

Country Name	The Project for Capacity Development of the National School of Fisheries
The Union of Comoros	(Projet de Renforcement de Capacité de L'Ecole Nationale de Pêche)

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In the Comoros, the fishery sector is one of the important industries. Since the territory of the country is composed of small volcanic islands, arable lands and forestry resources are very limited. Utilization of coastal resources is valuable for livelihood of rural population. On the other hand, overfishing has been serious in the coastal areas in the country. In addition, while offshore fishing using small fishing boats were increasing, various problems, such as frequent accidents, malfunctioning boats, increasing volumes of putrid fish and wasted ones have occurred. Therefore, it was essential to provide the local fishery workers extension services and training opportunities in order to make use of limited fishery resources. The National School of Fisheries (L'Ecole Nationale de Pêche: ENP), which used to be the Fishery Training Center constructed by the grant aid by Japan, is the sole training institute for the fishery sector. It was upgraded to a vocational training institute in 2008 and restarted their operation in April 2009 after an interruption by the political turmoil since 1999. However, ENP had various operational issues, including lack of training materials, undeveloped training curriculums and so on. Under those situations, the Government of the Comoros requested the Government of Japan a technical cooperation project to support curriculum development and to enhance school management of ENP.</p>														
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through rehabilitation of training facilities, installation of training equipment, development of training materials, modules and textbooks, and trainings for teaching staff as well as preparation of annual budget plan and financial report of ENP, the project aimed at improvement of training and management capacity of ENP, thereby contributing to promotion of practice of safe and effective utilization of fishery resources by the local fishery workers and improvement of engagement of alumni of ENP into the fishery sector.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: 1) The trained local fishery workers practice safe and effective utilization of fishery resources. 2) The engagement of alumni with diploma of the long-term training program into the fishery sector is improved. Project Purpose: The capacity of the National School of Fisheries to provide adequate trainings is improved. 														
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: Whole country of the Comoros Main Activities: 1) Rehabilitation of training facilities, installation of training equipment and development of training materials, 2) Development of training module and preparation of text books and materials, 3) Training for teaching staff of ENP, 4) Preparation of annual budget plan and financial report of ENP Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Comorian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 10 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 31 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees Received: 9 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Project office</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Training in the third country: 3 persons (Morocco), 4 persons (Réunion and Mayotte, France)</td> <td>3) Local expenses: payrolls for part-time instructors, cost for repair of the facilities, food costs for trainees</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Equipment: 9m training boats, 6m training boats, maintenance equipment and tools, outboard engines, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5) Local expenses: Cost for rehabilitation of the facilities, training materials, translators, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Comorian Side	1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff allocated: 31 persons	2) Trainees Received: 9 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office	3) Training in the third country: 3 persons (Morocco), 4 persons (Réunion and Mayotte, France)	3) Local expenses: payrolls for part-time instructors, cost for repair of the facilities, food costs for trainees	4) Equipment: 9m training boats, 6m training boats, maintenance equipment and tools, outboard engines, etc.		5) Local expenses: Cost for rehabilitation of the facilities, training materials, translators, etc.	
Japanese Side	Comorian Side														
1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff allocated: 31 persons														
2) Trainees Received: 9 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office														
3) Training in the third country: 3 persons (Morocco), 4 persons (Réunion and Mayotte, France)	3) Local expenses: payrolls for part-time instructors, cost for repair of the facilities, food costs for trainees														
4) Equipment: 9m training boats, 6m training boats, maintenance equipment and tools, outboard engines, etc.															
5) Local expenses: Cost for rehabilitation of the facilities, training materials, translators, etc.															
Project Period	March 2011 – October 2014	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 317 million yen, (actual) 373 million yen												
Implementing Agency	National School of Fisheries (ENP)														
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries														

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special perspective to be considered in the ex-post evaluation>

[Verification of the level of achievement of the Overall Goal 1 at the time of ex-post evaluation]

At the time of terminal evaluation, it was difficult to verify the level of achievement of the two indicators for the Overall Goal 1 since the results of the end-line survey had not been compiled and the target value had not been fairly defined. In addition, although the end-line survey with 620 ex-participants was compiled after the terminal evaluation, no comparable data of the Indicator 1 for the Overall Goal 1 was available at the time of ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the achievement level of the Overall Goal 1 was judged by qualitative data collected through interviews with the director and teaching staff of ENP as well as ex-participants.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of the Comoros at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with the Comorian development policies of “Poverty Reduction and Growth Strategy Paper (PRGSP)” (2010) prioritizing the fishery sector to increase production and employment creation as well as the GDP share and the “Fishery Development Plan” (2004) including human resource development using function of ENP.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of the Comoros at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with the Comorian development needs of training opportunity for local fishery workers and improvement of

operation of ENP to provide better trainings for fishery workers in order to make use of limited fishery resources in the country.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy to the Comoros prioritizing support for basic human needs area including the fishery sector¹.

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

Since the main project activities were mainly conducted at ENP located in Anjouan Island which is the different island from the Grande Comore, where the capital is situated, the communication between the project team and the ministries at the national level was limited and there were limited chances for the decision makers of the ministries to recognize importance of human resource development in the fishery sector through trainings delivered by ENP. As a result the project limitedly affected the political decision and advocacy especially in terms of securing the sufficient budget for the school operation. Although the project design to improve training capacity of ENP was adequate to fill the development needs, there had been a room for improvement of communications between the project team and the key ministries, in particular for considering necessary arrangements for the post project period in order to enhance sustainability.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion. The regular training program was smoothly implemented for two academic years by using textbook and teaching materials developed by the project (Indicator 1). The total number of students completed the training program and certified (Indicator 2) was more than the target value of 60. Also, 661 participants, which far exceeded the target number of 180, completed the short-term training course developed by the project and obtained a certificate (Indicator 3).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been partially continued since the project completion. The regular training course was redesigned from one-year course introduced by the project to two-year training course in the academic year² of 2016/17. The decision was based on the observation that the 1 year is too short for the student to acquire necessary knowledge, skills, and competences. On the other hand, the textbooks and the teaching materials have been utilized for the two-year course. The number of participants for the regular training course decreased from 30 in the academic year of 2014/15 to 18 in 2015/16 for the one-year course and from 12 in 2016/17 to 6 in 2017/18 for the two-year course. There is no single definitive reason to explain this decrease in the number of the students. However, according to the interview with the teaching staffs and students, after the project completion, when all the technical assistance including the dispatch of Japanese experts was complete, the attractiveness of the training course gradually waned leading to the decline in reputation. The short-term training courses for local fishery workers have been delivered on an ad hoc basis. Although no short-term training course was implemented in the academic years of 2014/15 and 2015/16, 3 courses in 2016/17 and 10 courses in 2017/18 were delivered by financial support of the World Bank (WB). However, the courses in 2017/18 were not the short-term training course developed by the project.

Training equipment installed by the project, such as an icemaking machine and training boats, have been continuously utilized. The icemaking machine has been used for students to get knowledge and skills about ice production. Four boats (two 6m-boats and two 9m-boats) provided by the project have been in good conditions but have been partially used for the trainings for 2 days/week because of some parts such as out-boat motor and motor cover, have been damaged or malfunctioning and have not been repaired yet.

<Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

It can be judged that the Overall Goal 1 (practice of safe and effective utilization of fishery resources by fishery workers) has been partially achieved though no quantitative data available. According to the interview to the 5 ex-participants by the ex-post evaluation survey, they considered that the short-term training really contributed decrease in the number of accidents. They are aware of lots of measures to be taken which does not require any cost, such as for example, checking the weather in advance, sharing their outgoing plan with their families and fishery folks, taking the mobile phone with them, checking the status of the motors before departure, and so on (Indicator 1.1). Although there still exist young people who are overconfident and willing to take risks to show their powers, which often lead to the accident, many fishing communities succeeded in decreasing the accidents which are predictable and preventable. From the interviews, it was found that one who took the short-term training understand well the necessity of resource management while it is not easy to diffuse to the entire fishing community. For the partnership of the government, the result of the end-line-survey by the project was not very positive with some varieties among islands. From the interviews with the director, teaching staffs, and the ex-participants it was found that the tendency remains same showing the weak partnership with the government in general (Indicator 1.2).

The Overall Goal 2 has been partially achieved. The number of alumni of the regular training course working for the fishery sector increased after the project completion compared to during the project period. However, since the number of participants in the regular training course decreased from the academic year of 2014/2015 to 2015/16, the number of alumni working for the fishery industry also decreased. Also, they have been engaged in the fishery sector on not permanent work but contract basis. The CoreSUD Project (World Bank) hired 14 graduates (old and newly graduates) after March 2014 and the SWOFish Project (World Bank) also hired at least 3 graduates of the regular training course at ENP. A few are self-employed or working in the small factories financed by EU project.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No other positive and negative impact of the project was not confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) The capacity of the	1. Training program is smoothly implemented for two academic years by using newly	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Continued) (Project Completion)

¹ Ministry of Foreign Affairs, "ODA Databook 2011"

² The academic year starts September.

National School of Fisheries to provide adequate trainings is improved.	introduced teaching materials and textbooks.	<p>By using the newly developed textbooks and teaching materials, training programs were successfully implemented for the following two academic years:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The academic year of 2012/13 (two-year program) ➤ The academic year of 2013/14 (newly introduced one-year program) <p>(Ex-post evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● From 2016/2017, they changed the training course from 1 year to 2 years and ENP has been delivering the two-year program again in the academic year of 2016/17 and 2017/2018. ● The textbooks and teaching materials have been utilized. 																														
	2. 60 students complete their regular training program and obtain a certificate of competence.	<p>Status of the Achievement: Achieved. (Not continued) (Project Completion)</p> <p>The number of students completed the program and certified was follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The academic year of 2011/12-2012/13 (two-year program): 35 ➤ The academic year of 2013/14 (one-year program): 32 <p>(Ex-post evaluation)</p> <p>[The number of participants in the training program]</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="775 593 1544 891"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2014/15</th> <th>2015/16</th> <th>2016/17*</th> <th>2017/18*</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>No. of participants in total</td> <td>30</td> <td>18</td> <td>12</td> <td>6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of female participants</td> <td>0</td> <td>2</td> <td>1</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of graduates certified in total</td> <td>30</td> <td>18</td> <td>12**</td> <td>N.A.***</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of female graduates certified</td> <td>0</td> <td>2</td> <td>1</td> <td>N.A.***</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note 1:* Two-year training program Note 2: **8 already validated +4 expected Note 3: *** They are entering 2nd year from September, 2018</p>		2014/15	2015/16	2016/17*	2017/18*	No. of participants in total	30	18	12	6	No. of female participants	0	2	1	2	No. of graduates certified in total	30	18	12**	N.A.***	No. of female graduates certified	0	2	1	N.A.***					
	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17*	2017/18*																												
No. of participants in total	30	18	12	6																												
No. of female participants	0	2	1	2																												
No. of graduates certified in total	30	18	12**	N.A.***																												
No. of female graduates certified	0	2	1	N.A.***																												
	3. 180 local fishers complete their short-term training course and obtain a certificate of attendance.	<p>Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Partially continued) (Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● In total, 661 participants, including 36 female participants, completed for the short-term programs of 35 courses in total. ● Certificates of attendance were printed and they were distributed to the participants by the end of the project. <p>(Ex-post evaluation)</p> <p>[The number of short-term training program and participants]</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="775 1243 1544 1505"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2014/15</th> <th>2015/16</th> <th>2016/17</th> <th>2017/18</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>No. of short-term programs</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>3</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of participants</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>180</td> <td>14</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of female participants</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>N.A.</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of participants completing and certified</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>180</td> <td>14</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of female participants completing and certified.</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>N.A.</td> <td>1</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● In 2016, they conducted 3 short-term training programs financed by the World Bank. They were conducted for three subjects for three islands. ● In 2017, again financed by the World Bank, newly recruited 14 extension workers employed under the World Bank Project from 3 islands were trained for 19 days. However, it was not short-term training program developed under the Project, but it was special training courses, which summarize the contents of the regular training course. 		2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18	No. of short-term programs	0	0	3	1	No. of participants	0	0	180	14	No. of female participants	0	0	N.A.	1	No. of participants completing and certified	0	0	180	14	No. of female participants completing and certified.	0	0	N.A.	1
	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18																												
No. of short-term programs	0	0	3	1																												
No. of participants	0	0	180	14																												
No. of female participants	0	0	N.A.	1																												
No. of participants completing and certified	0	0	180	14																												
No. of female participants completing and certified.	0	0	N.A.	1																												
(Overall Goal) 1. The trained local fishery workers practice safe and effective utilization of fishery resources.	1.1 The number of fishers who use the principle of security at sea increases	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not verified ● No data was available but the 5 respondents recognized that the number of accidents decreased by the measures which they had learned at ENP																														
	1.2. The fishers understand more about necessity of resource management and partnership with the government.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. ● Proportion of the ex-participants of short-term training program responding understanding on necessity of interaction with government officials for resource management in 2014/15: 20% in Grande Comore, 40% in Anjouan, 18% in Moheli ● Proportion of the ex-participants short-term training program responding satisfaction with the fishery administration including resource management: 35% in Grande Comore, 55% in Anjouan, 15% in Moheli																														
2. The engagement of alumni with diploma of	2.1 The number of alumni who work for the fishery activities increases from the ones for	(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved. [No. alumni of t(he one-year)regular training program working for the fishery sectors]																														

the long-term training program into the fishery sector is improved.	the period from 2009 to 2011.	2009-2011	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18
		3 out of 32	15> out of 30	5 out of 18	---*	N.A .out of 12
		*Since regular training program was changed to two-year from 2016/17, there is no new graduate that year.				

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Project Completion Report, Interview with ENP, ex-participants

3 Efficiency

The project cost and period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 117% and 102%, respectively). The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

Under the “Accelerated Growth and Development Strategy (Stratégie de Croissance Accélérée et de Développement Durable: SCA2D)” (2018-2021), the fishery sector is regarded as an important sector that will make an important contribution to the structural transformation of the Comorian economy, the well-being and the food for the populations by a sustainable management of the fishery rent and an accelerated development of the production of the sub-sector. The government also intends to put human capital development at the center of SCA2D's priorities. Therefore, the necessity of trainings at ENP has been endorsed by the government policy.

<Institutional Aspect>

ENP has mostly sustained necessary organizational setting for delivery of trainings and operation and management (O&M) of the training equipment provided by the project. The school management committees, such as the Advisory Committee, the Training Boat Management Committee, the Library Committee and Material Management Committee, have been fully functioning or functioning except the Ice Committee. Since ice production and sales activities has been stagnated due to decrease in ice demand in the area of ENP, the Ice Committee has not been functioning and the responsibility of book keeping on ice sales was transferred to the administrative section. The reason of the decreasing demand for ice is electrification in the area of ENP which enables neighboring households to produce ice at home. While the number of teaching staff (7 permanent instructors and 2 contract-based instructors) has been sufficient, the number of administrative staff (18 permanent and 10 contract-based) has been sufficient or maybe too many for the work load. Only two instructors trained by the project left ENP after the project.

<Technical Aspect>

The instructors sustained necessary knowledge and skills to deliver the one-year training course and the short-term training courses. The competency of the instructors is also recognized by the partner organizations and the Regional Office of the Ministry of Fishery. At the same time, it is noteworthy that almost all the instructors mentioned the need to have the further training to update their knowledge which could adapt to the recent development in the sector. There are just two instructors newly recruited. However, there is no training system for the newly recruited instructors because the school believes that they recruited for the one competent enough to deliver the training course.

Currency Unit in KMF

<Financial Aspect>

The serious problem is that there is no comprehensive financial data available to assess financial position of ENP. ENP insisted that they lost all the data because the hard disk of the PC was broken and that they did not keep any backup nor hardcopy with them. All the data collected by this ex-post evaluation survey was from the treasury note on the ice selling and the fee collection from the students. However, without the detailed data, it was found during the ex-post evaluation that no budget other than payroll of the staffs has been distributed to the school for the last few years. The revenue from the ice selling has been used for the operation of the school especially for the electricity bills and the fuel (of the boats used in the practical training), but when all the expenses cannot be covered by the revenue, the gaps often needs to be filled by the director's pocket. There is no budget for replicating the training manuals and maintaining the equipment which leads to the deterioration of the quality of the training in the long run. There is no special finance arrangement borne by the partnership agreement in the fishery sector between the EU and Comoros, which had been the important source of the revenue for the ENP during the project, since the partnership agreement was denounced in 2017.

	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18 (plan)
Budget from the Ministry of National Education ³	-	N.A.	N.A.	-
Sales of ice	1,690,000	1,472,150	1,474,200	1,340,150
Entrance fee of the one-year regular program	69,000	195,000	245,000	275,000
Dormitory fee	300,000	225,000	125,000	104,500

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, there is a serious problem of the financial aspect of the implementing agency, the sustainability of the effects through the project is low.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project partially achieved the Project Purpose and partially achieved the Overall Goal to develop human resources for the fishery sector and to disseminate practices for safe and effective use of fishery resources in the Comoros through delivery of trainings by ENP. As for the sustainability, there is a serious financial problem of ENP. As for the efficiency, the project cost and period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency: (For Ministry of National Education)

In order to operate ENP supported under the project, it is necessary that ENP receives the operational budget. Without any operational budget, ENP is having difficulty for the payment (ex. Water and Electricity, Fuel for the boat, maintenance of the equipment, duplication of the textbooks and materials). In addition, in order to maximize the utilization of the equipment provided by the Project, the Ministry should work with the ENP to repair the training boats damaged. As ENP is under the Ministry of Education, the Ministry should distribute the

³ The Ministry of National Education, Research, Culture, Arts for Youth and Sports

necessary operational budget to ENP as soon as possible.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- It is important that the result of the end-line survey is ready by the time of project completion, which makes it possible to identify the necessary actions to be taken before and/or after the end of the project. It also allows some time for the adjustment, if the result does not show the sufficient data necessary to conduct the post-evaluation especially in terms of level of achievement of the Overall Goal. Therefore, it is essential to plan and design baseline and end-line surveys at the time of project planning as well as to firmly conduct the surveys to collect necessary data for verification of project effects.
- For the project site(s) is away from the capital of the country, it is necessary to consider strategically how to advocate the good result of the project to the central ministry/ministries or how to communicate with them in order to solve the problems at the project sites. Those elements should be well taken into consideration at the planning stage, for example, placing one short-term expert in the central ministry, setting up the regular meeting in the capital. In addition, activities to enhance communication among stakeholders and to facilitate decision makers to mobilize resources, including budget allocation for the implementing agency should be incorporated in project component.



The equipment provided under the project
, operated by the teaching staffs



The boats provided under the Project