

Summary of Terminal Evaluation Results

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Republic of Kosovo	Project title: Project for Capacity Development of Radio Television of Kosovo
Issue/Sector: Broadcasting	Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation
Department in charge: Industrial Development and Public Policy Dept.	Total cost (as of the Terminal Evaluation): Approx. 350 million JPY
Period of Cooperation: (R/D) October 2, 2015 – October 1, 2017	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Radio Television of Kosovo (RTK)
<p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>RTK began broadcasting in September 1999 on analogue satellite with a daily two-hour transmission, expanding to four hours per day in November 2000. Following July, it expanded to seven hours a day. In 2001, RTK was established as an independent public service broadcaster, which is now a single public broadcaster and the largest media in Kosovo. It is mandated to fulfil its social responsibility for fair broadcasting, formation of correct public opinion, preservation of traditional culture and consideration for the socially vulnerable and disadvantaged communities from the standpoint of independent from the government. Since media, especially a public broadcasting institution, plays a crucial role to promote communication and reconciliation among different ethnic groups in post-conflict countries such as Kosovo, RTK had been making efforts to make itself a more reliable public broadcaster.</p> <p>However, RTK faced challenges in the institutional aspects to produce good quality programmes with limited budget and human resources. Therefore, the management system as well as concrete methods for good programme production and reporting should be urgently addressed for improvement. On the other hand, as time passed, the technology has been shifted from manual to computerized production. Based on a recommendation from the International Telecommunication Union, the Government of Kosovo prepared a law to digitalize terrestrial broadcasting by June 2015. Following this change, RTK needed to make a correct plan to digitalize its broadcasting, renew equipment, and develop human resources who can operate and maintain digitalized equipment properly (RTK has just prepared a digitization plan for network; production and archive). In this regard RTK was in the junction of changing its institution to be a more functional public broadcaster. In this circumstance, RTK requested the Government of Japan for the technical cooperation project for capacity development of human resources of RTK with updating TV broadcasting equipment.</p> <p>1-2 Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p>RTK becomes a model of mass media in Kosovo to deliver accurate, impartial and fair information to all ethnic groups.</p>	

(2) Project Purpose

Quality of the RTK programmes is improved as an independent public broadcaster for delivering accurate, impartial and fair information to all ethnic groups.

(3) Outputs:

Output 1: Capacities of RTK staff in operation and maintaining TV broadcasting equipment are enhanced.

Output 2: Capacities of RTK staff in programme production and news reporting are enhanced.

(4) Inputs (as of the Terminal Evaluation)

<Japanese side>

- JICA Experts: 6 short-term (15.53 MM)
- Trainees received: 11
- Provision of Equipment: JPY 757 thousand in total (TV, camera, PC, monitor, keyboard, PC camera, projector, air conditioning, microphone, etc.)
- Local Cost: JPY 18,253 thousand in total

<Kosovo side>

- Counterpart: 22
- Land and facilities: Necessary facilities for the project (office space, equipment, electricity, telephone, etc. in RTK)

2. Outline of the Terminal Evaluation Team

Evaluation Team	Name	Title	Occupation
	Dr. Keiichi Hashimoto	Leader	Senior Advisor, JICA
	Ms. Ayano Matsudo	Cooperation Planning	Law and Justice Team, Governance Group, Industrial Development and Public Policy Department, JICA
	Ms. Sawa Hasegawa	Evaluation Analysis	Principal Consultant, Project Management Department, OPMAC Corporation

Period of Evaluation	27 February to 11 March, 2017	Type of Study: Terminal Evaluation
----------------------	-------------------------------	------------------------------------

3. Summary of Terminal Evaluation Results

3-1 Progress of the Project

Inputs from both the Japanese and Kosovo sides have been provided as planned except for TV broadcasting equipment to be procured from the Japanese side. The implementation of some of project

activities have been delayed, one of which is the activity on Output 1, OJT for the technical staff members on the operation and maintenance of new broadcasting equipment due to the delayed procurement of equipment. Another of which is the activity on Output 2, the establishment of Consultative Commission on Programmes as well as the evaluation of TV programmes of RTK by the Consultative Commission due to a difficulty in selecting appropriate members of the Commission.

(1) Achievement of Outputs

1) Output 1

The achievement level as of the Terminal Evaluation: low

- Although the action plan for the new operation and maintenance system was developed at the early stage of the project, the procurement procedure of TV broadcasting equipment has been delayed as well as OJT for the technical staff members on the operation and maintenance of new broadcasting equipment scheduled in the action plan has been delayed accordingly.

2) Output 2

The achievement level as of the Terminal Evaluation: reasonable

- The activities for Output 2 are in progress except for the establishment of Consultative Commission on Programmes. While the new TV programme jointly produced by RTK-TV1 (RTK1, broadcasted in Albanian language) and RTK-TV2 (RTK2, broadcasted in Serbian language) have made good progress, the Consultative Commission has not been established yet since finding and selection of appropriate members of the Commission have proceeded with difficulty.

(2) Achievement of Project Purpose

The achievement level as of the Terminal Evaluation: low

- While the Project Purpose would be difficult to be achieved by the end of the project if assessed based on the present indicators, these indicators do not always match the actual conditions of the project. It is proposed that the present indicators for Project Purpose should be revised in order to make closer to the actual conditions of the project and the achievement of Project Purpose should be assessed based on more appropriate indicators.

3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance (high)

- The project is consistent with the national development plan of Kosovo “National Development Strategy 2016-2021” which places more value on the need to ensure social cohesion and inclusion, and “Professional Standards and Principles of Journalistic Ethics in the Programmes of RTK” which stipulates the principles RTK staff should follow as a public broadcaster such as provision of accurate, impartial and fair information to audience.

- The project meets the development needs of RTK in that RTK had a great need to renew the broadcasting equipment while at the same time they needed to strengthen the technical and production capacities of RTK staff to provide programmes with good quality.
- The project is consistent with Japan's ODA policy for Kosovo which places "enhancing administrative capacity and human resources" as one of the priority areas.

(2) Effectiveness (difficult to evaluate as of the Terminal Evaluation)

- While the effectiveness of the project is prospected to be relatively low if assessed based on the present indicators for Project Purpose, it should be assessed later based on the more appropriate indicators to be revised.
- The present indicators for Project Purpose do not always match the actual conditions of the project. In addition, a linkage between the indicators for Project Purpose and Outputs is relatively weak. It is prospected that it should be difficult to achieve the Project Purpose by the end of the project even if Outputs should be achieved by the end of the project. The indicators for Project Purpose therefore need to be revised based on the real situation having a reasonable linkage with Outputs. It is desirable to judge the effectiveness of the project based on the revised ones.

(3) Efficiency (low)

- Both the Japanese and Kosovo sides have provided their inputs as planned except for TV broadcasting equipment to be procured from the Japanese side. The quantity, quality and timing of the inputs except for equipment procurement provided by both sides are generally appropriate as all respective inputs have been utilized in the intended activities which themselves have been implemented as planned in most cases.

(4) Impact (difficult to evaluate as of the Terminal Evaluation, but prospected to be high)

- It is difficult to project the future achievement of Overall Goal at the time of Terminal Evaluation. The achievements of Outputs and Project Purpose are expected to contribute to the achievement of Overall Goal in the future.
- Some positive impacts have emerged during the project implementation, one of which is intercommunication between RTK1 and RTK2 jointly produced by RTK1 and RTK2 the successful production brought about positive effects among the staff of RTK. The joint produced TV programmes have received positive responses from their audience.

(5) Sustainability (prospected to be relatively high)

- Concerning the policy and institutional aspects, the policy on social cohesion and inclusion shown in the current National Development Strategy as well as RTK's Professional Standards are likely to be sustained even after the project completion and RTK continues to follow the policy as a public

broadcaster accordingly.

- Concerning the organizational aspect, although there is no special concern in terms of organizational aspect of RTK to sustain the project effects even after the project completion, it is necessary for the managing staff of RTK and JICA experts to fully discuss the future management plan of Consultative Commission on Programmes in establishing it before the end of the project.
- Concerning the financial aspect, the current financial sources of RTK are subsidies from the government (approximately 80% of revenue) and advertising (approximately 20%). While it is desirable for RTK to obtain a stable TV licence fee and to decrease the rate of subsidies in order to secure the editorial independence, it is necessary to be legislated by the parliament to realize it. The maintenance cost for TV broadcasting equipment to be procured is likely to be secured by RTK.
- Concerning the technical aspect, the technical staff members have originally high skills so that they are ready to acquire the new technical skills with OJT by JICA experts after the equipment will be installed. The production staff members have been provided with a number of workshops and OJT and been improving their programme production and reporting skills. It is quite necessary for both staff members to deliver the knowhow acquired by the project to other staff of RTK as many as possible.

3-3 Factors that promoted/inhibited realization of effects

(1) Promoting factors

1) Factors concerning Planning

- None

2) Factors concerning Implementation Process

- Good relationship and communication between RTK staff and JICA experts

(2) Inhibiting factors

1) Factors concerning Planning

- None

2) Factors concerning Implementation Process

- Significant delay in procurement of TV broadcasting equipment

3-4 Conclusion

Part of project activities has not been implemented as planned. The implementation of activities for Output 1 has been delayed due to the delayed procurement of TV broadcasting equipment. The establishment of Consultative Commission on Programmes for Output 2 has also been delayed due to a difficulty in finding and selecting appropriate members of the Commission. While at the same time, the project has produced positive and favourable impacts such as good communication and relationship

between RTK1 and RTK2.

3-5 Recommendations

- ① Extension of project period (one and half a year)
- ② Holding JCC meetings once a year
- ③ Revision of PDM (revision of three indicators for Project Purpose as well as minor changes in some of indicators for Overall Goal, Output 1 and Output 2)

3-6 Lessons Learned

- (1) Importance of careful confirmation in planning on the place of equipment suppliers in countries with a background of ethnic conflicts
- (2) Importance of making the procedure of procurement more efficient