

Country Name	Project on Integrated Urban Development Master Plan for the City of Nairobi								
Republic of Kenya									
I. Project Outline									
Background	The long term national development plan, “Vision 2030,” shows the long-term national development strategy of Kenya, aims at becoming a middle income country by 2030 and provides the baseline of the economic, social, and political frameworks. Nairobi City plays an important role not only as a political centre but also as a model for economic and social development. The urban development plan of Nairobi City, on the other hand, had not been updated since 1973 and its direction was not clearly defined. Besides, the population growth in Nairobi, urban problems such as perennial traffic congestion, expansion of slum areas, and environment deterioration had been left unsolved for a long time and were already causing negative impacts on the economic activities and daily lives of the people in Nairobi City. In order to accelerate sound and sustainable development, an integrated urban master plan was needed for improvement of the transport network, water supply and sewerage, solid waste management, and living environment have to be improved.								
Objectives of the Project	By developing the urban development master plan for 2030 and policies, systems and guidelines for urban development in the city of Nairobi, the project contributes to implementation of urban infrastructure projects based on the integrated urban plan and sustainable development and live environment improvement in the city of Nairobi.								
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Expected Goals through the proposed plan¹: Through implementation of the proposed plan, appropriate land use and urban facilities development will be promoted. Expected utilization of the proposed plan: The master plan proposed by the project is approved by the government as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan. 								
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: City of Nairobi Main activities: 1) situational analysis related to urban development in Nairobi City, 2) analysis of development potential and future constraints and issues, 3) development of the social and economic framework for 2030, 4) development of vision and structure plans, 5) environmental assessment, 6) development of the land use plan, 7) development of capacity development framework, etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Kenyan Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Mission members: 13 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 8 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Equipment: office equipment, etc.</td> <td>2) Operation cost.</td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Kenyan Side	1) Mission members: 13 persons	1) Staff allocated: 8 persons	2) Equipment: office equipment, etc.	2) Operation cost.
Japanese Side	Kenyan Side								
1) Mission members: 13 persons	1) Staff allocated: 8 persons								
2) Equipment: office equipment, etc.	2) Operation cost.								
Project Period	November 2012 to December 2014 (Extended period: February 2014 to December 2014)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 310 million yen, (actual) 372 million yen						
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development (Changed from the Ministry of Local Government due to the government restructuring in 2013), Nairobi City County (NCC)								
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Nippon Koei Co. Ltd, International Development Center of Japan Incorporated, Eight-Japan Engineering Consultants, Inc.								

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraint of Evaluation>

- First, due to the limited time and resources for the ex-post evaluation survey, sufficient information and data were not collected from the agencies which implement projects proposed by the project. It was attributed to the absence of data accumulation at the Government of NCC (NCCG). Second, effects of the projects proposed by the project could not be confirmed, since few has just started due to the delayed approval of the master plan. Therefore, judgement of the project effectiveness/impact and sustainability was based on the obtained data and information.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Kenya at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with Kenyan development policies, as development of a strategic investment plan for the urban area was prioritized in the “First Medium Term Plan” (2008-2012) of the national plan “Kenya Vision 2030.” The “Second Medium Term Plan” (2013-2017) targeted development of a framework for preparation of 47 County Spatial and Urban Development Plans and finalization of the National Urban Development Policy. Thus, the project was consistent at time of both the ex-ante evaluation and project completion.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Kenya at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

While the population of Nairobi was growing, urban problems were left unsolved and are causing negative impacts like perennial traffic congestion, expansion of slum areas, insecurity, poor urban governance, and environment deterioration. An integrated urban master plan was needed to improve infrastructure such as transport network, water supply, sewerage reticulation energy, and so on.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

In the Country Assistance Policy for Kenya (2012), one of the priority areas was economic infrastructure development. Thus, the project was consistent with Japan’s ODA policy at the time of the ex-ante evaluation.

¹ The degree of achievement of expected goals is not to be assessed in principle at the time of ex-post evaluation, since it is defined as the medium-to-long-term goals which will be attained as a result of crystallizing the proposed plan (“output” of the project).

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Objectives at the Time of Project Completion>

The objectives were achieved. Through the project activities, the master plan for 2030 (NIUPLAN) was drafted which included land use policy, road network development policy, urban infrastructure development strategies, capacity development framework, besides proposed programs and projects. The capacity development framework includes training goal, target, timeframe and approaches. According to the Urban Planning Chief Officer, NIUPLAN has been useful as a general guide for the city development, while detailed plans for the sub centers need to be prepared to allow for the implementation of the master plan at the district and lower levels. For implementation of NIUPLAN, the framework of capacity development of NCC was prepared.

<Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the Time of Ex-post Evaluation>

NIUPLAN was approved by the government as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan in August 2016. In NIUPLAN, 38 projects were proposed, prioritizing 20 projects of the five sectors. As of December 2018, among the five high priority projects for the intermediate term (2-3 years)², two projects of the urban transport sector have been planned, while three have been at the preparatory study phase because it has taken time for establishment of an inter-agency coordination mechanism. Regarding priority projects for the short term (4-5 years), three of 14 have been planned or implemented. For example, the preparatory survey for the Nairobi Viaduct and Road Improvement Project has been implemented by JICA as NIUPLAN's flagship project. Further, the World Bank has supported the ITS City Master Plan, which is one of the short term projects. Also, the detailed land use plan for Kilimani District was prepared, which has been under public consultation with technical assistance by JICA Urban Planning Advisor (2016-2018).

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the Time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Since NIUPLAN was approved in August 2016, no proposed project has been completed as of the ex-post evaluation, and therefore, its effects cannot be confirmed. Regarding capacity development on urban development administration of the Government of NCC (NCCG), after NIUPLAN was approved, presentation and sensitization sessions were conducted for the County Assembly and representatives of the implementing agency. On the other hand, the technical level of the Urban Planning Department of NCCG on urban development has not been sufficient, because skill transfer from the project was not enough due to their limited capacity development provided by JICA mission during the project period.

<Other Impact at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

There was one case of land acquisition, in which the Wakulima market traders are expected to be affected under the proposed project "Nairobi Viaduct and Road Improvement Project." A new market site for relocating the traders will be established nearby.

As an institutional impact, for NIUPLAN implementation, the national and county governments established the Nairobi Metropolitan Urban Transport Authority in 2017 for coordination on urban transport, which is awaiting the parliament approval at the time of the ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Utilization of the Proposed Plan and Achievement of Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan) The master plan proposed by the project is approved by the government as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan.	1. The master plan proposed by the project is approved by the government as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - NIUPLAN was approved by the government as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan in August 2016.
	2. Number of the master plan and implemented projects of land development and urban facilities development which were proposed by the project	<u>Status of achievement: Partially achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - 38 projects were proposed in the master plan. Among the five high priority projects for the intermediate term (2-3 years), two have been planned. Three more high priority projects for the short term (4-5 years) have been planned or implemented. Besides, one feasibility study has been implemented, and one land use plan was developed.
(Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan) Through implementation of the proposed plan, appropriate land use and urban facilities development will be promoted.	1. Status of the infrastructure development based on the land use plan	<u>Status of achievement: Not achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - No project has been completed as of the ex-post evaluation.
	2. Mitigation of the traffic congestion	<u>Status of achievement: Not verified.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - No project has been completed as of the ex-post evaluation.
	3. Improvement of the water supply coverage rate	<u>Status of achievement: Not verified.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - No project has been completed as of the ex-post evaluation.
	4. Capacity development on urban development administration (planning and update)	<u>Status of achievement: Partially achieved.</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - After the approval of NIUPLAN, presentation and sensitization sessions have been conducted by the Director of Urban Development of NCCG and JICA expert (Policy Advisor) for the Country Assembly and representatives of the implementing agencies of the proposed projects. - According to the Chief Officer of the Urban Planning Department, the technical level of the Urban Planning Department of NCCG on urban development has not been

² Priority projects for the intermediate and short terms are expected to be planned and/or implemented in 2-3 years and 4-5 years, respectively, after the inception of NIUPLAN.

sufficient and requires further capacity building.

(Source) Project Completion Report, and data/information obtained from NCCG.

3 Efficiency

Both of the project cost and period exceeded the plan (ratios against the plan: 120% and 173%, respectively). This is mainly because implementation of SEA was additionally required (increase of the output), since Nairobi City was upgraded to a country. This resulted in seven month-extension of the project period (ratio against the changed plan: 136%). Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

Urban Planning is required as per the County Government Act of 2012. The “National Urban Development Policy” (2018) regulates devolution, classification and management of urban areas, including popular participation. Through the project, NIUPLAN was approved by the government as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan in August 2016.

<Institutional Aspect>

At NCCG, there have been seven officers in the section in charge of NIUPLAN and the number of officers has not been sufficient to fulfill responsibilities, according to themselves. Demarcation among NCCG and other related agencies have been clear, they have lacked a coordination mechanism. Data on the staff number were not available from the implementing agencies.

<Technical Aspect>

While the Urban Planning Department of NCCG has not gained sufficient skills on urban development and management, a follow up technical support to coordinate implementation of NIUPLAN and project monitoring was done through the Project on Detailed Planning of Integrated Transport System and Loop Line Project in the Nairobi Urban Core (2017-2018) and JICA Urban Planning Advisor (2016-2018). Further, individual executing agencies for the proposed priority projects have gained experience through other JICA projects. For example, the Kenya Urban Roads Authority has had opportunities for capacity building from the Ngong Road Development Project I (2012) and II (2017).

<Financial Aspect>

Financial data were not available from the implementing agencies of the projects proposed by NIUPLAN. NCCG could not obtain such data, as most of the projects are still under formulation.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

In the project, the master plan for 2030 (NIUPLAN) was developed, including 38 proposed projects for urban development. After the project completion, NIUPLAN was approved by the government as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan in August 2016. As of the ex-post evaluation, few proposed projects have been implemented, so it was too early to confirm their impacts. Capacity development of NCCG has not been sufficiently realized for urban development and management but, as additional technical support was provided by JICA expert. Regarding sustainability, there have been issues such as staff shortage, lack of institutionalized inter-agency coordination. With regard to the project efficiency, both the project period and cost exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- It is recommended to NCCG to set up a coordination mechanism among NCCG and other related agencies, in order to speed up planning and implementation of the proposed projects and monitor the progress, in which they could share NIUPLAN’s goal and proposed projects and discuss detailed plans for implementation.
- It is recommended to NCCG to conduct trainings for the Urban Planning Department staff on urban development and management, based on the capacity development framework prepared by the project.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- NIUPLAN was drafted by the project completion in December 2014 and officially approved as the fourth Nairobi Urban Development Plan in August 2016. As of the time of the ex-post evaluation, among the five high priority projects for the intermediate term (2-3 years), two projects of the urban transport sector have been planned, and besides, three priority projects for the short term (4-5 years) have been started. On the other hand, some intermediate projects have been at the preparatory study phase because of the late approval of NIUPLAN and also inter-agency coordination. In projects for development of the master plan, it is desirable that the master plan would not only propose projects but also have an opportunity to explain proposed projects and necessary human and financial resources to concerned agencies during the project period, in order to ensure implementation of the proposed projects. Thus, after the project completion, the coordinating agency could continue this negotiation process with the concerned agencies to secure budgets and human resources for timely planning and implementation of proposed projects, without counting on an assumption that they would be automatically assigned.



Handover ceremony of NIUPLAN
(Governor of Nairobi City County and Japanese Ambassador)



Governor of Nairobi City Council and school children in the exhibition of
the city's visions