. Rehabilitation of boreholes	s and		Τ	-	-	-
8. Public health9. Community Mobilization20-9. Community Mobilization20-9. Community Mobilization20-10015055*As of September 2017Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.Status of Achievement: not verified. (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC-			maintenance						
9. Community Mobilization20-Total10015055*As of September 2017Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.Status of Achievement: not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSCImage: Community Mobilization (Community Mobilization)			7. Development of alternative	e water so	urce		-	-	-
Total10015055Total10015055*As of September 2017Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.Status of Achievement: not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSCJuly 200			8. Public health				-	-	-
Total10015055Total10015055*As of September 2017Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.Status of Achievement: not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSCJuly 200			9. Community Mobilization				20	-	-
As of September 2017Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant takeholders.Status of Achievement: not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC								150	55
Overall Goal)Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural water supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.Status of Achievement: not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSCStatus of Achievement: not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.			*As of September 2017				I		
SolutionInterface of Nucleon AndreadService delivery of RWSS s improved in Nigeria hrough Capacitywater supply facilities is increased compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project.(Ex-post Evaluation) not verified. Data is unavailable.Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSCNWRI/RWSSC	(Overall Goal)	Indicator 1: The rate of functional rural	<u>,</u>	ified					
s improved in Nigeria compared with the ones before the participation to the Training at RWSSC in Development of the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project. Data is unavailable.			(Ex-post Evaluation) not verifi						
hrough Capacity participation to the Training at RWSSC in Development of the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project. Aid Project. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC	-		Data is unavailable.						
Development of the specific States which received the Grant Aid Project. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC		-							
stakeholders. Aid Project. Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC									
Source : JICA internal documents, Questionnaire and interviews with NWRI/RWSSC	stakeholders.	-							
•			WRI/RWSSC						
sincition	Efficiency								

3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (the ratio against the plan: 77%), the project period exceeds the plan (the ratio against the plan: 124%). However, the project was extended as it was suspended almost one year in the middle of the project period due to security constraints⁵. Considering this situation, the efficiency of the project is high.

⁵ Volatility increased at the Project Site in Kaduna in the latter half of 2011 with coordinated terrorist explosions occurring at 3 locations including the air force facility near the project office. Terrorist explosions continued thereafter in Kaduna and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs issued a warning in May 2012 to postpone travel to the entire Kaduba State including the City of Kaduna. As a result, it became impossible for Japanese experts to work in Kaduna and

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

There is an established support from the government's policy direction. The main goal of "The Partnership for Expanded Water Supply and Sanitation & Hygiene (PE-WASH)", launched in 2016 and covering a period till 2030 is to improve water supply particularly in rural areas and sanitation.

<Institutional Aspect>

An appropriate organizational structure is in place for sustaining the project effects. RWSSC is one of three main centres in charge of providing specialized training under Training Department of NWRI. At RWSSC, single coordinator/trainer is assigned to each course. All course coordinators of RWSSC report to the head of RWSSC who is also the head of the Training Department. NWRI oversees all the training centres and other programmes of the institute. It prepares its own budget and each year, decides how much it allocates to RWSSC and other centres. The number of staff at RWSSC is 22, who are course coordinators/trainers and their assistance. The overall number of staff at NWRI is 151. In order to provide training, NWRI recruited 86 persons in 2015 to add to their capacity. <Technical Aspect>

NWRI/RWSSC has sufficient technical skills to conduct training. The staff members trained during the project are still working with the institute. In addition, newly recruited staff members were also trained. NWRI has a system to maintain or upgrade staff's skills. NWRI carries out induction courses and other trainings with support from a memorandum of understanding (MoU) with 6 universities signed. MoU mentions that lecturers from the 6 universities, in addition to the staff at NWRI are used as resource persons to help improve capacity of NWRI by giving lectures, seminars, trainings etc. On the other hand, although the project intended to improve the management capacity of RWSSC, activities under the component related to management skills were not fully materialized during the project period. Nonetheless, NWRI has sufficient management capacity. They had developed work plan and utilized it and manuals for administration and logistics as the project originally envisaged.

<Financial Aspect>

Although NWRI faces problems such as insufficient budget and delay in budget release, NWRI is able to secure funds to implement training courses which are highly needed the amount. The States do not allocate fund for tuition fee, therefore training courses are funded by NWRI only. FMWR has not promoted state governments to allocate funds for training at RWSSC.

			(Unit: NGN)
	2014	2015	2016
1.1 Applied budget of NWRI	403,000,000.00	350,000,000.00	1,001,330,552.00
1.2 Of which, the budget for RWSSC	20,925,000.00	6,000,000.00	19,535,884.40
2.1 Approved budget NWRI	353,000,000.00	142,000,000.00	1,001,330,552.00
2.2 Of which, the budget for RWSSC	10,006,699.18	3,000,000.00	16,826,190.19
3.1 Executed budget NWRI	153,599,622.00	71,138,410.00	848,947,303.00
3.2 Of which, the budget for RWSSC	9,762,274.18	3,000,000.00	16,826,190.19

Budget of NWRI and RWSSC

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency and state RUWASSAs such as lack of budget and delay in execution of the budget. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion as indicators set to measure the achievement of the project such as the evaluation result by trainees and the number of trainees were achieved. The effects of the project somewhat continued, though the number of training courses and participants has been limited by the budget constraint. The Overall Goal was not verified at the time of ex-post evaluation. As to the sustainability, slight problems have been observed in terms of the financial aspect of the implementing agency and state RUWASSAs such as lack of budget and delay in execution of the budget. As for the efficiency, the project period exceeded the plan due to security constraints.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- Annually, especially before budget plan of following year is finalized, NWRI should make advocacy visit to influential government officials such as State governors, deputy governors, state house of assemblies, commissioners of water resources, and other high level officers that influence budget in the state in the company of RUWASSA and FMWR staff.
- NWRI/RWSSC is recommended to provide training course on rehabilitation of boreholes and maintenance for Water Sanitation and Hygiene Committee (WASHCOM) and Local Area Mechanics (LAMs) at state level. Although it is reported that approximately 30% of boreholes are out-of-service two years after the completion in Nigeria, some RUWASSAs could not secure the budget of the trainings for the village level. Since NWRI could secure the funds for travel expenses of RUWASSAs staffs to come to the institute, it might be good for NWRI to visit the states and provide training not only for RUWASSA alone, but for WASHCOMS and LAMs to extent possible.
- Many local NGOs are involved in improving access to portable water in Nigeria. However, many of them have not been trained in
 borehole rehabilitation and maintenance. NWRI, through Outreach Division which is responsible for designing and conducting short
 courses to extend the water related technology to industries and end users, is recommended to provide training to local NGOs in order
 to increase their capacity so that they are able to repair the broken boreholes in the villages.
- NWRI/RWSSC is recommended to do proper record keeping of data relevant to indicating whether the overall goal of this project and

the Project was suspended. Subsequent discussion with Nigeria in October 2012 led to decisions including extension of the project period and the minutes were sighed.

other relevant projects is achieved e.g. number of boreholes drilled, number and organization of people attending training etc. Such data should be kept at the beginning of any training organized by the RWSSC. This will help both implementing agency and JICA in effectively and continuously evaluating the project effects.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- In the project aiming to enhance cascade training system, not only the trainers' agency (NWRI) but trainees' agencies (State RUWASSAs) must be advocated through the project or included in the project members to ensure the sustainability after the project end, especially in the case of federal country that each state agency needs to secure the budget at state level.
- All the equipment donated to NWRI/RWSSC is in good working condition. This can be attributed to the fact that the staff was well educated and the maintenance of the equipment was assigned to one course coordinator who is also very competent. The equipment donated to a training institute should be handled by one trained officer (not the head of the organization) for proper operation and maintenance. An appropriate highly competent person should be identified during project execution in collaboration with senior staff of the institute.



Donated rig to NWRI in good working condition



Inside of the RWSSC