

Country Name	The Project for Improvement of Access to Basic Education in Deprived Areas
Republic of Ghana	

I. Project Outline

Background	The gross enrolment rate in Ghana had greatly improved to 95.2% for primary education and 78.8% for junior high school education during the fiscal year of 2007/2008. However, the regional differences in education and concerns for improving school completion rate had become obvious. Under the situation, Ghana conducted a ranking exercise for 138 districts in the country, assessing enrolment rate, number of teachers and educational infrastructure. As a result, 53 lower ranked districts were defined as Deprived Districts thereby aiming at improving the school retention rate, the school dropout rate and the enrolment rate in these Deprived Districts. One of the reasons accounting for the low ranking of Deprived Districts was the lack of secured and appropriate educational environment for learning.			
Objectives of the Project	To improve the quality of primary education environment of target schools in Northern Region and Central Region by constructing school facilities and procuring furniture			
Contents of the Project	<p>1. Project Site: 33 schools* in Northern Region: Sawla Tuna Kalba, Bunkpurugu Yunyoo, Karaga, Central Gonja; and Central Region: Assin North, Assin South.</p> <p>*Although target schools were originally 37 schools, after the detailed design study, the total number of schools were reduced to 33 due to budget constraints originating from delays in constructions and price escalations. Out of the 33 schools, two primary schools (Dani-Uuri Primary and Konfali Primary) were not completed as there were substantial delays in construction by a contracting company. In the end, these remaining works were to be assumed by the Ministry of Education, however they were not completed at the time of ex-post evaluation.</p> <p>2. Japanese side</p> <p>(1) Construction of school buildings (132 Unit classrooms in 33 schools) and toilets (112 booths), teachers' accommodation units</p> <p>(2) procurement of furniture (student desks/chairs)</p> <p>3. Ghana side: Conducting demolition and removal of existing obstructions on Project school sites as well as land clearing works.</p>			
Project Period	E/N Date	August 13, 2009	Completion Date	June 27, 2014 (Completion of the construction)
	G/A Date	August 13, 2009		
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit / G/A Grant Limit: : 605 million yen			Actual Grant Amount: 605 million yen
Executing Agency	Ghana Education Service (GES)			
Contracted Agencies	<p>Main Contractor(s): None</p> <p>Main Consultant(s): Construction Planning Co., Ltd. Japan International Cooperation System (JICS)*</p> <p>*As a result of significant delays in construction work, the original consultant was not able to continue the contract. Therefore, the contract was terminated and JICS assumed consultancy work after October 2012.</p> <p>Agent: JICS</p>			

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Ghana at the Time of Ex-Ante and Ex-Post Evaluation></p> <p>The project has been consistent with the development policy of Ghana. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, Ghana had established “the Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy (I & II)” and took human resource development up as the top priority theme. In response to the advocate of “Education for All” (EFA), the Government of Ghana had established “the Free Compulsory Universal Basic Education (fCUBE) Program” and “the Education Strategic Plan” (ESP) and realized completely free basic education by introducing the Capitation Grant since 2005 in order to realize fair access to education. At the time of ex-post evaluation, under “the Coordinated Programme of Economic and Social Development Policies (2017- 2024)”, the focus of education is to improve inclusive and equitable access to and participation in education at all levels from primary schools to high schools. The ESP (2010-2020) also emphasizes improving equitable access to and participation in quality education at all levels.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Ghana at the Time of Ex-Ante and Ex-Post Evaluation ></p> <p>The project has been consistent with the development needs of Ghana for improving access to basic education as mentioned above. At the time of ex-post evaluation, although the education indicators in the target districts have improved, enrolment rate at some districts are still low and needs to be improved.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation></p>

The project was also consistent with the Japan's ODA policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Improvement of basic social services including basic education in deprived areas was one of the strategic objectives for the prioritized area of "Accelerating rural development" under "the Country Assistance Program for Ghana (2006)".

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Effectiveness>

The project mostly achieved its objective, "To improve the quality of primary education environment of target schools in Northern Region and Central Region", as targets of indicators set to measure the achievement of the objective such as "The number of classrooms in good environment" (indicator 1) and "the number of students per classroom" (indicator 2) were almost met, though the project did not achieve the targets as the construction of two schools were uncompleted, and four schools were excluded from the scope.

The number of classrooms in good environment increased from 18 to 144 after project completion. Facilities constructed under the project were confirmed by the respective District Education Directors and Circuit Supervisors to be in good condition. The six schools visited during the field visit through physical examination and observations were noted to be in good condition and were being properly used for teaching and learning activities. There was no case recorded or observed where the classrooms were not used for their intended purposes. From the field survey, some of the schools were making attempts through the work of the Parent Teacher Associations (PTA), School Management Committees (SMC) and the District Assemblies to provide additional classroom blocks which were at various levels of completion.

The number of students per classroom improved mainly because of the increased number of classrooms provided by this project and the Government of Ghana. The Government embarked on a program for removing "schools under trees" in the country by making available funding to construct school blocks and providing furniture for schools.

Interviews with teachers and pupils revealed that they were happy and glad for the structures provided. The pupils particularly made reference to the plywood provided for the construction of the ceiling which cooled the rooms during hot seasons. All the toilets surveyed during the field visits were being used properly and looked clean. Teachers and pupils alike confirmed that their hygiene situation had improved since there was no open defecation in and around the school. Some of the school furniture were still in good condition with a substantial number of them reported to be broken but were fixed and used.

<Impact>

Some head teachers, teachers and pupils attested to the fact that their academic results had improved because of the conducive environment of the classroom blocks provided though this assertion was without prove. However, all head teachers visited during the survey attested to the fact that the improvement in school environment had influenced positively the morale and improved attitude, motivation and behavior of pupils.

No negative impact on natural environment was observed and no land acquisition and resettlement occurred under this project.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Quantitative Effects

	Baseline (2009) Baseline Year	Target (2014) 3 years after Completion	Actual (2016) Year of Completion	Actual (2018) 2 years after Completion
Indicator 1: The number of classrooms in good environment*	18	162	144	144
Indicator 2: The number of students per classroom	Primary school	67.7	44.4	42.5
	Junior high school	63.1	35.2	32.6

Source : District Education Office

*Safe and clean classrooms

3 Efficiency

Although the total project cost was as planned (the ratio against the plan: 100%), as the number of schools was reduced from 37 to 33 and the construction of two schools was not completed, the project cost per Lot is deemed to have exceeded the plan. The project period significantly exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 244%), as there were delays in construction due to re-bidding etc. based on nonperformance by some local contractors.

Therefore, the efficiency of the project is low.

4 Sustainability

<Institutional Aspect>

Operation and maintenance (O&M) of the facilities provided under the project have been carried out by SMC of each school under the guidance of the District Education Office. The school system has had the required organizational structure to sustain the effect of the project. The organizational structure at the district level has been made up of three staff (the District Director of Education, the Planning Officer and the Accountant). At the School level, the structure has been made of the head teacher, and two scheduled teachers. At the SMC level, there have been about six members who have been responsible of O&M activities of the school. The number has been adequately sufficient to undertake

repairs and maintenance.

<Technical Aspect>

In each school, staff and SMC members jointly undertake planning for repairs and maintenance activities. They rely mainly on artisans in the community to undertake these repair works. They have adequate know-how to undertake maintenance of these activities and therefore, no problem has been observed in terms of planning of repairs and maintenance activities.

<Financial Aspect>

Though the schools have received a certain amount of capitation grant, these were either inadequate or irregular in terms of disbursement from the national level.

Revenue and maintenance expenditure of the schools visited

(Unit: GHC)

School	2015		2016		2017	
	Revenue: Capital Grant (Capitation Grant)	Expenditure for maintenance	Revenue: Capital Grant (Capitation Grant)	Expenditure for maintenance	Revenue: Capital Grant (Capitation Grant)	Expenditure for maintenance
Krofrofru M.A Primary	1,150	430	1,200	358	1,320	500
Adiambra Catholic Primary	1,380	360	1,439	454	1,458	543
Salimboukou B Primary	1,500	450	1,670	559	1,678	580
Konfali Primary	678	245	789	321	876	243
Kpabuso JHS	900	230	980	180	975	200
Karaga Primary	1,750	600	1,890	345	1,754	678

<Current Status of Operation and Maintenance>

The facilities installed under the project were confirmed by the District Education Offices to be in good condition. No major cracks or defects were reported by officials on all constructed schools under the project. The facilities of the schools visited during the survey were also observed to be in good condition except for minor defects such broken locks, weak hinges and loosen nails.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the sustainability of the project effect is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved its objective i.e. “To improve the quality of primary education environment of target schools in Northern Region and Central Region”, as the number of classrooms in good environment increased as planned, and the number of students per classroom significantly improved. Teachers and students were satisfied with the structures provided through the project and hence an improvement in the learning environment. As to the sustainability, although some limitations have been observed in the financial aspect, there has been no problem in terms of the institutional and technical aspects. As for efficiency, project cost of each Lot is deemed to have exceeded the plan and the project period significantly exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to Executing Agency:

- Two schools (Dani-Uuri Primary and Konfali Primary) earmarked under the project in the Sawla-Tuna-Kalba district were still uncompleted as at the time of project completion. As a result, the contracts with the contractors were terminated and the school blocks handed over to the Ministry of Education for completion. However, after initial efforts on the part of JICS and JICA to get MoE/GES started on completing these schools this completion exercise has been discontinued and no efforts are currently being made to complete them. There is the need for the Ministry of Education and the Ghana Education Service to engage the local authority (District Assembly) to make budgetary allocation for the completion of the school in the 2020 fiscal year. There is also the need for the communities to demand that the schools be completed to improve the teaching and learning environment in the district.

Lessons Learned for JICA

- The original challenge leading to the delay in construction of some schools had to do with price escalation due to high inflation and exchange rate effects at the time of construction. There is therefore the need for proper calculation of contract sums during the detailed design stage making adequate provision for price escalation due to inflation and exchange rate disparities.



Teachers Bungalow Constructed at Krofofordo
M.A. Primary Assin North District



3-Unit Class Room block constructed at Samlimboukou B
Primary School in the Bunkpurugu/Yunyoo District.