

## Summary of the Terminal Evaluation

<b>1.Outline of Project</b>	
Country: Republic of Colombia	
Project Title: OVOP Colombia Project	
Issue/Sector: Urban Development and Regional Development	
Type of Assistance: Technical Cooperation Project	
Department in charge: Team 1, Agricultural and Rural Development Group 1, Rural Development Department	
Total Cost : 460 million yen	
Cooperation Period	March 1 <sup>st</sup> 2014 – February 28 <sup>th</sup> 2018 (4 years) (R/D signed: March 27 <sup>th</sup> 2013)
	Partner Country’s Implementing Organization: National Department of Planning (DNP), Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD), Ministry of Commerce, Industry and Tourism (MINCIT), Ministry of Culture (Min.Cultura), Social Prosperity (PS), National Training Service (SENA), Artisanias of Colombia (ADC), Solidarity Organizations (OS), Colombian Presidential Agency of International Cooperation (APC)
Related Cooperation: Trainings in Japan related to rural development and tourism, Grant Assistance for Grass-Roots Human Security Projects	
<p><b>1-1 Background of the Project and</b></p> <p>As the Government of the Republic of Colombia (hereinafter referred to as ‘Colombia’) reached the peace agreement with the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia (FARC) in 2016, the Colombian society has been moving towards reconstruction and stabilization. However, social and economic disparity, which was the main cause of the armed conflicts, and aggravated by the conflict, calls for immediate attention.</p> <p>Under such social circumstances, Colombian government initiated the One Village One Product (hereinafter referred to as ‘OVOP’) Movement in 2009. The objective of the promotion of OVOP is not only to restore the war-torn rural economy but also to restore the trust among rural people including the victims of the conflicts as well as the vulnerables. After the initiation of OVOP Movement, Colombian government, with the partnership of Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), endeavoured to establish mechanisms to promote OVOP, through such measures as OVOP seminars and the establishment of the OVOP National Committee consisting of several organizations. JICA provided support through, for instance, the dispatch of 2 short-term experts (promotion of OVOP Movement and local development), training in Japan (promotion of OVOP Movement), and provision of advice to the OVOP National Committee for the selection of 12 Initiatives (*1). In March 2014, JICA started a technical cooperation project, namely ‘One Village One Product “OVOP” Colombia Project’ (hereinafter referred to as ‘the Project’) to support more robustly the OVOP in Colombia. The counterparts (hereinafter referred to as ‘CPs’) of the Project are nine organizations of the central government, of which the main CP is National Department of Planning (DNP). The Project targets 12 Initiatives selected by the OVOP National Committee.</p> <p>The Project supports mainly to the establishment of a model to promote OVOP by the OVOP National Committee, as well as the implementation of the action plans and business plans prepared by the OVOP Municipal Committees and the respective Initiatives. The Project draws close attention to the balanced realization of ”competitiveness of the products and services” of each Initiative, and ”community participation and social inclusion” to deliver benefits to a large number of people. The Project is thus expected to expand economic opportunities of the regions affected by the conflict while contribute to enhancing coexistence, reconciliation, and solidarity among various categories of vulnerable people, such as victims of conflicts, ex-combatants, people with disabilities, and indigenous people.</p> <p>JICA undertook a mid-term review in August 2016, with a view to streamlining the activities of the Project, in such a way as to serve as a basis for the local development model in the Colombian context. The purpose of this terminal evaluation is to evaluate at the results of the Project to be completed in February 2018, and to consider lessons learned for the remaining period of the Project as well as for similar projects in the future.</p>	

(\*1) An “Initiative” refers to organizations, associations and/or groups of communities, which promote local development through their own products, services, and ideas unique to their territories.

## 1-2 Project Overview

The Project provides support for local development to revitalize rural economy based on the philosophy and the principles of the OVOP, through the utilization of local products as well as the establishment and restoration of trust among community people. Concretely, the Project assists in achieving the balance between the strengthening of product competitiveness and community participation/social inclusion. Contents of the supports are the institutional development for the promotion of OVOP and capacity building. It is expected to establish an inclusive local development model, and thus contribute to the enhancement of the local development in Colombia, by utilizing the results of these supports.

### (1) Overall Goal

Social cohesion and autonomy of communities are strengthened to revitalize territories in contribution to peace in Colombia.

### (2) Objective of the Project

An inclusive local development model based on the principles of OVOP Movement is established as a strategy of local development policies in Colombia

### (3) Outputs

1. Institutional mechanism and capacities of actors (\*) in national level are strengthened for the implementation of OVOP, as the roles and the functions of each actor at the national level are clarified.
2. Institutional mechanisms and capacities of actors in local level are established and strengthened for the implementation of OVOP through the Initiatives as the roles and functions of each actor at the local level are clarified.
3. Capacities to develop, improve, sell and manage the products and services of the organizations and groups related with the initiatives are improved through implementation of business plan with special attention to community participation and product competitiveness.
4. The strategy and methodology documents for the implementation of the inclusive local development model of OVOP based on experiences of the Initiatives are formulated and promoted.

### (4) Inputs

Japanese side: Total cost 460 million Yen

Long-term expert: 1 person

Machinery and equipment: 610,963 Yen

Short-term experts: 6 persons

Local cost: 89,060,516Yen

Training in Japan: 74 persons

Colombian side:

Assignment of Counterparts: 60 persons

Provision of offices and facilities: One project office in DNP central office from March 2014 onwards, with the telephone and internet connection. Office spaces for the Project experts and local staff were provided by ADC (from May to December 2016), by OS (from May 2016 to March 2017) and in Chamber of Commerce in Armenia municipality of Quindío Department (from May 2016 onwards). The internet and utility cost born by the CP organizations.

Local Cost (up to July 2017): 1,274,763,834 Colombian Peso(47,213,475 Yen, including human resource cost, 1 yen=23 Colombian peso)

## 2. Outline of the Mission

Members of the Evaluation Team	Japanese side		
	Name	Designation	Position and organization
	Mr. Toru Homma	Leader	Senior Advisor (Private Sector Development) JICA
	Ms. Eri Komukai	Peacebuilding / social inclusion	Senior Advisor (Peacebuilding) JICA
Ms. Maho Chujo	Cooperation planning	Deputy Director, Team 1, Agricultural and Rural Development Group1, Rural Development Department, JICA	

	Ms. Rika Fujioka	Evaluation and Analysis	Senior Consultant Koei Research and Consulting Inc.
<u>Colombian side</u>			
	Name		Position and organization
	María Carolina Amador Silva		OVOP Coordinator, Department of Territorial and Sustainable Development, DNP
	María Fernanda Vargas		OVOP Coordinator, Department of Territorial and Sustainable Development, DNP
	Juan Carlos Sandoval Plata		Officer (in charge of Japan), Official Development Aid Department, Colombian Presidential Agency for International Cooperation (APC)
	Dora Peña		Contact person with DNP, APC
Period of Evaluation	From August 15 to September 7, 2017		Type of Evaluation: Terminal evaluation
<b>3.Summary of Results</b>			
3-1 Progress of the Project			
(1) Achievement of Results			
<b><u>Output 1: Institutional mechanism and capacities of actors (*) in national level are strengthened for the implementation of OVOP, as the roles and the functions of each actor at the national level are clarified.</u></b>			
<b>Level of achievement: partially achieved.</b>			
<p>The draft concept paper of the National Committee was prepared and distributed in September 2015. Its revised contents, based on the review will be incorporated in the strategy / methodology documents (Indicator 1-1). The action plan of the National Committee was prepared and monitored. However, in general, its contents do not reflect the situations and the needs of the Initiatives (Indicator 1-2). It is difficult to coordinate a relatively large number of Committee members with different degrees of commitments. As such, the National Committee did not appear to be functioning as the institutional mechanism to contribute to the implementation of the Project, as planned. Nevertheless, the Committee provides a good venue for the exchange of information (Indicator 1-3). In terms of the capacity building, the expected results were not achieved due largely to frequent change of personnel assignment (Indicator 1-4). Yet, DNP, the main CP has been fulfilling the role of coordination and monitoring.</p>			
<b><u>Output 2: Institutional mechanisms and capacities of actors in local level are established and strengthened for the implementation of OVOP through the Initiatives as the roles and functions of each actor at the local level are clarified.</u></b>			
<b>Level of achievement: mostly achieved.</b>			
<p>The Local Committees were established at 9 out of 12 originally identified Initiatives, most of which have prepared and are implementing the action plans (Indicators 2-1 and 2-2). In Quindío Department, 7 additional municipalities (Initiatives) have their OVOP Committees established. They have prepared and are implementing their action plans. The monitoring of the action plans has been undertaken at most of these Initiatives (Indicator 2-3). It can therefore be considered that the institutional mechanism to facilitate the Project implementation has been materialized at several initiatives, to a large extent. With regard to the capacity building, the former trainees have been sharing within their organizations and utilizing the lessons learned in Japan and Dominican Republic.</p>			
<b><u>Output 3: Capacities to develop, improve, sell and manage the products and services of the organizations and groups related with the initiatives are improved through implementation of business plan with special attention to community participation and product competitiveness.</u></b>			
<b>Level of achievement: mostly achieved.</b>			
<p>8 out of originally identified Initiatives, and all the 7 newly added Initiatives in Quindío Department prepared their business plans (Indicator 3-1). Most of them are implementing the plans (Indicator 3-2). There is overall improvement in terms both of community participation / social inclusion (at 10 initiatives: Indicator 3-3) and product competitiveness (at 8 initiatives: Indicator 3-4). Activities for further improvement will be undertaken.</p>			
<b><u>Output 4: The strategy and methodology documents for the implementation of the inclusive local</u></b>			

development model of OVOP based on experiences of the Initiatives are formulated and promoted.

**Level of achievement: mostly achieved.**

There has been a series of methodology documents prepared (Indicator 4-1). The strategy document is scheduled to be finalized in February 2018. The finalized version will be disseminated at the DNP portal (Indicator 4-2). Various brochures, as well as the good practices and video materials of the Project will be disseminated at DNP portal. Some public relations activities have already been in progress at existing websites of Departmental and municipal governments (Indicator 4-3). National and international seminars to share the experiences and lessons learned have already been organized. Another national seminar is scheduled for December 2017 (Indicator 4-4).

(2) Prospect for achieving **Objective of the Project**

Project purpose: An inclusive local development model based on the principles of OVOP Movement is established as a strategy of local development policies in Colombia.

**Level of achievement: partially achieved.**

The National Committee has been serving as a venue for information exchange. However, the strengthening of an institutional mechanism to promote the Project information was materialized to a limited degree (Indicator 1). At the local level, the OVOP committees have been established at a number of Initiatives, and the action plans have been prepared and implemented, in such a way as to contribute to the Project implementation (Indicator 2). There is a clear reference to OVOP at the current National Development Plan. Indicator 3 and 4 are considered mostly achieved as the result of the Output 3. Indicator 3-3 and 3-4 shows. However, these indicators need to be reconsidered in terms of the evaluation purpose.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

**Relevance of the Project is high.**

The Project is in line with the policies and priorities of both Colombia and Japan. The selection of the target groups and sites has been done in such a way as to contribute to the consideration and formulation of the OVOP-based local development model in diverse contexts and characteristics of the 12 Initiatives. The selection of DNP (responsible organization for the strategy planning) as the main C/P of the Project, and the OVOP as a method (utilization of local resources, creativity, etc.) are considered appropriate in the context of the local development in Colombia where the peace agreement is being implemented.

(2) Effectiveness

**Effectiveness of the Project is medium.**

The due attention paid to the balance between community participation / social inclusion and product competitiveness, adoption of the slogan “Mi Pueblo, Mi Producto, Mi Orgullo”, as well as the (Colombian) OVOP methodology seem to be effective for the achievement of the Project purpose. In the meantime, the OVOP National Committee does not fully fulfill its expected role. With regard to the indicators, the indicators 3 and 4 of the Project purpose are almost identical to the indicators 3-3 and 3-4 of the Output 3. In this sense, they need to be reconsidered in terms of the evaluation purpose.

(3) Efficiency

**Efficiency of the Project is relatively high.**

Notwithstanding the initial delay in the dispatch of Japanese experts, as well as some adjustment undertaken due to the shift in focus of the Project implementation (from the level of National OVOP Committee to the Departmental level), the Project activities have been implemented almost according to the plan. The sharing and utilization of the lessons learned from the training programs in Japan and Dominican Republic are not so active at the central level, but are very active at the local level.

(4) Impact

**The impact of the Project is relatively high.**

In terms of the strengthening of the community bonds and the materialization of self-reliant communities, the OVOP-based local development seem to be appropriate for the context of Colombia, namely, the implementation process of the peace agreement. In addition, there are ramifications to non-target groups around the localities of the Initiatives (start of activities in non-target localities, participation of the youth, etc.). With regard to the achievement of the overall

goal (social cohesion and autonomy of communities are strengthened to revitalize territories in contribution to peace in Colombia), it may be achieved if due attention is paid to (a) expansion of the Department-driven Initiatives; (b) recording of quantitative data, especially concerning the indicators 3 and 4 (overall goal), before the end of the Project; and (c) possible policy (re)orientation in conjunction with the 2018 Presidential election.

(5) Sustainability

**The sustainability of the Project is medium.**

There is a good prospect for “OVOP” to be referred in local development policies. The sustainability is likely to be ensured through the transfer of techniques. The shift in focus of the Project implementation to the Departmental level appears appropriate. Yet, in terms of sustainability, the establishment of this mechanism needs additional support to strengthen the capacity for Departmental level implementation.

3-3 Factors that promoted realization of effect

(1) Factors concerning planning

- The high level of understanding among the former trainees of the lessons learned from the training in Japan and a third country, as well as their utilization and sharing, have been contributing to the formulation of the OVOP-based local development model, as stipulated in the Project purpose.

(2) Factors concerning Implementation process

- The pairing of Japanese experts and local coordinators under respective main thematic responsibilities, and their collaboration in all the thematic areas, to respond to diverse needs of the Initiatives, have contributed to producing good result, especially at the Initiatives.
- The adoption of method in view of the Colombian context, such as the slogan and OVOP methodology, contributed to increasing interest among the Initiatives and beyond.

3-4 Factors that inhibited realization of effect

(1) Factors concerning planning

- Some indicators for the project purpose and output 3 which are similar or almost identical. The evaluation based on these indicators is difficult.

(2) Factors concerning Implementation process

- There is a difficulty in coordinating the National Committee members (CPs) with varied degrees of interest and commitment. The expected outcome, which is to contribute to the Project implementation to respond to the local needs, was not fully materialized to a limited degree at the central level. The consequent shift of the focus of the Project implementation towards the Departmental level demonstrated a possibility for the Project purpose to be achieved, based on the proactive activities of local-level actors.

3-5 Conclusion

This Project is in line with the policies and needs of Colombia and the development assistance policies of Japan. The planning is appropriate. Therefore, the significance of the implementation is high. In terms of the evaluation, its relevance is high, and its efficiency and impact are relatively high. The effectiveness and sustainability are medium. However, in terms of sustainability, it may be expected, with due attention to paid to the shift in focus of the Project implementation to the Departmental level, and the potential policy (re)orientation in conjunction of the presidential election. In order to appropriately deal with these issues, including the strengthening of the support mechanism, the extension of the Project period for 2 years is recommended, as explained later under “Recommendations”.

3-6 Recommendations

For the achievement of the Project Purpose and further enurement of the Overall Goal, the Evaluation Team proposed to extend the project period for two years to 1) strengthen the capacity to implment OVOP at the central level (Output 1) and 2) strengthen capacity to implement and disseminate OVOP at the departmental level (Output 2).

(1) Activities to be implemented by the end of the present project period (until february 2018)

- Completion of Strategy Document by DNP and Project team
- Completion of department level OVOP model based on the experience from Quindío

- Transition of main counterpart: from DNP as a policy making institutin to MARD or SENA as implementing institution
  - Modification of PDM (on OVOP national and Departmental Committiees etc.)
  - Signing of Minutes to modify the original R/D among JICA, DNP, APC and next main counterpart until November 2017
  - Implementation of End line survey (especially for the collection of quantitative data for the indicatios 3 and 4 of Overall Goal)
- (2) Activites to be implemented during the extention period
- Application of community development model based on OVOP within a post conflict context
  - information sharing for the smooth implementation of the project by the next main counterpart before and after presidential ellection of Colombia

### 3-7 Lessons Learned

- (1) The Project cleary set apparently two contradictory directions of community participation / social inclusion and product competitiveness and made them merged into an inclusive reigional development model with conplete guidelines based on expericences of OVOP activites.
- (2) The Prject buit the concept of OVOP Colombia by naming the producers' groups "initiatives" and setting the slogan of "my village, my product, my pride." This helped the actors to understand community/people-centered approach of OVOP.
- (3) Since the poject is not static but dynamic, an appropriate intititional framework shold be adopted depends on the progress of the project.
- (4) Flexibility in the implementation should be respected and reorientation of the Project in a timely manner is indespensable to cope with the dynamics that the project has.
- (5) Continuous effort and patience for long term are required for the community development. It is very helpful to collect tangible examples of good/bad practices during such long- term experiences.