

Country Name	The Project on Mangrove Ecosystem Conservation and Sustainable Use in the ASEAN Region
Republic of Indonesia	

I. Project Outline

Background	Indonesia, a country with the largest mangrove area in the world, has been made a certain arrangement to promote conservation of mangrove ecosystems within the country. However, there were still many areas that required administrative support to conserve the mangrove ecosystems. Likewise, urgent needs of conserving the mangrove ecosystems were common to the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) countries, not only to Indonesia. Under these circumstances, the Ministry of Forestry, encompassing two Mangrove Management Centers established through the JICA's technical cooperation project ("Mangrove Information Center Project" (2001-2004)), had been accumulating knowledge and know-how for conserving mangrove ecosystems, and were expected to play a central role for promoting the conservation of mangrove ecosystems in the ASEAN countries including Indonesia in terms of facilitating the South-South Cooperation.												
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through developing and implementing the Shared-Learning program for the ASEAN region as well as proposing a framework of cooperation mechanism for the conservation of mangrove ecosystems among the stakeholders in the ASEAN region, the project aimed at development of the cooperation mechanisms through the initiatives of the Ministry of Forestry of Indonesia, thereby contributing to enhancement of the cooperation mechanism for sharing good practices and lessons learned for conservation and sustainable use of the mangrove ecosystems.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Cooperating mechanism, to share the good practices and lessons learned regarding the mangrove ecosystems conservation and sustainable use ("the Practices and Lessons") in the ASEAN region ("the Cooperating Mechanism") is enhanced. Project Purpose: The Cooperating Mechanism is developed through the initiatives of the MoF, Indonesia. 												
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: Bali, Jakarta, Medan. model sites in Indonesia and in the ASEAN countries¹ Main Activities: 1) Developing the Shared-Learning program, (ii) organizing the Shared-Learning workshop for the ASEAN region, and (iii) proposing cooperation mechanism among the stakeholders in the ASEAN region, and so on. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Indonesian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 3 persons</td> <td>1) Staff Allocated: 14 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees Received: 8 persons</td> <td>2) Land and Facilities: Core project office at MMC 1(Bali); sub-offices at MoF</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: printers, PCs, etc.</td> <td>headquarters (Jakarta) and MMC 2 (Medan)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Local Costs: maintenance cost of the provided equipment, training cost, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Indonesian Side	1) Experts: 3 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 14 persons	2) Trainees Received: 8 persons	2) Land and Facilities: Core project office at MMC 1(Bali); sub-offices at MoF	3) Equipment: printers, PCs, etc.	headquarters (Jakarta) and MMC 2 (Medan)	4) Local Costs: maintenance cost of the provided equipment, training cost, etc.	
Japanese Side	Indonesian Side												
1) Experts: 3 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 14 persons												
2) Trainees Received: 8 persons	2) Land and Facilities: Core project office at MMC 1(Bali); sub-offices at MoF												
3) Equipment: printers, PCs, etc.	headquarters (Jakarta) and MMC 2 (Medan)												
4) Local Costs: maintenance cost of the provided equipment, training cost, etc.													
Project Period	June 2011 to June 2014	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 300 million yen (actual) 211 million yen										
Implementing Agency	Directorate of Land and Forest Rehabilitation (BRHL), Directorate General of Watershed Management and Social Forestry Development (BPDAS-PS), Ministry of Forestry (MoF), Mangrove Management Centers (MMC) 1, MMC 2 *MoF was merged to the Ministry of Forestry and Environment and MMC 1 and MMC were dismissed in 2014.												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Forestry Agency												

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Indonesia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with Indonesia's development policies prioritizing sustainable use of natural resources, such as "the Indonesia's Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN)" (2010-2014) and "Roadmap for an ASEAN Community" (2009-2015) as well as the presidential Decree of "the National Strategy for Mangrove Ecosystem Management in Indonesia" (2012).</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Indonesia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion ></p> <p>The project was consistent with Indonesia's development needs for promoting conservation of mangrove ecosystems not only in Indonesia but also the ASEAN countries.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation></p> <p>The project was consisted with "the Country Assistance Program for the Republic of Indonesia" (2004) prioritizing improvement of the administrative abilities and strengthening the systems of the central and local governments involved in natural resource management, developing human resources and spreading environmental education to Indonesian citizens.</p> <p><Appropriateness of the Project Design/Approach></p> <p>The project's approach was appropriate until the presidency has changed in October 2014. Under the new presidency, MOF was</p>

¹ The model sites in were Surabaya City and Balikpapan City for ASEAN workshops and Alas Purwo and Tarakan for domestic workshops in Indonesia, and selected sites in Thailand.

merged with the Ministry of Environment (became one ministry as the Ministry of Environment and Forestry) as a part of the administration reform. In addition, the new presidency also promoted efficiency of the government which has required efficient internal organizational setting in each ministry. In the process of those administrative reforms, MMC 1 and 2 were dismissed. Those administrative reforms significantly affected the project approach to establish ANMET for regional coordination to preserve mangrove ecosystems among the ASEAN countries. However, it was difficult to predict the changes and to cope with the changes at the time of project planning and during the project implementation period even though the JICA Indonesia Office had closely communicate with the implementing agency.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion. The work plan for establishing AMNET was agreed by the ASEAN Member States (AMS) (Indicator 1). Discussions about the establishment of AMNET were made at the meetings of the ASEAN Senior Officials on Forestry (ASOF) 14, 15 and 16 (Indicator 2 and 3)

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been partially continued since the project completion. AMNET was established in 2014 and the secretariat has the permanent status in Indonesia. As mentioned above, the administrative restructuring of the whole Directorate Generals in MoF and the efficiency of administration required several implementation units such as MMC 1 and MMC 2 dismissed. However, Balai PPI Bali (the former MMC 1) has still conducted shared-learning and training activities with other parties. Also, there was a workshop at the Asia Pacific Rainforest Summit (APRS II) forum in Yogyakarta in 2018. In addition, an international mangrove workshop was held in 2019. Management of mangrove conservation has been still being carried out by the Ministry of Environment and Forestry.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been partially achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. As mentioned above, AMNET was established in 2014 and has been under the Forest Management Working Group in the ASOF structure. The proposed ASEAN initiative on mangrove conservation through ASEAN Secretariat has already been approved in the ASOF Meeting.(Indicator 1). As mentioned above, after MMC and MMC 2 were dismissed, Balai PPI Bali (the former MMC 1) has still conducted shared-learning and training activities with other parties but the activities have depended on the ex-counterpart staff engaged in the project without official budget.(Indicator 2).

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts of the project were observed at the time of ex-post evaluation. For example, the shared-learning was used as an input for policy making, mangrove monitoring activity and knowledge extension to local people which had been conducted by MMC 1 and 2 just before restructuring and dismissing them.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) The Cooperating Mechanism is developed through the initiatives of MoF, Indonesia.	(Indicator 1) Action Plan is developed, for sharing the Practices and Lessons among the Stakeholders in the ASEAN region, and submitted to the appropriate authority of ASEAN.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) (Ex-post Evaluation) • A work plan to establishment of AMNET was agreed by AMS. • Verified as the achievement level of the Overall Goal (Indicator 1)
	(Indicator 2) A meeting regarding the Project is held more than once at the ASEAN forestry related group(s) (such as AEG-IFPP or ASOF), and the Cooperating Mechanism is examined.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) (Ex-post Evaluation) • MoF had proposed the establishment of AMNET at ASOF14 and ASOF15, and the proposal was endorsed at ASOF 16 in Brunei in July 2013. • Verified as the achievement level of the Overall Goal (Indicator 1)
	(Indicator 3) The Cooperating Mechanism is examined at the ASEAN forestry related group(s), for recognizing it as an official framework of ASEAN.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) (Ex-post Evaluation) • The proposal by MoF to establish AMNET was endorsed at ASOF 16 in Brunei in July 2013. • Verified as the achievement level of the Overall Goal (Indicator 1)
(Overall Goal) Cooperating mechanism, to share the good practices and lessons learned regarding the mangrove ecosystems conservation and sustainable use (“the Practices and Lessons”) in the ASEAN region (“the Cooperating Mechanism”) is enhanced	(Indicator 1) Cooperation for mangrove ecosystem conservation and sustainable use (“the Mangrove Conservation”) based on the Cooperating Mechanism is recognized as official framework in ASEAN.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Ex-post Evaluation) • AMNET was established in 2014 and it has been under the Forest Management Working Group in the ASOF structure. The proposed ASEAN initiative on mangrove conservation through ASEAN Secretariat has already been approved in ASOF Meeting.
	(Indicator 2) Shared-Learning is implemented in the ASEAN region, among the organizations and communities	Status of the Achievement: Partially achieved (Ex-post Evaluation) • Balai PPI Bali (the former MMC 1) has still conducted shared-learning and training activities with other parties but without official budget.

	involved in the Mangrove Conservation (“the Stakeholders”), continuously more than once annually, based on the Cooperating Mechanism.	
Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, information provided by the Directorate General of Watershed Management and Protected Forest		
3 Efficiency		
The project cost and period within the plan (ratio against the plan: 70% and 100%, respectively). The output was produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.		
4 Sustainability		
<Policy Aspect>		
<p>In Indonesia, there are two policies to conservation of Mangrove: i) Presidential Regulation number 73 year of 2012 regarding National Strategy for Mangrove Ecosystem Management; ii) Ministerial Regulation of Coordinating Minister for Economic Number. 4 year of 2017 regarding Policy, Strategy, Program, and Performance Indicator for Mangrove Ecosystem Management in National level (Ministry of Environment and Forestry). The Presidential Regulation is to promote sustainable management on mangrove for people’s welfare. It is also appointed the Coordinating Ministry of Economic as the coordinator for this national strategy. The Ministerial Regulation is to respond the Presidential Regulation and set the target for mangrove restoration, set the role each stakeholder, set performance indicator, and to coordinate among ministries and provincial government. In addition, on the One Map Policy, the Directorate of KTA becomes data trustee (wali data) as a rule of Head of the Geospatial Information Agency (BIG) (No.19/2013) and a rule of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (No.28/2016). Also, the Mangrove Rehabilitation Policy is included in the rule of the Minister of Environment and Forestry (No.105/2018).</p> <p>At the regional level of ASEAN, “the Strategic Plan of Action for ASEAN Cooperation on Forestry” (2016-2025) was elaborated. In the plan, the Strategic Thrust 3 addresses forestry sector resilience and role in climate change, that the role of coastal forest and mangrove in providing protection against natural disaster. In addition, Indonesia has successfully initiated the mangrove resolution at the 3rd UN Environment Assembly (UNEA III) in Nairobi in 2019.</p>		
<Institutional Aspect>		
<p>In terms of the cooperating mechanism for mangrove ecosystem conservation, the Directorate General of Watershed Management and Protected Forest has assigned staff to work in AMNET secretariat, and AMNET has been under the Forest Management Working Group of the ASOF structure and the ASEAN initiative on mangrove, which has been approved in the ASOF Meeting, has been proposed through the ASEAN Secretariat. After the restructuring of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry organization, mangrove management has still been taken care of by the Director General of PDASHL, the Directorate of KTA and the Watershed Protection and Forest Management Centers throughout Indonesia.</p> <p>As for the shared-learning, MMC 1 and MMC 2 were dismissed and restructured when the Ministry of Forestry and Ministry of Environment were merged in the early stage of new presidency (President Joko Widodo). Since then, the shared-learning related to the mangrove- conservation activities has been conducted by Balai PPI Bali with other parties as mentioned above since the ex-counterpart staff of the project have been still engaged in the work without the official budget allocation to the activities. This is an unforeseen situation by the time of project completion.</p>		
<Technical Aspect>		
<p>The materials developed by the project have been used for developing the AMNET project proposal to the ASEAN Secretariat as well as to the Japan-ASEAN Integration Fund (JAIF) as the funding resource. There is also an issue that is being discussed in the Ministry of Environment and Forestry that they have a plan to establish a research center for mangrove which will be further developed into a world mangrove conservation. In terms of the shared-learning related to the mangrove-conservation activities, the ex-counterpart staff of the project have sustained the skills and knowledge to deliver the relevant trainings.</p>		
<Financial Aspect>		
<p>The Ministry of Environment and Forestry has allocated some budget for AMNET and the donors are going to provide some fund. For the shared-learning activities, there is no specific budget allocation though Balai PPI Bali, the former MMC 1, has a certain budget to deploy the staff.</p>		
<Evaluation Result>		
<p>In the light above, there has been some problems in the institutional and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effects through the project is fair.</p>		
5 Summary of the Evaluation		
<p>The project achieved the Project Purpose and partially achieved the Overall Goal through the establishment of AMNET. As for sustainability, the mangrove conservation activities have been continued under the Ministry of Environment and Forestry though MMC1 and 2 were dismissed.in.</p> <p>Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.</p>		

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendation to Executing Agency:

After the project completion, the implementing agency of the project was reorganized and the main counterpart unit for the project activities have been dismissed and no alternative arrangement has been made to promote establishment of the proposed cooperating mechanism for mangrove ecosystem conservation within the framework of ASEAN. It hampered the achievement of the Overall Goal and the sustainability of the project effects. In order to reduce the risk of losing sustainability, the concerned Directorate in Ministry of Environment and Forestry is expected to follow up with alternative arrangement though it is very difficult to predict drastic administrative changes in a county like Indonesia where the change of presidency has significant impacts on government and administrative structures as well as consistency and continuity of the government policies.