

Country Name	Project on Activation of Women Development Centres (WDCs) to Improve Women's Livelihood Phase 2										
Republic of Nigeria											
I. Project Outline											
Background	<p>In Nigeria, gender inequality is serious regarding literacy and income. Women had limited participation in decision making at household and community level and needed comprehensive empowerment. Women Development Centres (WDCs) were established throughout the country to empower grass-roots women through vocational training and basic literacy education under the Better Life for Rural Women Programme. The National Centre for Women Development (NCWD) commissioned in 1992 was conceived under “the Better Life for Rural Women Programme.” WDCs had contributed to improving women’s capacities at that time. However, most of the WDCs were deserted or were not functioning well since late 90’s due to inappropriate management and the lack of commitment of the stakeholders and did not provide appropriate services.</p> <p>NCWD and JICA implemented a technical cooperation project “Project on Activation of Women Development Centres (WDCs) to Improve Women’s Livelihood” (WDC Activation Project Phase 1) (2007-2010). It aimed to develop guidelines on how to activate WDC’s based on the experiences of the pilot activities in Kano State, with an insight of women’s empowerment in Nigeria. In 2010, the Nigerian government requested JICA for the Phase 2 project to replicate and disseminate nationwide the outcomes brought about in the Phase 1 project, such as activated WDCs and empowerment of women who attended programs at WDCs.</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through enhancement of institutional capacity of NCWD to facilitate and supervise WDC activation, implementation of a pilot project of WDC activation in the target states between NCWD and State Ministry of Women Affairs (SMWA), and dissemination of WDC activation manuals developed for NCWD, SMWA, and Women Development Officers (WDOs) based on the result of the pilot project implementation, the project aimed at expansion of the WDC activation model beyond the target states, and thereby expanding the model in wider scale at the federal and state level and enhancing empowerment of women at the community and household level through activation of WDCs.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> WDC activation model is expanded in wider scale at federal and state level. Women’s empowerment is enhanced at the community and household level through activation of WDCs. Project Purpose: WDC activation model is expanded at federal level through WDC activation in target states. 										
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: Abuja and six target states (Anambra, Cross River, Kaduna, Kano, Kwara, and Niger) with three pilot local government areas (LGAs) and WDCs per state. Main Activities: (1) Needs assessment, development of advocacy materials and database, advocacy campaign, etc.; (2) pilot project including workshops for the target SMWAs and WDOs to formulate an action plan, technical training to improve service quality of WDCs based on the action plan, management training for target SMWAs and WDOs, support for SMWAs and WDOs to conduct trainings, stakeholder meetings, and advocacy, etc.; (3) identification of good practices and challenges, follow-up study on the WDCs in Kano state (also supported in Phase 1), formulation of manuals for NCWD, SMWA, and WDO, national workshop on utilization of the formulated manuals; workshops on the level of WDC activation as well as on the formulated manuals at the National Council of Women Affairs/Federal Ministry of Women's Affairs, etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Nigeria Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Experts: 13 persons</td> <td>1. Staff allocated: 26 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Trainees received: 20 persons (Japan)</td> <td>2. Local expenses: distribution of equipment to selected WDCs and conducting training, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Local expenses: project activities, equipment, training, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Nigeria Side	1. Experts: 13 persons	1. Staff allocated: 26 persons	2. Trainees received: 20 persons (Japan)	2. Local expenses: distribution of equipment to selected WDCs and conducting training, etc.	3. Local expenses: project activities, equipment, training, etc.	
Japanese Side	Nigeria Side										
1. Experts: 13 persons	1. Staff allocated: 26 persons										
2. Trainees received: 20 persons (Japan)	2. Local expenses: distribution of equipment to selected WDCs and conducting training, etc.										
3. Local expenses: project activities, equipment, training, etc.											
Project Period	February 2011 – February 2015	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 360 million yen, (actual) 351 million yen								
Implementing Agency	National Centre for Women Development (NCWD), State Ministry of Women Affairs and Social Development (SMWA) in six target states										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	O.P.C. Corporation										

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

- Gathering of data from states without visit has proven to be a challenge to the evaluation process for this project in Nigeria. This can be attributed to the hierarchical structures within the state government and levels of protocol that cannot be breached. Questionnaires completed must pass through several stages before clearance, approval, and submission and this has caused the delay in the process. However, all states we visited could submit Questionnaires on time since they knew we came to see them.

< Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation >

- To supplement the assessment of the continuation status of project effects, we examined the followings in the target states: the status of practicing the WDC activation model in the pilot LGAs and the status of expansion of the model to non-pilot LGAs.
- The indicator of the Overall Goal 2 is “social and economic participation rate.” However, it is difficult to define and examine the “rate” of participation. Therefore, the achievement of Overall Goal 2 was examined qualitatively.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Nigeria at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

“Vision 2020,” the long-term development policy in Nigeria lists a variety of activities regarding gender, for example, promotion of legal framework, formulation of guideline for countermeasures against violence, and reinforcement of national machinery (government unit for the advancement of gender equality) at national and state levels. Also, the “National Gender Policy” (2006) describes that the overall objective is to promote gender equality and sustainable human and economic development. It also defines that NCWD has responsibilities to plan and implement programmes related to empowerment of women. These policies were effective both at the times of ex-ante evaluation and project completion.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Nigeria at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

Both at the times of ex-ante evaluation and project completion, there was a need for activating WDCs to address issues such as women’s limited access to education, capital, labor, and entrepreneurial skills, which prevented many women from enjoying fruits of economic development of the country.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

Gender was one of the six priority areas of Japan’s assistance for Nigeria, which were confirmed in the economic cooperation policy dialogue in 2007.¹

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion. NCWD expanded the WDC activation model, consisting of four aspects, namely, (1) WDC service quality improved, (2) positive recognition towards WDC enhanced, (3) management of WDC improved, and (4) collaboration with related agencies strengthened, to six other states than the target states.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have partially continued to the time of ex-post evaluation. While the achievement status of the Project Purpose Indicator has continued as shown in the continued expansion of the WDC activation model to other states (see the table), we judged that the continuation status of project effects was partial considering the limited extent of expansion of the model within each state. In all five states we interviewed through field visit and phone out of the six target states, at least some activities based on the WDC activation model (such as training and skills development, report-writing, advocacy, etc.) have been continuously implemented at all pilot WDCs. NCWD has made efforts to expand the WDC activation model further. Such situations suggest the continuation of the project effects at the state level. At the LGA level, however, the expansion of the model in the target states is limited. Among the target states, it was only Anamba State and Kaduna State where non-pilot LGAs newly adopted the model. The reasons reported by the states for non-adoption of the model in other LGAs² are lack of funding, insufficient human resources and unavailability of equipment.³ NCWD authorized the manuals the project developed for NCWD, SMWA, and WDO, respectively, and distributed copies to states. It was confirmed that in the states we visited, the manuals had been utilized for the initial stage of adopting the model, although the manual volume was too large and not convenient for daily basis use nor self-education. NCWD wants to have more copies of manuals to disseminate the model for more LGAs, but no funding is available for additional printing.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goals have been mostly achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. Regarding the Overall Goal 1, NCWD has expanded the model to 12 new states as of 2018. Selection of the 12 states was determined using the six geographical zones in the country. For the states that are yet to adopt the model, reasons such as challenges in funding, low commitment from state governments contribute to the non-adoption. NCWD cannot expand it dramatically but one by one based on the budget they can obtain. One of the states we visited organizes training quite proactively based on the model. As for the Overall Goal 2, all interviewees (SMWAs, WDCs, etc.) in the target states mentioned that there are many positive impacts on women’s empowerment. Training participants we met also expressed their appreciation for the training based on the model.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No negative impacts of the project were observed. As a positive impact on gender, in addition to the positive changes on women mentioned above, respondents from all five states pointed out that men are happy to encourage their wives as there was an improvement in family income and there is now a better relationship among men and women. Some interviewees said that men now even want to acquire skills from WDCs and there is more respect from men towards the women. Other positive impacts raised by the interviewees include improved literacy among adult women, access to credit facilities, better health seeking behaviors on how to care for their children, better personal hygiene, fewer divorce cases, improvement of cooking and food and nutrition improved, etc.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) WDC activation model is expanded at federal level through WDC activation in target states.	More than 4 states other than target states newly adopt WDC activation model.	Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued) (Project Completion) NCWD expanded the WDC activation model to other six states, namely Adamawa, Ekiti, Gombe, Oyo, Ebonyi, and Zamfara. Management training was conducted based on the model. (Ex-post Evaluation) * See Overall Goal Indicator 1.
(Overall Goal)	More than 7 states other	(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved

¹ Ministry of Foreign Affairs, ODA Data book (2011).

² Basically, there is one WDC per LGA. The number of LGAs/WDCs of the target states ranges between 16 (Kwara) and 35 (Kano). Among them, the number of LGAs that newly adopted the model was nine in Anambra and one in Kaduna.

³ Anambra seemed to have expanded the model as they are able to get support from the state government to expand.

1. WDC activation model is expanded in wider scale at federal and state level.	than target states newly adopt WDC activation model.	Total 12 states newly adopted the model after the project (as of 2018).												
2. Women's empowerment is enhanced at the community and household level through activation of WDCs.	Women's social and economic participation rate is increased in the target states. (Alternative indicator) Qualitative information to indicate women's social and economic participation.	(Ex-post Evaluation) mostly achieved Positive impacts of WDCs raised by respondents <table border="1"> <tr> <td>Anambra</td> <td>Women grandaunts being fully empowered with equipment and take off grants. Women have been able to setup their businesses even with little capital.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cross River</td> <td>Women empowerment has been enhanced. The women are able to sustain themselves and those trained are provided with equipment e.g. baking ovens, hair dryers, generator sets after they graduate which will assist their business.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kaduna</td> <td>women are provided with microfinance loans by the SMWA.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kano</td> <td>Women are said to be more social, more independent as a result of skills acquired from the WDC. They are now able to provide financially towards family income, allow their children to attend schools, and accompany their children to the hospital due to literacy classes been taken which has improved communication and knowledge.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kwara</td> <td>No information was available.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Niger</td> <td>The women are now engaged and are politically empowered; they can express themselves, e.g., when the problem of abuse arises.</td> </tr> </table>	Anambra	Women grandaunts being fully empowered with equipment and take off grants. Women have been able to setup their businesses even with little capital.	Cross River	Women empowerment has been enhanced. The women are able to sustain themselves and those trained are provided with equipment e.g. baking ovens, hair dryers, generator sets after they graduate which will assist their business.	Kaduna	women are provided with microfinance loans by the SMWA.	Kano	Women are said to be more social, more independent as a result of skills acquired from the WDC. They are now able to provide financially towards family income, allow their children to attend schools, and accompany their children to the hospital due to literacy classes been taken which has improved communication and knowledge.	Kwara	No information was available.	Niger	The women are now engaged and are politically empowered; they can express themselves, e.g., when the problem of abuse arises.
Anambra	Women grandaunts being fully empowered with equipment and take off grants. Women have been able to setup their businesses even with little capital.													
Cross River	Women empowerment has been enhanced. The women are able to sustain themselves and those trained are provided with equipment e.g. baking ovens, hair dryers, generator sets after they graduate which will assist their business.													
Kaduna	women are provided with microfinance loans by the SMWA.													
Kano	Women are said to be more social, more independent as a result of skills acquired from the WDC. They are now able to provide financially towards family income, allow their children to attend schools, and accompany their children to the hospital due to literacy classes been taken which has improved communication and knowledge.													
Kwara	No information was available.													
Niger	The women are now engaged and are politically empowered; they can express themselves, e.g., when the problem of abuse arises.													

Source: Final Report of the project; questionnaires and interviews with NCWD, SMWAs, Desk Officer of SMWAs in Kano and Niger states, as well as WDO and HOC in the two states visited - Kano and Niger.

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 98% and 100%, respectively). The Outputs of the project were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The "National Gender Policy" (2006) is under review at the time of ex-post evaluation as many topics were not covered which have emerged over the years, e.g., young girls being used for extremist/bombing activities, etc. At the state level, some states mentioned that the government has put in place policies, plans and systems to support, e.g., "Establishment of skill centers at hard to reach areas (riverine areas) program for 10 years" (2014-2023) in Anambra State, at the time of ex-post evaluation, while other states did not. Some states/LGAs have challenges to obtain necessary support including budget due to less priority on gender issue within the management level.

<Institutional Aspect>

The organizational structure for women's empowerment and activation/implementation of WDCs (NCWD at the federal level, SMWA at the state level and LGA/WDOs and WDC/Head of WDC (HOC) at the LGA level) has not changed since project completion. At the LGA level, WDC activities are managed and supervised by WDOs and HOCs while the training/ teaching classes are organized and carried out by instructors. Some centres mentioned that the number of instructors (three to five persons/WDC) is not sufficient, but they are unable to engage further due to low funding.

<Technical Aspect>

According to NCWD, necessary skills to sustain project effects (supervisory and monitoring and leadership and coordination at NCWD, advocacy and capacity building at SMWA, administrative and management and leadership and coordination at LGA/WDO and WDC/HOC) are available at each level. NCWD maintains the WDC activation database developed under the project, and provide manuals, training, and workshops to states. NCWD also carries out unplanned visits to states to evaluate activities and make further assessments. States provide step down training which they receive from the federal level to the LGAs. Some of the personnel who received the technical transfer from this project left their jobs, and we observed that there was no proper handing over from the person in charge during the project to her/his successor at some states. Also, as mentioned above, the manuals developed by the project were no longer utilized as expected due to the bulky nature.

Most of the equipment provided to the pilot WDCs under the project is in good condition. However, in Niger State, some of the equipment such as knitting machines and sewing machines has been broken and not been used anymore. Therefore, there is no knitting class for the past six months (as to sewing machines, some are still working, and they have sewing class). According to the WDO, they could not get the necessary spare parts locally to repair them.

<Financial Aspect>

According to NCWD, the budget allocation which can be utilized for introducing the WDC activation model to new states is very limited for the last few years. The decline in the macro economy especially after the oil price plunge in 2015 could have affected such a budgetary situation. There is an effort to obtain a larger budget. However, the forecast is not clear. Many of the staff at LGAs does not know how much budget they have for the project. Nevertheless, it is commendable that NCWD and some states have managed to reserve minimum required budget to expand the model and continue WDC activities as stated above under the budget constraints.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the sustainability of the effects through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose of expanding the WDC activation model to more states other than the target states and mostly achieved the Overall Goal of expanding the model further and enhancing women's empowerment, while expansion to other LGAs within the target states has been limited. Regarding the sustainability, some problems were observed in the policy, institutional, technical, and financial

Budget allocated for implementation and expansion of WDC activation model (Unit: Nigerian Naira)

	2015	2016	2017	2018
NCWD				
- National budget	25,000,000	67,880,655	130,597,150	100,597,150
Anambra State	20,000,000	20,000,000	20,000,000	20,000,000
Cross River State	N/A	8,000,000	6,000,000	8,000,000
Kaduna State	N/A	8,000,000	6,000,000	8,000,000
Kano State	N/A	8,000,000	6,000,000	8,000,000
Kwara State	N/A	8,000,000	6,000,000	8,000,000
Niger State	N/A	8,000,000	6,000,000	8,000,000

Source: NCWD

aspects mainly due to unclear policy support, insufficient staffing and budget for expansion of the model. Nevertheless, the organizational structure and necessary skills for women’s empowerment and activation/implementation of WDCs are available at each level. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- Improve Monitoring and Evaluation for the centres. NCWD is recommended to make more regular field visits, e.g., every 2-3 months, which will potentially make centres more active when they know direct observation is carried out.
- Increase advocacy to the states on sensitization relating to gender issues. NCWD is recommended to make advocacy visits, workshops, etc. to the state governments and key personnel to improve gender activities in the state and also discuss/emphasize on how gender factors contribute to overall growth and development of the state.
- Create a more user friendly, pocket friendly and simplified version of the manual for WDCs. NCWD is recommended that the current manual need to be redrafted, reworded and simplified as provided an easy to read and carry document/ booklet will be more accessible. On the field, we noticed the manual in only one LGA out of the 5 LGAs visited across states. This manual was piled up and had not been used in a while.
- During the field visit, it was observed that conditions of provided equipment are quite different in two states. One reason of broken and left unused equipment is no spare parts to fix was available in the local market. NCWD is recommended to assess the background of unused equipment and support WDCs to keep them in good condition. For example, if spare parts are available only in big cities, NCWD can procure and deliver necessary spare parts to fix. Furthermore, mechanism of sharing good practice of maintenance from other states could be another possibility to keep equipment in good condition.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- Detailed manual with lots of pages is not always sustainable in terms of continued utilization especially at the field level. Combined usage of simplified version is desirable.
- For a future evaluation in a country like Nigeria, where questionnaires without visits do not collect necessary information, we recommend hiring of local consultant(s) who can physically visit all target states as this will likely speed up the process of collation and submission from the state and LGA level.

The image shows a handwritten time table for a Women Development Centre (WDC) in Kano State, Nigeria. The title is 'WUDIL MODEL WOMEN CENTRE AGENCY FOR MASS EDUCATION KANO STATE NIGERIA GENERAL TIME TABLE'. The table is organized into columns for different days of the week (Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday) and rows for different activities (Arts, Music, English, Health, etc.). Each cell contains a subject name followed by a code (e.g., 'Arts 002', 'Music 003'). At the bottom, there is a section for 'TEACHER'S NAME' with a list of names and their corresponding codes.

Time table of activities at WDC, Kano State (target state)



Students practicing head scarf tying (aso-oke gele) and make up amongst themselves at WDC, Ogun State (newly adopted state)