conducted by Brazil Office: October, 2019

	Project of Social Inclusion through the Incentive to Produce Oleaginous Plants for the
Federative Republic of Brazil	Generation of Bio-diesel in the State of Rio Grande do Norte

### I. Project Outline

I. Project Outline	
Background	In Brazil, an advanced country of the introduction of bio-fuel, the likelihood of poverty reduction through the oleaginous plants production was focused in 2005. The system of "Social Fuel Stamp" was enacted to promote purchase of oil seeds and crude oil produced by small-scale family farmers, and benefits for the farmers were expected, such as the proper use of uncultivated fields, crop diversification, and the securing of stable income generation sources. Western area of the State of Rio Grande do Norte is located in a semi-arid area called <i>Caatinga</i> , and the cropping season for the farmers without irrigation system is quite limited. In the past, those farmers generated income from cotton cultivation. However, as they faced the situation with insufficient and unstable cash income, the improvement of their farming, including introduction of new cash crop, was indispensable for them.
Objectives of the Project	<ul> <li>Through development of strategies for oilseed crops production and establishment of diversified utilization chain of processed products of oilseed crops, establishment of diversified farming model, recommendation of distribution routes for oilseed crops and processed products, establishment of cooperatives and support for their management, and preparation of manuals on oilseed crops, the project aimed at establishing a model of Bio-diesel-fuel (BDF) production chain and diversified farming system including oilseed crops for small-scale family famers by cooperatives in the target area, and thereby contributing to promotion of BDF production chain and processed products of oilseed crops for small-scale family famers through the oilseed crop cultivation.</li> <li>1. Overall Goal: Bio-diesel-fuel (BDF) production chain and processed products of oilseed crops for small-scale family farmers are promoted and income of small-scale family farmers is improved through the cultivation of silseed crops.</li> <li>2. Project Purpose: The model of BDF production chain and diversified farming system including oilseed crops</li> </ul>
Activities of the Project	<ul> <li>for small-scale family farmers by cooperatives is established in the target area.</li> <li>Project Site: Western area of the State of Rio Grande do Norte</li> <li>Main Activities: 1) Development of strategies for oilseed crop production and establishment of diversified farming models, 3) Recommendation of distribution routes for oilseed crops and its processed products, 4) Establishment of cooperatives and support of their administration, 5) Preparation of manuals on oilseed crops, etc.</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side</li> <li>Experts: 4 persons</li> <li>Staff Allocated: 15 persons</li> <li>Equipment: Oil extraction equipment at an oil extraction plant in Marcelino Vieira, Sprinkler straction plant in Marcelino Vieira, Sprinkler straction plant in Marcelino Vieira, Sprinkler straction plant in Lucrecia</li> <li>Local expense: cost for project activities</li> </ul>
Project Period	April 2009 – April 2015 (Extension: April 2013 – April 2015)Project Cost(ex-ante)310 million yen, (actual)496 million yen
Implementing Agency	State Secretary of Agriculture, Livestock and Fishery (Secretaria de Estado da Agricultura, da Pecuária e da Pesca: SAPE), Technical Assistance and Rural Extension Corporation (Empresa de Assistência Têcnica e Extensão Rural: EMATER), Rio Grande do Norte Agriculture and Livestock Research Corporation (Empresa de Pesquisa Agropecuária do Rio Grande do Norte: EMPARN)
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Chuo Kaihatsu Corporation, Agri Energy International Limited

# II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance	;
-------------	---

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Brazil at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with Brazil's development policies of "National Program of Biodiesel Production and Utilization" (2004) promoting the utilization of BDF and "Social Fuel Stamp" (2005) accelerating the purchase of oil seeds and crude oil from small-scale family farmers by refining enterprises at the time of ex-ante evaluation, and also, "National Program of Biodiesel Production and Utilization" (2004) and "Four-year plan" (2012-2015) prioritizing agriculture at the time of project completion.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Brazil at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with Brazil's development needs of the comprehensive improvement of farming including introduction of cash crops in the western area of the State of Rio Grande do Norte where small-scale family farmers' cash income was insufficient and unstable.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy<sup>1</sup> for Brazil, focusing on the five priority areas including agriculture, based on the top-level agreement between the President of Brazil and the Prime Minister of Japan when the President Lula visited Japan in May, 2005. <Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

During the project implementation, the State of Rio Grande do Norte had suffered from unprecedented droughts. According to EMPARN's data, the rainfalls in the state for the period between 2012 and 2017 reduced by 63% compared to the average between 1992 and 2018 and decreased by 36% on average for the six year. This brought about a catastrophe for the agricultural production across the whole state regardless of farming methods. It was confirmed that oilseed crops for BDF (especially, sesame) selected by the project have been continuously produced since the project completion even though experiencing such severe abnormal weathers, and the production contributed to an increase in the income of small-scale family farmers while the model of BDF production chain aimed by the project had not been established during the project. Therefore, the approach of the project is considered appropriate to support the small-scale family farmers.

Also, in order to take countermeasures against the above-mentioned unexpected serious droughts and secure the security of local people's living, it was necessary to have products which are less affected by weather and can contribute to the livelihood of the small-scale family farmers in the target area of the project. Small livestock and beekeeping, which were introduced by the project for diversifying farming among the small-scale family farmers, were able to meet the local needs, and it can be concluded that the modification of the project approach was appropriate.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was not achieved by the time of project completion. Through the project, small livestock (sheep), beekeeping and food processing, which are less affected by drought, were incorporated into a farming model, and the model was introduced by the model farmers (Indicator 1). However, although experiments on effective use of the sub-products of an oilseed crop (sesame) were carried out and a plan on the effective use of the sub-products by the model farmers was examined, the plan was not introduced to the model farmers due to the more severe droughts than the ones in the ordinary years (Indicator 2). Since oilseed crops were not able to be produced due to the severe droughts, the oilseed crops were procured from the external sources and a demonstration farm, and processed products by using the procured oilseed crops were sold on a demonstration basis (Indicator 3). However, in terms of recommendations on adaptable oilseed crops to the State of Rio Grande do Norte, the activities were limited to implementation of its related tests and research at EMPARN and the demonstrative farms, and oilseed crops to be introduced considering economic viability were not proposed (Indicator 4). No oilseed crop production was not realized by cooperatives organized by the small-scale family farmers (Indicator 5).

The Project Effects have been partially continued since the project completion. It was confirmed that the diversified farming models introduced by the project has been still effective at the time of ex-post evaluation since the model farming became a new income source for the model farmers. In addition, the fact has stimulated interests of other small-scaler family farmers in the model and introduction of the diversified farming models have been promoted by them. Regarding effective use of sub-products of oilseed crops that was not introduced during the project implementation, the cooperatives have extracted oil from sesame supplied by the model farmers, and the residuals have been utilized as livestock feed by the model farmers since the project completion. Oilseed crops (sesame) produced by the model farmers and the small-scale family farmers, and oilseed products (sesame oil) processed by the cooperatives have been continuously sold. Also, as for oilseed crops suitable to the State of Rio Grande do Norte, sesame, moringa, and cotton were proposed after the project. Moreover, the oilseed crop production by the cooperatives and small livestock (sheep) and beekeeping introduced by the project have been continued. Furthermore, the number of the member farmers of the cooperatives established by the project has increased from 26 to 44 in the Lucrecia Agricultural Cooperative (COAFAL) and from 26 to 52 in the Marcelino Vierira Agricultural Cooperative (COAAF) from the ones at the time of the establishment.

"Strategic Plan for Diversified Development of Agricultural Farmers in Semi-Arid Area" prepared by the project has been continuously utilized. EMPARN has used the Strategic Plan as a guidance for production by small-scale family farmers across the state for preparation of EMPARN's manuals. Also, Brazilian Agricultural Research Corporation (Empresa de Pesquisa Agropecuaria do Rio Grande do Norte: EMBRAPA) has used the Strategic Plan in research on mixed planting including sesame cultivation in order to attain social inclusion through promotion of participation of small-scale family farmers in production activities.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been partially achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. There are 26 small-scale family farmers who use the oilseed crops (sesame) introduced by the project in various manners. Although their average income had experienced a decrease from 300 reals per kg in 2015 to 120 reals per kg in 2017, it significantly augmented to 500 reals per kg in 2018. In addition, those farmers have not only improved their income by the production and sale of sesame but also expanded their income resources by processing the produced sesame.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts were observed at the time of ex-post evaluation. In the State of Rio Grande do Norte, a male-dominated atmosphere was seen before starting the project. However, the establishment of the cooperatives by the project has brought about the women's participation in production processing and marketing activities in the markets, and their participation led good results. As a result, women's position has been empowered. The head of COAFAL has been a woman. Also, international organizations including the World Bank (WB) and the United Nations Development Program have focused on improvement of poverty in the western region of Brazil in the "Development and Governance Project in the State of Rio Grande do Norte" (2013-2019), a loan project funded by WB. COAFAL and COAAF of the project were incorporated into the loan project as models of their project activities. From the viewpoint of the cooperatives, the WB project has been establishing a system collectively selling the targeted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ministry of Foreign Affairs "ODA Databook" (2007)

products from all the cooperatives in the state at the markets located in large cities. It is expected that the cooperatives organized by the project will have access to the markets in the large cities where they were not able to access by their production capacities. In addition, the number of the small-scale family farmers producing small livestock (sheep) and beekeeping other than the oilseed crops introduced by the project has increased from 3 in 2015 to 8 in 2018 for small livestock (sheep) and from 8 in 2015 to 28 in 2018 for beekeeping. Furthermore, the project brought about the additional income of the small-scale family farmers though income from each product has slightly fluctuated from 500 Real in 2015 to 900 Real in 2018 for small livestock (sheep) and from 6,125 Real in 2015 to 2,520 Real in 2018 for beekeeping

<Evaluation Result>

The project realized the expected project effects after the project completion and contributed to the improvement of the livelihood of small-scale farmers though the Project Purpose had not been achieved during its implementation. Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement	of Project Purpose	and Overall Goal

Aim	Achievement of Proje Indicators	ct Purpose and O	verali Goal	Results				
					Ð			
(Project Purpose)	(Indicator 1)	Status of the Achi		leved (continue	ea)			
The model of BDF	Diversified farming models are introduced	<ul> <li>(Project Completion)</li> <li>Small livestock (sheep), beekeeping and processed food, which are not less</li> </ul>						
production chain and	at model farmers.							
diversified farming		affected by dr	-	-		farming	model,	and the
system including oilseed		model was intro	-	model farmers	5.			
crops for small-scale		(Ex-post Evaluati						
family farmers by		• Sesame, small				ve been	produce	ed by the
cooperatives is established		model farmers		-scale family fa	armers.			
in the target area.		[Production of se		-				
			No. of	Rate of			roduction	
		Farmer	farmers producing	farmers producing			per a far	
			sesame	sesame	2015	2016	2017	2018
		Model farmers	26	59	10	7	7	7
		Small-scale	10	100	10	7	7	7
		family farmers			-		,	
		Note: the total	number of t	he model far	mers (4	4), the	number	r of the
		small-scale famil	y farmers inte	rviewed (10)				
		[Production of sm	nall livestock	(sheep)]				
			No. of	Rate of	No.	of sheep	per a fa	rmer
		Farmer	farmers	farmers				
			feeding	feeding	2015	2016	2017	2018
		Model farmers	sheep 4	sheep 10	8	8	8	8
		Small-scale					-	
		family farmers	4	100	10	10	10	10
		Note: the total	number of t	he model far	mers (4	4), the	number	r of the
		small-scale family						
			-					
		[Production of be	ekeeping]					
			No. of	Rate of	Ave	erage pr	oduction	ı of
		Farmer	farmers	farmers	hon	ey (kg p	er a farn	ner)
		1 armer	joining	joining	2015	2016	2017	2018
		Model	beekeeping	beekeeping				
		farmers	4	10	8	8	8	8
		Small-scale						
		family	4	100	10	10	10	10
		farmers						
		Note: the total	number of t	he model far	mers (5	2), the	number	r of the
		small-scale famil	y farmers inte	rviewed (17)				
	(Indicator 2)	Status of the Achi	ievement: not	achieved (part	ially ach	ieved)		
	Proposal of effective utilization of the	(Project Complet	ion)					
	sub-products of oilseed crops are introduced	· • •	-	utilization of	their re	siduals	of oilse	ed crops
	by the mode farmers.	-						-
		ners. were carried out and a plan to be proposed was examined, the plan was not introduced by the model farmers due to the droughts.						
		(Ex-post Evaluati						
		<ul> <li>The cooperativ</li> </ul>		icted oils from	sesame	e sunnli	ed by th	e model
		-					-	
		farmers, and the residuals have been utilized by the model farmers. As the ways for the utilization, livestock feed, agricultural fertilizer, and						
		production of s			a, agii	cunuld		, and
		production of s	mack have bee	n nsieu.				

(Indicator 3)       Status of the choicement: paralal a achieval (continual)         (Dised arops of the model furmers and (Preject Completion)       Poet to the description, solared crops as a row material were proceed from cooperatives as cold on the capacitance at a transmit furmers and the small-scale family in a constraint of firm. Demonstration sales of the processed products were carried out.         (Figure 1-chalation)       * Secare factorizes with by the model farmers and the small-scale family framers in the bern with by the model farmers and the small-scale family framers in the bern with by the model farmers and the small-scale family framers in the bern with by the model farmers (4). The moder of the model farmers (4). The moder of the small-scale family framers in traviewed (10)         Sales of scane cill by COAFAL									
processed products of the model       • Due to the droughts, dilect arops as a raw material were proceed from to comparison as do to the comparison of the processed products were carried out.         bisis to related companies and individuals.       • A processed product of sesane (sesame di) has been asld by COALAL.         Sales of sesane.       • A processed product of sesane (sesame di) has been asld by COALAL.         Sales of sesane.       • A processed product of sesane (sesame di) has been asld by COALAL.         Sales of sesane.       • A processed product of sesane (sesame di) has been asld by COALAL.         Sales of sesane.       • A processed product of sesane (sesame di) has been asld by COALAL.         Sales of sesane.       • A processed product of sesane (sesame di) has been asld by COALAL.         Sales of sesane.       • A processed product of sesane (sesame di) from asles of sesame of frames (AL).         (Indicator 4)       • O of comparison interview (at 10)         Sales of sesane.       • O of comparison interview (at 10)         Sales of sesane.       • Although isst and research reliate to the ofheed crops table been induced or the set oper sesand.         Officientor 4)       • Officientor 50       • Sales of research reliate to the othered construct of the set oper set.         Officientor 50       • Although isst and research reliate to the ofheed crops balable for Rio Grande do (Processed by processed sprocessed grand coxins as it was, and a stiltimal valatis of the coperative coperative is a sole or produced by a sole in		(Indicator 3)		-	artially achieved	l (contin	nued)		
cooperatives are add on the experimental basis to related comparise and individuals basis to related comparise and the provided of the advect basis to related comparise and the provided of the individual of the second of the advectory basis basis of the advectory basis basis of the advectory basis basis of the advectory basis basis comparise and the provided comparise and the advectory basis and the advectory individuals basis and the advectory individuals basis and the advectory individuals basis and the advectory individuals and second related to the other devided comparise and other advectory individual as a self-sufficient or proper to basis and second related to the other devided by the provided by the advectory basis and the advectory and contains and provided in the expension of them have have neuroneous transfer that here proposed. (Expert Evaluation) bases are produced by cooperative as the advectory and contains as a reveal information of the evaluation or the theorement and here accurated by the cooperatives. (Expert Evaluation) bases are apprecised by advectainally advectual production of small livestock (deep). (Indicator 5) (Difference 5) (Difference 5) (Difference		-							1.0
basis to related companies and individual.       individual. </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>-</td> <td>-</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>-</td> <td></td>				-	-			-	
(Fs-post Fvaluation)       • Sesame has bees sold by the model farmers and the small-scale family farmers.         • A processed product of sesame (sesame (a)) has been sold by COAFAL.       Sales of sesame]         Sales of sesame]       • Do. of farmers informers informers (a) has been sold by COAFAL.         Sales of sesame]       • Do. of farmers informers informers (a) has been sold by COAFAL.         Sales of sesame]       • Do. of the model farmers informers (a) has been sold by COAFAL.         Note: the total number of the model farmers (a), the number of the model farmers (b), the number of the model farmers introduced completion of the model farmers introduced by the cooperative.         (Indicator									
• Science has been sold by the model farmers and the small-scale family furners.         • A processed product of assame (issame oil) has been isold by COAFAL.         Sales of assame]         • Sales of assame]         • Farmer       farmers         • Sales of assame]         • Obles of crops and base of assame]         • Obles of cropsane assane (sales additional value of bassame paramely		basis to related companies and individuals.	1 1						
image:			· •		the model far	mers an	d the sr	nall_sca	le family
<ul> <li> <ul> <li>A processed product of secame (secame oil) by ECOAFAL. Solve of secame.</li> <li>Solve of</li></ul></li></ul>				been sold by	the model fai	incis an	u the st	11411-500	lie failing
Soles of seame)         Average sales of seame of the seamore of the seame of				product of ses	ame (sesame oi	) has be	en sold b	ov COA	FAL.
$ \left  \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			-	•	× ·	,		5	
$\frac{ ATILITY  }{ IVATILITY  IVATI$						Av			
			Farmer				(Real p	per 1 kg	g)
$ \left  \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $				-		2015	2016	2017	2018
$ \left  \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			Model farme			700	700	800	800
Inding attributes       Indig attributes       Ind					100	700	700	800	800
small-scale family farmers interviewed (10)         Isoles of sesame oil by COAFAL         Cope       Cope         Cope       Cope         Sesame oil       Sesame oil         Sesame oil       Sesame oil         Olised crops suitable for Rio Grande do       Project Completion         Ohsted crops suitable for Rio Grande do       Project Completion         Note are proposed.       - Although tests and research related to the oilseed crops had been conducted at IMPARN and in the demonstrative farme, niseed crops to be introduced considering the consolit visually consisting set of the constrative farme, niseed proposed.         (Indicator 5)       - Sesame, moring and coton were proposed (actually, mixed produced by the project, the state processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state processing sesame oil introduced by the project.         (Indicator 5)       Observertises         Ofleed crops are produced by comparities         farmers.       - Sesame, mol livestick (sheep), and beckeeping have here produced by the cooperatives.         farmers.       - Sesame, mol livestick (sheep), and beckeeping have here produced by the cooperatives.         (Indicator 5)       - Ooperative       - Ooperative sesame         (Indicator 5)       - Ooperative sesame       - Ooperative sesame         (Indicator 5)       - Ooperative sesame       - Ooperative sesame				rs					
Sales of sesame oil by COAFAL]         Coope- rative       No of coperative cooperative sesame oil       Werrage sales of sesame oil 2015       2016       2017       2018         (Indicator 4)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (achieved)       1       100       7,800       6,500       3,120       13,000         (Indicator 4)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (achieved)       1       100       7,800       6,500       3,120       13,000         (Indicator 4)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (achieved)       Norte are proposed.       *       Although tests and research related to the oilseed crops to be introduced of (Project Completion)       *       Although tests and research related to the oilseed crops to be introduced of them have been recommended). Sesame has provated as a adf-sufficient corp of to classification and in the demonstrative farm, oilseed crops to be introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended in to the thought only farmers is twas, and as additional value of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oliseed crops are produced by cooperatives farmers.       (Production of small livestock (sheep), and beckeeping have been produced by the cooperative.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oliseed crops are produced by						mers (	44), the	numb	er of the
$ \left  \begin{array}{c ccccccc} \hline No. of \\ \hline Ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$			sman-scare ran	inty farmers in	terviewed (10)				
$ \left  \begin{array}{c ccccccc} \hline No. of \\ \hline Ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$			[Sales of sesan	ne oil by COAI	FAL]				
$ \left  \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $				No. of	Rate of	-	·		ne oil
Image: Seame Oil Seame Oil Seame Oil 7800         2015         2017         2015         2017         2015         2017         2015         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2016         2017         2017         2015         2016         2017         2015         2017 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td>-</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>(</td> <td>Real per</td> <td>: 1 kg)</td> <td></td>			-			(	Real per	: 1 kg)	
COAFAL       I       100       7,800       6,500       3,120       13,000         (Indicator 4)         Oliseed crops suitable for Rio Grande do (Project Completion)         Norte are proposed.       • Although tests and research related to the oilseed crops had been conducted at EMPARN and in the demonstrative farm, oilseed crops to be introduced considering the cenomic viability were not proposed.         • Sesame, moring and cotton were proposed (actually, mixed products of them have been recommended). Sesame has prevailed as a self-sufficient crop for local small-scale family farmers as it was, and as additional value of the crops has been increased by processing sesume oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moring as an oilseed crop and cotton as product for the textile sector have been considered important also has recommended it. On the other hand, moring as an oilseed crop and cotton as a product for the textile sector have been considered important and been proposed.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)       • Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)         • Sesame, small livestok (sheep), and beekeeping have been produced by the cooperative       Sociar as a set as a set sesame         (Cooperative scename;       No. of       Rate of cooperatives if eeding sheep       No. of sheep per a cooperatives feeding sheep       No. of sheep per a						2015	2016	2017	2018
Oilsed crops suitable for Rio Grande do Norte are proposed.       (Project Completion)         • Although tests and research related to the oilseed crops had been conducted at EMPARN and in the demonstrative farm, oilseed crops had been conducted ornsidering the economic viability were not proposed.         • Sesame, moring and cotton were proposed (actually, mixed products of them have been recommended). Sesame has prevailed as a sald/stimicient crop for local small-scale family farmers as it was, and as additional value of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moring as an oilseed crop and cotton as a product for the textile sector have been considered important and been proposed.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives farmers.       (Project Completion)         • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beek eping have been produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)       • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beek eping have been produced by the cooperatives is cooperatives producing growtarives is sesame         (Indicator 1)       (Indicator 1)       • Sesame       • No. of cooperative sesame       • No. of seep per at cooperative producing isolate, of cooperative sesame       • No. of seep per at cooperative sesame         (Overall Goal)       (Indicator 1)       Small-scale family farmers' income       • No. of cooper				1		,800 6	5,500 3	3,120	13,000
Norte are proposed. <ul> <li>Although tests and research related to the oilseed crops had been conducted at EMPARN and in the demonstrative farm, oilseed crops to be introduced considering the conomic viability were not proposed.</li> <li>(Ex-post Evaluation)</li> <li>Sesame, moring and cotton were proposed (actually, mixed protects of them have been recommended). Sesame has prevailed as a self-sufficient crop for local small-scale family farmers as it was, and as additional value of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moring as an oilseed crop and cotton as a product for the testile sector have been considered important and been proposed.           (Indicator 5)         Otilsed crops are produced by cooperatives (Project Completion)              Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)              Under the cooperatives (Producting Produced by the cooperatives.           (Indicator 5)         Otilse of small-scale family              Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives.               Expect Completion)               Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beekceping have been produced by the cooperatives.            [Production of small livestock (sheep)]              Cooperatives             Producting sheep be a cooperative:             Cooperative secondaries             Econoperative secondaries             Record as a self autility achieved               No. of small-scale family             Secondary             Secondary             Secondary             Secondary             Secondary             Secondary</li></ul>		(Indicator 4)		chievement: no	ot achieved (ach				
at FMPARN and in the demonstrative farm, oilsed crops to be introduced considering the economic viability were not proposed.       introduced considering the economic viability were not proposed.         (Ex-post Evaluation)       • Sesame, moringa and cotton were proposed (actually, mixed products of them have been recommended.). Sesame has prevailed as a self-sufficient crop for local small-scale family farmers as it was, and as additional value of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project. The state proposed.         (Indicator 5)       Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives farmers.         (Indicator 5)       Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives farmers.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives farmers.       • No. of cooperatives for the vector of sesame]         • Dot to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives.       • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beckeeping have been produced by the cooperatives.         (Production of small livestock (sheep).       • Sesame is sesame]       • Sesame]         (Cooperative softwase is producing softwase is producing softwase is producing softwase.       • No. of faste of cooperatives is feeding sheep is 10 is 2016 2017 2018.         (Cooperative softwase is produced by cooperatives is feeding sheep is 10 is 2016 2017 2018.       • COAFAL       4       10       8       8       8         (Overall Goal)       (Indicator 1)       (Indicator 1)		Oilseed crops suitable for Rio Grande do	(Project Comp	letion)					
considering the conomic viability were not proposed.         (Ex-post Evaluation)         • Sessme, moring and cotton were proposed (actually, mixed products of them have been recommended). Sesame has prevailed as a self-sufficient crop finabes ne increased by processing sessme oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moring as an oilseed crop and cotton as a product for the textile sector have been considered important and been proposed.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives mainly consisting of small-scale family.       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         farmers.       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives forogeratives in producing in groucing gesame accoperative.       Rate of cooperative is cooperative.         (Reper text)       Sesame.       Rate of cooperative is cooperative.         (Cooperative cooperatives feeding sheep is not cooperatives feeding sheep is not of sesame)       No. of sheep per a cooperative is cooperative.         (Cooperative cooperative feeding sheep is not cooperative is feed		Norte are proposed.	-				-		
(Ex-post Evaluation)       • Sesame, moringa and cotton were proposed (actually, mixed products of the mhave been encommended). Sesame has prevailed as a self-sufficient crop for local small-scale family farmers as it was, and as additional value of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moringa as an oilseed erop and cotton as a product for the textile sector have been considered important and been proposed.         (Indicator 5)       Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives (Project Completion)         mainly consisting of small-scale family farmers.       (Project Completion)         (Ex-post Evaluation)       • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beekceping have been produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)         • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beekceping have been produced by the cooperatives.       • No. of Rate of Cooperatives cooperatives is sesame         (Cooperative cooperatives)       • Cooperative cooperatives is seed to be a cooperative.       • Sesame, seed to be a seed producing of seed to be a seed producing seed to be a seed producing of seed to be a seed producing of seed to be a seed producing seed to be a seed producing seed to be a seed producing of seed to be a seed producing of seed to be a seed producing seed to be a seed producing of seesed to be cooperatives cooperatives cooperativ							-	to be i	ntroduced
<ul> <li>Sesame, moringa and coton were proposed (actually, mixed products of them have been recommended). Sesame has prevailed as a self-sufficient error for local small-scale family farmers as it was, and as additual value of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moring as an oilsed crop and cotton as a product for the textile sector have been considered important and been proposed.</li> <li>(Indicator 5)</li> <li>Oilsed crops are produced by cooperatives (project Completion) mainly consisting of small-scale family firmers.</li> <li>Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)</li> <li>Oue to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)</li> <li>Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beckeeping have been produced by the cooperatives. (Production of sesame)</li> <li>Production of sesame]</li> <li>COAFAL</li> <li>You to first and the set of the small vestor (sheep)</li> <li>No. of sheep per a cooperative.</li> <li>(Cooperative feeding feeding</li></ul>			-		viability were no	ot propo	sed.		
(Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives       (Project Completion)         mainly consisting of small-scale family farmers'       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives       (Project Completion)         farmers.       Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives.         farmers.       (Departive for the the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives.         (Production of sesame)       (Production of sesame)         * Sesame small livestock (sheep), and beekceping have been produced by the cooperatives.         (Production of sesame)       (Production of sesame)         * Cooperative       Cooperatives         (Cooperative       Cooperatives         (Cooperative       Cooperatives         (Cooperative       Cooperatives         (Cooperative       Cooperative			· •			1 ( )	11	• 1	1
crop for local small-scale family farmers as it was, and as additional value of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moringa as an oilsed crop and cotton as a product for the textile sector have been considered important and been proposed.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives farmers.       (Project Completion)         mainly consisting of small-scale family       • Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)         • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beekeeping have been produced by the cooperatives.       [Production of sesame]         [Production of small livestock (sheep)]       Average produced by cooperative sesame         [Production of small livestock (sheep)]       [Rate of cooperative groducing producing sesame]       No. of sheep per a cooperative (age produced by the cooperative sesame)         [Production of small livestock (sheep)]       [Rate of cooperative groducing sesame]       No. of sheep per a cooperative (age produced by the cooperative sesame)         [Production of small livestock (sheep)]       [Rate of cooperative groducing seesame]       No. of sheep per a cooperative (age production of beekeeping]         [Production of beekeeping]       [Rate of cooperative groducing sheep       [Rate of cooperative (age production of beekeeping]       [Reding admeter (age production of beekeeping]         [Production of beekeep								_	
of the crops has been increased by processing sesame oil introduced by the project, the state government also has recommended it. On the other hand, moring as an oilsced crop and cotton as a product for the textile sector have been considered important and been proposed.         (Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilsced crops are produced by cooperatives farmers.       (Project Completion)         Barners.       Sesame, small ivestock (sheep), and beekeeping have been produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)         • Sesame, small ivestock (sheep), and beekeeping have been produced by the cooperatives. [Production of sesame]       Average producing sesame         Cooperative       cooperatives cooperatives.       Production of small livestock (sheep)]         [Production of small livestock (sheep)]       10       7       7         [Production of beckeeping]       No. of sheep per a cooperative sesame sesame 2015       2016       2017       2018         [Production of beckeeping]       Status of beckeeping]       No. of sheep per a cooperative sesame sesame 2015       2016       2017       2018         [Production of beckeeping]       Status of beckeeping beckeepi					-	-			
$\left  \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			-		-				
$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$			-		• •	-			-
(Indicator 5)       Status of the Achievement: not achieved (partially achieved)         Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives mainly consisting of small-scale family farmers.       (Project Completion)         • Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)       • Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)         • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beckeeping have been produced by the cooperatives. [Production of sesame]       • Average production of sesame]         Cooperative       Cooperatives operatives producing sesame       • Average production of sesame         COAFAL       26       59       10       7       7       4         Production of small livestock (sheep)]       Image: sesame operative sesame       No. of cooperatives freeding sheep       No. of sheep per a cooperative sesame       2015       2016       2017       2018         COAFAL       26       59       10       7       7       4       1       1       2016       2017       2018       2016       2017       2018       2016       2017       2018       2018       2015       2016       2017       2018       2016       2017       2018       2016       2017       2018       2016       2017       2018       2016       2017       2018       2016				-					
Oilseed crops are produced by cooperatives mainly consisting of small-scale family farmers.       (Project Completion)         • Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation)       • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beekeeping have been produced by the cooperatives. (Production of sesame)         • No. of Cooperative producing sesame       • No. of Cooperatives producing sesame       • Average production of sesame         • COAFAL       26       59       10       7       7         • (Production of small livestock (sheep)]       • No. of cooperatives producing sesame       • No. of 2015       2016       2017       2018         • (Production of small livestock (sheep)]       • Cooperatives producing sheep       • No. of sesame       • No. of sheep per a cooperative       • No. of sooperative       • No. of soope			have been co	onsidered impo	rtant and been	proposed	1.		
mainly consisting of small-scale family farmers.• Due to the droughts, oilseed crops were not produced by the cooperatives. (Ex-post Evaluation) • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beekeeping have been produced by the cooperatives. [Production of sesame]  Cooperative cooperatives producing sesameAverage production of sesame sesame COAFAL265910774 (Production of small livestock (sheep)] 2015201620172018 COAFAL265910774 (Production of small livestock (sheep)] (cooperatives) recorratives (cooperatives) sesameNo. of recorratives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives sheepNo. of sheep per a cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives feeding sheepNo. of sheep per a cooperative cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives cooperatives (Production of beckeeping]2015201620172018 2015 (CoAFAL4108888 (Production of beckeeping]108888(Overall Goal) Bio-diesel-fuel (BDF) production chain and(Indicator 1) small-scale family farmers' incomes increase by introducing oilseed crops and increase by introducing oilseed crops and example and became 26. Since the project completion, although their average		(Indicator 5)	Status of the A	chievement: no	ot achieved (pa	rtially ac	chieved)		
farmers.       (Ex-post Evaluation)       • Sesame, small livestock (sheep), and beekeeping have been produced by the cooperatives.         Production of sesame]       No. of cooperatives producing sesame       Average production of sesame]         COAFAL       26       59       10       7       7       4         Production of small livestock (sheep)]       sesame       sesame       (Kg per a cooperative)       sesame       sesame       (Kg per a cooperative)       sesame       10       7       7       4         Production of small livestock (sheep)]       Image: sesame       No. of sesame       Rate. of cooperatives       No. of sheep per a cooperatives       cooperative       Secoperative       S									
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$				-	d crops were no	t produc	ed by th	e coope	eratives.
$ \left( \begin{array}{c} \mbox{cooperatives.} \\ \mbox{[Production of sesame]} \end{array} \right) \\ \mbox{$$ Ooperatives$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sesame$} \\ \mbox{$$ sesame$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2015$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2016$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2017$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2018$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2015$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2016$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2017$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2018$} \\ \mbox{$$ cooperatives$} \\ \mbox{$$ feeding$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2015$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2016$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2017$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2018$} \\ \mbox{$$ cooperatives$} \\ \mbox{$$ feeding$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2015$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2016$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2017$} \\ \mbox{$$ 2018$} \\ \mbox{$$ cooperative$} \\ \mbox{$$ feeding$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ producing$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ \mbox{$$ sheep$} \\ $$ producin$		farmers.	` <b>^</b>	· ·	、				
[Production of seame] = [Production of small livestock (sheep)] = [Production of sheep per a cooperatives feeding sheep shee					neep), and beek	eeping h	ave been	n produ	ced by the
$\left[ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $									
$\left  \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					Rate of	А	verage n	roducti	on of
$\left[ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			Comparative	cooperatives	cooperatives		ses	same	
COAFAL265910774[Production of small livestock (sheep)]Cooperative feeding sheepNo. of cooperatives feeding sheepRate. of cooperatives feeding sheepNo. of sheep per a cooperative cooperativeCOAFAL410888Production of beekeeping]Rate. of cooperative joining beekeeping2015201620172018(Overall Goal) Bio-diesel-fuel (BDF) production chain and(Indicator 1) Small-scale family farmers' incomes increase by introducing oilseed crops and(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved to the small-scale family farmers' incomes (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion, although their average			Cooperative				<u><u> </u></u>		
(Overall Goal)       (Indicator 1)         Sine-lisel-fuel (BDF)       (Indicator 1)         Sind-scale family farmers' incomes       (Indicator 1) <td></td> <td></td> <td>COAFAI</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>			COAFAI						
$\left[ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			COATAL	20		10	/	/	
$\left[ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			[Production of	small livestocl	k (sheep)]				
$ \left( \begin{array}{c} Cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ sheep \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} cooperative \\ feeding \\ cooperative \\ feeding \\ feeding \\ feeding \\ cooperative \\ feeding \\ feedi$							No. of s	heep pe	er a
Image: Construction of between the systemImage: Construction of between			Cooperative						
COAFAL       4       10       8       8       8       8         Production of beekeeping]       No. of cooperative joining beekeeping       No. of cooperative cooperative joining beekeeping       Average production of honey (kg per a farmer)         (No. of cooperative cooperative joining beekeeping       2015       2016       2017       2018         (Overall Goal)       (Indicator 1)       (Indicator 1)       (Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved       Small-scale family farmers' incomes increase by introducing oilseed crops and increase by introducing oilseed crops and       (Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved       The number of the small-scale family farmers who use the oilseed crops (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion, although their average			1	-		2015	2016	2017	2018
Image: construction of between the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the image: construction of the small-scale family farmers who use the oilseed crops (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion,			COAFAL	1		8	8	8	8 8
No. of cooperative joining beekeeping       No. of cooperative joining beekeeping       Rate. of cooperative joining beekeeping       Average production of honey (kg per a farmer)         (No. of cooperative joining beekeeping       Rate. of cooperative joining beekeeping       Average production of honey (kg per a farmer)         (No. of cooperative joining beekeeping       2015       2016       2017       2018         (Overall Goal)       (Indicator 1)       (Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved       5.92       3.09       4.09       6.15         Small-scale family farmers' incomes increase by introducing oilseed crops and       (Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved       The number of the small-scale family farmers who use the oilseed crops (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion, although their average				-	•				· · ·
Cooperative       cooperative <thcooperative< th=""> <thcooperative< th=""></thcooperative<></thcooperative<>			[Production of						
Cooperativejoiningjoiningjoining20152016201720182000200						Avera			
Image: beaker bing bing bing bing bing bing bing bing			Cooperative						
COAAF171005.923.094.096.15(Overall Goal)(Indicator 1)(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achievedBio-diesel-fuel (BDF)Small-scale family farmers' incomes increase by introducing oilseed crops and(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved• The number of the small-scale family farmers who use the oilseed crops (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion, although their average									
Bio-diesel-fuel (BDF) production chain and Small-scale family farmers' incomes increase by introducing oilseed crops and (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion, although their average			COAAF			5.92	3.09	4.09	6.15
Bio-diesel-fuel (BDF) production chain and Small-scale family farmers' incomes increase by introducing oilseed crops and (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion, although their average	(Overall Goal)	(Indicator 1)	(Ex-post Evalu	ation) partially	/ achieved				
production chain and increase by introducing oilseed crops and (sesame) became 26. Since the project completion, although their average	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					rmers w	ho use t	the oils	eed crops
processed products of making diversified used of their processed income experienced a decrease between 2015 and 2017, it significantly									
	processed products of	making diversified used of their processed	income exp	erienced a dec	crease between	2015 a	nd 2017	', it sig	nificantly

oilseed crops for	products. increased in 2018 (a 160% increase compared to 2015).						
small-scale family farmers		[Average income of small-scale family farmers (Real per kg)]					
are promoted and income	2015 2016 2017 2018				2018		
of small-scale family		300	250	120	500 (160%)		
farmers is improved		(Ex-post Evaluation					
through the cultivation of	The number of means for small-scale family	mily • The know-how of sesame production introduced by the project has been					
oilseed crops.	farmers to gain income increases by						
	introducing oilseed crops and making						
	diversified use of their processed products.						
Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Questionnaire and Interview with EMPARN, COAFAL and COAAF							

#### 3 Efficiency

The project cost and period considerably exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 160% and 152%, respectively). It was because some planned activities were not able to be implemented within the original project period and the attainment of the Project Purpose became difficult due to the droughts occurred in the three consecutive years. The situation required additional cost and extension of project period. The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is low.

#### 4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The "Multi-year Plan" (2016-2019) promotes sustainable pastoral agriculture production, and "Promotion of Family Farming Products Purchases and Solidarity Economy" (No. 10.536/19) also does the production of oilseed crops and their oil. The project has been endorsed by the policies, in that it aimed at disseminating and promoting diversified farming models focusing on oilseed crops as well as BDF production chain.

### <Institutional Aspect>

[Dissemination and Promotion of diversified farming models and BDF production chain]

There have not been any major changes in the institution for dissemination and promotion of the diversified farming model and the BDF production chain. UMARIZAL of EMATER has played the following roles: 1) provision of technical instructions to farmers, 2) introduction of national policies, 3) promotion of farmers' participation in dissemination activities. 10 staff members are deployed to UMARIZAL of EMATER. According to EMATER, the staff has performed their activities as members of the cooperatives and contacted the target farmers of the project in a good manner so that the number of the staff is considered sufficient.

Communication and Business Section of EMPARN has provided supports related to agricultural techniques in cooperation with EMATER. According to EMPARN, 22 staff members have been deployed to the Communication and Business Section, and the number of the staff has been sufficient. They perform their dissemination and research activities without any major problems through collaborations with EMBRAPA and EMATER.

## [Cooperatives]

COAFAL and COAAF were established by the project. The cooperatives have contributed to the enhancement of members' productivity and empowered women's status. They have continued their activities even at the time of ex-post evaluation as they have been targeted for the WB loan project as mentioned above. COAFAL and COAAF reported that the number of registered members were 44 and 52 respectively. Since they have sufficiently implemented their activities, they considered that the number of the members has been enough.

[Operation and maintenance of equipment such as oil extraction machine]

The equipment (oil extraction machine, refining machine) provided to COAFAL by the project has been continuously maintained on a monthly basis, and they have been well functioning. Also, the equipment (work desk, centrifuge, honey cylinder) provided to COAAF by the project has been cleaned and maintained on a regular basis along with honey harvest season, and their conditions have been good. The reason why the equipment has been in good conditions is the equipment not requiring special maintenance.

# <Technical Aspect>

[Dissemination and Promotion of diversified farming models and BDF production chain]

EMATER has sustained the knowledge and skills necessary for dissemination and promotion of the diversified farming model and the BDF production chain. In the background, EMATER has endeavored to sustain and improve their staff's technical capacity by technical transfer by the external lecturers through technical discussion meetings, study sessions, and refresher training activities.

EMPARN has maintained the knowledge and skills necessary to provide agricultural technical support. In the background, their researchers have been striving to maintain and improve their abilities by participating in external research groups, seminars and internal trainings.

[Technical support for small-scale family farmers and cooperatives]

As mentioned above, EMAPTER has played a major role in provision of technical support for small-scale family farmers and cooperatives. According to EMATER, the knowledge and skills necessary for the technical support have been maintained through participation in local trainings and workshops, holding of monthly events, routine field visits, and visits by farmers. [Use of manuals]

The manuals (Manual on an oil crop cultivation using irrigation, small livestock (sheep) production manual, beekeeping manual, food processing manual, manual on establishment of cooperatives) prepared by the project have been continuously used by COAFAL and COAAF since they are useful to extend the project effects.

[Operation and maintenance of equipment such as oil extraction machine]

Since COAFAL and COAAF have regularly provided equipment management trainings to members of the cooperatives and their family members, they have had the knowledge and abilities necessary for the operation and maintenance of the equipment such as oil extraction machine.

<Financial Aspect>

[Dissemination and promotion of the diversified farming model and the BDF production chain]

The budget for the implementing agency

The budgets of EMATER and EMPARN for dissemination and promotion of the diversified farming model and the BDF production chain have been allocated by the state government and the federal government every year. According to EMATER and EMPARN, their budgets have been

(Un								
Organization	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020		
Organization	2015	2010	2017	2018	2019	(Plan)		
EMATER	210	145	278	160	373	340		
EMPARN	100	100	100	100	100	100		

sufficiently secured because they have carried out their activities without any major problems. In addition, since their activities introduced by the project have been incorporated into the loan project funded by WB, their budget has been in the upward trends. It is expected that the budges will be secured in the future.

# [Cooperatives]

Both COAFAL and COAAF have gained their revenues from charges to the members when they purchase products and request marketing of their products. As their revenues have exceeded the necessary expenses for their operations, they have sustained their sufficient financial positions for their operation. In addition, because the activities of the cooperatives have been incorporated into the WB's loan project, it is expected that their financial status will be sustained in the future.

(Unit: Rea								
Organization	2015	2016	2017	2018				
COAFAL	50	102	15	42				
COAAF	60	70	15	100				

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the sustainability of the effects through the project is high.

## 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project did not achieve the Project Purpose aiming at establishing the model of BDF production chain and diversified farming system including oilseed crops for small-scale family farmers by cooperatives by the time of project completion. However, since the project completion, the diversified farming model introduced by the project has been practiced by some of the farmers, and the project has partially achieved the Overall Goal aiming at promoting BDF production chain and processed products of oilseed crops for small-scale family farmers and improving their income through the cultivation of oilseed crops. As for the efficiency, the project cost and period considerably exceeded the plan due to the droughts.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

## III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- As a result of interviews with the cooperatives and farmers in the target area, the diversification of farming introducing oilseed crops, small livestock, and beekeeping has been progressing. However, the results of interviews with the state agencies including SAPE, it was confirmed that information at the local level has not always transmitted to these agencies in a prompt way. In order to develop and sustain the project effects, it is necessary to promote further contacts between the state government and the small-scale family farmers. To attain this, it is recommended that the needs on the field be readily communicated to the state government through strengthening site visits and observation of the activities by local extension workers, cooperatives, and farmers by the leaders of the state government including EMATER.
- Various manuals were prepared to promote and disseminate the diversified farming model introduced by the project. Even at the time of ex-post evaluation, due to their effectiveness, the manuals have continued to be utilized by the cooperatives established by the project. Taking the situation into account, they are likely to be useful to other farmers and cooperatives. In order to continuously expand and disseminate the project effects, it is recommended to disseminate the manuals using a network the state government has.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

The project introduced sesame as an oilseed crop for BDF at the time when the severe droughts occurred. In case where it is impossible to use such crops for BDF, it can be used for food. Therefore, it was useful to establish the diversified farming model. Also, the project introduced small livestock and beekeeping which were able to contribute to diversifying farming of the small-scale family farmers who are vulnerable against risks but were not directly linked to BDF in order to ensure the security of livelihood of the local people. On the other hand, on the project design, the Project Purpose contained a model "diversified farming for small-scale family farmers", and the Overall Goal aimed at enhancing the income of the farmers through the cultivation and processing of oilseed crops and the dissemination of BDF production chain, which limited its activities to the outputs related to BDF. This constrained further diversification of farming of the farmers for improvement of their income and moreover retarded the progress of activities and the production of the outputs due to the droughts. In a case of implementation of a project aiming at supporting vulnerable small-scale family farmers in high risk areas where agricultural production is severely affected by droughts, it is essential to scrutinize the applicability of crops (oilseed crops) for highly cashable specific purposes to target areas and consider project components, which can flexibly respond to and manage any risks, in order to operate the project with flexible responses to the risks. Also, it is desirable to design a project to cope with negative impacts by weather and other factors during the project implementation. In addition, it is recommended to incorporate a farming, which can be a safety net and is less affected by droughts, into a project component from a perspective of "diversified farming".



Sesame cultivation and cultivated sesame



Meetings by members of cooperatives