

Country Name	Project for Enhancing Access and Capacity of EQUITV Program (EQUITV Phase 2)
Papua New Guinea	

I. Project Outline

Background	Papua New Guinea (PNG) consists mainly of rugged terrains and islands. Most primary and secondary schools in PNG are small and located in rural and remote areas. The geographical constraints hampered education services to reach all of the rural areas where school infrastructure and resource materials are limited, and the number of teachers and the quality of education are insufficient. To improve the access to and quality of education, the National Department of Education (NDoE) began utilizing distance education to compensate for qualitative and quantitative shortcomings in basic education. NDoE and JICA implemented the Distance Education Utilizing Live Recording Broadcasting (2002-2004) and the Enhancing Quality in Teaching through TV Programs (EQUITV Phase 1) (2005-2008). Based on the achievements of EQUITV Phase 1, NDoE formulated the National Education Media Policy (NEMP) in 2010 and started introducing the program nationwide. NDoE needed to establish a sustainable mechanism for disseminating the EQUITV program.												
Objectives of the Project	Through preparation of the National and Provincial Dissemination Plans, development of training modules, and training of provincial trainers, the project aimed at strengthening the system for disseminating the EQUITV program at primary schools, thereby contributing to the program being utilized at primary schools nationwide. Overall Goal: The EQUITV program is utilized at primary schools nationwide. Project Purpose: The system for disseminating the EQUITV program at primary schools nationwide is strengthened.												
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: NGI Region (Bougainville, East New Britain, Manus, New Ireland and West New Britain provinces), Momase Region (East Sepik, Madang, Morobe and Sandaun provinces), Highlands Region (Western Highlands province) and Southern Region (National Capital District (NCD) and Central province). Main activities: preparation of the National and Provincial Dissemination Plans, development of training modules, training for provincial trainers, training for lectures of teachers' colleges, etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">PNG Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts from Japan: 12 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 66 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Training in Japan: 16 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Office space, facility and equipment for training, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Vehicle, satellite antenna, TV receiver, office equipment, etc.</td> <td>3) Local cost for workshop, monitoring, material development, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Local cost: Cost for travel, training, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	PNG Side	1) Experts from Japan: 12 persons	1) Staff allocated: 66 persons	2) Training in Japan: 16 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space, facility and equipment for training, etc.	3) Equipment: Vehicle, satellite antenna, TV receiver, office equipment, etc.	3) Local cost for workshop, monitoring, material development, etc.	1) Local cost: Cost for travel, training, etc.	
Japanese Side	PNG Side												
1) Experts from Japan: 12 persons	1) Staff allocated: 66 persons												
2) Training in Japan: 16 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space, facility and equipment for training, etc.												
3) Equipment: Vehicle, satellite antenna, TV receiver, office equipment, etc.	3) Local cost for workshop, monitoring, material development, etc.												
1) Local cost: Cost for travel, training, etc.													
Project Period	April 2012 to December 2015	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 390 million yen, (actual) 537 million yen										
Implementing Agency	National Department of Education (NDoE)												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	IC Net Limited, PADECO Co., Ltd.												

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Points to be considered at the time of the ex-post evaluation>

[Verification of the indicators for the Project Purpose at the time of ex-post evaluation]

- Indicator 1 of the Project Purpose was about authorization of the National Dissemination Plan, and Indicator 3 of the Project Purpose was for verification of recommendations for dissemination of the EQUITV in the Plan. Therefore, the continuation status of Indicator 3 at the time of the ex-post evaluation was referred to verification of Indicator 1.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of PNG at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

In the national development plan, "Papua New Guinea Vision 2050" and "Development Strategic Plan 2010-2030," universalization of basic education and promotion of Information, Communication and Technology (ICT) in the education sector are targeted. These are reflected in the sector plan such as "National Education Plan 2005-2014" and "Plan for Universalization of Basic Education 2010-2019." Promotion of e-learning, including the EQUITV program was emphasized in the "National Education Plan" (2015-2019). Thus, the project was consistent with PNG's development policies, at both the ex-ante evaluation and the project completion.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of PNG at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion>

The geographical constraints hampered education services to reach all of the rural areas where school infrastructure and resource materials are limited, and the number of teachers and the quality of education were insufficient. To improve the access to and quality of education, there were needs for nationwide diffusion of the distance education program at both the ex-ante evaluation and the project completion.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the time of ex-ante evaluation>

One of the priority areas for assistance for PNG was improvement of social services. Related to this area, support for improvement of the quality and access to primary education (particularly science and mathematics education at the primary level) was included¹.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

¹ Ministry of Foreign Affairs "ODA Databook 2012.", (2013).

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the project completion. The first National Dissemination Plan (NDP) of the EQUITV program was formulated in 2012. It was revised based on the revised Provincial Dissemination Plans and the progress of EQUITV-related activities in 2013, 2014 and 2015. These revised plans were approved by NDoE (Indicator 1). The revised NDP included recommendations for dissemination of EQUITV Program nationwide (Indicator 3). Meeting of the EQUITV Steering Committee composed of the Curriculum Development & Assessment Division (CDAD), Teacher Education Division (TED), Standards & Guidance Division (SGD) and Policy and Planning Division (PPD) were held more than once per quarter during the project period (Indicator 2). Thus, it can be said that the system for disseminating the EQUITV program was strengthened.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have continued. NDP has been integrated into the annual management plan of the NDoE's E-Learning Division (ELD) which is responsible for NDP. ELD, in accordance with the annual management plan, has implemented the EQUITV activities, such as revising model lessons, distributing equipment and conducting trainings, and so on. For the next revision of NDP, ELD plans to hold a national workshop with representatives from 22 provinces in August or September 2019. Meetings of the EQUITV Steering Committee have been integrated into NDoE's regular weekly inter-divisional meetings, such as the Top Management Team Meeting and Senior Staff Meeting. Topics related to EQUITV have been discussed at these meetings at least once a month. ELD has utilized other opportunities to discuss EQUITV matters. An example is the Senior Education Officials Conference, in which high-level officials from NDoE and provincial education offices participate.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been achieved. The EQUITV program has been diffused to primary schools nationwide. Out of the six provinces from which data were available at the ex-post evaluation, the ratio of schools which have utilized the EQUITV program increased from 2015. In East Sepik, the ratio of schools which have utilized the EQUITV program has decreased, because the total number of schools increased rapidly from 190 in 2015 to 254 in 2019. However, the number of schools utilizing the EQUITV program has increased from 152 to 180. In East Sepik, the provincial education office has given directions to schools to utilize DVDs, since TV reception is weak; the office made this suggestion at the provincial head teachers meeting. However, some schools have had difficulty in utilizing the EQUITV program without electricity, and teachers use teaching and learning materials of EQUITV program. In this province, 18 new schools have shown an interest in the EQUITV program and been awaiting the government subsidy to finance the equipment, according to the provincial education office. A concern was raised about possible robberies of TV and other materials at school.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

First, according to NDoE and the Inspector of the National Capital District, gender equality has been fairly promoted through EQUITV model lessons. The lessons facilitate teachers to organize group works in classrooms, where female and male pupils are encouraged to work together. Furthermore, the gender ratio of model teachers was an equal 50:50. Second, personnel of ELD who gained skills from the project have worked for not only scaling up EQUITV program but also preparing video contents for induction training of the Standard Based Education and developing textbooks of mathematics and science.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of the Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																																																	
(Project Purpose) The system for disseminating the EQUITV program at primary schools nationwide is strengthened.	Indicators: 1. The National Dissemination Plan of the EQUITV program is authorized by NDoE so as to promote UBE plan and NEMP.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved (Continued)</u> (Project Completion) - The revised NDP of the EQUITV program was approved by NDoE in 2015. (Ex-post Evaluation) - NDP has been integrated into the annual management plan of ELD of NDoE.																																																	
	2. The meeting of the EQUITV Steering Committee composed of CDAD, TED, SGD and PPRD is held at least once per quarter.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved (Continued)</u> (Project Completion) - The meetings were held more than one per quarter. (Ex-post Evaluation) - Meeting of the EQUITV Steering Committee have been integrated into NDoE's regular weekly inter-divisional meetings. These meetings have been held at least one a month.																																																	
	3. The measures to improve the rate of schools utilizing the EQUITV program in line with the National Dissemination Plan are proposed.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved (Continued)</u> (Project Completion) - The recommendations for dissemination were approved as a part of the revised National Dissemination Plan at the JCC meeting in December 2015. (Ex-post Evaluation) - Refer to the Indicator 1.																																																	
(Overall goal) The EQUITV program is utilized at primary schools nationwide.	1. The rate of primary schools utilizing the EQUITV program nationwide is improved.	<u>Status of achievement: Achieved</u> (Ex-post Evaluation) - The utilization rate of EQUITV program increased from 2015 in six of the seven provinces.																																																	
		<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>No. of schools</th> <th colspan="2">EQUITV utilization</th> <th>With TV, materials</th> <th>With DVD</th> <th>Trained</th> </tr> <tr> <th></th> <th></th> <th>2019</th> <th>2015</th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>NCD</td> <td>38</td> <td>28 (74%)</td> <td>(55%)</td> <td>28</td> <td>24</td> <td>25</td> </tr> <tr> <td>ARB</td> <td>238</td> <td>188 (79%)</td> <td>(50%)</td> <td>188</td> <td>188</td> <td>188</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Central</td> <td>129</td> <td>129 (100%)</td> <td>(70%)</td> <td>129</td> <td>129</td> <td>129</td> </tr> <tr> <td>ESP</td> <td>254</td> <td>180 (71%)</td> <td>(83%)</td> <td>180</td> <td>180</td> <td>180</td> </tr> <tr> <td>WHP</td> <td>100</td> <td>100 (100%)</td> <td>(50%)</td> <td>100</td> <td>100</td> <td>100</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		No. of schools	EQUITV utilization		With TV, materials	With DVD	Trained			2019	2015				NCD	38	28 (74%)	(55%)	28	24	25	ARB	238	188 (79%)	(50%)	188	188	188	Central	129	129 (100%)	(70%)	129	129	129	ESP	254	180 (71%)	(83%)	180	180	180	WHP	100	100 (100%)	(50%)	100	100	100
	No. of schools	EQUITV utilization		With TV, materials	With DVD	Trained																																													
		2019	2015																																																
NCD	38	28 (74%)	(55%)	28	24	25																																													
ARB	238	188 (79%)	(50%)	188	188	188																																													
Central	129	129 (100%)	(70%)	129	129	129																																													
ESP	254	180 (71%)	(83%)	180	180	180																																													
WHP	100	100 (100%)	(50%)	100	100	100																																													

		New Ireland	147	95 (65%)	(44%)	95	95	95
		ENBP	160	129 (81%)	(80%)	129	129	129
Note: As the number of schools increased from 2015 to 2019, the utilization rate is compared in percentage, not number.								

Source: Project Completion Report and information provided by NDoE and Provincial Education Offices.

3 Efficiency

Although the project period was as planned (ratio against the plan: 100%), the project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 138%). Outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the project efficiency is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The EQUITV Program is prioritized in “the National Education Plan” (2015-2019), which emphasizes necessity for maintaining successful e-learning programs such as the EQUITV Program. And, “the National Media Policy” (2010) directs scaling up of EQUITV nationwide.

<Institutional Aspect>

As mentioned earlier, NCD has been still effective, and most provincial education offices have integrated their dissemination plan of the EQUITV program into their annual operation plan, according to ELD. Some provinces even have included the plan also into the annual budget plan. ELD has 17 personnel against planned 44, due to inappropriate management of the recruitment process, according to NDoE. At the provincial level,, a provincial education officer is appointed as an EQUITV coordinator in most provinces, who connects primary schools and ELD. Inspectors monitor implementation of the EQUITV program at the school level in collaboration with the school head. Besides Inspectors’ monitoring, ELD collects EQUITV-related information in the annual school census on the progress of diffusion and utilization of the EQUITV program.

<Technical Aspect>

Since the project completion, ELD including the National Trainers have revised EQUITV (Grade 6 mathematics and science model lessons) in line with the national curriculum and teaching and learning materials. And, they have implemented EQUITV in-service training and trained a total of 242 teachers in Western Highlands, Chimbu, Jiwaka, Enga and Madang. Besides these facts, the interviewed personnel of ELD and provincial offices answered that ELD has sustained sufficient skills for material development and training. Regarding the Provincial Trainers, although they have not had training opportunities since the project completion, they have sustained sufficient skills to annually train newly assigned Inspectors and education officers on EQUITV induction (NCD) or supervising school-based in-service training (East Sepik). The EQUITV modules have been utilized at some teachers colleges as an optional course for familiarizing the EQUITV program.

<Financial Aspect>

Budgets of ELD allocated from NDoE for promotion and operation of the EQUITV program have gradually decreased from 1.2 million Kina in 2016 to 0.8 million Kina in 2019. These have not been sufficient to diffuse the EQUITV program to remote areas in the rural areas. Provincial education offices have not secured sufficient budgets, either, primarily because of the limited funding from the central government.

<Evaluation Result>

In the light above, there have been some problems in the institutional and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effects is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal, and the project effects have continued. As a system for disseminating the EQUITV program at primary schools nationwide, NCD developed by the project was authorized and stakeholders’ meetings were organized. Since the project completion, this system has been sustained, and the number of the schools which utilize the EQUITV program has increased. Regarding sustainability, although the organizational framework has been sustained for promoting and operation of the EQUITV program, there have been concerns on the shortage of personnel at ELD and budgets at the central and provincial level. As for efficiency, the project cost exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing agency:

- For further dissemination of the EQUITV program with limited financial and human resources, it is recommended to NDoE to rethink the required minimum package (equipment, materials and training), budget and procedures to implement the EQUITV program. With regard to this, it is necessary to simplify the contents and procedure as much as possible in the given settings at school. For example, as for training as part of the minimum requirements, it will be useful to develop more simplified modules for in-service training on the EQUITV program so that it would be more expanded at each school’s initiative in the framework of school-based training. For diffusion of these minimum packages and modules, it is recommended to ELD to make clear the responsible section by assigning a focal person (EQUITV help desk) at ELD and persons in charge also at the provincial level for communication and trouble-shooting with schools.
- It is recommended to NDoE to provide guidance to Inspectors and school heads to conduct regular inspections on the storage condition of the provided equipment when they monitor the EQUITV program implementation, so that the equipment would not be exposed to the risk of robbery.

Lessons Learned:

- The EQUITV program strengthened by the project has been diffused to other schools nationwide even since the project completion. This has been attributed to incorporation of the National Dissemination Plan developed by the project into the annual plan of ELD and also EQUITV Steering Committee established by the project into NDoE’s regular interdivisional meetings. In projects which newly develop a plan or establish an organization, it is important to design the plan or organization which could be incorporated into exiting institutional and operational structure of the implementing agency and involve the counterpart in the development process of such a plan or organization as core implementers for sustaining the project effects.



Teacher giving the lesson with use of the EQUITV program to Grade 7 students at St. Theresa Primary School in NCD



Science experiment in group of Grade 8 class with guidance from the EQUITV program at Banak Primary School in East Sepik Province